South Coast
Air Quality Management District
21865 Copley Drive, Diamond Bar, CA 91765-4178
(909) 396-2000 • www.aqmd.gov

SENT VIA E-MAIL: July 22, 2020

rbrady@rivco.org
Russell Brady, Project Planner
Riverside County, Planning Department
4080 Lemon Street, 12th Floor
Riverside, CA 92501

Draft Environmental Impact Report (Draft EIR) for the Proposed Barker Logistics, LLC Project (SCH No.: 2019090706)

South Coast Air Quality Management District (South Coast AQMD) staff appreciates the opportunity to comment on the above-mentioned document. The following comments include recommended revisions to the health risk assessment and air quality mitigation measures that the Lead Agency should include the Final EIR.

South Coast AQMD Staff's Summary of Project Description

The Lead Agency is proposing to construct a 699,630-square-foot warehouse/logistics building on 31.55 acres (Proposed Project). The Proposed Project is located on the northeast corner of Placentia Avenue and Patterson Street in the community of Mead Valley within Riverside County. Construction of the Proposed Project is anticipated to occur over a 15- to 16-month period and be completed for operation in August 2021[1]. During construction a maximum of 15,000 cubic yards of soil may be imported or exported to or from the Proposed Project site[2], resulting in a maximum total of 1,875 haul truck trips[3]. Once operational, the Proposed Project will include 109 dock doors[4] and is expected to generate 276 two-way daily truck trips[5]. Upon review of Exhibit 2-3: *Existing Site-Aerial* in the Draft EIR and aerial photographs, South Coast AQMD staff found that the closest residential sensitive receptors are located within 120 feet of the Proposed Project[6] .

South Coast AQMD Staff's Summary of the Air Quality Analysis and Health Risk Assessment (HRA)

In the Draft EIR, the Lead Agency quantified the Proposed Project's construction emissions and compared those emissions to South Coast AQMD's recommended localized and regional CEQA significance thresholds for construction. The Proposed Project's regional construction air quality impacts were found to be less than significant[7]. But, the Proposed Project's localized construction air quality impacts were found to be significant for PM10 and PM2.5 emissions at 10.69 pounds per day (lbs/day) and 6.05 lbs/day[8], which would exceed South Coast AQMD's air quality CEQA localized significance thresholds for construction at 10.69 lbs/day and 6.05 lbs/day, respectively. To reduce those emissions, the Lead Agency is committed to Mitigation Measure Air Quality (MM-AQ)-1 for construction, which commits to watering the project site during site preparation and grading activity four times per day, every two hours[9]. With implementation of MM-AQ-1, the Lead Agency found that the Proposed Project's

[1] Draft EIR. Chapter 4: Environmental Impacts. Page 4.18-1.
[2] Draft EIR. Executive Summary. Page 0-6.
[3] Draft EIR. Appendix D: Air Quality Impact Analysis. PDF Page 181.
[4] Draft EIR. Exhibit 2-6: *Proposed Site Plan*. PDF Page 97.
[5] Draft EIR. Appendix D: Air Quality Impact Analysis. Page 44.
[6] Draft EIR. Chapter 4: Environmental Impacts. Page 4.3-22.
[7] Draft EIR. Appendix D: Air Quality Impact Analysis. Page 42.
[8] *Ibid.* Page 54.
[9] *Ibid.* Page 2.

localized PM10 and PM2.5 emissions would be reduced to the less than significant levels at 7.86 lbs/day and 4.71 lbs/day, respectively[10].

The Lead Agency quantified the Proposed Project's localized and regional operational emissions. Based on this analysis, the Lead Agency found that the Proposed Project's localized operational air quality impacts would be less than significant[11] and unmitigated regional operational air quality impacts would be significant for NOx at 79.34 lbs/day[12], which would exceed South Coast AQMD's regional operational air quality CEQA significance threshold at 55 lbs/day. The Lead Agency is committed to implementing operational MM-AQs, which include, but are not limited to, on-site anti-idling and off-site truck route signage, and compliance with the County of Riverside *Good Neighbor Policy for Logistics and Warehouse/Distribution Centers*, as implemented through the Proposed Project's condition of approval[13]. The Lead Agency did not quantify emissions reductions from those mitigation measures and found that the Proposed Project's regional operational air quality impacts for NOx would remain significant and unavoidable at 79.34 lbs/day[14].

