



South Coast Air Quality Management District

21865 Copley Drive, Diamond Bar, CA 91765-4178
(909) 396-2000 • www.aqmd.gov

SENT VIA E-MAIL AND USPS:

November 19, 2019

Juliad@moval.org

Julia Descoteaux, Associate Planner
City of Moreno Valley, Community Development Department
14177 Frederick Street
Moreno Valley, CA 92553

Draft Environmental Impact Report (Draft EIR) for the Proposed Kaiser Permanente Moreno Valley Medical Center (SCH No.: 2018111051)

South Coast Air Quality Management District (South Coast AQMD) staff appreciates the opportunity to comment on the above-mentioned document. The following comments are meant as guidance for the Lead Agency and should be incorporated into the Final EIR.

South Coast AQMD Staff's Summary of Project Description

The Lead Agency proposes to redevelop and expand an existing 219,500-square-foot medical center, which would include the demolition of 147,200 square feet of existing medical buildings and construction of 1,113,000 square feet of new medical service facilities with 460 hospital beds and 2,550 parking spaces on 30 acres (Proposed Project). The Proposed Project is located at 27300 Iris Avenue on the northwest corner of Iris Avenue and Oliver Street within the City of Moreno Valley. The Proposed Project would be constructed in three phases (Phase I, II, and III) over an 18-year construction period from 2020 through 2038¹. Throughout the 18-year construction period, a total of 8,668 heavy-duty, diesel fueled one-way haul truck trips are estimated to occur; the highest amount of one-way haul truck trips would occur during Phases II and III, Grading (1,300 one-way haul trips) and Phase III, Demolition (2,000 one-way haul trips)². The Proposed Project will become operational as early as 2023³. Although the Proposed Project involves three phases of development, air quality impacts from Phase I are evaluated at a project level, and air quality impacts from Phases II and III are analyzed at a programmatic level in the Draft EIR.

The Lead Agency has incorporated Project Design Features for Air Quality (PDF-AQ), PDFs-AQ-1 and -2, and Energy and Greenhouse Gas Emissions (PDF-GHG), PDF-GHG-1, into the Proposed Project. Together these PDFs require that the Proposed Project use off-road construction equipment with Tier 4 Final or newer engines, use off-road vehicles with the newest, low-emission diesel powered engines or use retrofit devices, and incorporate technology that will reduce the Proposed Project's energy demand, such as solar power, among others⁴.

South Coast AQMD Staff's Summary of the Air Quality Analysis

In the Air Quality Analysis, the Lead Agency quantified the Proposed Project's construction and operational emissions from Phase I development and compared those emissions to South Coast AQMD's recommended regional and localized air quality CEQA significance thresholds. Based on the analysis, the Lead Agency found that regional and localized air quality impacts from construction of Phase I development would be less than significant and no mitigation is required⁵.

¹ Draft EIR. Executive Summary. Page ES-5; Section 4.2 Air Quality. Page 4.2-25 through 4.2-37.

² *Ibid.* Section 4.5 Energy. Page 4.5-17 through 4.5-18.

³ *Ibid.* Appendix B: Air Quality, Greenhouse Gas and Energy Data. CalEEMod Output, Winter Run. PDF page 100.

⁴ Draft EIR. Executive Summary. Page ES-7 through ES-9.

⁵ *Ibid.* Section 4.2 Air Quality. Page 4.2-24 through 4.2-29.

Despite the unavailability of project-specific information for Phases II and III developments such as a construction schedule⁶, the Lead Agency used a good-faith effort and quantified their construction and operational emissions. Based on the analyses, the Lead Agency found that construction of Phases II and III developments would not result in significant regional and localized air quality impacts. For the Proposed Project's operational air quality impacts, the Lead Agency found that NOx emissions from the combined operation of Phases I and II developments, and Phases I through III developments would be significant, primarily contributed by mobile sources, at 69 pounds per day (lbs/day) and 117 lbs/day, respectively, when compared to South Coast AQMD's CEQA air quality significance threshold of NOx from operation, at 55 lbs/day⁷. However, the Lead Agency found that there are no feasible mitigation measures to reduce operational NOx emissions to less than significant; therefore, the Proposed Project's operational air quality impacts would remain significant and unavoidable⁸.

