



# South Coast Air Quality Management District

21865 Copley Drive, Diamond Bar, CA 91765-4178  
(909) 396-2000 • [www.aqmd.gov](http://www.aqmd.gov)

SENT VIA E-MAIL:

[kjenson@beaumontca.gov](mailto:kjenson@beaumontca.gov)

Katie Jenson, Case Planner

City of Beaumont

550 E. 6th Street

Beaumont, California 92223

November 16, 2023

## **Site Plan Consultation for the PLAN2023-1032 Olivewood Commercial Bolour Project (Proposed Project)**

South Coast Air Quality Management District (South Coast AQMD) staff appreciates the opportunity to comment on the above-mentioned document. Our comments are recommendations on the analysis of potential air quality impacts from the Proposed Project that should be included in the CEQA document. Please send a copy of the CEQA document upon its completion and public release directly to South Coast AQMD as copies of the CEQA document submitted to the State Clearinghouse are not forwarded. **In addition, please send all appendices and technical documents related to the air quality, health risk, and greenhouse gas analyses and electronic versions of all emission calculation spreadsheets, air quality modeling and health risk assessment input and output files (not PDF files). Any delays in providing all supporting documentation for our review will require additional review time beyond the end of the comment period.**

### **Responsible Agency and South Coast AQMD Permits**

CEQA Guidelines Section 15096 sets forth specific procedures for a Responsible Agency, including making a decision on the adequacy of the CEQA document for use as part of the process for conducting a review of the Proposed Project and issuing discretionary approvals. Moreover, it is important to note that if a Responsible Agency determines that a CEQA document is not adequate to rely upon for its discretionary approvals, the Responsible Agency must take further actions listed in CEQA Guideline Section 15096(e), which could have the effect of delaying the implementation of the Proposed Project. In its role as CEQA Responsible Agency, the South Coast AQMD is obligated to ensure that the CEQA document prepared for this Proposed Project contains a sufficient project description and analysis to be relied upon in order to issue any discretionary approvals that may be needed for air permits.

For these reasons, the final CEQA document should be revised to include a discussion about any and all new stationary and portable equipment requiring South Coast AQMD air permits, provide the evaluation of their air quality and greenhouse gas impacts, and identify South Coast AQMD as a Responsible Agency for the Proposed Project as this information will be relied upon as the basis for the permit conditions and emission limits for the air permit(s). Please contact South Coast AQMD's Engineering and Permitting staff at (909) 396-3385 for questions regarding what types of equipment would require air permits. For more general information on permits, please visit South Coast AQMD's webpage at <http://www.aqmd.gov/home/permits>.

### **CEQA Air Quality Analysis**

Staff recommends that the Lead Agency use South Coast AQMD's CEQA Air Quality Handbook and website<sup>1</sup> as guidance when preparing the air quality and greenhouse gas analyses. It is also recommended that the Lead Agency use the CalEEMod<sup>2</sup> land use emissions software, which can estimate pollutant emissions from typical land use development and is the only software model maintained by the California Air Pollution Control Officers Association.

South Coast AQMD has developed both regional and localized significance thresholds. South Coast AQMD staff recommends that the Lead Agency quantify criteria pollutant emissions and compare the emissions to South Coast AQMD's CEQA regional pollutant emissions significance thresholds<sup>3</sup> and localized significance thresholds (LSTs)<sup>4</sup> to determine the Proposed Project's air quality impacts. The localized analysis can be conducted by either using the LST screening tables or performing dispersion modeling.

The Lead Agency should identify any potential adverse air quality impacts that could occur from all phases of the Proposed Project and all air pollutant sources related to the Proposed Project. Air quality impacts from both construction (including demolition, if any) and operations should be calculated. Construction-related air quality impacts typically include, but are not limited to, emissions from the use of heavy-duty equipment from grading, earth-loading/unloading, paving, architectural coatings, off-road mobile sources (e.g., heavy-duty construction equipment) and on-road mobile sources (e.g., construction worker vehicle trips, material transport trips, and hauling trips). Operation-related air quality impacts may include, but are not limited to, emissions from stationary sources (e.g., boilers and air pollution control devices), area sources (e.g., solvents and coatings), and vehicular trips (e.g., on- and off-road tailpipe emissions and entrained dust). Air quality impacts from indirect sources, such as sources that generate or attract vehicular trips, should be included in the analysis. Furthermore, emissions from the overlapping construction and operational activities should be combined and compared to South Coast AQMD's regional air quality CEQA *operational* thresholds to determine the level of significance.

