



## **Minutes for the AQMP Advisory Group Meeting Wednesday, December 13, 2006**

### **1. Welcome and Introduction**

Dr. Elaine Chang, Deputy Executive Officer, Planning, Rule Development and Area Sources, called the meeting to order at 9 a.m. and presented a brief overview of the agenda for the meeting. There were no comments on the November minutes.

### **2. Status of the AQMP CEQA Analysis**

Dr. Steve Smith, Program Supervisor, gave an update on CEQA analysis. The Notice of Preparation/Initial Study was released for 30-day public review period on November 14, 2006. Three comment letters were received to date, and the comment period closed on December 13, 2006. The Draft Program Environmental Impact Report (PEIR) is currently being prepared, and will be released by January 2007 for a 45-day comment period. The PEIR will analyze the AQMP "program" including all the control measures recommended in the draft plan for stationary sources, state and federal sources with the assumption that "bump-up" request is needed, and rely on SCAG's PEIR for the 2004 RTP to analyze the impacts of the transportation control measures. Further analysis of secondary impacts to environmental areas will be provided for seven alternatives which include two no-project alternatives. One alternative will consider CARB's control concepts while another alternative will focus on less SO<sub>x</sub> and more NO<sub>x</sub> reductions for PM<sub>2.5</sub> attainment. The final alternatives will consider more NO<sub>x</sub> and less VOC reductions and an less NO<sub>x</sub> and more VOC reductions for ozone attainment. The CEQA analysis will be available for Governing Board certification by April 2007.

### **3. Status of the AQMP Socioeconomic Analysis**

Dr. Sue Lieu, Program Supervisor, gave a brief overview of the REMI model and the socioeconomic analysis. The objective of the socioeconomic analysis is to provide public information on benefits of meeting state and federal ambient air quality standards (avoiding health effects, congestion relief, better visibility, less damage to environments, additional crop yield), as well as costs by industry, job and other socioeconomic impacts to the regional as well as 19 sub-regions. The socioeconomic analysis will analyze all CEQA alternatives.

### **4. Methodology of Health Benefit Assessment**

Dr. Leland Deck and Ms. Lauraine Chestnut, Stratus Consulting Inc., gave a brief overview on the long term cohort studies on health effects related to PM<sub>2.5</sub> and ozone, and their recommended methods that could be used for estimating health benefits from air quality improvements in the South Coast area, and the associated economic values associated with these health benefits. Health benefits have both financial (cost of illness) and non-financial (enjoyment of life and activities) values. Recent studies generally use the Willingness-To-Pay (WTP) to describe how much income or expenditure people are willing to trade for a change in probability of a health effect, and there are many other alternatives to associate a dollar value to health effects. Based on a comprehensive analysis of available studies, Stratus Consulting recommended a unit value of \$4.8 million for premature mortality caused by mainly PM<sub>2.5</sub>. Monetary values for other health effects such as chronic bronchitis, heart attacks were also provided. Stratus Consulting would address several key issues such as choice of mortality function that should be used and whether or not there is a threshold for health effects, and provide support and explanation for their mortality valuation in a final report to staff in a near future.

### **5. AQMP Status and Update**

Mr. Joe Cassmassi, Planning & Rules Manager, gave a summary on the development process of the AQMP. Staff completed 9 regional workshops and multiple presentations to regional COGs and local government, written comments are being reviewed. The revised draft 2007 AQMP will be released by January 15. For attainment demonstration, staff is in the process of finalizing final carrying capacities, simulating ozone and PM<sub>2.5</sub> with updated emissions, refining the control strategies. He indicated that "bump-up" seems inevitable. He also summarized comments and suggestions of additional control measures received from the workshops.

### **6. Appointment of Advisory Council Member**

Dr. Elaine Chang, Deputy Executive Officer, asked the Advisory Committee to appoint two Advisory Council members to first review the health effects analysis, as well as policy issues and others, and provide recommendations to management and the Board. The Advisory Committee nominated Mr. Bob Wyman as the proposed member and Ms. Mee H. Lee as an alternate.

