



# Assembly Bill (AB) 617 Community Air Initiatives

## San Bernardino, Muscoy Community Steering Committee Meeting #2

Thursday, January 17, 2019 — 6:00 p.m. – 8:00 p.m.  
Muscoy PAL Center  
2450 Blake St. Muscoy, CA 92407

Time	Item	Presenter	Why is this important?
5:45 pm	Doors open  Poster session – Monitoring Technologies		
6:00 pm	Welcoming Remarks, and Meeting Expectations – 5 min	Miguel Rivera <i>(Muscoy Resident, Cohost)</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Set expectations for this meeting</li> </ul>
6:05 pm	Meeting Overview, Air Quality Concerns and Community Boundaries, continued committee discussion and input – 60 min	Jo Kay Ghosh <i>(Health Effects Officer, Planning, Rule Development &amp; Area Sources)</i>  <b>Committee Members</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Requested by CSC members</li> <li>• Help us understand this community's air quality concerns, and start thinking of which concerns can be addressed through AB 617</li> <li>• Provide input on community boundaries, which will help guide technical analysis and prioritization of air quality concerns in this community</li> </ul>
7:05 pm	STRETCH BREAK - 5 min		
7:10 pm	Community Air Monitoring and committee Q&A – 30 min	Andrea Polidori <i>(Atmospheric Measurements Manager, Science &amp; Technology Advancement)</i>  <b>Committee Members</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Requested by CSC members</li> <li>• Provide ideas for what monitoring we may want to do through AB 617</li> </ul>
7:40 pm	CSC Charter and Next Steps – 5 min	Jo Kay Ghosh <i>(Health Effects Officer, Planning, Rule Development &amp; Area Sources)</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ask committee to sign charter</li> <li>• Preview of next steps, next meeting topics</li> </ul>
7:45 pm	Public Comment – 15 min		
8:00 pm	Adjourn		



# Assembly Bill (AB) 617 Community Air Initiatives

## San Bernardino, Muscoy Community Steering Committee Meeting #2 Attendance

Thursday, January 17, 2019 — 6:00 p.m. – 8:00 p.m.  
Muscoy PAL Center  
2450 Blake St. Muscoy, CA 92407

Affiliation	Representative (Primary <sup>1</sup> , Secondary <sup>2</sup> )	Participant in the Committee Meeting Discussion
<b>Category: Agency, school, university, hospital</b>		
San Bernardino County Land Use Planning Manager	Karen Watkins <sup>1</sup> , Suzanne Peterson <sup>2</sup>	Suzanne Peterson
San Bernardino County Department of Public Health	Bernadette Beltran <sup>1</sup> , Corwin Porter <sup>2</sup>	Bernadette Beltran
CSUSB	Andreas Beyersdorf <sup>1</sup> , Rudy Morales Gamez <sup>2</sup>	Rudy Morales Gamez
City of San Bernardino	Polonia Majas <sup>1</sup> , Flor Murillo <sup>2</sup>	
Omnitrans	Anna Jaiswal <sup>1</sup> , Jeremiah Bryant <sup>2</sup>	Anna Jaiswal
Loma Linda University School of Public Health	Dr. Rhonda Spencer-Hwang <sup>1</sup> , Dr. Ryan Sinclair <sup>2</sup>	Dr. Ryan Sinclair
San Bernardino County Transit Authority	Otis Greer <sup>1</sup> , Nicole Soto <sup>2</sup>	Nicole Soto
San Bernardino Valley College	Mary Valdemar	Mary Valdemar
SDUSD Board of Education – K-12	Abigail Medina	
<b>Category: Elected Officials</b>		
Assembly member Eloise Reyes Office	Maha Rizvi	Maha Rizvi
Supervisor Josie Gonzales	Erika Willhite	Erica Willhite
<b>Category: Business representative, business organization or labor organization</b>		
Railroads – BNSF	LaDonna DiCamillo	LaDonna Di Camillo
Warehouse/Logistics - Pacific Mountain Logistics - San Bernardino	B.J. Patterson	
Utility - Southern California Edison	Christopher Abel <sup>1</sup> , Tammy Yamasaki <sup>2</sup>	Tammy Tamasaki
Wyatt's Paint & Body, Inc.	Kris Wyatt <sup>1</sup> , Randy Wyatt <sup>2</sup>	Randy Wyatt
Tacos Don Ramon	Angel Rodriguez	
<b>Category: Community organization</b>		
Chicano Indigenous Community for Culturally Conscious Advocacy and Action	Jason Martinez <sup>1</sup> , Paula Alvarez Venegas <sup>2</sup>	Jason Martinez
Muscoy Action Committee	Jane Hunt-Ruble	Jane Hunt-Ruble
Center for Community Action and Environmental Justice (CCA EJ)	Andrea Vidaurre <sup>1</sup> , Allen Hernandez <sup>2</sup>	Andrea Vidaurre
Sierra Club, My Generation	Angelica Balderas	Angelica Balderas
CLCV ED Fund	Matt Abularach-Macias	
<b>Category: Active residents (not representing a community organization or a business)</b>		
Active Resident - San Bernardino	Joshua Bell	

