



Minutes for the STMPR Advisory Group Meeting Wednesday, February 14, 2007

1. Welcome and Introduction

Mr. Joe Cassmassi, Planning & Rules Manager, Planning, Rule Development and Area Sources, called the meeting to order at 1:00 p.m. and presented a brief overview of the agenda for the meeting. There were no comments on the January meeting minutes.

2. AQMP Status and Update

Mr. Cassmassi gave a summary on the development process of the AQMP. Staff focused in finalizing modeling analysis, control strategies, attainment demonstration, and responding to comments received. CARB recommended a bifurcation of ozone and PM2.5 plans. The District proposed an integrated PM2.5 and 8-hour ozone plan since the District could demonstrate attainment with PM2.5 by 2015 utilizing a combination of CARB's control measures and several complimentary measures developed by District staff. In addition, the District could demonstrate compliance with 8-hour ozone standards by 2023 with the use of a black box of 20 tons per day VOC and 160 tons per day NOx. A "bump-up" request to "extreme" ozone classification was inevitable to minimize impacts to NSR and Title V and avoid sanctions. Based on a court decision, the District was required to demonstrate compliance with 120 ppb ozone in 2010 and re-establish conformity budgets. For 1-hour ozone attainment demonstration, staff used the 2009 inventory and the August 1997 episode, and predicted a maximum concentration of about 130-140 ppb. Staff planned for a Governing Board public hearing on May 4th.

3. Update on Regional Modeling Analyses

Staff made inventory adjustments, included emission reductions from composting and livestock rules, made adjustments to the attainment demonstration, and reviewed weekend versus weekday emissions and performance. Staff will focus in localized impacts and closely evaluate the emissions distribution profile. Staff plans to use stricter criteria to evaluate model performance such as looking for days where concentrations are within 20-25% of the base-year design value or days where concentrations are larger than 70 ppb, 80 ppb, or 85 ppb. Staff used a more realistic 45 ppb top boundary ozone concentration instead of an EPA default clean value of 25 ppb. No sensitive analysis for PM2.5 boundaries was conducted.

For PM2.5 and PM10, staff used 3-year design value based on 2003-2005, not 2004-2006, because there were uncertainties associated with the 2005-2006 inventory; and conducted several analyses including an assessment for visibility. For ozone, staff conducted several studies (1-hour 2010, 8-hour 2010, 8-hour 2012 for Coachella Valley, 8-hour 2021 and 2023 with and without the amount of emission reductions estimated for the "black box") and several CEQA alternatives (no-plan, heavy-VOC, VOC & NOx combined reduction scenarios). Projected annual emissions in tons per day for VOC, NOx, SOx, and PM2.5 in 2014, and projected annual emissions in tons per day for VOC, NOx and CO in 2023, with and without implementing the control measures, were presented.

In summary, attainment of 24-hour PM2.5 standard can be demonstrated with ease, attainment of annual PM2.5 in 2014 needs the utilization of all CARB's measures and additional mobile source measures developed by the district, and attainment of 8-hour ozone in 2024 requires the use of emission reductions from the black box.

4. Review of Initial Comments from Peer Reviews

Mr. Cassmassi provided a summary of all comments received on Appendix V and District's responses to these comments. The responses will be in Appendix V. A peer review group including 5 experts was formed to review the modeling analyses and staff responses to Appendix V.

During the meeting, the STMPR Advisory Committee raised several questions, and answers provided by staff are as follows:

Q: Does the District control measures have to meet a certain cost criteria such as 10,000 – 12,000 \$/ton? (Rob Farber)

A: In the event that the cost effectiveness is higher than a certain level, staff commits to alert the Governing Board about the situation, however there is no cutoff limit.

Q: Why does the District oppose to the bifurcation of the PM2.5 and ozone plans? (Rob Farber)

A: 80-85% emission reductions come from off-road/on-road vehicles, and fleet turnover is expensive even though the technologies are ready for 2010 implementation. Tracking old engines (heavy duty trucks, construction equipment etc.) is a challenging task, therefore we need to tackle the task as soon as possible to meet the PM2.5 attainment date by 2015.

Q: Did the modeling that predicted 130-140 ppb maximum 1-hour ozone concentration under-predict or over-predict the actual concentrations? Did the District conduct any sensitivity analysis for VOC or NOx boundary levels? (Shep Burton)

A: Staff will double-check the performance statistic of the model and will conduct additional analyses in the future.

Q: Does the plan use under-estimated SOx baseline emissions of 43 tpd for 2014? (Rob Farber)

A: No. About 60-70% of SOx emissions came from port related equipment and the plan carefully incorporated all impacts from goods movement and reflected that in the baseline.

In addition, several suggestions were provided: 1) a discussion on the expected air quality improvements or trends in the Executive Summary or Appendix V of the 2007 AQMP should be provided for public information; and 2) a more realistic localized heavy NOx reduction scenario (e.g. reduction from heavy-duty trucks at the ports, or construction equipment) should be analyzed and the ozone reduction benefits from the east and west basin should be discussed.

5. Closing Remarks/Scheduling Next Meeting/Adjourn

There being no additional public comments, Mr. Cassmassi adjourned the meeting at approximately 4:00 p.m.

February 14, 2007 STMPR Advisory Group Meeting

MEMBERS PRESENT

Ed Avol, University of Southern California
Carol Bohnenkamp, U.S. EPA
Shep Burton, Consultant
Rob Farber, Southern California Edison

MEMBERS ABSENT

John DaMassa, California Air Resources Board
Bill Dennison, California Small Business Alliance
Fereidun Feizollahi, California Air Resources Board
Jane Hall, California State University - Fullerton
Deng Bang Lee, Southern California Association of Governments
Steve Levy, Center for Continuing Study of the California Economy
Fred Lurmann, Sonoma Technology, Inc.
Rory MacArthur, Western States Petroleum Association
Ralph Morris, ENVIRON International Corp.
Paul Ong, UCLA School of Public Policy & Social Research
Karen R. Polenske, MIT Dept of Urban Studies & Planning
George Treyz, Regional Economic Models, Inc.

OTHERS PRESENT

Alan DeSalvio, Mojave Desert AQMD
Matt Russell, ENVIRON International Corp.
Arnie Sherwood, ITS, SCAG, UCB

AQMD STAFF

Joe Cassmassi, Planning & Rules Manager
Minh Pham, Air Quality Specialist
Laki Tisopoulos, Assistant Deputy Executive Officer
Xinqi Zhang, Air Quality Specialist