BOARD MEETING DATE: June 4, 2021 AGENDA NO. 1

MINUTES: Governing Board Monthly Meeting

SYNOPSIS: Attached are the Minutes of the May 7, 2021 meeting.

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

Approve Minutes of the May 7, 2021 Board Meeting.

Faye Thomas Clerk of the Boards

FT:cmw

## **FRIDAY, MAY 7, 2021**

Notice having been duly given, the regular meeting of the South Coast Air Quality Management District Board was conducted remotely via video conferencing and telephone. Members present:

Mayor Pro Tem Ben Benoit, Chairman Cities of Riverside County

Senator Vanessa Delgado (Ret.), Vice Chair Senate Rules Committee Appointee

Supervisor Lisa A. Bartlett County of Orange

William A. Burke, Ed.D. Speaker of the Assembly Appointee

Council Member Joe Buscaino City of Los Angeles

Mayor Pro Tem Michael A. Cacciotti Cities of Los Angeles County – Eastern Region

Gideon Kracov Governor's Appointee

Supervisor Sheila Kuehl County of Los Angeles

Mayor Pro Tem Larry McCallon Cities of San Bernardino County

Supervisor V. Manuel Perez County of Riverside

Vice Mayor Rex Richardson Cities of Los Angeles County – Western Region

Mayor Pro Tem Carlos Rodriguez Cities of Orange County

Supervisor Janice Rutherford County of San Bernardino

Members absent: None

# **CALL TO ORDER**: Chairman Burke called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m.

- Pledge of Allegiance: Led by Mayor Pro Tem Benoit
- Roll Call
- Swearing in of Chair and Vice Chair for Term May 2021 to January 2022

Dr. Burke administered the oath of office to Chairman Ben Benoit and Vice Chair Vanessa Delgado who were elected for a term ending January 14, 2022.

Retirement Presentation to William A. Burke, Ed.D.

Chairman Benoit thanked Dr. Burke for his strong leadership and highlighted major initiatives, programs and accomplishments that were spearheaded under Dr. Burke's leadership.

Assembly Member Autumn Burke expressed deep appreciation for the legacy and impact that her father has made in environmental justice communities and commented on how his legacy of equity for disadvantaged communities has become the benchmark in their family and a motivating factor in her career. She urged the Board to continue the work to ensure that all communities have clean air to breathe.

Executive Officer Wayne Nastri commented on the many accomplishments under Dr. Burke's leadership and the legacy he leaves behind. Mr. Nastri shared the virtual unveiling of the South Coast AQMD auditorium named in honor of Dr. Burke.

Each Board Member expressed appreciation to Dr. Burke for his years of service and leadership and shared memories and highlights of past meetings. A segment of the signature "The Right to Breath" video was played that epitomizes the hallmarks of Dr. Burke's career on the Board.

Cynthia Verdugo-Peralta, former Governing Board member, thanked Dr. Burke for his many years of service to environmental justice communities and his work on the fleet rules and wished him a happy retirement. She congratulated the chair and vice chair on their appointments.

Jack Broadbent, Chief Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer, Bay Area Air Quality Management District thanked Dr. Burke for his leadership and accomplishments and congratulated him on his retirement.

Ray Whitmer, Secretary-Treasurer/International Brotherhood of Teamsters, Local 911, presented a plaque and personalized Teamsters jacket to Dr. Burke on behalf of the represented employees at the South Coast AQMD.

Dr. Joseph Lyou, former South Coast AQMD Board member/Coalition for Clean Air, commented on Dr. Burke's vision years ago to deploy air quality monitors across the South Coast Air Basin and shared a screenshot of the current network of PurpleAir low-cost air sensors. He announced that Dr. Burke would be a recipient of the Coalition for Clean Air's Lifetime Achievement Award at their 50<sup>th</sup> anniversary event on June 17, 2021.

Dr. Burke expressed appreciation for comments, cards, letters and emails he received. He also thanked staff and expressed appreciation to Marie Patrick, his Board assistant, for her many years of dedicated service. He urged staff to pursue hiring preferences for veterans and the Board to continue their work on environmental justice, equity and educational programs.

Harvey Eder, Public Solar Power Coalition, expressed concerns about democracy and the future of our country, climate change and reliance on fossil fuels. Expressed support for the Solar New Deal.

Javier Sanchez acknowledged Dr. Burke as a hero in the environmental community and thanked him for his years of service and leadership.

Keri Then, retired U.S. Air Force veteran, thanked Dr. Burke for his many years of leadership and allowing public speakers adequate time to make comments. Expressed appreciation for Dr. Burke's comments about respecting the sacrifices made by veterans.

Robina Suwol, California Safe Schools, thanked Dr. Burke for decades of service.

Patty Senecal, Western States Petroleum Association (WSPA), thanked Dr. Burke for his many years of service. She announced that WSPA is making a donation in Dr. Burke's name to the R.M. Pyles Boys Camp Legacy Wall.

Rita Loof, RadTech International, expressed appreciation to Dr. Burke for his many years of service and for his common sense approach to discussions.

Todd Campbell, Clean Energy, expressed appreciation to Dr. Burke for always taking the time to meet with people and trying to understand their concerns about air quality. Thanked him for his leadership and work on the fleet rules.

Lucy Garcia, Sierra Club, expressed appreciation for the gains that have been made in air quality over the years. She urged the Board to adopt the warehouse Indirect Source Rule (ISR) without delay for the sake of underrepresented communities of color.

Yvonne Martinez Watson, Sierra Club, thanked Dr. Burke for his many years of service and for taking her concerns about the gas industry's operations seriously.

Angelica Balderas, Sierra Club/AB 617 San Bernardino, Muscoy Community Steering Committee co-host, thanked Dr. Burke for his many years of public service.

Al Sattler thanked Dr. Burke for his years of service and reflected on a hearing that was held in San Pedro many years ago about the coal and coke terminal.

Ranji George, a member of public, thanked Dr. Burke for his many years of service and leadership, especially with the Lower Emissions School Bus Program. Urged the Board to consider how our actions impact the Global South.

Steven Goldsmith, Torrance Refinery Action Alliance, thanked Dr. Burke for his help and guidance on efforts to replace hydrofluoric acid (HF) with safer alternatives.

Council Member Ben Reynoso, City of San Bernardino, thanked Dr. Burke for his dedication to cleaning the air and environment. Stated that he is calling for a moratorium on new warehouses in the City of San Bernardino.

Ana Gonzalez, Center for Community Action and Environmental Justice (CCAEJ) and President of Chicano Latino Caucus of San Bernardino County, thanked Dr. Burke for his many years of service.

Hector De Leon stated that voting to adopt the warehouse ISR would positively affect people's lives and add to Dr. Burke's legacy.

Tracy Hernandez, Los Angeles County Business Federation (BizFed) acknowledged Dr. Burke's leadership over the years and expressed gratitude for all he has done to clean the air.

Kareem Gongora, County of San Bernardino Planning Commissioner/CCAEJ/Fontana resident, thanked Dr. Burke for his leadership and work on electric school buses. He reflected on a memorable moment during a Board meeting in 2017 that kept him interested and engaged in the South Coast AQMD's work. Thanked Senator Delgado for her leadership at Environmental Justice Advisory Group meetings.

William Zobel, California Hydrogen Business Council, thanked Dr. Burke for his leadership. He commented on meeting with Dr. Burke many years ago as a young policy advisor at the Coalition for Clean Air.

# Opening Comments

Vice Mayor Richardson announced that May 6, 2021 was his last day as president of the Southern California Association of Governments (SCAG) and noted the critical role that SCAG plays in the community. He commented on a recent meeting he convened with South Coast AQMD staff, SCAG, the Ports and the Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transit Authority to discuss coordinating efforts for a clean vehicle infrastructure plan. He also announced that Electrify America is investing \$25 million in Long Beach and Wilmington electric vehicle charging infrastructure as part of its Green City program.

Mayor Pro Tem McCallon thanked Vice Mayor Richardson for his leadership on SCAG.

Chairman Benoit announced that Item No. 27 would be taken out of order and moved to the beginning of the agenda.

-0-

#### This item was taken out of order.

# **PUBLIC HEARING**

27. Certify Final Environmental Assessment and Adopt Proposed Rule 2305 – Warehouse Indirect Source Rule – Warehouse Actions and Investments to Reduce Emissions Program, and Proposed Rule 316 – Fees for Rule 2305, Submit Rule 2305 for Inclusion Into the SIP, and Approve Supporting Budget Actions

lan MacMillan, Assistant DEO/Planning, Rule Development and Area Sources gave the staff presentation on Item No. 27. Barbara Baird, Chief Deputy Counsel, commented on South Coast AQMD's legal authority to adopt PR 2305 and PR 316.

