



South Coast Air Quality Management District

21865 Copley Drive, Diamond Bar, CA 91765-4178
(909) 396-2000 • www.aqmd.gov

SENT VIA E-MAIL AND USPS:

October 22, 2019

askpw@beverlyhills.org

Tristan Malabanan, P.E., Project Manager
City of Beverly Hills, Department of Public Works
Engineering Division
345 Foothill Road
Beverly Hills, California 90210

Mitigated Negative Declaration (MND) for the Proposed La Brea Subarea Well and Transmission Project

South Coast Air Quality Management District (South Coast AQMD) staff appreciates the opportunity to comment on the above-mentioned document. The following comments are meant as guidance for the Lead Agency and should be incorporated into the Final MND.

South Coast AQMD Staff's Summary of Project Description

The Lead Agency proposes to demolish an existing structure and rehabilitate an existing 10,250 linear feet of water pipelines ranging in diameter from 18 inches to 24 inches (Proposed Project). The Proposed Project will also include construction of a four-mile water pipeline 16 inches in diameter and a 700-gallon-per-minute water well. The Proposed Project is located along Burton Way, Le Doux Road, and La Cienega Boulevard from the northeast corner of Chariton Street and Guthrie Avenue in the City of Los Angeles to the northeast corner of La Cienega Boulevard and Cadillac Avenue in the City of Beverly Hills. Construction of the Proposed Project is anticipated to take up to 13 months, becoming operational in Winter of 2020¹. The well equipping (grading²) and the rehabilitation/transmissions main installation (building construction³) construction phases are estimated to take seven and eight months to complete, respectively⁴, and construction activities from both phases will occur adjacent to existing sensitive receptors⁵.

South Coast AQMD Staff's Summary of the Air Quality Analysis

In the Air Quality Analysis Section, the Lead Agency quantified the Proposed Project's construction and operational emissions and compared those emissions to South Coast AQMD's recommended regional and localized air quality CEQA significance thresholds. Based on the analysis, the Lead Agency found that the Proposed Project's regional construction and operational impacts would be less than significant⁶. Based on the localized air quality analysis, the Lead Agency found that the Proposed Project would result in localized PM_{2.5} emissions at 2.9 pounds per day (lbs/day)⁷, which did not exceed South Coast AQMD's localized air quality CEQA significance threshold for PM_{2.5} at 3 lbs/day. As such, no air quality mitigation was included⁸.

¹ MND. Section 2.0 Project Description. Page 12.

² MND. Appendix A: Air Quality, Greenhouse Gas, and Energy Information. CalEEMod Summer Run. PDF page 42.

³ *Ibid.*

⁴ MND. Section 2.0 Project Description. Page 12.

⁵ MND. Section 4.3 Air Quality. Pages 33 through 36.

⁶ *Ibid.* Pages 28 through 37.

⁷ *Ibid.*

⁸ *Ibid.*

Recommended Mitigation Measure for Localized Air Quality Impacts from Construction

While the Proposed Project's localized PM_{2.5} construction emissions (i.e., approximately 2.9 lbs/day) did not exceed South Coast AQMD's localized air quality CEQA significance threshold for PM_{2.5} at 3 lbs/day for one acre with sensitive receptors at 25 meters in Source Receptor Area 2 (Northwest Coastal LA County), they were slightly below the applicable significance threshold. Therefore, to further reduce PM_{2.5} emissions during construction and to ensure that nearby sensitive receptors are not adversely affected by the emissions from the use of off-road diesel-powered construction equipment that will occur adjacent to sensitive receptors, South Coast AQMD staff recommends that the Lead Agency incorporate the following mitigation measure into the Final MND.

Tier 4 Construction Equipment or Level 3 Diesel-Particulate Filters

To further reduce PM_{2.5} emissions during construction and minimize their impacts on nearby residents, South Coast AQMD staff recommends that the Lead Agency require the use of off-road diesel-powered construction equipment that meets or exceeds the California Air Resources Board (CARB) and U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (USEPA) Tier 4 Final off-road emissions standards for equipment rated at 50 horsepower or greater during construction of the Proposed Project. Such equipment will be outfitted with Best Available Control Technology (BACT) devices including a CARB certified Level 3 Diesel Particulate Filter (DPFs). Level 3 DPFs are capable of achieving at least 85 percent reduction in particulate matter emissions⁹. A list of CARB verified DPFs are available on the CARB website¹⁰.

To ensure that Tier 4 Final construction equipment or better would be used during the Proposed Project's construction, South Coast AQMD staff recommends that the Lead Agency include this requirement in applicable bid documents, purchase orders, and contracts. Successful contractor(s) must demonstrate the ability to supply the compliant construction equipment for use prior to any ground disturbing and construction activities. A copy of each unit's certified tier specification or model year specification and CARB or South Coast AQMD operating permit (if applicable) shall be available upon request at the time of mobilization of each applicable unit of equipment. Additionally, the Lead Agency should require periodic reporting and provision of written construction documents by construction contractor(s) to ensure compliance, and conduct regular inspections to the maximum extent feasible to ensure compliance.

In the event that construction equipment cannot meet the Tier 4 Final engine certification, the Project representative or contractor must demonstrate through future study with written findings supported by substantial evidence that is approved by the Lead Agency before using other technologies/strategies. Alternative applicable strategies may include, but would not be limited to, construction equipment with Tier 4 Interim or Tier 3 emission standards, reduction in the number and/or horsepower rating of construction equipment, limiting the number of daily construction haul truck trips to and from the Proposed Project, and/or limiting construction phases occurring simultaneously.

Conclusion

Pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15074, prior to approving the Proposed Project, the Lead Agency shall consider the MND for adoption together with any comments received during the public review process. Please provide South Coast AQMD with written responses to all comments contained herein prior to the adoption of the Final MND. When responding to issues raised in the comments, responses should provide sufficient details giving reasons why specific comments and suggestions are not accepted. There should be good faith, reasoned analysis in response. Conclusory statements unsupported by factual information do not facilitate the purpose and goal of CEQA on public disclosure and are not meaningful,

⁹ CARB. November 16-17, 2004. *Diesel Off-Road Equipment Measure – Workshop*. Page 17. Accessed at: https://www.arb.ca.gov/msprog/ordiesel/presentations/nov16-04_workshop.pdf.

¹⁰ *Ibid*. Page 18.

informative, or useful to decision makers and the public who are interested in the Proposed Project. Further, when the Lead Agency makes the finding that the additional recommended mitigation measure is not feasible, the Lead Agency should describe the specific reasons for rejecting them in the Final EIR (CEQA Guidelines Section 15091).

South Coast AQMD staff is available to work with the Lead Agency to address any air quality questions that may arise from this comment letter. Please contact Alina Mullins, Assistant Air Quality Specialist, at amullins@aqmd.gov or (909) 396-2402, should you have any questions.

Sincerely,

Lijin Sun

Lijin Sun, J.D.

Program Supervisor, CEQA IGR

Planning, Rule Development & Area Sources

LS:AM

LAC190924-04

Control Number