The Lead Agency also conducted an operational HRA, which assumed that 276 daily truck trips would visit the Proposed Project. Using EMFAC2017, the Lead Agency developed a weighted average emission factor for the trucks anticipated to visit the Proposed Project. The Lead Agency included on-site and off-site trucks traveling, and on-site truck idling in the air dispersion model to identify the maximum concentration at the sensitive receptors to calculate the Proposed Project's inhalation cancer risk. The Lead Agency found that that the Proposed Project's operational inhalation cancer risk would be 5.02 in one million[15], which would not exceed South Coast AQMD's CEQA significance threshold of 10 in one million for cancer risk.

Summary of South Coast AQMD Staff's Comments

Based on a review of the Draft EIR and supporting technical documents, South Coast AQMD staff has a comment on the breathing rates that were used to calculate the inhalation cancer risk. Although the Proposed Project's construction air quality impacts were found to be less than significant, and because sensitive receptors are located in close proximity to the Proposed Project, South Coast AQMD recommends that the Lead Agency incorporate additional air quality mitigation measures in the Final EIR to further reduce the Proposed Project's construction emissions. Additionally, the Lead Agency should include the specific provisions of the *Good Neighbor Policy for Logistics and Warehouse/Distribution Centers* in the Final EIR. Please see the attachment for more information.

Conclusion

Pursuant to California Public Resources Code Section 21092.5(a) and CEQA Guidelines Section 15088(b), South Coast AQMD staff requests that the Lead Agency provide South Coast AQMD staff with written responses to all comments contained herein prior to the certification of the Final EIR. In addition, issues raised in the comments should be addressed in detail giving reasons why specific comments and suggestions are not accepted. There should be good faith, reasoned analysis in response. Conclusory statements unsupported by factual information will not suffice (CEQA Guidelines Section 15088(c)). Conclusory statements do not facilitate the purpose and goal of CEQA on public disclosure and are not meaningful, informative, or useful to decision makers and to the public who are interested in the Proposed Project. Further, if the Lead Agency makes the findings that the recommended revisions to the existing air quality mitigation measure and additional recommended mitigation measures are not feasible, the Lead

[10] *Ibid.* Page 54.
[11] *Ibid*. Page 56.
[12] *Ibid*. Page 48.
[13] Draft EIR. Executive Summary. Page 0-9.
[14] Draft EIR. Appendix D: Air Quality Impact Analysis. Page 48.
[15] Draft EIR. Chapter 4: Environmental Impacts. Page 4.3-23.

Agency should describe the specific reasons supported by substantial evidence for rejecting them in the Final EIR (CEQA Guidelines Section 15091).

South Coast AQMD staff is available to work with the Lead Agency to address any air quality questions that may arise from this comment letter. Please contact Margaret Isied, Assistant Air Quality Specialist, at misied@aqmd.gov if you have questions or wish to discuss the comments.

Sincerely,

Lijin Sun

Lijin Sun, J.D.
Program Supervisor, CEQA IGR
Planning, Rule Development & Area Sources

Attachment
LS:MI
RVC200611-28
Control Number

ATTACHMENT

1. Mobile Source Health Risk Assessment (HRA) Breathing Rates

The Proposed Project includes operation of a warehouse, which is expected to generate 276 two-way truck trips per day during operation[16]. Sensitive receptors adjacent to the Proposed Project would be exposed to diesel particulate matter (DPM) from the transportation and idling of trucks visiting the Proposed Project. DPM is a toxic air contaminant (TAC) and a carcinogen. Therefore, the Lead Agency performed a quantitative mobile source HRA to determine if the Proposed Project would result in a significant incremental increase in potential cancer risk to the surrounding sensitive receptors (i.e., residential units within 120 feet of the Proposed Project)[17]. In the HRA Technical Report, the Lead Agency calculated cancer risk for each age bin and summed the risk together to find that the Proposed Project would result in a cancer risk of 5.02 in one million at the maximum impacted receptor[18]. However, the Lead Agency used the 80th percentile daily breathing rate for each respective age bin between the third trimester to 30 years (e.g., 273 L/kg-day for the 0-0.25 age bin, 758 L/kg-day for the 0-2 age bin, 572 L/kg-day for the 2-16 age bins, and 261 L/kg-day for the 16-30 age bin)[19]. Children are more susceptible to the exposure to air toxics. Since the existing residential uses are within 120 feet of the Proposed Project, to avoid underestimating the health risks impacts to children who would be exposed to higher DPM concentrations during the early years of the Proposed Project operation, South Coast AQMD staff recommends that the Lead Agency re-calculate the Proposed Project's cancer risk based on the 95th percentile daily breathing rates (e.g., 361 L/kg-day for the 0-0.25 age bin, 1090 L/kg-day for the 0-2 age bin, 861 L/kg-day for the 2-9 age bin, 745 L/kg-day for the 9-16 age bin, and 335 L/kg-day for the 16-30 age bin) in the Final EIR.