Supervisor Kuehl commended staff for their efforts to address numerous concerns that were raised throughout the three-year rulemaking process. She reminded everyone that the warehouse ISR was included in the 2016 AQMP as a control measure strategy and is needed to assist in meeting air quality standards to avoid the federal government imposing sanctions for nonattainment. She commented on the health impacts from poor air quality and the related costs. She expressed support for the staff recommendation, noting that the menu of options allows flexibility for warehouse operators to meet the rule requirements.

Supervisor Rutherford acknowledged that the South Coast region needs to do more to improve air quality and accelerate the turnover of truck fleets to zero emission technology; however, she questioned whether PR 2305 was the best way to do it. She inquired about the amount of pollution attributed to warehouses that have been built in recent years, noting the decrease in NOx and PM emissions.

Mr. MacMillan responded that heavy-duty trucks are the largest source of NOx emissions in the South Coast Basin and warehouses are a key destination for trucks. The emissions associated with warehouses is approximately equal to all stationary sources and a significant fraction of the NOx profile. NOx and PM emissions have decreased over time due to new emissions controls for heavy-duty trucks; however, existing and anticipated controls will not be enough to meet attainment.

Supervisor Rutherford questioned the role of PR 2305 in transitioning truck fleets because it does not hasten or increase the availability of zero emission trucks, noting that CARB regulations will accelerate the turnover of fleets. She commented on how warehouse operators accrue points for the purchase of clean trucks and questioned the cost assumptions.

Mr. MacMillan stated that Class 8 zero emission trucks are not widely commercially available yet but more are expected to become available beginning later this year with more becoming available in 2022, and near-zero emission trucks are available today. He clarified that the costs shown in the slide presentation were incremental costs that would be incurred when fleet turnover occurs or new trucks are purchased.

Supervisor Rutherford asked whether warehouse operators can earn WAIRE Points for mitigation actions that are already required by local programs or those contained in the World Logistics Center (WLC) settlement agreement.

Mr. MacMillan stated that many of the mitigation actions in the WLC settlement agreement or existing requirements from local programs that are on the WAIRE menu are eligible for points but added that WAIRE Points may be earned only for actions that go beyond existing U.S. EPA and CARB regulations.

Supervisor Rutherford inquired about the process for determining how Mitigation Program Funds will be spent and emphasized the importance of having AB 617 communities provide input into what needs to be done in their communities. She highlighted the need to ensure that priority is given to owners who purchase clean trucks that are domiciled in the communities where they live.

Mr. MacMillan stated that pubic outreach will be conducted, and Board approval is required prior to releasing solicitations or awards. Funds will be segregated by geographic areas to track where the funds originate from and where projects occur. Through the solicitation process, funds would be used to incentivize the purchase of near-zero emissions or zero emissions trucks and zero emissions charging/fueling infrastructure in the communities near warehouses that paid the fee. There is no provision in the rule that requires the truck be domiciled in the community where the owner lives because a truck may be domiciled in one community but have most of its activities concentrated in another community.

Supervisor Rutherford expressed concerns with reporting and recordkeeping requirements and associated costs.

Mr. MacMillan responded that there are a variety of methods that exist to count trucks and warehouse operators may already have some of those measures in place for either security or tracking purposes. If a warehouse operator chose to track near-zero or zero emission trucks that visited their facility to earn WAIRE Points, staff has provided guidance and implementation on several potential recordkeeping methods.

Supervisor Rutherford expressed concerns with the concept of an ISR, noting that CARB regulations, technology advancements and the market will lead to more zero- and near-zero emission trucks. She stated that PR 2305 will not achieve that goal any faster and will cause higher costs to the logistics industry. She noted that the ports are the starting point for the trucks and recommended looking at the connection with the ports.

Mayor Pro Tem Cacciotti inquired about the phase-in schedule for CARBs adopted or proposed heavy-duty truck regulations.

Mr. MacMillan responded that it depends on the specific regulation but requirements are scheduled to begin in 2023 at the earliest.

Mayor Pro Tem Cacciotti asked staff to provide a brief update on the Volvo LIGHTS (Low Impact Green Heavy Transport Solutions) project.

Dr. Matt Miyasato, Chief Technologist/Science and Technology Advancement, responded that the Volvo LIGHTS project is a seminal project undertaken by the South Coast AQMD to work with the two largest truck manufacturers in the world, Daimler and Volvo. Volvo is on the cusp of demonstrating that Class 8 battery electric trucks will become a viable product. They began taking customer orders for Class 8 battery electric trucks, with customer deliveries scheduled for next year; Daimler will follow shortly thereafter.

Mayor Pro Tem Cacciotti inquired about what some of the leading logistics providers that serve as models for others in the industry are doing to transition their fleets, equipment and infrastructure to zero emissions technology.

Dr. Miyasato commented on the efforts of fleet partners that have been willing to test the early deployment of new technology, noting there have been challenges in the deployment of infrastructure and getting the groundwork done. These efforts are a pathway toward full commercialization and deployment of zero emission trucks but they will not be produced in volume for several years.

In response to Mayor Pro Tem Cacciotti, Mr. MacMillan confirmed that Class 2b through Class 8 trucks are eligible to earn WAIRE Points.

Mayor Pro Tem Cacciotti asked whether evaluating the state of technology every five years is adequate, since technology advances quickly.

Mr. MacMillan stated that the five-year interval was to allow the full phasing in of the rule and for technology to continue to mature; however, staff is planning to provide annual updates to the Mobile Source Committee.

Mr. Nastri added that updates can also be included as part of the Technology Advancement Office Clean Fuels Program Annual Report and Program Plan Update.

Mayor Pro Tem Cacciotti recommended reducing the time interval for the state of technology evaluation. He also emphasized the need to provide training and guidance on implementing the rule to applicable warehouse operators, especially small businesses. He recommended that contact information be provided to businesses who may need assistance. Mr. Nastri commented on the ability to do enhanced outreach through the collective efforts of staff.

Mayor Pro Tem Cacciotti commented on the Gladstein, Neandross & Associates study and inquired about the available supply of renewable natural gas (RNG). He also asked staff to address comments that contend RNG is not as good as electricity.

Mr. MacMillan noted that there is an increase in the production of RNG. This can be attributed to the California Low Carbon Fuel Standard that encourages the use of alternative sources of clean energy in the transportation sector, noting that there are a lot of mechanisms available to increase the use RNG.

Dr. Miyasato added that financial incentives are available for providers to provide RNG and the majority are providing natural gas as a selling point to fleets. RNG is one of the few fuels that is currently available to use for Class 8 trucks and the combination of using near-zero natural gas trucks with a renewable fuel achieves significant air quality and greenhouse gas benefits.

Mayor Pro Tem Cacciotti commented on the high rents for warehouse space and asked about the likelihood of warehouse operations relocating to nearby areas outside of South Coast AQMD's jurisdiction or cargo owners shipping their goods through other ports due to PR 2305 compliance costs.

Mr. MacMillan stated that the Industrial Economics, Inc. (IEc) study commissioned by the South Coast AQMD found that PR 2305 would not result in warehouses relocating. He noted that the rents and space for the warehousing industry has increased dramatically for at least the past decade and the ports have reported record-breaking cargo traffic as consumer demand has increased. The goods movement industry is a key economic engine for the region and is expected to stay strong.

Vice Mayor Richardson noted that due in large part to Dr. Burke's leadership and legacy the South Coast AQMD is on the cusp of taking one of the most meaningful steps to address air pollution in the region. He commented on the importance of getting the economy back on track but it should not be at the expense of vulnerable communities experiencing health, economic and environmental disparities. He emphasized the need to commit to a clean and modern goods movement system with the creation of local quality jobs. He inquired about language in the Resolution requiring that a skilled and trained workforce and local certified apprentices be used for projects funded with the WAIRE Mitigation Program Funds.

Mr. MacMillan responded that provisions were added to the Resolution that requires the use of a skilled and trained workforce, as defined by the California Public Contract Code, for projects funded by WAIRE Mitigation Program Funds; and that electricians involved in related projects must have the appropriate license and training certification.

Vice Mayor Richardson asked if the mitigation funds will be invested directly into communities near warehouses and whether the rule will be reevaluated and phased out as trucks get cleaner.

