

**ASSESSMENT, DEVELOPMENT AND DEMONSTRATION OF LOW-VOC  
CLEANING SYSTEMS FOR SOUTH COAST AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT  
DISTRICT RULE 1171**

Prepared for:  
The South Coast Air Quality Management District  
Under SCAQMD Contract #01172

Prepared by:  
Mike Morris and Katy Wolf  
Institute for Research and Technical Assistance

August 2003

## **DISCLAIMER**

This report was prepared as a result of work sponsored and paid for in whole by the South Coast Air Quality Management District (AQMD). The opinions, findings, conclusions, and recommendations are those of the authors and do not necessarily represent the views of AQMD. AQMD, its officers, employees, contractors, and subcontractors make no warranty, expressed or implied, and assume no legal liability for the information in this report. AQMD has not approved or disapproved this report, nor has AQMD passed upon the accuracy or adequacy of the information contained herein.

## **ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

This analysis benefited considerably from the efforts of many persons within and outside the Institute for Research and Technical Assistance (IRTA). We would particularly like to acknowledge the valuable contributions made by the South Coast Air Quality Management District (SCAQMD) staff. We would also like to acknowledge the support we received from Abid Latif, the SCAQMD project officer. We are especially grateful to the companies that agreed to test alternatives or use their case studies for this project. Finally, we appreciate the efforts of Amy Blume of IRTA in helping to prepare the document.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. Introduction and Background .....	1
Target Applications .....	1
Project Approach .....	1
Cleaner Performance .....	3
Cost Analysis .....	4
Low-VOC, Low Toxicity Alternatives .....	5
Water Based Cleaners .....	6
Soy Based Cleaners .....	6
Acetone .....	6
Methyl Acetate .....	7
Volatile Methyl Siloxanes .....	7
HCFC, HFEs and HFCs .....	7
Report Organization .....	7
II. Alternatives in Electronics and High Technology Equipment .....	9
2.1 Preliminary Laboratory Testing .....	9
2.2 Field Testing .....	10
2.2.1 Teledyne Controls .....	10
2.2.2 Hydro-Aire .....	11
2.2.3 Teledyne Microelectronic Technologies .....	12
2.2.4 Corona Magnetics .....	13
2.2.5 Cicoil Corporation .....	15
2.2.6 Sterling Electric, Inc. ....	16
2.2.7 Walton Motors & Controls, Inc. ....	17
2.2.8 Burbank Water and Power .....	19
2.2.9 Covanta Energy .....	21
2.2.10 Northrop Grumman (Formerly TRW Space & Technology Division).....	22
2.2.11 Northrop Grumman (Formerly Litton Guidance & Control Systems).....	23
2.2.12 Astro Pack .....	25
III. Alternatives in Coating and Adhesive Application Equipment Cleaning .....	26
3.1 Preliminary Laboratory Testing .....	26
3.2 Field Testing .....	28
3.2.1 Hydro-Aire .....	28
3.2.2 Gulfstream .....	30
3.2.3 California Propeller .....	31
3.2.4 American Security Products .....	32
3.2.5 Metrex .....	33
3.2.6 Oakwood Furniture .....	33
3.2.7 Bausman & Father .....	36
3.2.8 El Dorado .....	38
3.2.9 Holmes Body Shop .....	39
3.2.10 Westway Industries, Inc. ....	41
3.2.11 PCM Leisure World .....	42
3.2.12 Murphy Industrial Coatings, Inc. ....	44
3.2.13 Hickory Springs .....	47

3.2.14 VACCO Industries, Inc. ....	48
IV. Alternatives in Screen Printing Application Equipment Cleaning.....	50
4.1 Preliminary Laboratory Testing .....	50
4.2 Field Testing.....	51
4.2.1 Teledyne Microelectronic Technologies .....	51
4.2.2 Owens Illinois .....	53
4.2.3 Southern California Screen Printing .....	54
4.2.4 Nelson Nameplate .....	56
4.2.5 City of Santa Monica Paint Shop .....	58
4.2.6 Stith .....	59
4.2.7 Quickdraw .....	60
4.2.8 Melmarc .....	62
4.2.9 Total Enterprises .....	62
4.2.10 Huhtamaki .....	63
V. Results of the Analysis .....	64
Electronics and High Technology Equipment Cleaning .....	64
Coating and Adhesive Application Equipment .....	66
Printing Application Equipment Cleaning .....	68
Recommendations .....	70
Appendix A Material Safety Data Sheets (MSDSs) for Certain Coatings and Inks	
MSDSs for Hydro-Aire Primer and Topcoat	
MSDS for Metrex Coating	
MSDS for Oakwood Stain	
MSDSs for Holmes Coatings	
MSDS for Murphy Coatings	
MSDS for Nelson Nameplate Ink	
Appendix B Stand Alone Case Studies for Selected Facilities	
Teledyne Controls Converts to Low-VOC Rework Cleaner	
Litton Converts Away from VOC Solvents	
Burbank Aerospace Company Adopts Alternative Spray Gun Cleaner	
Small Aerospace Company Makes Spray Gun Cleaning Conversion	
Fontana Company Adopts Low-VOC Coating Equipment Cleaners	
Small Glendora Company Converts to Low-VOC Spray Gun Cleaner	
Small Huntington Beach Furniture Stripper Converts to Better Spray Gun Cleaning Method	
Appendix C Selected Cleaning Alternatives	
Alternative Cleaners Examined During Preliminary Tests for Coating and Adhesive Application Equipment Cleaning	
Alternatives Tested at Southern California Screen Printing	
Alternatives Tested at Nelson Nameplate	
Alternatives Tested at Stith and Quickdraw	
Alternatives Tested at Huhtamaki	

## LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 3-1 Spray Gun Cleaning System at Hydro-Aire .....	29
Figure 3-2 Furniture Manufactured by Oakwood .....	34
Figure 3-3 Spray Equipment Cleaning at Oakwood .....	35
Figure 3-4 Tabletop Ultrasonic Cleaning Unit at Bausman & Father .....	37
Figure 3-5 Spray Gun Cleaning System at Holmes .....	40
Figure 3-6 Spray Gun Cleaning System at Westway .....	42
Figure 3-7 Spray Gun Cleaning Equipment at Murphy .....	45
Figure 3-8 Adhesive Spray Booth at Hickory Springs .....	47
Figure 4-1 Screen Printing Operation at Owens Illinois .....	53
Figure 4-2 Screen and Cleaning System at Southern California Screen Printing .....	55
Figure 4-3 Screen Printing at Nelson Nameplate .....	57

-

## LIST OF TABLES

Table 1-1 Rule 1171 Cleaning Applications and Target VOC Content .....	2
Table 1-2 Companies Participating in SCAQMD Project with Electronics or High Technology Operations .....	3
Table 1-3 Companies Participating in SCAQMD Project with Coating or Adhesives Applications .....	4
Table 1-4 Companies Participating in SCAQMD Project with Printing Applications .....	5
Table 2-1 Electronics and High Technology Cleaning Applications.....	9
Table 2-2 Annual Cost Comparison for Teledyne Controls for Rework Cleaning.....	11
Table 2-3 Annual Cost Comparison for Hydro-Aire for Rework .....	12
Table 2-4 Annual Cost Comparison for Corona Magnetics for Electromagnetic Assembly.....	15
Table 2-5 Annual Cost Comparison for Cicoil for Cleaning Electromagnetic Assemblies.....	16
Table 2-6 Annual Cost Comparison for Sterling for Electric Motor Manufacture.....	17
Table 2-7 Annual Cost Comparison for Walton for Electric Motors.....	18
Table 2-8 Annual Cost Comparison for Burbank Water & Power for Non- Energized Electrical Equipment Cleaning.....	19
Table 2-9 Annual Cost Comparison for Burbank Water and Power for Energized Electrical Equipment Cleaning.....	21
Table 2-10 Annual Cost Comparison for Covanta for Generator Cleaning .....	22
Table 2-11 Annual Cost Comparison for Northrop Grumman for Solar Cell Manufacture.....	23
Table 2-12 Annual Cost Comparison for Northrop Grumman for Optics Cleaning.....	24
Table 2-13 Annual Cost Comparison for Astro Pak for Scientific Instruments.....	25
Table 3-1 Companies Providing the Coatings and Adhesives for Preliminary Testing....	27
Table 3-2 Results of Preliminary Screening Tests .....	27
Table 3-3 Annual Cost Comparison for Spray Gun Cleaning for Hydro-Aire .....	29
Table 3-4 Annual Cost Comparison for Spray Gun Cleaning for Gulfstream.....	31
Table 3-5 Annual Cost Comparison for Spray Gun Cleaning for California Propeller....	31
Table 3-6 Annual Cost Comparison for Spray Gun Cleaning for American Security Products.....	32
Table 3-7 Annual Cost Comparison for Spray Gun Cleaners for Metrex.....	33
Table 3-8 Annual Cost Comparison for Oakwood for Spray Equipment Cleaning.....	36
Table 3-9 Cost Comparison for Bausman & Father for Spray Gun Cleaning .....	38
Table 3-10 Annual Cost Comparison for Spray Gun Cleaning for El Dorado.....	39
Table 3-11 Annual Cost Comparison for Spray Gun Cleaning for Holmes Body Shop...	41
Table 3-12 Annual Cost Comparison for Spray Gun Cleaning for Westway Industries, Inc. ....	42
Table 3-13 Annual Cost Comparison for Spray Gun Cleaning for PCM .....	44
Table 3-14 Annual Cost Comparison for Spray Equipment Cleaning for Murphy .....	46
Table 3-15 Annual Cost Comparison for Spray Gun Cleaning for Hickory Springs.....	48
Table 4-1 Companies Providing Inks for Preliminary Testing.....	51
Table 4-2 Annual Cost Comparison for Teledyne for Screen Printing .....	53

Table 4-3 Annual Cost Comparison for Owens Illinois for Screen Printing .....	54
Table 4-4 Annual Cost Comparison for Southern California Screen Printing .....	56
Table 4-5 Annual Cost Comparison for Nelson for Screen Printing .....	58
Table 4-6 Annual Cost Comparison for City of Santa Monica for Screen Printing .....	58
Table 4-7 Annual Cost Comparison for Stith for Screen Printing .....	60
Table 4-8 Annual Cost Comparison for Quickdraw for Screen Printing .....	61
Table 5-1 Electronics and High Technology Applications Cleaning Alternatives .....	65
Table 5-2 Coating and Adhesive Application Equipment Cleaning Alternatives .....	67
Table 5-3 Printing Application Equipment Cleaning Alternatives .....	69
Table 5-4 Target VOC Content for Rule 1171 .....	71