2. Additional Recommended Air Quality Mitigation Measures

CEQA requires that all feasible mitigation measures that go beyond what is required by law be utilized to minimize or eliminate any significant adverse air quality impacts. Because sensitive receptors are located in close proximity to the Proposed Project, South Coast AQMD recommends that the Lead Agency incorporate additional air quality mitigation measures as follows in the Final EIR to further reduce the Proposed Project's localized and regional construction emissions.

Construction-related Air Quality Mitigation Measures

a) Require the use of off-road diesel-powered construction equipment that meets or exceeds the California Air Resources Board (CARB) and U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (USEPA) Tier 4 Final off-road emissions standards for equipment rated at 50 horsepower or greater during construction of the Proposed Project. Such equipment will be outfitted with Best Available Control Technology (BACT) devices including a CARB certified Level 3 Diesel Particulate Filter (DPFs). Level 3 DPFs are capable of achieving at least 85 percent reduction in particulate matter emissions. A list of CARB verified DPFs are available on the CARB website.

   To ensure that Tier 4 Final construction equipment or better would be used during the Proposed Project's construction, South Coast AQMD staff recommends that the Lead Agency include this requirement in applicable bid documents, purchase orders, and contracts with construction contractor(s). Successful contractor(s) must demonstrate the ability to supply the compliant construction equipment for use prior to any ground disturbing and construction activities. A copy of each unit's certified tier specification, model year specification, and CARB or South Coast

[16] Draft EIR. Appendix D: Air Quality Impact Analysis. Page 44.
[17] Draft EIR. Chapter 4: Environmental Impacts. Page 4.3-22.
[18] Draft EIR. Chapter 4: Environmental Impacts. Page 4.3-23
[19] Draft EIR. Appendix O: Mobile Source Health Risk Assessment. Page 14. Breathing rates listed in the 2015 Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA) *Air Toxics Hot Spots Program Risk Assessment Guidelines*, Page 5-25.

AQMD operating permit (if applicable) shall be available upon request at the time of mobilization of each applicable unit of equipment. Additionally, the Lead Agency should require periodic reporting and provision of written documents by construction contractor(s) to ensure compliance, and conduct regular inspections to the maximum extent feasible to ensure compliance.

In the event that construction equipment cannot meet the Tier 4 Final engine certification, the Project representative(s) or contractor(s) must demonstrate through future study with written findings supported by substantial evidence that is approved by the Lead Agency before using other technologies/strategies. Alternative applicable strategies may include, but would not be limited to, construction equipment with Tier 4 Interim or Tier 3 emission standards and reduction in the number and/or horsepower rating of construction equipment

b) During the grading phase of construction, it is estimated that the Proposed Project may require a maximum of 1,875 haul trips to import or export up to 15,000 cubic yards of soil[20]. To further reduce NOx emissions from haul truck trips, the Lead Agency should require the use of zero-emissions (ZE) or near-zero emissions (NZE) trucks during construction (e.g., soil import/export), such as trucks with natural gas engines that meet the CARB's adopted optional NOx emission standard of 0.02 grams per brake horsepower-hour (g/bhp-hr). At a minimum, require that truck operator(s)/construction contractor(s) commit to using 2010 model year or newer engines that meet CARB's 2010 engine emission standards of 0.01 g/bhp-hr for particulate matter (PM) and 0.20 g/bhp-hr of NOx emissions or newer, cleaner trucks. To monitor and ensure ZE, NZE, or 2010 model year or newer trucks are used at the Proposed Project, the Lead Agency should require that truck operator(s)/construction contractor(s) maintain records of all trucks associated with the Proposed Project's construction and make these records available to the Lead Agency upon request. Alternatively, the Lead Agency should require periodic reporting and provision of written records by truck operator(s)/construction contractor(s) and conduct regular inspections of the records to the maximum extent feasible and practicable.

c) Maintain equipment maintenance records for the construction portion of the Proposed Project. All construction equipment must be tuned and maintained in compliance with the manufacturer's recommended maintenance schedule and specifications. All maintenance records for each equipment and their construction contractor(s) should be made available for inspection and remain on-site for a period of at least two years from completion of construction.