Mr. MacMillan stated that the structure of the mitigation program is set up so that the funds will be pooled in local communities, and then directed back into that community. Staff will seek projects through the solicitation process and award contracts to those that have a local focus so that communities around warehouses are the first to benefit. Staff will provide annual updates and progress reports on the implementation of the rules to the Mobile Source Committee, evaluate the state of technology every five years and a sunset provision has been added to the rule that would apply when the federal and state air quality standards have been achieved.

Vice Mayor Richardson thanked staff and acknowledged the contribution of stakeholders, community members and labor advocates for their hard work in crafting a rule that focuses this transition on creating local jobs to help benefit our communities, reduce vehicle miles traveled and invest in electrification and clean vehicle infrastructure. He emphasized the importance of partnering with federal, state and local governments, industry and other entities, and the significant investment and resources needed to make the transition.

Senator Delgado asked if warehouse operators can use Carl Moyer Program funds to buy new equipment.

Mr. MacMillan noted that incentive programs such as the Carl Moyer Program have their own restrictions on how funds can be spent; however, PR 2305 does not prohibit using incentive funding to earn WAIRE Points. He noted that a

warehouse operator that purchases a truck using Carl Moyer funds cannot earn WAIRE Points for the purchase but would earn WAIRE Points for the visits the truck makes to a warehouse.

Dr. Burke asked what is being done to make sure people of color are included in the skilled workforce training and apprenticeship programs.

Mr. MacMillan stated that the apprenticeship programs do their own outreach and there is no requirement in the Resolution language that specifically addresses the diversity of the workforce.

Council Member Buscaino commented that we need to balance growing cleanly with maintaining jobs, but help is needed from the state and federal government to reduce mobile source emissions. South Coast AQMD's primary regulatory authority is stationary sources but mobile sources are the major source of emissions. He mentioned that he grew up near the Ports, noting that emissions have improved but more can be done. He supports the warehouse ISR and asked his colleagues for an "Aye" vote to adopt as it will help disadvantaged communities surrounded by warehouses. He expressed appreciation for all the letters he has received and meetings held to discuss this topic.

The public hearing was opened, and the following individuals addressed the Board on Agenda Item 27.

\*Jessica Craven, North East Los Angeles (NELA) Climate Collective/California Democratic Party Platform Committee

Julie Weatherford, Riverside resident/350 Riverside

Daniel Weatherford, Riverside resident/350 Riverside

\*Sari Fordham, 350 Riverside

\*Chris Lovekin, 350 Riverside

Robina Suwol, California Safe Schools

Jeri John, Riverside County resident

Hector De Leon, UCLA student

Council Member Ben Reynoso, City of San Bernardino

Susan Debounty, Pasadena resident

Emily Spokes, NELA Climate Collective

\*Carolina Forni, NELA Climate Collective

Ana Gonzalez, Center for Community Action and Environmental Justice (CCAEJ)/
Latino Caucus of San Bernardino County

Elizabeth Sena, South Fontana Concerned Citizens Coalition

Abigail Rosales Medina, San Bernardino school board member

Elliott Gonzales, Long Beach resident

Rosario Cardenas, University of Redlands student

Alma Marquez, CCAEJ

Faraz Rizvi, CCAEJ

Shane Ysais, CCAEJ

Daniel Reyes, CCAEJ

Liz Penny Muguia, CCAEJ

\*Gabriela Mendez, CCAEJ

Robert Nothoff, Los Angeles County Federation of Labor

\*Tiffany Sanchez, East Yard Communities for Environmental Justice (EYCEJ)

Carina Sanchez, EYCEJ

Jose Lopez, EYCEJ

Taylor Thomas, EYCEJ

Laura Cortez, EYCEJ

Arturo Orozco, San Bernardino Valley College student

Robin Sales, Reseda resident/retired registered nurse

Enrique Camacho, San Bernardino resident/Service Employees International Union Local 2015

\*Kathy Hoang, Partnership for Working Families, Warehouse Worker Resource Center, Orange County Communities for Responsible Development and Los Angeles Alliance for a New Economy

Melissa Gonzalez, South Fontana resident

Eddie Sanchez, Redlands resident

Angelica Balderas, Sierra Club/AB 617 San Bernardino, Muscoy Community Steering Committee co-host

Steve Jimenez, American Lung Association

Christina Ross, Irvine resident

Luis Montes, Jr., Inside Sustainability

Cynthia Gonzalez, Fontana resident

Noelle Pulaski, Orange County resident

Arthur Levine, Robert Redford Conservancy for Southern California Sustainability

Mirella Deniz-Zaragoza, Warehouse Worker Resource Center

Rosalie Preston, Los Angeles resident

Kiarra Shelby, Riverside resident

Amparo Munoz, Fontana resident

Yvonne Martinez Watson, Sierra Club

Mariela Loera, Leadership Council

Ariana Rodriguez, City Terrace resident

Al Sattler, Sierra Club and San Pedro resident

Daryl Gale, Los Angeles resident

Jeff Clark, Natural Gas Vehicles for America

Angel Orozco, San Bernardino high school student

Pamela Amaya, Long Beach resident

Lucy Garcia, Chatsworth resident

Roxanna Barrera, UC Santa Barbara student

Fauzia Rizvi, Riverside resident

\*Andrea Vidaurre, Anthony Victoria, People's Collective for Environmental Justice

Adan Alvarez, International Brotherhood of Teamsters, Local 296

David Marrett, Ph.D., Riverside resident/environmental science teacher

Esmeralda Vasquez, Inland Empire resident

Leonardo Pilosa, San Bernardino resident/student

Jocelyn Del Rio, Bell Gardens resident/AB 617 member/EYCEJ

\*Cheryl Auger, Pasadena resident

Dee Ariano, Santa Ana Unified School District parent

Martha Dina Arguello, Physicians for Social Responsibility

\*Keri Then, Moreno Valley resident

Ricardo, Inland Empire resident/student

\*Silvia Betancourt, Long Beach Alliance for Children with Asthma

Nancy Madsen

Ryan, East Los Angeles resident

Resa Barillas, California League of Conservation Voters

Ben Powell, City Terrace resident

\*Michelle Ghafar, Earthjustice

Darby Osnaya, Colton resident

Sandy Kasper, Hemet resident/teacher

Vice Mayor Vilma Cuellar Stallings, City of Paramount

Stephanie Tong, Los Angeles resident

\*Jeremy Santos, Fullerton resident/Cal Poly Pomona student

Diana Sanchez, Los Angeles resident

\*Donatella Galella, Riverside resident/UC Riverside Professor

James Christofoli, Los Angeles resident

Robert Apodaca, United Latinos Vote

\*Justin Lowery, Murrieta resident

Janet Bernabe, Riverside resident/CCAEJ/League of United Latin American Citizens Council 3190/ League of Women Voters Riverside

Linda Cleveland, Watts Clean Air & Energy Committee and AB 617 South Los Angeles Co-Lead

Michael Munoz, Los Angeles Alliance for a New Economy

\*Gustavo Hurtado, Rainbow Pride Youth Alliance and Perris resident

(\*Submitted Written Comments)

These commenters expressed support for a strong ISR. Commented on the adverse health impacts that disproportionately affect residents in disadvantaged communities due to the proliferation of warehouses. Noted the record-breaking profits the logistics industry is earning due to increased e-commerce.

Joseph Sullivan, National Electrical Contractors, expressed support for the warehouse ISR, noting that poor air quality can be largely attributed to the growing logistics industry. The warehouse ISR will protect workers and communities in the South Coast Air Basin and create projects and high road careers for skilled trades people.

Terry Manies, Orange EV
\*Kitty Christensen, Palm Springs resident
Jasmine Vargas, Food, Water and Watch
Jose Trinidad Casteneda, Climate Action campaign
(\*Submitted Written Comments)

These commenters expressed support for a strong warehouse ISR that prioritizes zero emissions technology and infrastructure and creates job opportunities in clean energy.

Clayton Heard, on behalf of Congressman Alan Lowenthal, emphasized the need to ensure that economic growth is not at the expense of the health and safety of the communities that have suffered from the poorest air quality in the nation. He urged the Board to prioritize zero emissions technology and infrastructure, continue to strengthen the rule and to not delay the implementation. (Submitted Written Comments)

Dr. Karen Jakpor, American Lung Association, expressed support for the warehouse ISR and commented on the exponential growth in e-commerce during the pandemic and record profits the logistics industry has been earning. With the rapid growth of the logistics industry, the warehouse ISR is needed to meet air quality standards. She added that the warehouse ISR is flexible and offers many choices. (Submitted Written Comments)

Dr. Christine James, Climate Health Now, stated that adopting the warehouse ISR would reduce exposure to high pollution and cited studies showing that exposure to high levels of air pollutants increases the risk of high blood pressure in children and adolescents and increases their risk for hypertension as adults. She commented on the rising costs of healthcare and the need to seek participation from all stakeholders to address pollution. Urged the Board to adopt a strong warehouse ISR to protect the health and future of people.

