



Assembly Bill (AB) 617 Community Air Initiatives

Wilmington, Carson, West Long Beach
Community Steering Committee Meeting #3

Tuesday, February 12, 2019 — 6:00 p.m. – 8:15 p.m.
Wilmington Senior Center
1371 Eubank Ave., Wilmington, CA 90744

Time	Item	Presenter	Why is this important?
5:45 pm	Doors open		
6:00 pm	Welcoming Remarks, and Facilitator Introduction – 5 min	Facilitator	
	Enforcement Overview – 5 min	Terrence Mann (Assistant Deputy Executive Officer, Compliance and Enforcement)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> To help explain examples of enforcement strategies used by SCAQMD Requested by CSC members
	Q & A on Enforcement – 5 min	Committee Members	
6:15 pm	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Strategies to Address Air Pollution Concerns – 10 min Air Pollution Emissions Data – 10 min 	Jo Kay Ghosh (Health Effects Officer, Planning, Rule Development & Area Sources)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> To help with developing emission reduction plans in this community To understand where emissions come from in this community
	Q & A on Strategies and Emissions Data – 5 min	Committee Members	
6:40 pm	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Community Boundary and Prioritization of Air Quality Concerns – 10 min Prioritization Activity – 30 min Activity Report Back – 20 min Break – 5 min Activity Consensus Results Discussion – 15 min 	SCAQMD staff; Facilitator Committee Members	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Helps SCAQMD prioritize the top air quality concerns from the community Helps guide the SCAQMD's focus for the community emission reduction plans
8:00 pm	Important Reminders and Next Steps – 5 min	Facilitator	
8:05 pm	Public Comment – 10 min	Members of the public	
8:15 pm	Adjourn		



Assembly Bill (AB) 617

Community Air Initiatives

Wilmington, Carson, West Long Beach

Community Steering Committee Meeting #3 Attendance

Tuesday, February 12, 2019 — 6:00 p.m. – 8:15 p.m.

Wilmington Senior Center

1371 Eubank Ave., Wilmington, CA 90744

Affiliation	Representative (Primary ¹ , Secondary ²)	Participant in the Committee Meeting Discussion
Category: Community Organization		
Century Villages at Cabrillo	Jeffery Tate	
Coalition for a Safe Environment	Jesse Marquez ¹ , Rick Pulido ²	Jesse Marquez
Communities for a Better Environment	Alicia Rivera ¹ , Ashley Hernandez ²	Ashley Hernandez
Long Beach Alliance for Children with Asthma	Sylvia Betancourt ¹ , Maria Reyes ²	
Los Cerritos Neighborhood Association	Gary Hamrick ¹ , Joe Hower ²	
Philippine Action Group for the Environment	Fe P. Koons	
SBCC Thrive LA	Maribel Alejandre ¹ , Leticia Herrera ²	Maribel Alejandre
Category: Active Resident (city indicated below)		
Carson	Daniel Toledo	Daniel Toledo
Carson	Sergio Franco	
Carson	Joseph Luis Piñon ¹ , Yasaman Houshang ²	Joseph Luis Pinon
Carson	William Koons	William Koons
West Long Beach	Christopher Chavez ¹ , Pastor Anthony Quezada ²	Christopher Chavez
West Long Beach	Jacob Broderick ¹ , Emelio Ramirez ²	Jacob Broderick
West Long Beach	Ron Batiste	
West Long Beach	Whitney Amaya	Whitney Amaya
Wilmington	Salvador Lara	Salvador Lara
Wilmington	Flavio Mercado	Flavio Mercado
Wilmington	Dulce Altamirano	Dulce Altamirano
Wilmington	Magali Sanchez-Hall ¹ , Silvia Arredondo ²	Magali Sanchez-Hall
Category: Agency or School		
City of Carson	Saied Naaseh ¹ , McKina Alexander ²	Saied Naaseh
City of Los Angeles	Uduak-Joe Ntuk ¹ , Erica Blyther ²	Erica Blyther
Gulf Avenue Elementary School	Linda Bassett ¹ , Esperanza Romero ²	
LA County Public Health	Matt Baca, Janet Scully	Katie Butler*
Long Beach Public Health	Nelson Kerr ¹ , Judeth Luong ²	
Long Beach Unified School District	Brooke Murray	Brooke Murray
Port of Los Angeles	Tim DeMoss ¹ , Amber Coluso ²	Tim DeMoss
University of Southern California	Jill Johnston	Jill Johnston
Category: Business, Business Organization, or Labor Organization		
Carson Chamber of Commerce	John Wogan ¹ , Janet Grothe ²	John Wogan
Long Beach Area Chamber of Commerce	Jeremy Harris ¹ , Brissa Sotelo ²	Jeremy Harris
Wilmington Chamber of Commerce	Dan Hoffman ¹ , Cecilia Moreno ²	Dan Hoffman
Marathon Petroleum Company	Ken Dami ¹ , Olga Chavez ²	Olga Chavez
Rail - Union Pacific	Lupe Valdez	Lupe Valdez
Trucking - Yusen Logistics	Cameron D. Smith ¹ , Nikki Nguyen ²	
Labor - USW Local 675	Pat Patterson	

* Katie Butler sat at the CSC table to represent the LA County Public Health Department since neither official representative was present. However she was to participate as a member of the public.