South Coast AQMD's 2016 Air Quality Management Plan

On March 3, 2017, South Coast AQMD's Governing Board adopted the 2016 AQMP⁹, which was later approved by the California Air Resources Board (CARB) on March 23, 2017. Built upon the progress in implementing the 2007 and 2012 AQMPs, the 2016 AQMP provides a regional perspective on air quality and the challenges facing the South Coast Air Basin. The most significant air quality challenge in the Basin is to achieve an additional 45 percent reduction in nitrogen oxide (NOx) emissions in 2023 and an additional 55 percent NOx reduction beyond 2031 levels for ozone attainment.

South Coast AQMD Staff's General Comments

Upon a review of the Air Quality Analysis, South Coast AQMD staff found that the Lead Agency did not analyze a scenario where construction activities overlap with operational activities (e.g., some components of Phases I and/or Phase II development may be operational while some components of Phases II and/or Phase III development are under construction). This may have led to an underestimation of the Proposed Project's air quality impacts, especially NOx emissions from the overlapping passenger vehicle trips visiting the operational portions of the Proposed Project as on-road haul trucks travel to and from portions of the Proposed Project that are still under construction. Please see the attachment for more information

As described in the 2016 AQMP, achieving NOx emissions reductions in a timely manner is critical to attaining the National Ambient Air Quality Standard (NAAQS) for ozone before the 2023 and 2031 deadlines. South Coast AQMD is committed to attaining the ozone NAAQS as expeditiously as practicable. The Proposed Project plays an important role in contributing to additional NOx emissions during the 18-year construction period when construction activities of Phases II and/or III developments will overlap with operational activities of Phases I and/or II developments. Therefore, South Coast AQMD staff recommends that the Lead Agency include an additional construction mitigation measure to reduce the Proposed Project's NOx emissions during overlapping development phases. Please see the attachment for more information.

Conclusion

Pursuant to California Public Resources Code Section 21092.5(a) and CEQA Guidelines Section 15088(b), South Coast AQMD staff requests that the Lead Agency provide South Coast AQMD staff with written responses to all comments contained herein prior to the certification of the Final EIR. In addition, issues raised in the comments should be addressed in detail giving reasons why specific comments and suggestions are not accepted. There should be good faith, reasoned analysis in response. Conclusory

⁶ *Ibid.* Page 4.2-30; 4.2-34.

⁷ *Ibid.* Page 4.2-40 through 4.2-41.

⁸ *Ibid.* Page 4.2-50.

⁹ South Coast AQMD. March 3, 2017. 2016 Air Quality Management Plan. Accessed at: <http://www.aqmd.gov/home/library/clean-air-plans/air-quality-mgt-plan>.

statements unsupported by factual information will not suffice (CEQA Guidelines Section 15088(c)). Conclusory statements do not facilitate the purpose and goal of CEQA on public disclosure and are not meaningful, informative, or useful to decision makers and to the public who are interested in the Proposed Project. Further, when the Lead Agency makes the finding that the recommended mitigation measure is not feasible, the Lead Agency should describe the specific reasons for rejecting it in the Final EIR (CEQA Guidelines Section 15091).

South Coast AQMD staff is available to work with the Lead Agency to address any air quality questions that may arise from this comment letter. Please contact Alina Mullins, Assistant Air Quality Specialist, at amullins@aqmd.gov or (909) 396-2402, should you have any questions.

Sincerely,

Lijin Sun

Lijin Sun, J.D.

Program Supervisor, CEQA IGR

Planning, Rule Development & Area Sources

Attachment
LS:AM
RVC191015-05
Control Number

ATTACHMENT

Air Quality Impact Analysis – Overlapping Construction and Operational Activities

1. Based on a review of the Air Quality Analysis, South Coast AQMD staff found that the Lead Agency did not consider nor analyze a scenario where construction activities overlap with operational activities (e.g., daily passenger vehicle trips during the operation of Phases I and/or Phase II developments may occur simultaneously while Phases II and III, Grading, with 1,300 one-way haul truck trips and Phase III, Demolition, with 2,000 one-way haul truck trips are also occurring). Since implementation of the Proposed Project is expected to occur in phases over a multi-year timeframe of 18 years from 2020 to 2038¹⁰, it is reasonably foreseeable that construction and operation of various development components may overlap, unless the Lead Agency includes requirement(s) that will prohibit overlapping construction and operational activities. If an overlapping construction and operation scenario is reasonably foreseeable, to conservatively analyze a worst-case impact scenario, South Coast AQMD staff recommends that the Lead Agency use its best efforts to identify the overlapping construction and operational years and development components, combine construction emissions (including emissions from demolition) with operational emissions, and compare the combined emissions to South Coast AQMD's air quality CEQA *operational* thresholds of significance to determine the level of significance in the Final EIR.