Sensitive receptors are people that have an increased sensitivity to air pollution or environmental contaminants and include schools, daycare centers, nursing homes, elderly care facilities, hospitals, and residential dwelling units. The Proposed Project will include, among others, 324 residential units, and to facilitate the purpose of a CEQA document as an informational document, it is recommended that the Lead Agency perform a mobile source health risk assessment<sup>Error! Bookmark not defined.</sup> to disclose the potential health risks<sup>5</sup>.

The California Air Resources Board's (CARB) *Air Quality and Land Use Handbook: A Community Health Perspective*<sup>6</sup> is a general reference guide for evaluating and reducing air pollution impacts associated with new projects that go through the land use decision-making process with additional guidance on strategies to reduce air pollution exposure near high-volume roadways available in CARB's technical advisory<sup>7</sup>.

---

<sup>1</sup> South Coast AQMD's CEQA Handbook and other resources for preparing air quality analyses can be found at: <http://www.aqmd.gov/home/rules-compliance/ceqa/air-quality-analysis-handbook>.

<sup>2</sup> CalEEMod is available free of charge at: [www.caleemod.com](http://www.caleemod.com).

<sup>3</sup> South Coast AQMD's CEQA regional pollutant emissions significance thresholds can be found at: <http://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/ceqa/handbook/scaqmd-air-quality-significance-thresholds.pdf>.

<sup>4</sup> South Coast AQMD's guidance for performing a localized air quality analysis can be found at: <http://www.aqmd.gov/home/regulations/ceqa/air-quality-analysis-handbook/localized-significance-thresholds>.

<sup>5</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>6</sup> CARB's *Air Quality and Land Use Handbook: A Community Health Perspective* can be found at: <http://www.arb.ca.gov/ch/handbook.pdf>.

<sup>7</sup> CARB's technical advisory can be found at: <https://www.arb.ca.gov/ch/landuse.htm>.

The South Coast AQMD's *Guidance Document for Addressing Air Quality Issues in General Plans and Local Planning*<sup>8</sup> includes suggested policies that local governments can use in their General Plans or through local planning to prevent or reduce potential air pollution impacts and protect public health. It is recommended that the Lead Agency review this Guidance Document as a tool when making local planning and land use decisions.

The Proposed Project would include, among other things, a gasoline service station with nine pumps. Benzene, which is a toxic air contaminant, may be emitted from the operation. To ensure that sensitive receptors are not going to be adversely affected by the exposure to benzene, it is recommended that the Lead Agency evaluate, quantify, and perform a health risk assessment for the Proposed Project in the CEQA document<sup>9</sup>.

### **Mitigation Measures**

In the event that the Proposed Project results in significant adverse air quality impacts, CEQA requires that all feasible mitigation measures that go beyond what is required by law be utilized to minimize these impacts. Any impacts resulting from mitigation measures must also be analyzed. Several resources to assist the Lead Agency with identifying potential mitigation measures for the Proposed Project include South Coast AQMD's CEQA Air Quality Handbook,<sup>10</sup> South Coast AQMD's Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Plan for the 2022 Air Quality Management Plan,<sup>11</sup> and Southern California Association of Government's Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Plan for the 2020-2045 Regional Transportation Plan/Sustainable Communities Strategy.<sup>12</sup>

Mitigation measures for operational air quality impacts from other area sources that the Lead Agency should consider in the CEQA document may include the following:

- Maximize use of solar energy by installing solar energy arrays.
- Use light colored paving and roofing materials.
- Utilize only Energy Star heating, cooling, and lighting devices, and appliances.
- Use of water-based or low VOC cleaning products that go beyond the requirements of South Coast AQMD Rule 1113.