Florence Gharibian, Del Amo Action Committee, commented on heavy-duty trucks using residential streets in Torrance and their detrimental impacts to the neighborhood. She added that a new warehouse will be built nearby on a contaminated superfund site and urged the Board to adopt the warehouse ISR. (Submitted Written Comments)

Tammy Yamasaki, Southern California Edison (SCE)/San Bernardino, Muscoy AB 617 Community Steering Community member, commented on SCE's support of the ISR, noting that the proposed rule has flexible compliance options, while emphasizing the critical need for zero emission technologies to achieve emission reductions. Commented on the challenges faced by warehouse owners and operators and expressed SCE's commitment to do their part to ensure successful implementation of the rule.

Kareem Gongora, County of San Bernardino Planning Commissioner/CCAEJ/Fontana resident, commented on aerial photos he submitted of warehouses in the Inland Empire and added that many did not have solar panels on their rooftops. He commented that warehouse owners/operators could earn WAIRE Points by installing solar panels, which is a technology that is already available. He expressed support for the warehouse ISR and noted that the City of Colton is considering a moratorium on warehouses. (Submitted Written Comments)

Maha Rizvi, representing Assembly Member Eloise Gomez Reyes, commented on a letter of support for the warehouse ISR that was submitted by several members of the California Legislature, including Assembly Speaker Anthony Rendon. She emphasized the need to prioritize frontline communities that are being detrimentally impacted by the many diesel trucks associated with warehouses. She noted that the socio-economic analysis in the staff report indicates no projected job loss because of the rule. (Submitted Written Comments)

Mike Townsend representing Senator Connie Leyva, echoed Maha Rizvi's comments. (Submitted Written Comments)

Tommy Faavae, International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers (IBEW), Local 11, expressed strong support for the warehouse ISR. He commended the inclusion of workforce development language that ensures the use of a skilled and trained workforce and certified electricians on projects funded through the WAIRE Mitigation Program. He noted their commitment to hire locally and bring people of color into their apprenticeship program.

Chris Chavez, Coalition for Clean Air/Wilmington, West Long Beach, Carson AB 617 Community Steering Committee member, stated that nearly 200 people had signed their petition in support of a strong ISR. He expressed support for requests to increase the stringency of the rule and prioritizing immediate and actual emission reductions rather than air filtration systems. He expressed concerns about warehouse operators using the mitigation fee as a pay-to-pollute option by banking points but noted that the warehouse ISR will reduce air pollution and save lives. He noted that the economic impacts of the rule will be minimal and will be outweighed by public health benefits. (Submitted Written Comments)

Les Swizer, California New Car Dealers Association, expressed support for efforts to reduce emissions from large warehouse operations. Expressed concern with potential unintended consequences as the broad definition of warehouse may include facilities not intended to fall under purview of the rule, such as larger car dealerships that house a service center, parts department and showroom.

Ranji George, member of the public, expressed support for the transition toward zero emissions technology. He noted RNG is far cleaner than diesel but the combustion RNG also results in air toxics emissions and is inefficient. He requested that more points be allocated for fuel cell technologies.

Chris Shimoda, California Trucking Association, commented on the NOx reductions achieved in the South Coast Basin over the last two decades as a result of CARB and U.S. EPA regulations. He noted that the state's economy relies on the goods movement industry and job loss will result from the warehouse ISR.

William Zobel, California Hydrogen Business Council expressed support for the warehouse ISR, noting that it will create new jobs. He urged the Board to increase the stringency in the rule to prioritize zero emission technologies and remove indoor air filters from the WAIRE menu options. Expressed their commitment to continuing to work with staff to integrate hydrogen and fuel cell technology. (Submitted Written Comments)

Marc Carrel, BREATHE Southern California, expressed support for the ISR, noting that the technology is available to implement the requirements and achieve significant air quality and public health benefits. He requested the mitigation fee be increased to incentivize investing in the WAIRE menu, remove air filtration as an option as it does not achieve emission reductions and apply the rule to all warehouses. (Submitted Written Comments)

Iván Nicholas Cisneros, Columbia University doctoral researcher/Fontana resident, expressed support for the ISR, noting that the rule applies to warehouses over 100,000 square feet so many of the small to medium-sized trucking and logistics industries in Fontana and the Inland Empire will not be negatively affected.

Jerilyn Lopez Mendoza, commented that she served on the Los Angeles Port Commission when the Clean Air Action Plan was developed and commented that industry expressed the same concerns about job and business loss as they are today with the ISR. The Clean Air Action Plan has significantly reduced air pollution for people living and working near the ports and is in its third iteration. She expressed support for the ISR noting that change is always difficult, but communities heavily impacted by warehouses need support.

Carlo De La Cruz, Sierra Club Yassi Kavezade, Sierra Club

Expressed support for the warehouse ISR and noted that the Sierra Club submitted close to 6,000 signatures and comments from residents and families in the South Coast Air Basin. Urged the Board to increase the stringency of the rule to maximize NOx emission reductions and public health benefits. (Submitted Written Comments and 5,644 digital petition signatures)

Gracie Torres, Western Municipal Water District/CCAEJ, noted that for 30 years water agencies have been working through regulations to stop indirect water polluters. These regulations have created jobs in both private and public sectors and continue to identify and plan a more sustainable water future. She urged the Board to adopt a strong warehouse ISR and hold indirect polluters accountable.

Tom Swenson, Cummings Inc., expressed support for the ISR with two modifications: 1) to eliminate air filtration because it does not support direct emission reductions; and 2) points should be given for emission reductions achieved and not indexed on the cost of a technology. He also commented on the availability of near-zero natural gas heavy-duty engines, noting that Cummings currently offers three engine platforms ranging from local delivery trucks to 80,000-pound heavy-duty trucks. (Submitted Written Comments)

Brett Barry, Clean Energy Ryan Kenny, Clean Energy \*Todd Campbell, Clean Energy

Expressed support for the warehouse ISR. Noted that low-NOx trucks are commercially available and already being deployed by leading fleets. Low-NOx trucks provide significant NOx reductions, and when fueled by RNG, greatly reduce carbon emissions. RNG is certified by CARB as a carbon negative fuel and there is a robust supply to support this rule. (\*Submitted Written Comments)

John McNamara, CR&R Katrina Au, Hexagon Agility

Expressed support for the ISR and requested removing the cost component from the points methodology in the compliance menu and award points based on emission reductions. Removing the cost component from the compliance menu will assist those who have invested in low NOx fleets to comply with the warehouse ISR. Added that low NOx medium and heavy-duty trucks remain one of the most effective remedies to address greenhouse gas and NOx emissions and are economically and commercially available and technologically feasible.

Sarah Wiltfong, BizFed

Maria Salinas, Los Angeles Chamber of Commerce

Peter Herzog, NAIOP/Commercial Real Estate Development Association

Luis Portillo, Inland Empire Economic Partnership

Giancarlo Rubio, Valley Industry and Commerce Association

Michael Lewis, Construction Industry Air Quality Coalition

Stephen Lamar, American Apparel and Footwear Association

Paul Granillo, Inland Empire Economic Partnership

Steve McCarthy, California Retailers Association

Christine Bos, Long Beach Chamber of Commerce

Connor Medina, Orange County Business Council

Thomas Jelenic, Pacific Merchant Shipping Association

Mike Williams, International Warehouse Logistics Association

Rex Hime, California Business Properties Association

\*Bill LaMarr, California Small Business Alliance

Marne Sussman, Holland and Knight LLP, representing California Trucking Association

Jeff Malin

Mayor Acquanetta Warren, City of Fontana

(\*Submitted Written Comments)

These commenters expressed opposition to the warehouse ISR. Some of their concerns include: increased costs to the logistics industry to implement the rule, which will be passed on to consumers, loss of jobs and businesses leaving the state, jurisdictional/legal authority of the South Coast AQMD to impose fees, will not result in achievable and quantifiable emissions reductions and would not result in SIP credit, unavailability of technology needed to earn WAIRE Points, the ability of warehouse operators to control trucks that visit their facilities, and

inadequate opportunity for the public to review the draft Environmental Assessment (EA).

