Proposed Rule 1179.1
NOx Emission Reductions from Combustion Equipment at Publicly Owned Treatment Works Facilities

Working Group Meeting #2
August 13, 2019
Conference call #: 1-866-705-2554
Passcode: 104774
Agenda

- Summary of Previous Working Group meeting
- Public Comments
- Applicability
- BARCT Assessment
Summary of Last Working Group Meeting

- **Challenges**
  - Digester gas operations, food waste processing, financial implications

- **Rule Development Process**

- **Proposed Applicability**
  - Boilers and turbines located at POTWs that fire either natural gas and/or digester gas
  - Other equipment covered by a rule with a recent or near future BARCT assessment

- **Equipment Inventory**
  - Types, sizes, fuel

- **BARCT Assessment**
  - Emission limits for existing units

- **Emissions Summary**
Comments Made at Working Group Meeting #1

- **Applicability**
  - Include all biogas equipment in one rule
  - Include engines in applicability

- **Emissions Summary**
  - Include fuel usage context in the discussion of emissions from combustion sources
Applicability
Overall Approach

- Proposing only to address biogas equipment located at POTWs and landfills
  - Including all biogas equipment (i.e. turbines at food distribution facilities) would remove focus from an industry specific rule
- Proposing two rules to address biogas equipment at POTWs (1179.1) and landfills (1150.3)
  - Different industries with distinct process characteristics (gas quality, supply)
- Rule development for POTWs and landfills will be in tandem
  - Working group meetings will be held back to back
  - Approximately same timeframe for rule development (BARCT assessment, rule language, etc.)
Four equipment categories were assessed for applicability:

- Engines
- Boilers
- Turbines
- Miscellaneous combustion equipment
Stakeholders have suggested including biogas engine provisions in Proposed Rule (PR) 1179.1 for the purpose of having all POTW provisions in one rule.

Recent amendments to Rule 1110.2 specifically addressed biogas engines:

- 42 engines at POTWs with digester gas combustion equipment are regulated under Rule 1110.2.
- Rule 1110.2 lowered the NOx limit for biogas engines in 2012 with a compliance date in 2017.
- A new BARCT assessment is not needed for engines located at POTWs.
- Most engines are complying with Rule 1110.2 provisions and limits.
  - Variances for two facilities representing 7 engines.
Applicability Assessment – Engines (continued)

- Staff is still discussing if engines should be incorporated into PR 1179.1
- Applications for new permits will be required
  - Fees
  - Increased permitting timeline
- If engines are included in PR 1179.1
  - Rule 1110.2 along with Proposed Amended Rule 1110.2 for biogas engines will be copied into PR 1179.1
  - No emission limits will change
Applicability - Boilers

- All boilers at POTWs will be subject to PR 1179.1
- A BARCT assessment will be conducted for boilers firing digester gas
- A BARCT assessment will not be conducted for natural gas boilers
  - Recent rulemaking for Rule 1146 series addressed natural gas boilers
- PR 1179.1 will apply to small boilers < 2 mmbtu/hr fueled by digester gas
  - A BARCT assessment will be conducted for these boilers
  - Natural gas boilers < 2 mmbtu/hr will be subject to Rule 1146.2
- Staff proposes that provisions and limits for natural gas boilers will copied into PR 1179.1
Applicability - Turbines

- All turbines will be subject to PR 1179.1
- A BARCT assessment will be conducted for turbines using digester gas
- A BARCT assessment for natural gas turbines will be not be conducted
  - Recent rulemaking for Rule 1134 addressed natural gas turbines
- Staff proposes that applicable provisions and limits for natural gas turbines will be copied into PR 1179.1
Applicability - Miscellaneous Combustion Equipment

- **Microturbines**
  - There is no current rule for microturbines
  - A BARCT assessment for natural gas and digester gas microturbines is needed
  - Staff proposes to include all microturbines located at a POTW in applicability

- **Dryers**
  - 2 dryers are subject to Rule 1147
  - A BARCT assessment for dryers will be conducted for Proposed Amended Rule 1147
  - Staff proposes to not include dryers in applicability
**Applicability - Miscellaneous Combustion Equipment (continued)**

- **Flares**
  - Recent rulemaking of Rule 1118.1 addressed flares located at POTWs and is currently ongoing
  - Staff proposes that flares are not included in applicability

- **Other miscellaneous combustion equipment**
  - Afterburners, regenerative thermal oxidizers, emergency engines
    - These equipment do not use digester gas and are not specific to POTWs
  - Equipment subject to Rule 1147 will have a BARCT assessment conducted during the Proposed Amended Rule 1147 series rulemaking
  - Staff proposes that this equipment not be included in applicability
Beginning stages of the BARCT assessment
Emission and Limit Assessment

- Emissions summary – what are the major sources of emissions at POTWs?
- Permit limits vs rule limits – are these limits being met?
- Source tests – what limits can be met?
- Other agency limits
  - What are the limits?
  - Are there any units in practice achieving these limits?
- Control technologies will be discussed in next Working Group meeting
Turbines are the highest emitting equipment category.