Operational-related Air Quality Mitigation Measures

In the Draft EIR, the Lead Agency required the Proposed Project to comply with provisions of the County of Riverside *Good Neighbor Policy for Logistics and Warehouse/Distribution Centers*[21], but did not specify which provisions of the Policy would apply to the Proposed Project (MM-AQ-5). CEQA requires specific details of a mitigation measure or specific performance standards the mitigation will achieve be specified (CEQA Guidelines Section 15126.4(a)(1)(B)). Therefore, South Coast AQMD recommends that the Lead Agency specify which provisions of the Policy for the Proposed Project to implement during operation in the Final EIR. The specified provisions are in line with the basic purposes of CEQA for an EIR which is a public document used by the government agency to analyze, the significant environmental effects of a proposed project […], and to disclose possible ways to reduce or avoid the possible environmental damage (CEQA Guidelines Section 15002(f)). At a minimum, the following recommended mitigation measures should be included in the Final EIR.

[20] Draft EIR. Appendix D: Air Quality Impact Analysis. PDF Page 181.
[21] Draft EIR. Chapter 4: Environmental Impacts. Page 4.3-33.

d) Require the use of ZE or NZE trucks during operation, such as trucks with natural gas engines that meet the CARB's adopted optional NOx emission standard of 0.02 grams per brake horsepower-hour (g/bhp-hr). At a minimum, the project operator(s) shall ensure, through sale or leasing agreements, that the truck fleet consist of trucks that meet the emissions standards of a 2010 vehicle model, and as trucks are replaced they are replaced with the newest available model. To monitor and ensure that ZE, NZE, or 2010 model year or newer trucks are used at the Proposed Project, the Lead Agency should require that operators maintain records of all trucks and equipment associated with the Proposed Project's operation and make these records available to the Lead Agency upon request. Alternatively, the Lead Agency should require periodic reporting and provision of written records by operators and conduct regular inspections of the records to the maximum extent feasible and practicable.

Technology is transforming the transportation sector at a rapid pace. Cleaner trucks such as ZE or NZE trucks are increasingly more feasible and commercially available as technology advances. If using ZE or NZE trucks as a mitigation measure to reduce the Proposed Project's operational air quality impacts is not feasible today, cleaner trucks could become feasible in a reasonable period of time within the lifetime of the Proposed Project (CEQA Guidelines Section 15364). Therefore, it is recommended that the Lead Agency develop a process with performance standards to deploy the lowest emission technologies and incentivize the use of ZE or NZE heavy-duty trucks during operation (CEQA Guidelines Section 15126.4(a)). The Lead Agency can and should develop the performance standards as follows or any other comparable standards in the Final EIR.

- Develop a minimum amount of ZE or NZE heavy-duty trucks that the Proposed Project must use during each year of the operation to ensure adequate progress. Include this requirement in the Proposed Project's tenant selection and operation management bid documents and business agreement.

- Establish a tenant/truck operator(s) selection policy that prefers tenant/truck operator(s) who can supply the use of ZE or NZE heavy-duty trucks at the Proposed Project. Include this policy in the bid documents and business agreement.

- Develop a target-focused and performance-based process and timeline to review the feasibility to implement the use of ZE or NZE heavy-duty trucks during operation. Include this process and timeline in the Proposed Project's tenant selection and operation management bid documents and business agreement.

- Develop a project-specific process and criteria for periodically assessing progress in implementing the use of ZE or NZE heavy-duty trucks during operation. Include this process and criteria in the Proposed Project's tenant selection and operation management bid documents and business agreement.

e) Limit the daily number of truck trips allowed at the Proposed Project to the level that was analyzed in the Final EIR (e.g., 276 daily truck trips during operation). If it is reasonably foreseeable before the Final EIR is certified that the Proposed Project would generate more than 276 two-way daily truck trips, the Lead Agency should take into account additional daily truck trips and re-evaluate the Proposed Project's air quality impacts and cancer risk (CEQA Guidelines Section 15088.5). If information becomes available, after the Proposed Project is approved, suggesting that the Proposed Project will generate more than 276 daily truck trips during operation, the Lead Agency should re-evaluate the Proposed Project's air quality and health risks impacts based on a higher number of daily truck trips through a CEQA process (CEQA Guidelines Section 15162).

Additional mitigation measures for operational air quality impacts from area sources that the Lead Agency should consider and incorporate in the Final EIR may include the following.

f) Maximize use of solar energy including solar panels.

g) Install the maximum possible number of solar energy arrays on the building roofs and/or on the project site to generate solar energy for the facility and/or electric vehicle charging stations.

h) Maximize the planting of trees in landscaping and parking lots.

i) Use light colored paving and roofing materials.

j) Utilize only Energy Star heating, cooling, and lighting devices, and appliances.

k) Require use of electric or alternatively fueled sweepers with HEPA filters.