There being no further testimony on this item, the public hearing was closed.

Chairman Benoit asked staff to respond to some of the issues raised by public commenters.

Mr. Nastri stated that the emission reductions achieved or facilitated by PR 2305 are quantifiable, real, permanent and enforceable. He emphasized that NOx and PM emission reductions will be achieved and noted that the proposed rule implements a control measure in the 2016 AQMP. He expressed confidence that the rule would get SIP approval when submitted. He noted that PR 2305/PR 316 were developed through a thorough public process that allowed sufficient time for discussion with all stakeholders.

Barbara Baird, Chief Deputy Counsel, noted that the optional mitigation fee is not a tax because it is voluntary and not compulsory. She cited provisions in the Health and Safety code that authorizes air districts to adopt ISRs and added that the warehouse ISR is not preempted by federal law. There are other ISRs that have already been adopted in California, including a similar rule adopted by the San Joaquin Valley Air Pollution Control District that was upheld by the courts.

In response to the comment that the CEQA document should have been recirculated, Ms. Baird explained that there was no need for the CEQA document to be recirculated because changes made after the draft EA was released did not involve any significant new environmental impacts.

Mr. MacMillan commented that the public health benefits that will occur due to emission reductions would be focused more on the disadvantaged communities located near warehouses and noted for the record that the public hearing documents were made available to the public on May 1, 2021.

Supervisor Perez expressed appreciation to staff and the many different groups and community members for their efforts and working together to come to a compromise and expressed support for PR 2305 and PR 316.

Supervisor Bartlett thanked everyone for their time and participation in the rule development process. She expressed concerns that the proposed rule is complex, will cost jobs, raise consumer prices and do little to improve air quality. She stated that we all want to strive for cleaner air, but does not believe the proposed rule is the best mechanism to get there.

Supervisor Kuehl noted that the rule appropriately focuses on warehouses because they are the source that attracts much of the truck traffic and reiterated her support for the warehouse ISR.

Vice Chair Delgado expressed an understanding of the need to ensure that regulations balance public health without undue impacts to the business sector. She expressed support for the warehouse ISR as it is an important step towards measurable air quality improvements that will save lives in mostly disadvantaged communities of color. However, she committed to monitoring the implementation of the rule for unintended consequences to small businesses and ensure that fees are used as envisioned.

Mayor Pro Tem Cacciotti inquired about the consequences if the South Coast region does not meet the federal air quality standards

Mr. Nastri explained that the proposed rules would fulfill South Coast AQMD's commitment in the 2016 AQMP to adopt a control measure to regulate indirect source emissions from warehouse facilities to help attain air quality standards. Since U.S. EPA approved the 2016 AQMP, the South Coast AQMD is legally obligated under the Clean Air Act to undertake all feasible measures committed to in the AQMP and it can also be enforced through citizen suit. U.S. EPA can take various actions up to and including sanctions, the most significant of which would be the loss of transportation funding. Mr. Nastri added that the warehouse ISR will have a significant impact and help the region to reach attainment.

Mayor Pro Tem Cacciotti inquired about the installation of air filtration systems or the replacement of air filters as a WAIRE menu option.

Ms. Baird stated that it is appropriate to include installation of air filtration systems at sensitive receptor locations in the WAIRE menu of options. The Health and Safety Code gives South Coast AQMD the authority to reduce or mitigate emissions from indirect sources. The installation of air filters will not result in emission reductions, but mitigate emissions and adverse impacts by reducing exposure to emissions. It also provides additional flexibility by including another option that warehouse operators can chose from to earn WAIRE Points, consistent with the design of the rule.

Mayor Pro Tem Cacciotti commented on the moral and social responsibility to respond to the serious health and environmental impacts from diesel-polluting trucks and that companies also have a responsibility to do their part to protect the environment. He stated that the protection of public health and the economy are not mutually exclusive goals.

Mayor Pro Tem Rodriguez expressed support for reducing emissions and improving air quality but opposes PR 2305 as currently written because it will result in substantial operational costs to warehouse owners/operators, increase the cost of goods and services to consumers and drive jobs out of the region. He recommended that staff continue working with the industry to address key concerns related to energy reliability, alternative fuel infrastructure needs and technology considerations prior to imposing a stringent regulation.

Mayor Pro Tem McCallon noted that he voted against the 2016 AQMP because of the ISRs. He emphasized the need to balance clean air and a good economy. The logistics industry is the economic driver of the Inland Empire and the warehouse ISR will cause jobs to leave the area. He explained that while air quality affects public health, the biggest impact on public health is poverty and unemployment. He believes it would have been better to work with the industry through an MOU.

Supervisor Rutherford stated that the problems many of the speakers raised should be addressed by local land use authorities, cities and counties. Improving air quality and the quality of life for residents in disadvantaged communities will not be accomplished through an ISR but could be accomplished by directly cleaning up heavy-duty trucks. Time, technology, the market and CARB rulemaking will move fleets toward cleaner technology. She reiterated her concerns with the cost to implement the rule that will be passed on to consumers.

Dr. Burke commented that people interested in cleaning the environment know that it will have a cost but they are willing to pay for that. He questioned why the installation of indoor air filters at sensitive receptor sites is included as a WAIRE menu option.

Ms. Baird responded that it is a benefit to the warehouse operators in being able to carry out their obligation to reduce the impact of their emissions. The more options that are available on the WAIRE menu makes the rule stronger.

DR. BURKE MOVED TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION FOR PR 2305 AND PR 316 WITH AN AMENDMENT TO REMOVE THE INSTALLATION OF INDOOR AIR FILTERS FROM THE WAIRE MENU OF OPTIONS. MAYOR PRO TEM CACCIOTTI SECONDED THE MOTION.

Supervisor Rutherford opposed removing air filters because AB 617 communities want funding spent on air filters to mitigate emissions.

Chairman Benoit expressed support for the rule with the air filter option because it is an important part of the rule and makes it stronger.

## DR. BURKE WITHDREW HIS MOTION.

Mayor Pro Tem Cacciotti moved, seconded by Richardson, to approve the staff recommendation for PR 2305 and PR 316 with an amendment to modify the Resolution to change the state of technology evaluation from five years to three, and provide contact information to identify who businesses can call if they need assistance.

MOVED BY CACCIOTTI, SECONDED BY RICHARDSON: AGENDA ITEM NO. 27 APPROVED AS RECOMMENDED. ADOPTING RESOLUTION NO. CERTIFYING THE FINAL ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT FOR PROPOSED RULE 2305 - WAREHOUSE INDIRECT SOURCE RULE -WAREHOUSE ACTIONS AND INVESTMENT TO REDUCE EMISSIONS PROGRAM, AND PROPOSED RULE 316 - FEES FOR RULE 2305, ADOPTING RULE 2305 – WAREHOUSE INDIRECT SOURCE RULE - WAREHOUSE ACTIONS AND INVESTMENTS TO REDUCE EMISSIONS PROGRAM, AND RULE 316 -FEES FOR RULE 2305 AND SUBMITTING RULE 2305 - WAREHOUSE INDIRECT SOURCE RULE - WAREHOUSE ACTIONS **REDUCE** AND **INVESTMENTS** TO **EMISSIONS** PROGRAM TO EPA FOR **INCLUSION** IN THE STATE **IMPLEMENTATION** PLAN WITH AN MODIFY RESOLUTION AMENDMENT TO 21-9 AS SET FORTH BELOW BY THE **FOLLOWING VOTE:** 

AYES: Benoit, Burke, Buscaino,

Cacciotti, Delgado, Kuehl, Kracov,

Perez and Richardson

NOES: Bartlett, McCallon, Rodriguez and

Rutherford

ABSENT: None

# **Modify the Resolution as follows:**

**BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED**, that the South Coast AQMD Governing Board does hereby direct the Executive Officer to evaluate the state of technology and the WAIRE Menu every **three five** years from the date of adoption of Proposed Rule 2305 and to report the results and make any recommendations for potential updates to the WAIRE Mitigation Program Menu to the Mobile Source Committee;

**BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED**, that the Executive Officer is hereby directed to conduct outreach to applicable warehouse operators to provide training and guidance on how to comply with PR 2305 with emphasis on warehouse operators that are small businesses, and to establish single points of contact including a hotline for the regulated community;

The list of written comments submitted for Agenda Item 27 can be found in Attachments 1A and 1B to the Minutes.

(Senator Delgado left the meeting at 4:25 p.m.)