Turbines consume about twice as much fuel as boilers or engines, however, emissions are more than three times boilers or engines.
Assessment of NOx Levels

- Staff evaluated all permitted NOx concentration limits for turbines and boilers fueled by digester gas (will assess microturbines later)
  - All NOx limits for boilers were corrected to 3% O2
  - All NOx limits for turbines were corrected to 15% O2
- Staff reviewed source tests to identify tested emissions
  - Source tests represent a snapshot of emissions
- Staff compared NOx permit limit data with NOx source test results to assess compliance margin
Turbines
- 6 combined cycle turbines
- All use digester gas
- No rule that applies to turbines located at POTWs
- 3 turbines are permitted at 25 ppmv
- 3 turbines are permitted at 18.8 ppmv
Source Test Results - Turbines

- Two source tests
- Source test values for two turbines range from 16 to 22 ppm
- Unit with SCR had the lowest source test
- Source test results are about 15% below the permitted limit for both units
## Limits at Other Air Districts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Air District</th>
<th>Size</th>
<th>Fuel</th>
<th>Fuel description</th>
<th>Limit (ppmv)</th>
<th>Compliance Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bay Area</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5 – 150 mmbtu/hr</td>
<td>Waste gas</td>
<td>Mixture of hydrogen, gaseous hydrocarbons and other diluent gases generated by sewage treatment...</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&gt; 150-250 mmbtu/hr</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sacramento</strong></td>
<td>≥ 10 MW (no SCR)</td>
<td>Gaseous fuel</td>
<td>Any fuel which is a gas at standard conditions</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>1997</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>≥ 10 MW (w/ SCR)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
<td>1997</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>San Joaquin Valley</strong></td>
<td>&gt; 10 MW combined cycle</td>
<td>Gas fuel</td>
<td>Any of the following fuels or fuels containing any of the following fuels: natural gas, LPG, propane, digester and landfill gas</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5 (standard)*</td>
<td>2004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3 (enhanced)*</td>
<td>2004</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Enhanced and Standard refer to compliance timeframes*
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Size</th>
<th>Control Technology</th>
<th>Rule Limit (ppmv @ 15% O&lt;sub&gt;2&lt;/sub&gt;)</th>
<th>Source Test Result (ppmv @ 15% O&lt;sub&gt;2&lt;/sub&gt; - average load)</th>
<th>Fuel</th>
<th>District</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Combined cycle</td>
<td>3.38 MW</td>
<td>Selective catalytic reduction Water injection</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2.5 – 3.7</td>
<td>DG</td>
<td>San Joaquin Valley</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Combined cycle</td>
<td>3.38 MW</td>
<td>Selective catalytic reduction Water injection</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2.5 – 3.9</td>
<td>DG</td>
<td>San Joaquin Valley</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Combined cycle</td>
<td>500 mmbtu/hr</td>
<td>Selective catalytic reduction</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>Permitted at 2.5</td>
<td>DG/NG</td>
<td>Sacramento</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Simple cycle</td>
<td>500 mmbtu/hr</td>
<td>Selective catalytic reduction</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>Permitted at 2.5</td>
<td>DG/NG</td>
<td>Sacramento</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Combined cycle</td>
<td>2,200 mmbtu/hr</td>
<td>Selective catalytic reduction Dry low NOx combustion</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>Permitted at 2.0</td>
<td>DG/NG</td>
<td>Sacramento</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Combined cycle</td>
<td>2,200 mmbtu/hr</td>
<td>Selective catalytic reduction Dry low NOx combustion</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>Permitted at 2.0</td>
<td>DG/NG</td>
<td>Sacramento</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

DG = Digester Gas  NG = Natural Gas
Summary of Source Test Results from (Other Districts) – Turbines

- Bay Area air district does not have any turbines located at a POTW.
- Sacramento air district has four turbines fueled by either natural gas or a blend of natural gas and digester gas.
- San Joaquin Valley air district has permitted two turbines that are fueled by 100% digester gas and is located at a POTW. Both meet the rule limit of 5 ppmv, 10 ppmv NH$_3$.
- More information is needed from facilities and manufacturers to determine the feasibility of achieving lower limits, including gas cleanup.
There is no rule limit for turbines located at POTWs.

The turbines in South Coast AQMD are permitted at 18.8 ppmv and 25 ppmv with source test results ranging from 15 ppmv to 22 ppmv.

Sacramento and San Joaquin Valley air districts have limits for digester gas fired turbines that are more stringent than South Coast AQMD.

Only San Joaquin Valley has permitted turbines located at a POTW that fire 100% digester gas.

- These turbines met the rule limit of 5 ppmv for several years with SCR and water injection.

