South Coast
Air Quality Management District
South Coast AQMD 21865 Copley Drive, Diamond Bar, CA 91765-4178
(909) 396-2000 • www.aqmd.gov

AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT PLAN ADVISORY GROUP MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, September 3, 2020
10:30 a.m. to 12:30 p.m.

1. Welcome, Introductions, Approval of Minutes, and Updates

Mr. Zorik Pirveysian, Planning and Rules Manager of South Coast Air Quality Management District's (South Coast AQMD) Planning, Rule Development, and Area Sources Division, called the Zoom videoconference meeting to order at 10:30 a.m. Dr. Sarah Rees, Assistant Deputy Executive Officer of South Coast AQMD's Planning, Rule Development, and Area Sources Division, welcomed all participants and introduced South Coast AQMD staff present. Dr. Rees asked if there were any comments on the previous meeting's minutes. Since there were no comments, the minutes were approved. Dr. Rees then provided an update on the 2016 AQMP related activities, including the recent U.S. EPA actions on the PM2.5 and Ozone State Implementation Plans (SIP) and Rule 445 amendments to address the contingency measure requirements for PM2.5 standards.

Comments from Advisory Group and Staff Responses:
No comments from the Advisory Group members on this agenda item.

Comments from Public and Staff Responses:
Comments on the implementation of solar technology, the effects of COVID-19, and the impacts of wild fires on the attainment status. Staff thanked the individual and appreciated the comments.

2. Attainment Plan for the 2006 24-hour PM2.5 Standard for the South Coast Air Basin

Dr. Rees provided updates on the draft attainment plan of the 2006 24-hour PM2.5 standard for the South Coast Air Basin. On July 10, 2020, the U.S. EPA proposed to determine that the South Coast Air Basin failed to attain the 24-hour PM2.5 standard by the 2019 attainment date based on the 2017–2019 monitoring data. Two sites, Mira Loma and Compton, exceeded the 24-hour PM2.5 standard. Due to the failure to attain by the deadline, a SIP revision is due to the U.S. EPA by December 31, 2020. Elements of the SIP revision include emissions inventory, attainment demonstration, five percent annual reductions of PM2.5 or PM2.5 precursors, additional feasible measures analysis, reasonable further progress (RFP), and contingency measures. The attainment demonstration includes a two-fold approach. The attainment demonstration for Mira Loma and other monitoring stations (except Compton) is based on the updated emissions inventory and regional air quality modeling analysis. The attainment demonstration for Compton relies on supplemental weight of evidence and air quality trend analysis based on monitoring data. Attainment is expected by 2023 relying on emission reductions from existing regulations included in the baseline. A draft plan will be released on or before September 18, 2020.

Comments from Advisory Group and Staff Responses:
No comments from the Advisory Group members on this agenda item.

Comments from Public and Staff Responses:
Inquiry on whether Compton's proximity to major surrounding freeways could have had an influence on the abnormally high PM2.5 readings in 2017. Staff responded that while higher PM2.5 levels can occur close to freeways, South Coast AQMD has near-roadway monitoring sites to quantify these impacts. The near-road site located close to Compton and adjacent to freeway I-710 measured lower PM2.5 concentrations when the Compton monitoring site experienced the peak readings in 2017, indicating the high PM2.5 levels in Compton were likely due to local human activity such as wood burning or fireworks.

Comments about concerns over fossil fuels, natural gas, and methane emissions, and that solar is competitive and should be incorporated into the new plan. Staff thanked the individual and appreciated the comments.

Inquiry regarding South Coast AQMD's plans to get low NOx trucks on the road, and the opportunities from CARB's mobile source strategy and cap and trade program. Staff responded that extensive penetration of near-zero and zero emission technology is needed to attain the ozone standards. Working groups are being established to develop specific mobile source control strategies over the next year for 2022 AQMP.

Inquiry regarding how wildfires started on government land or by arsonists affect 2006 PM2.5 attainment goals. Staff responded that South Coast AQMD works with other agencies including CALFIRE on wildfire management and prescribed burn management plans to minimize smoke impacts. While smoke from wildfires affects air quality, the days when air quality is strongly impacted by wildfire are eligible to be considered as exceptional events and be excluded from attainment determination calculations based on U.S. EPA's guidelines.

3. Coachella Valley Extreme Area Plan for the 1997 8-hour Ozone Standard

Dr. Rees provided updates on the draft attainment plan of the 1997 8-hour ozone standard for Coachella Valley. On July 10, 2019, the U.S. EPA granted South Coast AQMD's request to reclassify Coachella Valley from Serious to Extreme nonattainment, with a new attainment deadline of June 15, 2024. A SIP revision is due to the U.S. EPA by February 2021. Regional air quality modeling shows that existing rules provide the emission reductions needed for Coachella Valley to reach attainment by the deadline while recently-adopted rules and regulations since 2016 AQMP will provide additional assurance of attainment. Key SIP elements in the draft plan include emissions inventory update, attainment demonstration, reasonably available control technology/reasonably available control measure (RACT/RACM) analysis, RFP, and contingency measures. The draft plan will be released on or before September 11, 2020.

