Proposed Amended Rule 1134
Emissions of Oxides of Nitrogen from Stationary Gas Turbines

Working Group #1
February 22, 2018
Background

- **2016 Air Quality Management Plan**
  - Control Measure CMB-05 called for further NOx reductions from an assessment of the RECLAIM program, including:
    - A five ton per day NOx reduction to be achieved no later than 2025; and
    - Sunsetting the RECLAIM program and transitioning to a command-and-control regulatory structure that requires Best Available Retrofit Control Technology (BARCT) level controls

- **2017 - AB 617**
  - Expedited BARCT schedule for largest emitters
  - Implementation schedule to be developed by 1/1/2019
  - Full BARCT implementation by 12/31/2023
RECLAIM Transition

- Developing transition strategy for facilities exiting RECLAIM
  - Transition plan to be released shortly
Regulatory Background for Stationary Gas Turbines

- **1989 - Adoption of Rule 1134**
  - Applicable to existing (as of August 1989) gas turbines rated ≥ 0.3 MW

- **1993 - Adoption of RECLAIM**
  - Most utilities and third-party power generating gas turbines entered into RECLAIM
  - Gas turbines located at Publicly Owned Treatment Works, landfills, hospitals, and other public facilities not eligible under RECLAIM still subject to Rule 1134
    - As new equipment replaced older gas turbines, few facilities remain subject to Rule 1134; most are in RECLAIM or not subject to a source specific rule

- **1995 - Amendment of Rule 1134**
  - Gas turbines located in Southeast Desert Air Basin (now Mojave Desert Air Basin) and San Clemente Island conditionally exempted

- **1997 - Amendment of Rule 1134**
  - Increased NOx limit for gas turbines using sewage digester gas from 9 ppm to 25 ppm and clarified that Continuous Emission Monitoring System (CEMS) requirements
Current Rule 1134 Requirements

- Applies to gas turbines greater than 0.3 MW existing prior to 1989
  - Does not apply to turbines installed after August 4, 1989
- NOx limits based on:
  - Size of unit
  - Type of unit (combined or simple cycle)
  - Type of gas burned
  - Presence of Selective Catalytic Reduction
- CEMS required for gas turbines ≥ 2.9 MW
- Source testing required annually for units emitting ≥ 25 ppm of NOx
  - Others test after 8,400 hours of operation
- Daily records and monthly reporting
## Current NOx Limits in Rule 1134

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Unit Size (MW)</th>
<th>NOx Reference Limit (ppm)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>No SCR</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.3 to &lt; 2.9</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.9 to &lt; 10</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.9 to &lt; 10 (Sewage Digester Gas)</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 and Over</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60 and Over (Combined Cycle)</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>With SCR</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.9 to &lt; 10</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 and Over</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60 and Over (Combined Cycle)</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

NOx Compliance Limit = Reference Limit x (EFF/25%)
EFF = (3413 x 100%)/Actual Heat Rate at Higher Heating Value of Fuel
Overview of Amendments to Rule 1134

- Revise the applicability to include RECLAIM facilities and post-1989 gas turbines
- BARCT review of NOx limits
- Review of Monitoring, Reporting, and Recordkeeping requirements
- Exclude Rule 1134 gas turbines at refineries and electricity generating facilities
  - Gas turbines at refineries and electricity generating facilities will be included in industry specific rules
    - Rule 1109.1 - Refineries
    - Rule 1135 - Electricity Generating Facilities
### Possible Rule 1134 Facilities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Facility Type</th>
<th>Non-RECLAIM Facilities</th>
<th>RECLAIM Facilities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Publicly Owned Treatment Works</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Landfill</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hospital</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Public Facility</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Third Party Generator</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Petroleum Production</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On-Site Generator</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emergency</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>25</strong></td>
<td><strong>17</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Equipment Potentially Subject to PAR 1134

- 98 turbines/duct burners at 42 facilities
  - 47 simple cycle
  - 38 combined cycle and duct burners
  - Emergency - 17 turbines at 6 facilities are operated less than 200 hours per year
# Turbines at Non-RECLAIM Facilities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Facility Type</th>
<th>Total Number of Facilities</th>
<th>Simple Cycle Units</th>
<th>Combined Cycle Units and Duct Burners</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Publicly Owned Treatment Works</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Landfill</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hospital</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Public Facility</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Third Party Generator</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On-Site Generator</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emergency</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>25</strong></td>
<td><strong>37</strong></td>
<td><strong>29</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Turbines at RECLAIM Facilities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Facility Type</th>
<th>Total Number of Facilities</th>
<th>Simple Cycle Units</th>
<th>Combined Cycle Units</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Other Public Facility</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Third Party Generator</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On-Site Generator</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Petroleum</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>17</strong></td>
<td><strong>24</strong></td>
<td><strong>8</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Emissions from PAR 1134 Equipment

- Mass emissions reported from facilities
- Some missing data, will complete in future analysis
  - Many emergency only equipment not reporting
  - Facilities beginning operations after 2015 not included