Meeting Summary: During CSC Meeting #3, an overview of enforcement actions, strategies to address air pollution concerns, and air pollution emissions data were discussed. Community members also prioritized air quality concerns in their communities during the small group discussion.

1. **Welcoming Remarks, and Facilitator Introduction** - Valerie Martinez (Facilitator)
 - a. Valerie (Facilitator) introduced VMA facilitator services and what their role will be in the CSC meetings. She commented that VMA has been working with communities on environmental justice issues for many years and hopes to create an opportunity for everyone's voices to be heard in this committee. She further commented that today's meeting's focus is on prioritization and strategies to reduce air pollution in the Wilmington, Carson, and West Long Beach Community. She went over housekeeping rules and shared that questions will be taken on question cards throughout the meeting. She also shared that there will be public comment period at the end of the meeting, which is limited to three minutes of speaking time per person.
2. **Enforcement Overview** - Terrence Mann (SCAQMD)
 - a. Terrence provided an overview of the Office of Compliance and Enforcement, including how the inspector teams are organized. He discussed the types of enforcement activities, which include response to complaints, inspections, response to notifications, source education and outreach, special project investigations, and enforcement actions. He further commented that noise complaints, most indoor air quality issues, and soil remediation and water issues are not in SCAQMD's jurisdiction. He summarized the types of air quality concerns identified by the Wilmington, Carson, and West Long Beach community, and noted the types of enforcement activities that SCAQMD staff could conduct for each of these types of concerns (refineries, warehouses and industrial facilities, oil and gas sites, waste management, and the ports/harbor). He discussed the variety of tools to monitor and enforce for these different source categories.
3. **Q and A on Enforcement**
 - a. William Koons (Carson resident) asked what category construction falls in.
 - i. Terrence responded that the broad categories presented represent what the community identified as concerns and does not represent everything. Nonetheless construction and truck related activity can be classified as warehouse and industrial sources.
 - b. Jesse Marquez (Coalition for a Safe Environment) asked why information about idling truck sweeps has not been provided to the Wilmington community.
 - i. Terrence responded this is a newer enforcement strategy that is being used to enforce CARB's rule for idling trucks.
 - c. Jesse Marquez (Coalition for a Safe Environment) asked what the process is for a resident to receive a final report after a complaint is filed.
 - i. Terrence responded that if it concerns an ongoing investigation or involves a criminal offence, information cannot be released. However, SCAQMD does its

- ii. Jo Kay responded that the license plate readers allow us to tap into a database that gives us information about truck owners and their engine model. SCAQMD has not used this technology yet but CARB has, and it is a technology that we can employ.
 - f. Jesse Marquez (Coalition for a Safe Environment) commented that the public does support the use of public funds to support private business and public incentive programs. He also commented that the public supports the “polluter pays principle” for the generation of funds, especially for businesses to mitigate their community impacts. He also would like SCAQMD to conduct a survey of cities who have unique ordinances such as Los Angeles City Clean Up Green Up.
 - g. Jill Johnston (University of Southern California) asked how the percentage of air toxics, including gas and particles, was calculated. She also wanted to know if oil and gas extraction is included in the air emission inventory.
 - i. Jo Kay responded that oil and gas extraction is included in the air emission inventory.
 - h. Jacob Broderick (West Long Beach resident) commented that emission inventories do not take leaks into account. He wanted to know if there was a way to quantify toxics from methane leaks.
 - i. Jo Kay responded that there are ways to measure methane but that CARB has authority over greenhouse gases. She commented that this question should be directed to CARB.
 - i. Maribel Alejandre (SBCC Thrive LA) asked if the focus is only on stationary sources.
 - i. Valerie (Facilitator) responded that we are focusing on both stationary and mobile sources.
 - ii. Jo Kay further commented that although we have authority over stationary sources we do have the ability to impact mobile sources through various programs.
 - j. Daniel Toledo (Carson resident) asked what emissions are from the off-road category.
 - i. Jo Kay responded that construction vehicles, trains and ships are examples of what is considered off-road.
 - k. Jesse Marquez (Coalition for a Safe Environment) commented that SCAQMD previously provided online planned flaring events and unplanned flaring events. SCAQMD stopped publishing unplanned flaring events, but the public still requests unplanned flaring event information.
 - l. Maribel Alejandre (SBCC Thrive LA) asked for the statistics and details of benzene from mobile sources.
 - i. Valerie (Facilitator) commented that the information would be provided afterwards.
7. **Community Boundary and Prioritization of Air Quality Concerns** – SCAQMD staff; Valerie Martinez (Facilitator)
- a. Valerie (Facilitator) explained that the goal of the prioritization activity is to identify air quality priorities for this community and that each group would be responsible for identifying what the top priorities are for this community. She also explained how the activity will be conducted. Valerie provided information about the budget commitment that SCAQMD has put behind the AB 617 program. She shared the finalized community

boundary line, along with areas where there were several stationary or mobile source concerns identified by the community.