-0-

#### This item was taken out of order.

25. Adopt Executive Officer's FY 2021-22 Proposed Goals and Priority Objectives, and Proposed Budget.

Sujata Jain, Chief Financial Officer, gave the staff presentation on Item No. 25.

The public hearing was opened, and the following individuals addressed the Board on Agenda Item 25.

Fernando Gaytan, Earthjustice, commended staff for identifying the development of cleaner advanced technologies as a priority. He expressed optimism at the South Coast AQMD's commitment to develop zero emission heavy-duty trucks and EV infrastructure, and recommended that zero emissions be prioritized over other options. He noted that robust regulations that set zero emission standards for appliances are equally important and incentives for zero emission appliances will become important to address NOx emissions from buildings. He expressed concern about the reduced number of employees allocated to enforcement activities. (Submitted Written Comments)

There being no further testimony on this item, the public hearing was closed.

MOVED BY PEREZ, SECONDED BY BUSCAINO, AGENDA ITEM 25 APPROVED AS SET FORTH BELOW:

- 1) REMOVE FROM RESERVES AND DESIGNATIONS ALL AMOUNTS ASSOCIATED WITH THE FY 2020-21 BUDGET;
- 2) APPROVE TOTAL APPROPRIATIONS OF \$179,883,403;
- 3) APPROVE REVENUES FOR FY 2020-21 OF \$179,883,403;

- 4) APPROVE THE ADDITION OF EIGHT NET AUTHORIZED/FUNDED POSITIONS AS DETAILED IN THE FY 2021-22 BUDGET;
- 5) APPROVE THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER'S FY 2021-22 GOALS AND PRIORITY OBJECTIVES;
- 6) APPROVE A PROJECTED JUNE 30, 2022 FUND BALANCE FOR TOTAL RESERVED AND UNRESERVED DESIGNATIONS OF \$19,429,673 AND TOTAL UNDESIGNATED FUND BALANCE OF \$62,096,338; AND
- 7) INSTRUCT STAFF TO ACTIVELY REVIEW AND ASSESS FISCAL CHANGES AND REPORT MONTHLY TO THE ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE AND BOARD.

## BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

AYES: Bartlett, Benoit, Burke, Buscaino,

Cacciotti, Kuehl, Kracov, McCallon, Perez, Richardson,

Rodriguez, and Rutherford

NOES: None

ABSENT: Delgado

-0-

(Council member Buscaino left the meeting at 4:30 p.m.)

This item was taken out of order.

<u>PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD</u> – (Public Comment on Non-Agenda Items, Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3)

Jeff Malin explained how plastic pollution in the ocean negatively affects the ability of tiny marine phytoplanktons in reducing carbon dioxide from the atmosphere and generating breathable oxygen on earth. He suggested looking into innovative strategies to curb plastic pollution.

Linda Cleveland, Watts Clean Air & Energy Committee/AB 617 South Los Angeles co-lead, expressed the need for additional funding for their communities and requested the boundary be expanded.

# Written Comments Submitted by:

Andy Abele Re: Clean Fuels Program

Robert Benz Re: Rule 1146

# **CONSENT AND BOARD CALENDAR**

- 1. Approve Minutes of April 2, 2021 Board Meeting
- Set Public Hearing June 4, 2021 to Consider Adoption of and/or Amendments to South Coast AQMD Rules and Regulations
  - A. Determine That Proposed Amendments to Rule 1466 Control of Particulate Emissions from Soils with Toxic Air Contaminants, Are Exempt from CEQA, and Amend Rule 1466
  - B. Certification of Nonattainment New Source Review and Clean Fuels for Boilers Compliance Demonstration for 2015 8-hour Ozone Standard
  - C. Determine That 2021 PM10 Maintenance Plan for South Coast Air Basin Is Exempt from CEQA and Approve 2021 PM10 Maintenance Plan for South Coast Air Basin

## Items 3 through 9 - Budget/Fiscal Impact

- Execute Contract for Global Positioning Systems Installation and Monitoring, Amend Awards for Carl Moyer and Community Air Protection Programs and Appropriate Funds for Proposition 1B - Goods Movement Emission Reduction and Lower Emission School Bus Programs
- 4. Amend Contracts to Develop and Demonstrate Zero Emission Drayage Trucks and Add Funds for Administrative Assistance
- Recognize Revenue, Appropriate and Transfer Funds for Air Monitoring Programs, Issue RFQ and Purchase Orders for Air Monitoring Equipment and One Vehicle, and Execute Contract

- 6. Execute Contract to Upgrade Real-time Public Alerts of Hydrogen Sulfide Events in Coachella Valley
- 7. Establish Lists of Prequalified Counsel to Represent and Advise South Coast AQMD on Legal Matters Related to Environmental Law and General Matters
- 8. Authorize Purchase of OnBase Software Support
- 9. Approve Award Modification as Approved by MSRC

# <u>Items 10 through 15 – Information Only/Receive and File</u>

- 10. Legislative, Public Affairs and Media Report
- 11. Hearing Board Report
- 12. Civil Filings and Civil Penalties Report
- 13. Lead Agency Projects and Environmental Documents Received
- 14. Rule and Control Measure Forecast
- 15. Status Report on Major Ongoing and Upcoming Projects for Information Management

## Item 16 - Staff Presentation/Board Discussion

16. Budget and Economic Outlook Update (Presentation in Lieu of Board Letter)

PRESENTATION ONLY; NO ACTION REQUIRED

## Items 17 through 23 - Reports for Committees and CARB

- 17. Administrative Committee
- 18. Legislative Committee
- 19. Mobile Source Committee

- 20. Stationary Source Committee
- 21. Technology Committee
- Mobile Source Air Pollution Reduction Review Committee
- 23. California Air Resources Board Monthly Report
- 24. <u>Items Deferred from Consent and Board Calendar</u>

Board Member Kracov noted that he has no financial interests in Item No. 4 but is required to identify for the record that he is a Board Member of CARB, which is involved in this item.

MOVED BY CACCIOTTI, SECONDED BY KUEHL, AGENDA ITEMS 1 THROUGH 15 AND 17 23 **APPROVED** THROUGH AS RECOMMENDED, TO RECEIVE AND FILE COMMITTEE. MSRC AND REPORTS, AND APPROVE THE LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE'S RECOMMENDATIONS LEGISLATION AS SET FORTH BELOW, BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

AYES: Bartlett, Benoit, Burke, Cacciotti,

Kuehl, Kracov, McCallon, Perez, Richardson, Rodriguez, and

Rutherford

NOES: None

ABSENT: Buscaino and Delgado

#### **LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATIONS**

## Agenda Item Recommendation

AB 365 (O'Donnell) Sales and use taxes: exclusion: zeroemission and near-zero-emission drayage trucks Support

AB 762 (Lee) Hazardous emissions and substances: school sites: private and charter schools

Support

AB 1001 (C. Garcia) Environmental

permitting and air pollution

Work With Author

SB 596 (Becker) Environmental permitting and air pollution

Oppose Unless Amended

HR 848 (Thompson) Growing Renewable Energy and Efficiency Now (GREEN) Act of 2021 Work With Author

HR 1512 (Pallone, Tonko, Rush) Climate Leadership and Environmental Action for our Nation's (CLEAN) Work With Author

Future Act

.....

-0-

# **PUBLIC HEARING**

 Determine That Proposed Amendments to Rule 1469.1 – Spraying Operations Using Coatings Containing Chromium, Are Exempt from CEQA, and Amend Rule 1469.1

Chairman Benoit recommended that the public hearing on this item be continued to the June 4, 2021 Board meeting.

MOVED BY KUEHL, SECONDED BY BENOIT, TO CONTINUE AGENDA ITEM 26 TO THE JUNE 4, 2021 BOARD MEETING, BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

AYES: Bartlett, Benoit, Burke, Cacciotti,

Kuehl, Kracov, McCallon, Perez, Richardson, Rodriguez, and

Rutherford

NOES: None

ABSENT: Buscaino and Delgado

-0-

# **CLOSED SESSION**

There was no closed session.

## **ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned by Chairman Benoit at 4:35 p.m.

The foregoing is a true statement of the proceedings held by the South Coast Air Quality Management District Board on May 7, 2021.