Comments from Advisory Group and Staff Responses:
Inquiry on whether the plan is specific to Coachella Valley and clarifications on the process of the RACT analysis. Staff clarified that the plan is specific to Coachella Valley. On the RACT analysis, staff explained that attainment by 2023 is expected to be achieved based on existing baseline emissions, and other recently adopted regulations provide additional emission reductions that will further ensure attainment. The RACM demonstration included in the Coachella Valley Plan builds upon the last AQMP and provides an update in some areas where there are new developments since the last AQMP. Emission reductions from all RACM, if identified, should advance the attainment

date by one year. Staff evaluated the recently adopted rules and regulations in other air agencies for additional possible control measures but did not identify any new feasible RACM.

Inquiry on whether South Coast Air Basin will need further control measures in order to reduce ozone levels in Coachella Valley, and if there will be an assessment of how COVID-19 affects ozone levels. Staff responded that modeling shows that existing regulations from 2016 AQMP for the South Coast Air Basin and regulations reflected in EMFAC 2017 are sufficient to attain the standard in Coachella Valley without additional controls. Staff is currently evaluating the impacts of COVID-19, but emission perturbations from the COVID-19 situation will not affect future attainment strategy.

Comments from Public and Staff Responses:
Inquiry on the whether the two ground ozone monitors (Palms Springs and Indio) are representative of all of Coachella Valley. Staff explained that ozone is a regional pollutant, and these two monitors are representative of a large area and are in locations consistent with U.S. EPA siting criteria. The monitors are placed where modeling shows the highest expected ozone concentrations. Due to meteorology and the closer proximity to South Coast Air Basin, Palm Springs, located further west of the Coachella Valley, shows higher levels of ozone than Indio which is located southeast of Palm Springs. Staff expects peak ozone levels to occur in northern and western Coachella Valley with concentrations decreasing further south and east. Therefore, the two existing monitors should represent the higher ozone levels in Coachella Valley.

Inquiry on who to contact regarding air quality modeling. Staff responded that Zorik Pirveysian and Sang-Mi Lee are the points of contact.

Inquiry regarding how wildfires are classified if they are started by people on government land. Staff responded that it is outside of South Coast AQMD's range of responsibilities to classify wildfires, but that smoke impacts have not been seen in Coachella Valley.

Comment that using modeling will not help reach the 2023 attainment deadline, and the transition to solar power will help climate and other problems. Staff thanked the individual and appreciated the comments.

4. 2022 AQMP Control Measure Development

Mr. Pirveysian presented updates for the 2022 AQMP, South Coast AQMD's next comprehensive plan to address the 2015 8-hour ozone standard (70 ppb) for the South Coast Air Basin (Extreme nonattainment) and Coachella Valley (Severe nonattainment). Four SIP requirements for the 2015 8-hour ozone standard that were due to the U.S. EPA on August 3, 2020, namely the base year emissions inventory, emissions statement certification, RACT demonstration, and VMT demonstration, have been adopted and submitted to the U.S. EPA by the August 3rd deadline. Other SIP requirements for the 2015 8-hour ozone standard include the attainment demonstration, RACM, RFP, transportation conformity budgets, and contingency measures. In addition to the AQMP Advisory Group, working groups for on-road mobile sources, off-road mobile sources, and residential and commercial buildings are being established to have focused discussions on potential control measures in these areas. The working groups are scheduled to meet regularly starting soon. The draft AQMP is scheduled to be released next fall, and a final AQMP is due to the U.S. EPA by August 2022.

Comments from Advisory Group and Staff Responses:
Inquiry on whether 2022 AQMP will focus specifically on 2015 ozone standard, or will it include other standards, and when will black box measures be identified. Staff responded that while the 2022 AQMP will focus on the 2015 standard, the 1997 and 2008 ozone standards will be addressed to the extent possible. South Coast AQMD submitted a Contingency Measure Plan in December 2019 to address black box reductions for the 1997 ozone standard.

Inquiry on how much NOx reductions are needed for attainment and how reliant the plan will be on new sources of funding; also, when additional provisions for NOx and VOCs need to be implemented via Clean Air Act Section 185(b). Staff is currently in the process of updating emissions inventory. The 2016 AQMP highlighted the need for near zero and zero emission technologies with 55% NOx reductions needed by 2031. Based on air quality modeling analysis, NOx controls are the fastest and most effective way for ozone attainment. The emission reductions from existing and future regulations and new measures will be estimated with incentives helping achieve the remaining balance of reductions needed for attainment. On the Section 185(b) requirement, staff responded that a program needs to be in place by 2028, 10 years prior to the attainment date of 2038, for non-attainment fees. The program will go into effect if South Coast Air Basin fails to reach attainment.

