

**DRAFT MAY 31, 2022 SCIENTIFIC, TECHNICAL & MODELING PEER
REVIEW MEETING MINUTES**

(To be submitted to the South Coast AQMD Governing Board Mobile Source Committee)

COMITTEE MEETING DATE: October 21, 2022

AGENDA NO.

REPORT: Scientific, Technical & Modeling Peer Review Meeting Minutes

SYNOPSIS: The Scientific, Technical & Modeling Peer Review Advisory Group held a remote meeting on Tuesday, May 31, 2022. The following is a summary of the meeting.

RECOMMENDED ACTION:
Receive and file.

SLR:IM:IES:CN:WS

Advisory Group Members

Present: Jeremy Avise, Chief of Modeling & Meteorology, CARB
John Cho, Southern California Association of Governments
Ken Davidson, USEPA Region IX
Peter Evangelakis, Vice President, REMI, Inc.
Gloria González-Rivera, University of California, Riverside
Ralph Morris, Principal, Ramboll
Anthony Oliver, Senior Economist, CARB

Absent: Greg Osterman, Jet Propulsion Laboratory/NASA
Robert Kleinhenz, Kleinhenz Economics
Gabriele Pfister, National Center for Atmospheric Research
Fred Lurmann, Sonoma Technology Inc.
Rynda Kay, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region 9
Alex Gunther, University of California, Irvine
Pablo Saide, University of California, Los Angeles
Kelly Barsanti, University of California, Riverside

For additional details of the Scientific, Technical & Modeling Peer Review Meeting, please refer to the Webcast at: [Webcast](#)

AGENDA ITEM:

1. Preliminary Costs of the 2022 AQMP – South Coast AQMD Measures

Brian Vlasich, Air Quality Specialist/Planning Rule Development and Implementation, provided a summary on the preliminary costs of the Draft 2022 AQMP control measures.

Harvey Eder, Public Solar Power Coalition, requested that the 2022 AQMP residential control measures address cooling and solar renewables in the cost-effectiveness and public health benefits analyses. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 17:09.

2. 2022 State Strategy for the State Implementation Plan: Economic Analysis Approach

Dr. Jie Zhou, Office of Economic and Policy Analysis Section, California Air Resources Board (CARB), presented a summary of CARB’s economic impact analysis approach for the State Implementation Plan (SIP) and next steps for the publication and outreach for the next draft of the SIP.

Mr. Eder expressed concerns regarding renewable natural gas and support for solar power. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning 38:10.

3. Preliminary Public Health Benefits Associated with the 2022 AQMP Implementation

Henry Roman and William Raich, Industrial Economics, Inc. (IEc), presented a summary of the preliminary public health impacts of the Draft 2022 AQMP.

Dr. Ken Davidson, United States Environmental Protection Agency (USEPA), inquired whether there were any additional health endpoints considered with California or South Coast specific baseline data. Mr. Roman responded that his team has been looking for local health endpoint data where possible and that county level data was obtained from the USEPA Environmental Benefits Mapping and Analysis Program (BenMAP), and data obtained from the California Department of Health Care Access and Information (HCAI) are more refined and current than BenMAP. Dr. Elaine Shen, Planning and Rules Manager/Planning, Rule Development and Implementation, also responded that the analysis also utilizes data from the California Department of Finance data to project future mortality rates stratified by age group, gender, and other demographic units. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning 1:20:32.

Dr. James Enstrom, Scientific Integrity Institute, expressed concern that the results presented by IEc misrepresent the public health impacts from ozone and particulate matter (PM) exposures in the South Coast region. Dr. Enstrom commented that the

measured personal individual exposures in the South Coast region are far below the reported monitor levels and national ambient air quality standards (NAAQS) for ozone and PM, and asked that IEc staff consider two scientific articles Dr. Enstrom published finding the lack of mortality effects of PM_{2.5}. Dr. Enstrom expressed desire to engage with South Coast AQMD staff to further discuss health impacts. Staff welcomed discussions with Dr. Enstrom. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning 1:29:41.

Mr. Mark Abramowitz, Community Environmental Services, commented on the importance to include the most conservative data to prevent the underestimation of air adverse quality impacts on public health and to weigh studies with differing conclusions appropriately when conducting health impact analyses. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning 1:37:35.

Dr. Stan Young, former statistician at a pharmaceutical company, commented that ozone does not pose health risks based on multiple sources and that CARB data sets used for ozone health impact analyses be publicly available. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning 1:42:38.

OTHER MATTERS:

4. Other Business

Ian MacMillan, Assistant Deputy Executive Officer/Planning/Rule Development & Implementation, presented on the proposed cost-effectiveness approach in the Draft 2022 AQMP for the South Coast AQMD Control Measure Implementation.

Mr. Abramowitz expressed concern with increasing cost-effectiveness thresholds based on cost of living, given that the South Coast AQMD has not identified ways to achieve standards under the cost-effectiveness thresholds and requested that staff not prioritize more costly stationary source measures over less costly mobile source measures. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning 1:50:41.

5. Public Comment on Non-Agenda Items

None.

6. Next Meeting Date

TBD

Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 11:55 a.m.

Attachments