



# South Coast Air Quality Management District

21865 Copley Drive, Diamond Bar, CA 91765-4178  
(909) 396-2000 • www.aqmd.gov

SENT VIA E-MAIL:

December 15, 2023

[ggonzalez@eastvaleca.gov](mailto:ggonzalez@eastvaleca.gov)

Gustavo Gonzalez, Community Development Director  
City of Eastvale, Community Development Department  
12363 Limonite Ave., Suite 910  
Eastvale, CA 91752

## **Draft Environmental Impact Report (EIR) for Eastvale 2040 General Plan Update Project (Proposed Project)**

South Coast Air Quality Management District (South Coast AQMD) staff appreciates the opportunity to review the above-mentioned document. The City of Eastvale (City) is the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Lead Agency for the Proposed Project. To provide context, South Coast AQMD staff (Staff) has provided a brief summary of the project information and prepared the following comment.

### **South Coast AQMD Staff's Summary of Project Information in the Draft EIR**

Based on the Draft EIR, the Proposed Project consists of amendments to the City of Eastvale's general plan, known as the Eastvale 2040 General Plan.<sup>1</sup> The City is in northwestern Riverside County, covers approximately 13 square miles,<sup>2</sup> and Interstate 15 (I-15) runs along the City's eastern boundary. The City's last general plan was adopted in 2012.<sup>3</sup> Some of the major components of the Eastvale 2040 General Plan include updating the general plan development projections to the year 2040 and updating the Land Use Element and Land Use Map with new land use designations and policy areas.<sup>4</sup> The Proposed Project, by serving as a regulatory document that will guide future development of the Proposed Project area, will aid in increasing the number of dwelling units (thereby helping the City achieve its share of statewide housing needs as allocated to it by the Southern California Association of Governments) as well as allow for the development of additional commercial and industrial uses.<sup>5</sup> Construction is projected to commence in 2023 and end in the buildout year of 2040.<sup>6</sup> During this period the Proposed Project anticipates new development of up to 4,173 residential dwelling units, 6,999,959 additional square feet of non-residential uses, and a population gain of 16,358.<sup>7</sup>

### **South Coast AQMD Staff's Comment**

*Recommend Lead Agency Include Mitigation Measures to Reduce Significant Air Quality Impacts from the Proposed Project's Construction and Operation Phases*

---

<sup>1</sup> DEIR. Executive Summary. Page ES-2.

<sup>2</sup> *Ibid.* Section 2.0. Project Description. Page 2.0-1.

<sup>3</sup> *Ibid.* Executive Summary. Page ES-2.

<sup>4</sup> *Ibid.* Executive Summary. Page ES-2 – ES-3.

<sup>5</sup> *Ibid.* Section 3.1. Air Quality. Page 3.1-18.

<sup>6</sup> *Ibid.* Section 2.0. Project Description. Page 2.0-5.

<sup>7</sup> *Ibid.* Section 2.0. Project Description. Page 2.0-17.

### *Air Quality Impacts During Construction*

The Draft EIR's air quality section states that 'Individual development projects under the proposed Eastvale 2040 General Plan would be required to undergo subsequent environmental review pursuant to CEQA and would be required to employ all applicable mitigation measures to reduce construction-related emissions.'<sup>8</sup> It then states that some of these future development projects '... could be large enough in scale and/or intensity such that many pieces of heavy-duty construction equipment and/or heavy-duty trucks may be required and that construction period emissions could exceed the [South Coast AQMD] significance thresholds. Therefore, impacts would be considered **significant and unavoidable**.'<sup>9</sup> The aforementioned refers to the Proposed Project's construction regional estimated emissions. For the Proposed Project's construction localized estimated emissions, the Draft EIR states that construction emissions from the Proposed Project may also exceed South Coast AQMD's Localized Significance Thresholds (potentially significant).<sup>10</sup> The health risk associated with the Proposed Project's anticipated construction diesel particulate matter (DPM) emissions may also be potentially significant.<sup>11</sup> Finally, the Lead Agency states that no feasible mitigation measures are available for any of the above mentioned construction air quality impacts.<sup>12</sup>