Design considerations for the Proposed Project that the Lead Agency should consider to further reduce air quality and health risk impacts include the following:

- Clearly mark truck routes with trailblazer signs, so that trucks will not travel next to or near sensitive land uses (e.g., residences, schools, day care centers, etc.).
- Design the Proposed Project such that truck entrances and exits are not facing sensitive receptors and trucks will not travel past sensitive land uses to enter or leave the Proposed Project site.
- Design the Proposed Project such that any check-in point for trucks is inside the Proposed Project site to ensure that there are no trucks queuing outside.

---

<sup>8</sup> South Coast AQMD. 2005. *Guidance Document for Addressing Air Quality Issues in General Plans and Local Planning*. Available at: <http://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/planning/air-quality-guidance/complete-guidance-document.pdf>.

<sup>9</sup> South Coast AQMD. Guidance for performing a gasoline dispensing station health risk assessment can be found here: <http://www.aqmd.gov/home/permits/risk-assessment>.

<sup>10</sup> <https://www.aqmd.gov/home/rules-compliance/ceqa/air-quality-analysis-handbook>

<sup>11</sup> South Coast AQMD's 2022 Air Quality Management Plan can be found at: <http://www.aqmd.gov/home/air-quality/clean-air-plans/air-quality-mgt-plan> (Chapter 4 - Control Strategy and Implementation).

<sup>12</sup> Southern California Association of Governments' 2020-2045 RTP/SCS can be found at: [https://www.connectsocial.org/Documents/PEIR/certified/Exhibit-A\\_ConnectSoCal\\_PEIR.pdf](https://www.connectsocial.org/Documents/PEIR/certified/Exhibit-A_ConnectSoCal_PEIR.pdf).

- Design the Proposed Project to ensure that truck traffic inside the Proposed Project site is as far away as feasible from sensitive receptors.
- Restrict overnight truck parking in sensitive land uses by providing overnight truck parking inside the Proposed Project site.

### **Health Risk Reduction Strategies**

Many strategies are available to reduce exposures, including, but are not limited to, building filtration systems with MERV 13 or better, or in some cases, MERV 15 or better is recommended; building design, orientation, location; vegetation barriers or landscaping screening, etc. Enhanced filtration units are capable of reducing exposures. However, enhanced filtration systems have limitations. For example, in a study that South Coast AQMD conducted to investigate filters<sup>13</sup>, a cost burden is expected to be within the range of \$120 to \$240 per year to replace each filter panel. The initial start-up cost could substantially increase if an HVAC system needs to be installed and if standalone filter units are required. Installation costs may vary and include costs for conducting site assessments and obtaining permits and approvals before filters can be installed. Other costs may include filter life monitoring, annual maintenance, and training for conducting maintenance and reporting. In addition, because the filters would not have any effectiveness unless the HVAC system is running, there may be increased energy consumption that the Lead Agency should evaluate in the CEQA document. It is typically assumed that the filters operate 100 percent of the time while residents are indoors, and the environmental analysis does not generally account for the times when the residents have their windows or doors open or are in common space areas of the project. These filters have no ability to filter out any toxic gases. Furthermore, when used filters are replaced, replacement has the potential to result in emissions from the transportation of used filters at disposal sites and generate solid waste that the Lead Agency should evaluate in the CEQA document. Therefore, the presumed effectiveness and feasibility of any filtration units should be carefully evaluated in more detail prior to assuming that they will sufficiently alleviate exposures to diesel particulate matter emissions.

South Coast AQMD staff is available to work with the Lead Agency to ensure that air quality, greenhouse gas, and health risk impacts from the Proposed Project are accurately evaluated and mitigated where feasible. If you have any questions regarding this letter, please contact me at [swang1@aqmd.gov](mailto:swang1@aqmd.gov).

Sincerely,

*Sam Wang*

Sam Wang

Program Supervisor, CEQA IGR

Planning, Rule Development & Implementation

SW

RVC231101-02

Control Number

---

<sup>13</sup> This study evaluated filters rated MERV 13 or better. Accessed at: <http://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/ceqa/handbook/aqmdpilotstudyfinalreport.pdf>. Also see 2012 Peer Review Journal article by South Coast AQMD: <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/ina.12013>.