### **7. Closing Remarks/Scheduling Next Meeting/Adjourn**

There were no additional public comments. Dr. Chang indicated that the next meeting would be held on January 10, 2006 and adjourned the meeting at approximately 12:00 p.m.

## December 13, 2006 AQMP Advisory Group Meeting

### MEMBERS PRESENT

Stacy Alameida, MTA  
Ed Avol, University of Southern California  
Don Blose, American Lung Association of Inland Counties  
Shep Burton, Consultant  
Frank Caponi, Los Angeles County Sanitation District  
Wook J. Cho, Korean Drycleaners-Laundry Association  
Curtis Coleman, Southern California Air Quality Alliance  
Diane Forte, Coalition for Clean Air/Environment Now  
Kim Fuentes, South Bay Cities Council of Governments  
Gretchen Hardison, City of Los Angeles  
Bill LaMarr, California Small Business Alliance  
Mee H. Lee, Lee Consulting Group  
Clayton Miller, Construction Industry Air Quality Coalition  
Ken Pulskamp, City of Santa Clarita  
Rebecca Rosen, U.S. EPA  
Paul Ryan, P.F. Ryan & Associates  
Gary Stafford, Calif. Furniture Manufacturers Association  
Lucille Van Ommering, California Air Resources Board  
Carla Walecka, Realtors Committee on Air Quality  
Lee Wallace, SoCal Gas Company  
Mike Wang, Western States Petroleum Association  
Bob Wyman, Latham & Watkins

### OTHERS PRESENT

John Billheimer, Enviro-Reality  
Craig Chalfant, City of Long Beach  
Miles Héller, BP  
Lori Huddleston, MTA  
Bryan Jacobsen, Natural Resources Defense Council  
Frances Keeler, Keesal, Young & Logan  
Julia Lester, ENVIRON International Corp.  
Ralph Morris, ENVIRON International Corp.  
Ivan Tether, California Independent Petroleum Assn.

### MEMBERS ABSENT

Ralph Appy, Port of Los Angeles  
Howard Berman, Environmental Mediation  
Gerry Bonetto, Printing Industries of California  
Art Brown, City of Buena Park  
Nathan DeBoom, Milk Producers Council  
Bob Dulla, Sierra Research  
Bahram Fazeli, Communities for a Better Environment  
Vernon Hall, Clean Air Now  
David Hayes-Bautista, Center for the Study of Latino Health  
Joe Garcia, City of Monrovia  
David Gutierrez, City of San Gabriel  
Steve Levy, Center for Continuing Study of CA Economy  
Melissa Lin Perrella, Natural Resources Defense Council  
Glenn Maddalon, American Lung Assn of Orange County  
Anastacio Medina, American Lung Assn. of Los Angeles  
Jonathan Nadler, SCAG  
Penny Newman, Center for Community Action and EJ  
Peter Okurowski, Association of American Railroads  
Bill Quinn, CCEEB  
Ty Schuiling, San Bernardino Associated Governments  
Jeb Stuart, Consultant  
Monte Ward, Orange County Transportation Authority  
John Wohlmuth, Coachella Valley Association of Govts

### AQMD STAFF

Sam Atwood, Media Manager  
Joe Cassmassi, Planning & Rules Manager  
Elaine Chang, Deputy Executive Officer  
Lori Berard, Air Quality Specialist  
Shah Dabiarian, Air Quality Specialist  
Ed Eckerle, Program Supervisor  
Tracy Goss, Program Supervisor  
Michael Harris, Senior Deputy District Council  
Patricia Kwon, Air Quality Specialist  
Lee Lockie, Director  
Sue Lieu, Program Supervisor  
Jean Ospital, Director  
Minh Pham, Air Quality Specialist  
Gary Quinn, Program Supervisor  
Steve Smith, Program Supervisor  
Laki Tisopulos, Assistant Deputy Executive Officer  
Patti Whiting, Staff Specialist  
Jill Whynot, Planning & Rules Manager