8. Prioritization Activity – Group Activity

- a. Groups were formed with up to six CSC members each, generally consisting of one to two members from each of the different categories (resident, local agency, business, etc.) of the CSC roster to discuss and build a consensus on what the priorities for the community should be. There was also a discussion group for members of the public, who also participated in the same activity. One facilitator and one note taker were present at each table to guide the activity and take notes on the details of each prioritized concern. After 30 minutes of discussion, each group shared aloud to all meeting attendees to describe their top air quality concerns.
- b. Jo Kay summarized that refineries, ports, and truck traffic were the top priorities. For the refineries, flaring and leaks were of primary concern. For the ports, ship emissions and leaks were a concern. For truck traffic, in addition to the diesel emissions, the truck routes were of concern. Other top categories included oil and gas drilling near residential areas, rail related emissions at railyards and from the ports, schools and other sensitive receptors. Jo Kay commented that this information is a starting point to develop strategies to address these concerns.

9. Important Reminders and Next Steps - Valerie Martinez (Facilitator)

- a. Valerie (Facilitator) reviewed the future meetings, which included:
 - i. Technical Advisory Group (TAG) Meeting: February 27th (9:00 – 11:00 am) at the SCAQMD’s Diamond Bar headquarters. Valerie (Facilitator) commented that six members volunteered to be on the TAG, however the final three representatives for the TAG need to be decided.
 - ii. CSC Meeting #4: March 14th at 6:00pm at the Wilmington Senior Center
- b. Valerie (Facilitator) also reviewed the future potential topics for the next meeting, which could include:
 - i. California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) timeline
 - ii. RECLAIM – Best Available Retrofit Control Technology (BARCT) Rule development update
 - iii. Indirect Source Rule (ISR) development update
 1. Rules to control mobile source emissions at warehouses, railyards, etc.

10. Public Comment

- a. Alex Spataru, a researcher at UCLA, provided information about UCLA’s study on clean and dirty fuel used by ships at the Port. Researchers are using a floating device to monitor the type of fuel ships are using. This information can be relayed to enforcement authorities.
- b. Erica Blyther, with the City’s Office of Natural Gas and Petroleum Administration and Safety, commented that there were a lot of questions about oil and gas drilling. Currently they are looking at a motion to include buffer zones and boundaries around oil and gas drilling sites. She commented that there are more health concerns with populations around a higher density of wells. Currently in Wilmington there are 500 approved sites, 200 active sites, and 90 more sites in planning.
- c. Ashely Hernandez (Communities for a Better Environment) commented that she wanted to focus on the replacement of boilers and heaters at refineries, as well as make sure

that there is a moratorium on the expansion of refineries. She commented that wet scrubbers should be implemented in refineries as they have been done in Northern California.

- d. Valerie (Facilitator) relayed questions from the question cards about why only limited sensitive receptors were identified on the map. She responded that the map included those receptors identified by the community, but is in no way meant to be a complete list and can be added to.
- e. Valerie (Facilitator) relayed questions from the question cards about the Technical Advisory Group (TAG) including what the qualifications are to be a member and the meeting commitments.
 - i. Jo Kay responded that the meetings will be quarterly. As far as qualifications, Jo Kay responded that while nothing specific is required, TAG members should be able to understand and contribute to a technical discussion about emissions inventories, air pollution modeling, and air monitoring.
- f. Jesse Marquez (Coalition for a Safe Environment) commented that he would like to see how the prioritization information will be used in developing the community plan. He requested time to write something more formal in the plan if this is the goal.
 - i. Jo Kay responded that SCAQMD will follow the guidance laid out in the CARB blueprint. She commented that for each of the highest priorities, SCAQMD will write the strategies for the plan.
 - ii. Jesse Marquez (Coalition for a Safe Environment) commented that he would like to know what is on the agenda so that he can prepare and tap into the expertise of the community members.
 1. Valerie (Facilitator) responded that it would be helpful for members to draft documents and share that information so that those ideas can be incorporated.
- g. Harvey Eder (Public Solar Power Coalition) discussed issues related to natural gas use and encouraged conversion to solar power.