Recommended Additional Mitigation Measure

2. As stated above, the Proposed Project would require a total of 8,668 heavy-duty, diesel fueled one-way haul truck trips during the 18-year construction period¹¹. To further reduce construction emissions, particularly from NOx, South Coast AQMD staff recommends the following mitigation measure as a suggested resource and guidance that the Lead Agency should review for incorporation in the Final EIR. The recommended mitigation measure would also reduce NOx emissions from the heavy-duty, diesel fueled on-road haul trucks during the overlapping construction and operational activities (see Comment No.1) and facilitate the achievement of attainment goals and timelines outlined in the 2016 AQMP. For more information on potential mitigation measures as guidance to the Lead Agency, please visit South Coast AQMD's CEQA Air Quality Handbook website¹².
 - a) Require the use of zero-emission (ZE) or near-zero emission (NZE) on-road haul trucks (e.g., material delivery trucks and soil import/export) during construction such as heavy-duty trucks with natural gas engines that meet the CARB's adopted optional NOx emission standard at 0.02 grams per brake horsepower-hour (g/bhp-hr). When requiring ZE or NZE on-road haul trucks, the Lead Agency should include analyses to evaluate and identify sufficient power and supportive infrastructure available for ZE/NZE trucks in the Energy and Utilities and Service Systems Sections of the Final EIR, where appropriate.

CARB also adopted the statewide Truck and Bus Regulation in 2010. The Regulation requires diesel trucks and buses that operate in California to be upgraded to reduce emissions. Newer heavier trucks and buses must meet particulate matter filter requirements beginning January 1, 2012. Lighter and older heavier trucks must be replaced starting January 1, 2015. By January 1, 2023, nearly all trucks and buses will need to have 2010 model year engines or equivalent¹³. Since the construction schedule of the Proposed Project extends beyond 2023 for 18 years, 2010 model year trucks will be required for the Proposed Project and should become more widely available commercially. Therefore, South Coast AQMD staff recommends that the Lead Agency implement the Truck and Bus Regulation early and require, at a minimum, that

¹⁰ Draft EIR. Executive Summary. Page ES-5; Section 4.2 Air Quality. Page 4.2-25 through 4.2-37.

¹¹ *Ibid.* Section 4.5 Energy. Page 4.5-17 through 4.5-18.

¹² South Coast AQMD. Accessed at: <http://www.aqmd.gov/home/regulations/ceqa/air-quality-analysis-handbook>.

¹³ California Air Resources Board. December 20, 2018. <https://www.arb.ca.gov/msprog/onrdiesel/onrdiesel.htm>.

construction vendors, contractors, and/or haul truck operators commit to using 2010 model year or newer engines, or establish a vendor(s)/contractor(s) selection policy that prefers vendor(s)/contractor(s) who can supply 2010 model year trucks, and include the requirement in the Proposed Project's Construction Management Plan. The Lead Agency's commitment to early implementation of the Truck and Bus Regulation at the Proposed Project helps facilitate the Proposed Project's transition to 2010 model year trucks in 2023, provides time and opportunities to address and resolve any implementation challenges ahead of 2023, eases the costs and burden of regulatory compliance over a period of time, and yields emission reductions from fleets earlier than 2023.

To monitor and ensure ZE, NZE, or 2010 model year trucks are used at the Proposed Project, the Lead Agency should require that operators maintain records of all trucks associated with the Proposed Project's construction and make these records available to the Lead Agency upon request. The records will serve as evidence to prove that each truck called to the Proposed Project during construction meets the minimum 2010 model year engine emission standards. Alternatively, the Lead Agency should require periodic reporting and provision of written records by contractors, and conduct regular inspections of the records to the maximum extent feasible and practicable