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Facility</th>
<th>Tons Per Year NOx (2015)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>RECLAIM</td>
<td>673.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Simple Cycle</td>
<td>652.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Combined Cycle</td>
<td>20.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-RECLAIM</td>
<td>281.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Simple Cycle</td>
<td>204.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Combined Cycle</td>
<td>76.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>955.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Combined Cycle Gas Turbines/Duct Burners

- Sizes: 8 - 2,096 MMBtu/hr
- NOx Permit Emission Limits: 2 - 102 ppm
- 4 outliers
  - 2 units - 2,096 MMBtu/hr with 2 ppm emission limit (BACT)
  - 1 unit - 410 MMBtu/hr with 102 ppm emission limit
    - Unit had 2 ppm emission limit removed from permit conditions
  - 2 units - 16 MMBtu/hr turbine combined with 7 MMBtu/hr duct burner both with 41 ppm emission limit
    - Unit installed in 1993
Combined Cycle Gas Turbines and Associated Duct Burners

*Some units installed to meet BACT and BARCT
Simple Cycle Gas Turbines

- Sizes: 11 - 1,080 MMBtu/hr
- NOx Permit Emission Limits: 2.5 - 140 ppm
  - Permitted emission limits vary widely
- Outliers
  - 6 smaller units (29-42 MMBtu/hr) with highest permitted emission limits (65-140 ppm NOx @ 15% O₂)
    - All associated with offshore platforms
  - 246 MMBtu/hr unit with 42 ppm NOx @ 15% O₂
    - NOx limit not included in RECLAIM permit; reinstated 1986 BACT limit
  - 466 MMBtu/hr unit with 42 ppm NOx @ 15% O₂
    - Unit installed in 1991
Simple Cycle Gas Turbines (continued)

*Some units installed to meet BACT and BARCT
Sixteen turbines utilizing landfill gas

Sizes: 52 - 226 MMBtu/hr

NOx Limits:

- Three 52 MMBtu/hr simple cycle units with 25 ppm NOx @ 15% O₂
- Two 53 MMBtu/hr simple cycle units with permitted emission limits of 25 ppm NOx @ 15% O₂
- Five 61 MMBtu/hr simple cycle units with 12.5 ppm NOx @ 15% O₂ (BACT)
- Four 72 MMBtu/hr combined cycle units with 25 ppm NOx @ 15% O₂
- Two 226 MMBtu/hr combined cycle units with 6 ppm NOx @ 15% O₂ (BACT)
Fifteen turbines and duct burners utilizing sewage digester gas

Sizes: 14 - 113 MMBtu/hr

NOx Limits:

- Nine 14 MMBtu/hr duct burners and three 138 MMBtu/hr combined cycle units with permitted emission limits of 18.8 ppm NOx @ 15% O₂
- Three 113 MMBtu/hr simple cycle units with 25 ppm NOx @ 15% O₂
BARCT Determination Process

- Identify one or more potential control options which achieves the emission reduction objectives for the regulation

- Review the information developed to assess the cost-effectiveness of the potential control option
  - Cost-effectiveness is the cost, in dollars, of the potential control option divided by emission reduction potential, in tons (For example: $ per ton of NOx reduced)

- Calculate the incremental cost-effectiveness for the potential control options identified in paragraph
  - The incremental cost-effectiveness is the difference in the dollar costs divided by the difference in the emission reduction potentials between each progressively more stringent potential control option as compared to the next less expensive control option

- In addition to the overall cost-effectiveness, additional considerations for:
  - Outliers
  - Stranded assets
  - Accounting for recent installations - implementation of previous requirements - BARCT or BACT
Considerations for NOx Limits

- Limits may vary by size (input in MMBtu/hr or power output in MW) and fuel gas (natural gas, landfill gas, sewage digester gas)
- Limits may vary by type of turbine (simple/combined cycle)
- Possible Start-up and Shutdown provisions including number of starts, NOx limits, and time limits
- CEQA implications for ammonia slip
- Averaging times (15 minutes, 1 hour, etc.) under consideration
- Implementation timeline may also vary by size and fuel gas
Schedule

Next Working Group Meeting | March 2018
Public Workshop | 3rd Quarter 2018
Stationary Source Committee | July 20, 2018
Set Hearing | September 7, 2018
Public Hearing | October 5, 2018
Contacts

PAR 1134 Development
Michael Morris, mmorris@aqmd.gov, (909) 396-3282
Uyen-Uyen Vo, uvo@aqmd.gov, (909) 396-2238

RECLAIM Questions
Gary Quinn, P.E. gquinn@aqmd.gov, (909) 396-3121
Kevin Orellana, korellana@aqmd.gov, (909) 396-3492
Tracy Goss, P.E. tgoss@aqmd.gov, (909) 396-3106

General Questions
David De Boer, ddeboer@aqmd.gov, (909) 396-2329
Sarah Rees, srees@aqmd.gov, (909) 396-2856
Susan Nakamura, snakamura@aqmd.gov, (909) 396-3105