Active Resident - San Bernardino	Valerie Dobesh	Valerie Dobesh
Active Resident - San Bernardino	Mathew Taylor	Mathew Taylor
Active Resident - San Bernardino	Ruben Garza	
Active Resident - San Bernardino	Maria G. Corona	Maria G. Corona
Active Resident - San Bernardino	Graciela Regalado	Graciela Regalado
Active Resident - San Bernardino	Olga Medina	Olga Medina
Active Resident - San Bernardino	Lorena Rodarte	Lorena Rodarte
Active Resident - San Bernardino	James Albert	James Albert
Active Resident - San Bernardino	Ericka Flores <sup>1</sup> , Ada Trujillo <sup>2</sup>	Ericka Flores
Active Resident – Muscoy	Miguel A. Rivera	Miguel A. Rivera
Active Resident – Muscoy	Christopher Alonso	

**Meeting Summary:** During CSC Meeting #2, a summary of air quality concerns and community boundaries were discussed. Information on air monitoring, and ideas for air monitoring through AB 617 were shared with the committee.

1. **Welcoming Remarks and Meeting Expectations** – Miguel Rivera (Muscoy Resident, Co-host)
  - a. Miguel welcomed community participants and reviewed meeting roles and expectations, and objectives for Meeting #2.
2. **Meeting Overview, Air Quality Concerns and Community Boundaries, Continued Committee Discussion and Input** – Jo Kay Ghosh (SCAQMD)
  - a. Jo Kay provided a brief review of how MATES IV, CalEnviroScreen 3.0, community nominations, and information about proximity of schools to industrial land use and freeways were used to identify the Year 1 communities for AB 617. She then summarized the results of the air quality concerns mapping exercise from Meeting #1 and then moved into a discussion of the updated boundary lines.
  - b. Andrea Vidaurre (Center for Community Action and Environmental Justice (CCA EJ)) asked why warehouses were being considered a mobile source. She further asked if classifying warehouses as mobile sources will limit actions that can be taken since SCAQMD primarily focuses on stationary sources and has limited authority over mobile sources.
    - i. Jo Kay responded that warehouses were marked as mobile sources because the primary concern were the trucks coming in and out of the facility. Nonetheless on the map the warehouses were marked in a special way to indicate they were warehouses being considered as mobile sources to be aware of the distinction. She clarified that while SCAQMD regulates stationary sources, it also does a lot of work on mobile sources (e.g. facility-based mobile source measures).
  - c. Jane Hunt-Ruble (Muscoy Action Committee) asked what the need of a boundary line is since winds cause pollution to affect the whole Basin. She also commented that along Cajon Blvd./Route 66, there are a lot of trucks parked in empty lots in residential communities.
    - i. Jo Kay responded that historically as an agency SCAQMD has addressed regional area quality issues, but AB 617 directs the agency to focus on community-level

air quality, and thus the need to define boundaries for this specific effort. As for the trucks parking in residential areas, Jo Kay mentioned that community members did bring up this concern in the last meeting.