### *Air Quality Impacts During Operation*

Similarly, the Draft EIR's air quality section states that future individual development projects under the proposed Eastvale 2040 General Plan 'would be evaluated for potential air emissions once development details have been determined and are available, and individual projects may or may not result in significant operational air quality emissions.'<sup>13</sup> Later it states that 'Given the volume of air pollutants attributable to buildout of the proposed Planning Area, impacts would be conservatively significant and unavoidable...'<sup>14</sup> The aforementioned refers to the Proposed Project's operational regional estimated emissions. The Lead Agency states that no feasible mitigation measures are available for the above-mentioned operation impact.<sup>15</sup>

### *Tiering for Future CEQA Projects*

In the Draft EIR, the lead agency states they intend to tier off of the Draft EIR for future projects.<sup>16</sup> CEQA California Public Resources Code (PRC) Section 21068.5 defines tiering as 'the coverage of general matters and environmental effects in an environmental impact report prepared for a policy, plan, program or ordinance followed by narrower or site-specific environmental impact reports which incorporate by reference the discussion in any prior environmental impact report and which concentrate on the environmental effects which (a) are capable of being mitigated, or (b) were not analyzed as significant effects on the environment in the prior environmental impact report.'

Additionally, CEQA Guidelines Section 15126.4(a)(1)(B) states that 'Where several measures are available to mitigate an impact, each should be discussed and the basis for selecting a

---

<sup>8</sup> DEIR. Section 3.1. Air Quality. Page 3.1-19.

<sup>9</sup> *Ibid.* Section 3.1. Air Quality. Page 3.1-19 – 3.1-20.

<sup>10</sup> *Ibid.* Section 3.1. Air Quality. Page 3.1-23 – 3.1-24.

<sup>11</sup> *Ibid.* Section 3.1. Air Quality. Page 3.1-24 – 3.1-25.

<sup>12</sup> *Ibid.* Section 3.1. Air Quality. Page 3.1-23 & 3.1-26.

<sup>13</sup> *Ibid.* Section 3.1. Air Quality. Page 3.1-21.

<sup>14</sup> *Ibid.* Section 3.1. Air Quality. Page 3.1-22.

<sup>15</sup> *Ibid.* Section 3.1. Air Quality. Page 3.1-23.

<sup>16</sup> *Ibid.* Section 1.0. Introduction. Page 1.0-4.

particular measure should be identified. Formulation of mitigation measures shall not be deferred until some future time. The specific details of a mitigation measure, however, may be developed after project approval when it is impractical or infeasible to include those details during the project's environmental review provided that the agency (1) commits itself to the mitigation, (2) adopts specific performance standards the mitigation will achieve, and (3) identifies the type(s) of potential action(s) that can feasibly achieve that performance standard and that will be considered, analyzed, and potentially incorporated in the mitigation measure.'

Staff disagrees with the Lead Agency's findings that there are no feasible mitigation measures available for the identified air quality impacts. Although the draft EIR states that future development projects will be required to undergo subsequent environmental review pursuant to CEQA and would be required to employ all applicable mitigation measures to reduce emissions,<sup>17</sup> Staff believes that numerous general mitigation measures can be identified at this step of the CEQA process that will help reduce significant impacts from future development impacts.

#### *Recommended Mitigation Measures*

CEQA PRC Section 21002 states that projects should not be approved if there are feasible mitigation measures available which could substantially lessen the significant environmental effects of such projects. The Proposed Project is a guiding regulatory document for the future development of the City of Eastvale. The Draft EIR for the Proposed Project serves as the first-tier, programmatic level analysis that can provide guidance to subsequent, project-level environmental analyses through the year 2040. To further reduce the Proposed Project's air quality impacts, Staff recommends that the Lead Agency incorporate the following mitigation measures in the Final EIR.

#### For Construction:

It is reasonably foreseeable that Tier 4 might not be the cleanest technology when construction occurs later during the approximately 15-year time span of the Proposed Project's planned construction period. One of CARB's strategies for reducing emissions from off-road construction equipment aims to start implementing off-road Tier 5 in 2027/2028.<sup>18</sup> Additionally, the Governor's Executive Order in September 2020 (N-79-20) requires CARB to develop and propose a full transition to Zero Emissions (ZE) off-road equipment by 2035, where feasible.<sup>19</sup> Staff therefore recommends that the Lead Agency include a mitigation measure that commits the Proposed Project to using the cleanest technology for construction during future development projects, if available and feasible, and include the revisions in the Final EIR.