Respectfully Submitted,

Faye Thomas Clerk of the Boards

Date Minutes Approved:

\_\_\_\_\_\_

Ben Benoit, Chairman

Attachments: 1A and 1B

#### **ACRONYMS**

AQMP = Air Quality Management Plan

CARB = California Air Resources Board

CEQA = California Environmental Quality Act

FY = Fiscal Year

ISR = Indirect Source Rule

MOU = Memorandum of Understanding

MSRC = Mobile Source (Air Pollution Reduction) Review Committee

NOx = Oxides of Nitrogen

PM = Particulate Matter

RFP = Request for Proposals

U.S. EPA = United States Environmental Protection Agency

VOC = Volatile Organic Compound

WAIRE = Warehouse Actions and Investments to Reduce Emissions

# ATTACHMENT 1A TO THE MINUTES – MAY 7, 2021 GOVERNING BOARD MEETING: WRITTEN COMMENTS SUBMITTED FOR PR 2305 AND PR 316

Michael Nguyen Bryan Bradford, Resident of Riverside

Vilma E Letosky David Nester, Exemplis, LLC

Verzhine Uzunyan Timur Tecimer, Overton Moore Properties

Louisa Marie Henry Anita Smith

Fred Sabine Erika Kauzalarich-Bird

Diane Sydell Mark Ahlers, Paige Electric Co. L.P.

Tony Wang, Southland Industries Bob Niedbalski, Paige Electric Co. L.P.

Jack MacDonald, Matco-Norca Mason Controls

Charlie Williams, Matco-Norca David A. Cummins, Cummins Logistics

Rudy Vasquez, Swat Fame, Inc. Ryan Howard, HD Supply, Inc.

Travis Fletcher, Envise Ryan Ole Hass Wayne Ulanski, SVF Flow Controls Gregg Pawlik

Michael Bonino, Three Way Logistics, Inc. Jordan Kort

Wendy McCain, Performance Machine

accounting@xovision.com Melinda Andrade

Dallas Roster, Silver Spur Corporation Averil Edwards, United Airlines

Bob Khalsa Randall J. Steward, Quidel

Elizabeth de Carteret Sadaf Foods

Mayor Jon E. Peat, City of Cypress Clare Bachman, Breathe Southern California

Pat Donohoe, Bay Cities

Tom Simmons Amy Vasquez

Lucy Dunn Daniel Curtin, Progressive Converting, Inc.

Austin Ra Jim Jennison, DCG Fulfillment

Stephan Schwarzl Shirley Price

Nancy Starczyk David Lanzer, Rexford Industrial Realty, LP

Dan Hoffman, Wilmington Chamber John Pourmoradi, Great Buy Products

Ruth Drizen-Dohs Tracy Hernandez, Biz Fed
Tim Chicoine, Minka Group Donna Duperron, Biz Fed
Joseph Medlin, Dart International David Fleming, Biz Fed

Stanley Greschner, GRID Alternatives

Rebecca J. Walsh, Ventura Foods, LLC

Robert Taylor

Nicolette Rohr, Resident of Riverside

Arrel itt Besident of Riverside

Amy Litt, Resident of Riverside Robert Evans

Brissa Sotelo Catherine

Joanne McClaskey Jennifer Rodriguez, Los Angeles resident

Pat Anderson Lisa Beebe, Studio City resident

Douglas Williams Mike Wodkowski, Los Angeles resident

Gene Zarillo Emiliana Dore, Los Angeles resident

Danny De La Mora Mr. Dency L. Nelson, Hermosa Beach resident

Corporate Green Erica Silverman, Los Angeles resident
Long John Laura Shady, North Hollywood resident
Ann Dorsey Jessica Eason, Los Angeles resident
Sig Fried Sarah Eggers, Pasadena resident

Yassamin Kavezade Saba Harouni Lurie, Los Angeles resident

Ben Dijo Alice DuBois, Los Angeles resident

Jeffrey Clarke, NGVAmerica Vincent V, Commerce resident

Timothy A. Pohle, Airlines for America Robert Hufnagel, Rancho Cucamonga resident

Manny Vivanco, The Kroger Co.

Barry Pressman, PureTek Corp.

Gary Clevenger, Oxnard resident
Alberto Mendiola, Fontana resident

Jennifer Mandel, Los Angeles resident Bob Smith, Glendale resident

Allyson Lambert, Los Angeles resident

Bryn Lindblad, Los Angeles resident

Elise Kalfayan, Glendale resident

Amelie Cherlin, Los Angeles resident

Emily Falappino, Temecula resident

Moriah Radin, Los Angeles resident

Joshua Bowe, El Segundo resident Sharon Greenspan, Sherman Oaks resident

Dennis Orr, Apple Valley resident Valerie Hurt

Tara Platt, Hollywood resident Caitlin Brady, Burbank resident

Judith Glass, Ph.D., Studio City resident

Cord Thomas, Westchester resident

Bob Schroeder, WSI Supply Chain Solutions

Parris Hare, Moreno Valley resident Scott Kelrick, AL2 LLC
Barbara Delgleize, Huntington Beach resident Rachael Mason

Rebecca Hall, Costa Mesa resident

Dave Stefanides, Laguna Hills resident

Vikki Cavalletto, Santa Barbara resident

Tamsin Rawady

Linda Torn, Los Angeles resident

Alan Bell

Alyssa D. Bell, Los Angeles resident

Katie Covell

Kathleen Duffy, La Canada Flintridge resident

Katy Norris

Leah Pressman, Culver City resident Elisabeth Kiernan Averick

Doug Bender, Torrance resident Sarah Bassak

Polly Estabrook, Los Angeles resident Grace Medrano, South Gate resident

Jessica Tardieu Haines, Glendale resident

Vicki Friesen, South Pasadena resident

Grayson Hanson, Los Angeles resident

Michael MacDonald, Los Angeles resident

Jonathan Ekno

Barbara Thomas

Heidi L. Gallegos

Indivisible Ventura, Board of Directors

Laura Payne, Los Angeles resident

Mindy Do

Carolyn Cavecche, Orange resident

Daniel Carpenter-Gold, Long Beach resident

Jibiana Jakpor,

Luis Cetina

Sheri Alto

Tanya Veluz, Altadena resident

Valerie Stidean, San Bernardino resident

Jesse Sanford, Los Angeles resident

Leslie Warren, Camarillo resident

Linda Warren, Camarillo resident

Kevin Henning, Victorville resident

Ramona Natividad, Riverside resident

Olivia Ramirez, Glendale resident

Saba Harouni Lurie

Katherine Steck, Glendale resident

Joline Sattarelle, Los Angeles resident

Alain V. Berrebi, Los Angeles resident

Armando D. Guerra

Dawn Pia

Erin Snyder, Riverside resident

Steve Grushen

Kathleen Phillips, Riverside resident

Alana Langdon, Nikola Corporation

Jimmy O'Dea, Ph.D., Union of Concerned

Scientists

James M. Casso, Casso & Sparks, LLP, representing City of Industry

Sam Wade, Coalition for Renewable Natural Gas

Adrian Martinez, Earthjustice, GIS images

David Hawkins, Natural Resources Defense Council

Rita Elizabeth Tayenaka

Mallory Cremin

Jim Gilmore

Mike Royce, Los Angeles resident

John Luly

Robotics Robothomies, Moreno Valley resident

Luana Barajas, Filmore resident

Rachel Kelley, Los Angeles resident

Patrick Ellis, Murrieta resident

Jiyoung Carolyn Park, Los Angeles resident

Cora Went, Encino resident Koren Bell. Malibu resident

**Emily Shesh** 

Jamie Roe Graham

Linda Lehnkering, Anaheim resident

Jason Gardea-Stinnett, Commerce resident

Abby Austin, Los Angeles resident

Timothy Jemal, NAIOP SoCal

Robert Evans, NAIOP Inland Empire

Nikki, Los Angeles resident

Amir Levi, Los Angeles resident

Don Dwiggins, Northridge resident

Marianna Tekosky, Los Angeles resident

Brett, Los Angeles resident

Ann Bermingham, Santa Barbara resident

Mike Royce

Robert Swanson, State of California Dept of Justice

Joanna Bowe, El Segundo resident

**Environmental Justice Advisory Group** 

Jessica Craven, NELA Climate Collective

Sari Fordham, 350 Riverside

Chris Lovekin, 350 Riverside

Carolina Forni, NELA Climate Collective

Gabriela Mendez, Center for Community Action and Environmental Justice

Tiffany Sanchez, East Yard Communities for Environmental Justice

Kathy Hoang, Partnership for Working Families

Andrea Vidaurre, People's Collective for Environmental Justice

Anthony Victoria, People's Collective for Environmental Justice

Cheryl Auger, Pasadena resident

Keri Then, Moreno Valley resident

Silvia Betancourt, Long Beach Alliance for Children with Asthma

Jeremy Santos, Fullerton resident/Cal Poly Pomona student

Donatella Galella, Riverside resident/UC Riverside Professor

Justin Lowery, Murieta resident

Gustavo Hurtado, Rainbow Pride Youth Alliance and Perris resident

Dr. Karen Jakpor, American Lung Association

Florence Gharibian, Del Amo Action Committee

Kareem Gongora, County of San Bernardino Planning Commissioner

Chris Chavez, Coalition for Clean Air

William Zobel, California Hydrogen Business Council

Marc Carrel, BREATHE Southern Calfornia

Tom Swenson, Cummings Inc.