- d. Dr. Ryan Sinclair (Loma Linda University School of Public Health) furthered Jane's comment about trucks parking in residential areas, stating that San Bernardino is a big trucking port. He commented that San Bernardino Railyard is a main source of pollution and a main cause of asthma as his recent published works shows. He offered to share his research findings with the community.
- e. Jane Hunt-Ruble (Muscoy Action Committee) asked if off-road vehicles and gas powered leaf blowers were discussed as pollution sources.
  - i. Jo Kay responded that off-road vehicles were identified as a concern in the last meeting. The location identified in the community mapping exercise was outside the emission study area (pink line), but sources within the study area can be considered for the plans.
- f. Andrea Vidaurre (CCA EJ) mentioned that CARB's blueprint for AB 617 says that measures taken in the AB 617 communities will go beyond existing state and regional rules. She asked if this applies to the San Bernardino and Muscoy area. She also inquired if rules can be written specifically for the San Bernardino and Muscoy Community.
  - i. Jo Kay responded that what the agency writes into the emission reduction plan will go beyond what is currently being done. As for SCAQMD rules, Jo Kay commented that these rules are meant to apply basin-wide. However, the idea or need for a rule may originate from a particular community-identified need. She further commented that incentives and investments can be targeted at specific areas.
- g. Mary Valdemar (San Bernardino Valley College) commented that point 46 from the community mapping exercise is not indicated on the map. She further inquired about the reasoning for choosing Grant Ave. as the southern boundary. She also commented that at the last meeting the mapping activity was a spontaneous activity and many of the members were not prepared to identify all the sensitive receptors, especially parks of which many have not been identified on the map.
  - i. Jo Kay responded that as a technical point SCAQMD had to draw a boundary line using streets or other natural boundaries for the emission study. She also commented that the SCAQMD is not solely relying on the community concern map to identify the sensitive receptors, many different land maps will be used. Nonetheless if there are other specific sensitive receptors of concern, the CSC can email the locations to the AB 617 team.
- h. James Albert (San Bernardino resident) asked if the freeway structure can be considered a stationary source. He asked if the CSC has the authority to recommend regulating the freeway structure, since often freeways in the area have been expanded to allow for more cars and thus increase air pollution.
  - i. Jo Kay responded that this isn't something that the agency has done in the past but we may inquire with other agencies like Caltrans whether this is a possibility.

- i. Jane Hunt-Ruble (Muscoy Action Committee) mentioned that she lives on 2nd Ave. below Vermont school and that there is a lot of traffic from the school buses.
  - j. Ericka Flores (San Bernardino resident) asked what process is going to be used to approve the map boundaries. She asked if the boundary of the map can be changed at a later stage.
    - i. Jo Kay responded that final comments will be taken tonight and then the staff will finalize the boundaries so that the CSC can move into strategizing priorities. She mentioned that SCAQMD needs to complete a technical analysis and changing the boundaries will require another analysis, so any comments on boundaries should be mentioned now.
- 3. Community Air Monitoring and Committee Q&A – Andrea Polidori (SCAQMD)**
- a. Andrea Polidori (SCAQMD) discussed the purposes of air monitoring, and noted some challenges of monitoring air pollution in areas where there are many air pollution sources. He discussed the types of monitoring that are currently being done in Wilmington, Carson, and West Long Beach, and also the benefits and limitations of the different types of air monitoring that can be implemented in AB 617 communities.
  - b. Mary Valdemar (San Bernardino Valley College) asked how the mobile monitoring platform has been used in the past and for what duration.
    - i. Andrea Polidori (SCAQMD) shared the example of the mobile monitoring that was done in Porter Ranch. The SCAQMD outfitted the mobile platform to measure methane and drove approximately 2,000 miles in the area to monitor. He shared that the vehicle pictured in the presentation has previously been outfitted to measure different pollutants like PM2.5, ozone, NO<sub>2</sub>, etc.
    - ii. Jason Low (SCAQMD) further commented that the agency also has the ability to contract out mobile platforms if the agency does not have the in-house capabilities to measure certain pollutants.
  - c. Dr. Ryan Sinclair (Loma Linda University School of Public Health) inquired about the application of data from sensors when the public and community organizations use them. He asked what role the sensor data would play in compliance and enforcement. He further noted that since quality control can be an issue, he felt it may be better for SCAQMD to handle monitoring rather than community organizations and the public. Dr. Sinclair also inquired about the most productive way community organizations can use sensors, and what the process would be for citizens to host them.
    - i. Andrea Polidori (SCAQMD) responded that one of the important reasons to have low cost sensors is for community education. One possibility is to have one regulatory sensor and then add low cost sensors. The regulatory sensors can lead to compliance action, but low cost sensors can help hone in on problem areas.
  - d. Andrea Vidaurre (CCA EJ) asked how many regulatory instruments are used in the area.
    - i. Andrea Polidori (SCAQMD) responded that there is one main regulatory instrument station. In addition to this there are other monitoring stations as part of different grants and research.