#### Other Construction Mitigation Measures to include:

- Require that, at a minimum, future development use 2014 and newer haul trucks (including material delivery trucks and soil import/export) entering or on the Proposed

---

<sup>17</sup> DEIR. Section 3.1. Air Quality. Page 3.1-19 – 3.1-21.

<sup>18</sup> Presentation accessed at: <http://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/clean-air-plans/air-quality-management-plans/2022-air-quality-management-plan/combined-construction-carb-amp-aqmp-presentations-01-27-21.pdf>

<sup>19</sup> Presentation accessed at: <http://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/clean-air-plans/air-quality-management-plans/2022-air-quality-management-plan/combined-construction-carb-amp-aqmp-presentations-01-27-21.pdf>

Project site. Additionally, all heavy-duty haul trucks should also meet CARB's lowest optional low oxides of nitrogen (NOx) standard.<sup>20</sup>

- Require the use of electric or alternative-fueled (i.e., non-diesel) construction equipment, if available, including but not limited to, concrete/industrial saws, pumps, aerial lifts, material hoist, air compressors, forklifts, excavator, wheel loader, and soil compactors.
- Owners and operators of future development projects shall maintain records of all trucks associated with project construction to document that each truck used meets these emission standards and make the records available for inspection. The Lead Agency should conduct regular inspections of future development projects.
- Provide electric vehicle (EV) charging stations or, at a minimum, provide the electrical infrastructure. Electrical panels shall also be appropriately sized. Electrical hookups should be provided for trucks to plug in any onboard auxiliary equipment.
- Provide temporary traffic controls such as a flag person during all phases of significant construction activity to maintain smooth traffic flow, where necessary.
- Provide dedicated turn lanes for the movement of construction trucks and equipment on- and off-site, where applicable.
- Ensure that vehicle traffic inside the project site is as far away as feasible from sensitive receptors.
- Reduce traffic speeds on all unpaved roads to 15 miles per hour (mph) or less.
- Suspend all excavating and grading operations when wind speeds (as instantaneous gusts) exceed 25 mph.
- Configure construction parking to minimize traffic interference.
- Require covering of all trucks hauling dirt, sand, soil, or other loose materials.
- Install wheel washers where vehicles enter and exit the construction site onto paved roads or wash off trucks and any equipment leaving the site for each trip.
- Apply non-toxic soil stabilizers according to manufacturers' specifications to all inactive construction areas (previously graded areas inactive for ten days or more).
- Replace ground cover in disturbed areas as quickly as possible to minimize dust.
- Pave roads and road shoulders, where applicable.

---

<sup>20</sup> CARB's optional low-NOx emission standard can be found at: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/our-work/programs/optional-reduced-nox-standards>

- Sweep streets at the end of the day with South Coast AQMD Rule 1186 and 1186.1 compliant sweepers if visible soil is carried onto adjacent public paved roads (recommend water sweepers that utilize reclaimed water).

### For Operation

Most of the Proposed Project's NO<sub>x</sub>, CO, PM<sub>10</sub> and PM<sub>2.5</sub> operational emissions come from mobile sources.<sup>21</sup> Project-level air quality mitigation measures for operational air quality impacts from mobile sources that the Lead Agency should consider and include in the Final EIR, and any subsequent CEQA document and future development project, may include the following:

- Future projects that tier from this EIR shall provide documentation to the City demonstrating that occupants/tenants of such future project sites have been provided documentation on funding opportunities, such as the Carl Moyer Program (which provides incentives for using cleaner-than—required engines and equipment) as well as other incentives and programs found on the South Coast AQMD Incentives & Programs landing page, <http://www.aqmd.gov/home/programs>. South Coast AQMD offers a broad range of programs for businesses, the community, and local government that help to achieve cleaner air quality. Many of these programs offer financial incentives for implementing new clean air technologies. Some provide partnerships and new ways of addressing air quality issues throughout the South Coast Basin.
- The Lead Agency should require the use of ZE or near-zero emissions (NZE) heavy-duty trucks by future development projects during operation such as trucks with natural gas engines that meet CARB's adopted optional NO<sub>x</sub> emission standard of 0.02 g/bhp-hr, if and when feasible. Given the State of California's (State) clean truck rules and regulations aiming to accelerate the utilization and market penetration of ZE and NZE trucks such as the Advanced Clean Trucks Rule<sup>22</sup> and the Heavy-Duty Low NO<sub>x</sub> Omnibus Regulation,<sup>23</sup> ZE and NZE trucks will become increasingly more available to use. The Lead Agency can and should require future development projects to have a phase-in schedule to incentivize the use of these cleaner operating trucks to reduce any significant adverse air quality impacts. South Coast AQMD staff is available to discuss the availability of current and upcoming truck technologies and incentive programs. At a minimum, require the use of 2014 or newer model year trucks.
- Where appropriate, include environmental analyses to evaluate and identify sufficient electricity and supportive infrastructures in the Energy and Utilities and Service Systems Sections in the CEQA document. Include the requirement in applicable bid documents, purchase orders, and contracts.