Todd Campbell, Clean Energy

Bill LaMarr, Southern California Business Alliance

Roberto C. Arnold, Multicultural Business Alliance

Cindy Roth, Greater Riverside Chambers of Commerce

Richard W. Corey, California Air Resources Board

Mark Linville, 1-800-Pack-Rat, LLC; Zippy Shell, Inc.

Michael Tunnell, American Trucking Associations

Joanne Winteler-McClaskey, City of Industry resident

Catherine "Kitty" Christensen, Riverside County Resident

Ron Herrera, International Brotherhood of Teamsters

Susan St Louis, Courageous Resistance of the Desert

Andrea Antony-Morr, Resident of Long Beach

Devon Bhakta, Resident of Los Angeles and Laguna Niguel

Adam Holt, Association of California Recycling Industries

Stuart Waldman, The Valley Industry and Commerce Association

Joel Barton, International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers

Carolyn Cavecche, Orange County Taxpayers Association

The South Coast AQMD Youth Leaders Advisory Council

Michael Colvin and Timothy O'Connor, Environmental Defense Fund

Manuel A. Mancha, City of Moreno Valley Community Development Department

Allyssa J. Holcomb, Garrett Stiepel Ryder, LLP, on behalf of Warland Investments Company

Ellen M. Peter, California Air Resources Board; Enclosure: May 6, 2021 letter from

the Attorney General's Office

- Letter Submitted by Earthjustice, with World Logistics Center Settlement Agreement
- Letter Submitted by Redondo Beach Chamber of Commerce on behalf of: Garden Grove Chamber of Commerce and South Bay Association of Chambers of Commerce
- Letter submitted by: Partnership for Working Families on behalf of: Los Angeles Alliance for a New Economy; Orange County Communities Organized for Responsible Development and Warehouse Workers Resource Center
- Letter Submitted by the California Legislature on behalf of: Eloise Gomez Reyes, 47<sup>th</sup> Assembly
   District; Anthony Rendon, 63<sup>rd</sup> Assembly District; Cristina Garcia, 58<sup>th</sup> Assembly District; Phil Ting,
   19<sup>th</sup> Assembly District; Luz Rivas, 39<sup>th</sup> Assembly District; Mike A. Gipson, 64<sup>th</sup> Assembly District;
   Wendy Carrillo, 51<sup>st</sup> Assembly District; Eduardo Garcia, 56<sup>th</sup> Assembly District; Laura Friedman, 43<sup>rd</sup>
   Assembly District; Monique Limon, 19<sup>th</sup> Senate District; Chris Holden, 41<sup>st</sup> Assembly District; Lena
   Gonzalez, 33<sup>rd</sup> Senate District; Ed Chau, 49<sup>th</sup> Assembly District; Connie Leyva, 20<sup>th</sup> Senate District;
   Josh Newman, 29<sup>th</sup> Senate District; Scott Weiner, 11<sup>th</sup> Senate District; Ben Allen, 26<sup>th</sup> Senate
   District; Dave Min, 37<sup>th</sup> Senate District; Adrin Nazarian, 46<sup>th</sup> Assembly District and Miguel Santiago,
   53<sup>rd</sup> Assembly District
- Letter Submitted by Earthjustice on behalf of: 350 Riverside; Environmental Justice Committee and Asian Pacific Policy & Planning Council; California League of Conservation Voters; Center for Community Action & Environmental Justice; Coalition for a Safe Environment; East Yard Communities for Environmental Justice; Long Beach Alliance for Children with Asthma; Los Angeles County Electric Truck & Bus Coalition; Natural Resources Defense Council; People's Collective for Environmental Justice; Robert Redford Conservancy for Southern California Sustainability, Pitzer College; San Pedro & Peninsula Homeowners Coalition; Sierra Club; Stop Fracking Long Beach; Union of Concerned Scientists and Warehouse Worker Resource Center
- Letter Submitted by Biz Fed on behalf of: American Trucking Associations, Association of California
  Recycling Industries, Auto Care Association, Building Owners and Managers Association, California
  Beer and Beverage Distributors, California Building Industry Association, California Business
  Properties Association, California Business Round Table, California Distributors Association,
  California Fuels and Convenience Alliance, California Manufactures & Technology Association,
  California Retailers Association, California Small Business Alliance, California Taxpayers
  Association, California Trucking Association, Carson Dominguez Employers Alliance, CAWA –

Representing the Automotive Parts Industry, Chemical Industry Council of California, Construction Industry Air Quality Coalition, El Segundo Chamber of Commerce, Engineering Contractors' Association, Foreign Trade Association of Southern California, Greater Ontario Business Council, Harbor Trucking Association, Inland Empire Economic Partnership, International Bottled Water Association, Long Beach Area Chamber of Commerce, Los Angeles Area Chamber of Commerce, Los Angeles County Business Federation, Majestic Realty, NAIOP Inland Empire, NAIOP SoCal, National Retail Federation, Orange County Business Council, Pacific Merchant Shipping Association, Pacific Mountain Logistics, LLC, PactivEvergreen, Quik Pick Express, LLC, San Gabriel Valley Economic Partnership, Southern California Leadership Council, The Toy Association, Valley Industry and Commerce Association, Watson Land Company, Western Aerosol Information Bureau, Western Independent Refiners Association

Letter Submitted by Snell & Wilmer, LLP on behalf of NAIOP, Re: Public Records Act Request

# ATTACHMENT 1B TO THE MINUTES – MAY 7, 2021 GOVERNING BOARD MEETING: WRITTEN COMMENTS SUBMITTED FOR PR 2305 AND PR 316

(These comments were received after the May 7, 2021 meeting.)

Michaela Boyce, Orange resident

Greg Tippin, Irvine resident

Elizabeth Delay, Mission Viejo resident

Lime V

John Davis, San Francisco resident

Fabio Conti, Menifee resident

John Weigel, Baldwin Park resident

Katie Grodd, Los Angeles resident

Joan Kover, Menifee resident

Derek Hansen, Santa Barbara resident

Robert Matthews, San Bernardino resident

Michael Bourgeois, Thousand Oaks resident

Debi Cagle, Ontario resident

Allison Duran, Banning resident

Precious Mackey, San Bernardinto resident

Rosie Armijo, Victorville resident

George Miller, Hemet resident

Lonni Mullins, San Jacinto resident

Muhammad Bhatti, Chino Hills resident

Christopher Shaw, Moreno Valley resident

Derrick Pulce, Barstow resident

Dave Lamb, Upland resident

Cesar Vazquez, Rancho Cucamonga resident

Dale Annderson, Murrieta resident

Tamara King, Redlands resident

Michael Lopez, Wildomar resident

Mark Fugate, Nipomo resident

Robert Mock, Lake Arrowhead resident

Terri Galdo, Rancho Cucamonga resident

Marlo Snelbaker, Rancho Cucamonga resident

Sondra Tumlin, Menifee resident

Danuelle Wilson, Colton resident

Mr. Jayden, Corona resident

Tim Walborn, Arrowhed Farm resident

Clinton Mcclurkin, Hemet resident

Christopher Shaw, Moreno Valley resident

Joyce Myers, Corona resident

Daniel Eide, Phelan resident

Andrea Adame, San Bernardino resident

Pamela Dailey, Riverside resident

B. Maxson, Arrowhed Farm resident

Peggi Hazlet, Ontario resident

Paul Rams, Banning resident

Nancy Nichols, San Bernardino resident

Sick Off, Victorville resident

John Luly, Loma Linda resident

Timothy Roberts, San Clemente resident

Emily Smiles, Los Angeles resident

Debra Cooper, Temecula resident

Tom Nightingale, Rancho Cucamonga resident

Oscar Valdepena, Moreno Valley resident

George Gray, Fontana resident

Kristin Hansen, Cherry Valley resident

Zeb Welborn, Chino resident