Gathering information to determine the feasibility of achieving lower limits, including gas cleanup.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Size (mmbtu/hr)</th>
<th>Permit/Rule Limit</th>
<th>Control Technology</th>
<th>Source Test Result* (ppmv @ 3% O₂ – average load)</th>
<th>Test Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Digester</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>Low NOx burner (retrofit)</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dual fuel</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>Low NOx burner</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dual fuel</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>Low NOx burner</td>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Digester</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>Low NOx burner (retrofit)</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dual fuel</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>Low NOx burner</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>2014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dual fuel</td>
<td>10.5</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>Low NOx burner</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dual fuel</td>
<td>4.63</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>Low NOx burner</td>
<td>6.6</td>
<td>2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dual fuel</td>
<td>5.25</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>Low NOx burner</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dual fuel</td>
<td>9.95</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>Low NOx burner</td>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dual fuel</td>
<td>5.25</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>Low NOx burner</td>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dual fuel</td>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>Low NOx burner</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dual fuel</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>Ultra Low NOx burner</td>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dual fuel</td>
<td>10.5</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>Low NOx burner</td>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dual fuel</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>Low NOx burner</td>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dual fuel</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>Low NOx burner</td>
<td>9.5</td>
<td>2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dual fuel</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>Cleaver-Brooks Profire burner</td>
<td>9.8</td>
<td>2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Digester</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>Low NOx burner (retrofit)</td>
<td>11.4</td>
<td>2014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dual fuel</td>
<td>10.5</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>Low NOx burner</td>
<td>11.7</td>
<td>2019</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Unit firing 100% digester gas
Permitted Limits - Boilers

- All digester gas and dual fuel boilers are permitted at 15 ppmv
  - Rule 1146 series specifies a 15 ppmv NOx limit for any boiler > 2 mmbtu/hr that fires digester gas
- All digester gas and dual fuel boilers are meeting their permitted limits
18 source tested boilers with permit limits of 15 ppmv (tested w/ 100% digester gas)
- All source tested under 12 ppmv
- 11 source tested under 9 ppmv
- Units range from 3 – 62 mmbtu/hr – showing good distribution of units

Source tests for 11 digester gas boilers were unavailable
### Limits at Other Air Districts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Air District</th>
<th>Size (mmbtu/hr)</th>
<th>Fuel</th>
<th>Fuel description</th>
<th>Limit (ppmv)</th>
<th>Compliance Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bay Area</td>
<td>&gt; 2</td>
<td>Digester gas</td>
<td>Gas derived from the decomposition of organic matter in a digester</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sacramento</td>
<td>≥ 1-5</td>
<td>Gaseous fuel</td>
<td>Any fuel which is a gas at standard conditions</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>≥ 5-20</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&gt;20</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>San Joaquin Valley</td>
<td>≥ 2-5</td>
<td>Gaseous fuel</td>
<td>Any fuel which is a gas at standard conditions</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>12/9*</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&gt; 5</td>
<td>&lt; 50% by volume, PUC quality gas</td>
<td>Specific to units at a wastewater treatment facility</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2014</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*atmospheric/non-atmospheric installed after 2010
Emissions Achieved in Practice – Other Air Districts

- Bay Area and Sacramento air districts do not have any boilers fueled by digester gas located at a POTW
- San Joaquin Valley air district has one boiler located at a POTW

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Size (mmbtu/hr)</th>
<th>Control Technology</th>
<th>Rule Limit</th>
<th>Source Test Result* (ppmv @ 3% O₂ – average load)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dual fuel</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td>Low NOx burner</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>7.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Unit firing 100% digester gas
Summary – Boilers

- All digester gas and dual fuel boilers >2mmbtu/hr are permitted at the Rule 1146 limits for digester gas – 15 ppmv
- All boilers are meeting the 15 ppmv limit
- Source tested boilers indicate that lower digester gas limits are achievable for digester gas and dual fuel boilers
- Limits as low as 7 ppmv
  - Size ranges from 3 - 62 mmbtu/hr
  - Retrofit and replacement control technology to be reviewed
- San Joaquin Valley and Sacramento districts have limits for boilers using digester gas that are more stringent than the current limits at South Coast AQMD
- Only the San Joaquin Valley district has a boiler that is firing on 100% digester gas and is located at a POTW
  - Boiler is subject to a 9 ppmv limit
Meeting Summary

- PR 1179.1 will address turbines, boilers, and microturbines
- Staff is still assessing if engines will be included in PR 1179.1
- Other air districts impose lower limits for boilers and turbines using digester gas
- Source tests demonstrate that lower limits for boilers and turbines are feasible
- Control technology needs to be further looked into to determine feasibility and cost
Next Steps

- Continue site visits
- BARCT assessment – technology assessment
- Draft rule language for applicability
Contacts

Melissa Gamoning  
Assistant Air Quality Specialist  
mgamoning@aqmd.gov  
909-396-3115

Kevin Orellana  
Program Supervisor  
korellana@aqmd.gov  
909-396-3492

Mike Morris  
Planning and Rules Manager  
mmorris@aqmd.gov  
909-396-3282

To receive e-mail notifications for Rule 1179.1 - NOx Emission Reductions from Combustion Equipment at Publicly Owned Treatment Works Facilities, sign up at: www.aqmd.gov/sign-up