- ii. Jason Low (SCAQMD) commented that the regulatory instrumentation looks at the region as a whole to make sure we meet national standards, but with AB 617 we will now be adding to what currently exists.
- e. LaDonna DiCamillo (Railroads – BNSF) asked how information from the monitoring plans will enhance what the CSC is trying to find out.
  - i. Jo Kay responded that more information may be needed to address certain air quality issues. Monitoring will serve as a tool for investigation, track progress, and prioritize concerns. Jo Kay commented that monitoring can be used as a complementary tool. However, given the deadlines where monitoring must be in place by July 2019 and emission reduction plans approved in September 2019, the emission reduction plans will be written before there is much new monitoring data available through AB 617 efforts.
  - ii. Jason Low (SCAQMD) mentioned that the regulatory monitoring station is located on 4<sup>th</sup> street just east of the San Bernardino City Hall.
- f. Jane Hunt-Ruble (Muscoy Action Committee) asked if the current federal administration’s positions will have an impact on this project.
  - i. Jason Low (SCAQMD) commented that AB 617 is a state initiative and isn’t affected by the federal EPA.
- g. Dr. Ryan Sinclair (Loma Linda University School of Public Health) asked what the July 2019 deadline is for.
  - i. Andrea Polidori (SCAQMD) responded that it is to start the monitoring process.
- h. Randy Wyatt (Wyatt's Paint & Body, Inc.) requested clarification on the current monitoring employed in the San Bernardino and Muscoy area as well the duration of their use. He further asked for guidance on the number of monitoring stations needed when moving forward with AB 617. He also asked if monitors measure natural gas.
  - i. Andrea Polidori (SCAQMD) commented that monitoring in the San Bernardino area started 20 to 30 years ago. In 2012 SCAQMD did the MATES IV study. Furthermore, there was another project that involved monitoring around the railyard with one year of data. Andrea mentioned that there is an ongoing monitoring project in the area through the US EPA STAR GRANT, for which there is currently one year’s worth of data. Andrea responded that to determine the number of monitoring stations and type of monitoring employed a discussion in the CSC will take place. Andrea also answered that the monitoring equipment used in those studies did not measure natural gas.
- i. Mary Valdemar (San Bernardino Valley College) asked if there is capacity to put a low cost sensor on every sensitive receptor. She further asked if there has been any correlation between current sensors and the locations of concern the community has identified.
  - i. Jason Low (SCAQMD) responded that monitoring is one tool but that there are others tools as well. He commented that it would make sense to see what is appropriate for the issue. If there are more complicated things that need to be measured low cost sensors won’t be effective. Low cost sensors do not work in all cases.

- ii. Andrea Polidori (SCAQMD) further responded that the preliminary data shows the railyard and the freeway as points of concern.
    - j. Ericka Flores (San Bernardino resident) asked if there is a way to track the distance pollutants have travelled.
      - i. Andrea Polidori (SCAQMD) responded that sensors can be placed at different distances from a source. He further commented that this is a good question and it will be important to discuss in the future.
- 4. CSC Charter and Next Steps – Jo Kay Ghosh (SCAQMD)**
- a. Jo Kay commented that there were only a few changes made to the charter and that committee members must sign and submit the charter by January 24<sup>th</sup>, 2019. Any additional air quality concerns should also be submitted by January 24<sup>th</sup>. Jo Kay requested that members submit their biographies ASAP.
  - b. Toxics tour/Facility tour
    - i. Jo Kay asked if there were any suggestions or volunteers for a tour.
    - ii. Ericka Flores (San Bernardino resident) volunteered to help organize the tour.
    - iii. Jason Martinez (Chicano Indigenous Community for Culturally Conscious Advocacy and Action) volunteered to help organize the tour.
    - iv. Jane Hunt-Ruble (Muscoy Action Committee) asked what facilities could be toured. She suggested the [*Baldwin*]\* facility as a good facility to reach out to.  
*\*Please note: The feed of the recording was inaudible at this portion of the meeting.*
  - c. Jo Kay announced that Meeting #3 will be on February 21<sup>st</sup> 6:00 - 8:00 p.m. at the Muscoy PAL Center
    - i. Jo Kay mentioned that prioritization, strategies, and enforcement will be discussed.
  - d. Jo Kay announced that the first Technical Advisory Group (TAG) meeting will be February 27<sup>th</sup> in Diamond Bar.
- 5. Public Comment**
- a. Andrea Vidaurre (CCA EJ) asked if details of the budget have been finalized.
    - i. Jo Kay responded that it hasn't been determined yet how much SCAQMD will receive from the state.
    - ii. Jason Low (SCAQMD) further commented that SCAQMD will be looking at all three communities to determine prioritization of the air monitoring resources.
  - b. Ericka Flores (San Bernardino resident) commented that it is refreshing to see Miguel as a co-host and asked how other co-hosts would be identified. She also asked if the TAG members have to be on the CSC.
    - i. Jo Kay responded that SCAMQD requested volunteers from Muscoy and San Bernardino to co-host. She further responded that TAG members are volunteers from the CSC as well as other technical experts.
  - c. LaDonna DiCamillio (Railroads – BNSF) asked what the role of the TAG is and if the TAG will take from the role of the CSC. She further asked about the qualifications to be on the TAG.
    - i. Jo Kay responded that the TAG will not overrule anything that is discussed in CSC. The TAG will help give input on the specific monitoring technologies,