---

<sup>21</sup> Draft EIR. Section 3.1. Air Quality. Page 3.1-20 – 3.1-21.

<sup>22</sup> CARB. June 25, 2020. *Advanced Clean Trucks Rule*. Accessed at: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/our-work/programs/advanced-clean-trucks>.

<sup>23</sup> CARB has recently passed a variety of new regulations that require new, cleaner heavy-duty truck technology to be sold and used in state. For example, on August 27, 2020, CARB approved the Heavy-Duty Low NO<sub>x</sub> Omnibus Regulation, which will require all trucks to meet the adopted emission standard of 0.05 g/hp-hr starting with engine model year 2024. Accessed at: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/rulemaking/2020/hdomnibuslownox>.

- Provide electric vehicle (EV) charging stations or, at a minimum, provide electrical infrastructure, and electrical panels should be appropriately sized. Electrical hookups should be provided for truckers to plug in any onboard auxiliary equipment.
- Limit the daily number of trucks allowed at future development projects to the levels analyzed in the subsequent, project-level environmental analyses for these projects. If higher daily truck volumes are anticipated to visit the site, additional analysis should be done through CEQA prior to allowing this higher activity level.
- Operation design considerations that the Lead Agency should consider and include in the Final EIR for future development projects to further reduce air quality and health risk impacts:
  - Clearly mark truck routes with trailblazer signs so that trucks will not travel next to or near sensitive land uses (e.g., residences, schools, day care centers, etc.).
  - Restrict overnight truck parking near sensitive land uses by providing overnight truck parking inside the future development project site.
  - Design future development projects such that any check-in point for trucks is inside the project site to ensure that there are no trucks queuing outside.
  - Design a future development project to ensure that truck traffic inside the project site is as far away as feasible from sensitive receptors.

South Coast AQMD staff also suggests the Lead Agency review the references listed below and consider including additional recommended mitigation measures in the final CEQA document:

- State of California – Department of Justice: Warehouse Projects: Best Practices and Mitigation Measures to Comply with the California Environmental Quality Act
- South Coast AQMD 2022 South Coast Air Quality Management Plan, specifically:
  - Appendix IV-A – South Coast AQMD’s Stationary and Mobile Source Control Measures
  - Appendix IV-B – CARB’s Strategy for South Coast
  - Appendix IV-C – SCAG’s Regional Transportation Strategy and Control Measures

### Conclusion

As set forth in California Public Resources Code Section 21092.5(a) and CEQA Guidelines Section 15088(a-b), the Lead Agency shall evaluate comments from public agencies on the environmental issues and prepare a written response at least 10 days prior to certifying the Final EIR. As such, please provide South Coast AQMD written responses to all comments contained herein at least 10 days prior to the certification of the Final EIR. In addition, as provided by CEQA Guidelines Section 15088(c), if the Lead Agency’s position is at variance with recommendations provided in this comment letter, detailed reasons supported by substantial

Gustavo Gonzalez, Community Development Director

December 15, 2023

evidence in the record to explain why specific comments and suggestions are not accepted must be provided.

Thank you for the opportunity to provide comments. South Coast AQMD staff is available to work with the Lead Agency to address any air quality questions that may arise from this comment letter. Please contact Evelyn Aguilar, Air Quality Specialist, at [eaguilar@aqmd.gov](mailto:eaguilar@aqmd.gov) should you have any questions.

Sincerely,

*Sam Wang*

Sam Wang

Program Supervisor, CEQA-IGR

Planning, Rule Development & Implementation

SW:EA

RVC231101-14

Control Number