emission inventory, as well as what data sources are good and reliable to use. As far as qualifications, Jo Kay responded that while nothing specific is required, TAG members should be able to understand and contribute to a technical discussion about emissions inventories, air pollution modeling, and air monitoring.

- d. Jason Martinez (Chicano Indigenous Community for Culturally Conscious Advocacy and Action) asked if the agency has data on what amount of pollution is coming from LA into the IE, and how will it affect what is done through AB 617.
  - i. Jo Kay responded that the agency's regional monitoring looks at pollution from LA into the IE. She mentioned that as part of AB 617 the CSC may look at a specific air pollutants to see what portion is local and what is from outside.
- e. Mary Valdemar (San Bernardino Valley College) asked if maps can be printed for the community members that don't have access to internet.
  - i. Jo Kay responded that there are interactive maps online. As for printing she would check and follow up.
- f. Luis Portillo asked if the public can get access to whatever information is provided to the committee. He also mentioned that the current format to have public comment only at the end of the meeting doesn't allow for the public to be as engaged. He suggested a public comment section after each section.
  - i. Jo Kay responded that the AB 617 team will explore ways to share information sent to the committee. She also responded that staff would explore having public comment earlier in the agenda.
- g. Jason Martinez (Chicano Indigenous Community for Culturally Conscious Advocacy and Action) commented that he still feels a top down model from the agency. He commented that it is the job of the committee to make this known.
- h. Asher Jones commented that she has been writing notes, but it's hard to keep up with the conversation when public comment is only at the end. She said that those with visual disabilities can't see the presentation.
- i. Leland Lubinsky brought attention to the southern map boundary. He commented that south of the boundary is a carbon copy of Muscoy. He wanted to know where the idea of a southern boundary came from, and suggested San Timotoe drainage as a boundary.
  - i. Jo Kay emphasized that the intent of AB 617 is to focus on community level issues, and cautioned extending the boundary too far. She also commented that any improvements to mobile source emissions in the current emissions study area would benefit the area south of the current boundary (pink line).
  - ii. Jason Low (SCAQMD) further commented that just because an area is not in the boundary and covered by AB 617 doesn't mean the agency can't address the issues through other mechanisms.
- j. Pace commented that the AB 617 process is very exciting and thanked SCAQMD and the committee. He wanted to know what the process for the community to engage and be a part of the decision making process is. He wanted to know what the steering committee is actually steering and if decisions will be made on consensus or a vote.
  - i. Jo Kay responded that the steering committee is one of the main resources to help the agency engage and get information from the community.

- ii. Mary Valdemar (San Bernardino Valley College) responded that as members of the CSC, the members have an obligation to listen to the community and make space for people to make concerns known. She encouraged the public to use the provided contact information of CSC members and communicate with them. Mary shared that San Bernardino Valley College has a bi-weekly Air and Water Quality Meeting that is open to the public. In terms of decision making, Mary commented that the committee members just signed the CSC Charter that said that the committee will try to reach consensus and her opinion is to always strive for consensus.
- iii. Jo Kay responded that as a committee we will try to reach consensus.
- iv. Jane Hunt-Ruble (Muscoy Action Committee) responded that those living in Muscoy can come to the Muscoy Committee Action meetings.
- k. Juanita Chen reiterated that having a public forum is important.