Inquiry on while NOx emissions were reduced in the spring during the first part of the COVID-19 shutdown, a similar reduction in ozone did not take place. Staff responded that initially there were lower NOx emissions due to reduced traffic during the COVID-19 shutdown. However, changes in weather and frequent precipitation affect the ozone levels. The rain was followed by high temperature days that promote ozone formation which also played a pivotal role in the high ozone episodes. Marginal level of NOx reductions could result in a temporary increase of ozone due to ozone chemistry. However, significant amount of NOx reductions would overcome this increase and result in ozone reductions. Staff is currently conducting air quality modeling for the COVID-19 shutdown period, which provides a unique opportunity to evaluate the modeling performance and attainment strategy. During COVID-19 period, there are also uncertainties regarding VOC emissions, such as increased use of disinfectant and hand sanitizers. VOCs are generally more difficult to measure, and the NOx-to-VOC ratio is also an important factor governing ozone formation and chemistry.

Inquiry about what South Coast AQMD can do with regard to zero-emissions and near zero emissions mobile sources as well as facility-based indirect sources. Staff is continuing its efforts on facility-based mobile source measures despite South Coast AQMD's limited authority over mobile sources for indirect source rules. Staff considers an all-inclusive approach utilizing incentives, regulatory programs, leveraging CARB regulations, and voluntary commitments.

A study by Ramboll Engineering addresses the issue of no changes/increase in ozone emissions when NOx concentrations significantly decreased. Staff is aware of the study and has had extensive discussion with the scientific community, other regulatory agencies, and the industry on the impact of NOx since the 2016 AQMP. South Coast AQMD's strategy reflects the best-known practices to attain the ozone standards. A small reduction in NOx results in a temporary increase in ozone, but substantial NOx reductions will attain the ozone standard.

Comment that CARB's focus is on long-term goals, and that the 2023 attainment deadline is not a priority. Staff acknowledged the comment and thanked the individual.

Comments from Public and Staff Responses:
Inquiry on equity implications associated with pollution and near-zero emission technology and how closely South Coast AQMD works with SCAG regarding growth projections of commuters. Staff responded that the latest growth projections from 2020 RTP provided by SCAG will be used in the 2022 AQMP. South Coast AQMD sees the extensive need for near-zero technologies and will work with all levels of governments to promote and implement these technologies. Rongsheng Luo, Advisory Group member representing SCAG, responded that SCAG works closely with local jurisdictions, the public, and major stakeholders to develop growth projections and develop sustainability strategies to forecast regional trends.

Inquiry on whether South Coast AQMD can use the COVID-19 mandated shutdown to promote more telecommuting programs, if South Coast AQMD will deploy more air monitoring stations in the future, how many community members are in this group, and if more tree planting and greenspace programs can be implemented. Staff is monitoring changes in emissions due to COVID-19, and while there was a sharp decline in light duty passenger vehicles during COVID-19 shutdown, truck traffic remained at a similar level with truck emissions responsible for a significant portion of NOx emissions. Regulations are already in place for employee commute trip reductions, applicable to businesses over 250 employees. Teleworking is an option to comply with this regulation. Staff is evaluating how to further encourage telecommuting. Monitoring stations are subject to U.S. EPA siting requirements and are re-evaluated every 5 years. Biogenic emissions, including VOC emissions from trees, are already included in modeling. Low VOC tree planting programs as well as other greenhouse gas regulations from local cities are being investigated for co-benefits.

Inquiry on if there is a modeling working group, if the previously referenced in-house analysis on the relationship between NOx and ozone will be publicly available, and if emissions reductions from industries significantly affected by COVID-19, such as the airline sector, will be considered and reflected in the inventories. Staff responded that the off-road mobile source working group will address aircraft emissions and is open to ideas on how to move forward with improving modeling; the Scientific, Technical & Modeling Peer Review Advisory Group also addresses modeling at South Coast AQMD. VOC white papers developed during 2016 AQMP discuss temporary increases of ozone on the path to attainment. Temporary disbenefit is widely known in several publications. The 2022 AQMP is under development based on SCAG's growth projections. Rongsheng Luo, Advisory Group member representing SCAG, stated that long-term COVID-19 impacts will be reflected in 2024 growth projections and forecasts, but not the 2020 Regional Transportation Plan that is scheduled for adoption on the same day.

Comment that the environment is not in a clean state and renewable natural gas is not clean. Staff acknowledged the comment and thanked the individual.

5. Other Business

No additional comments, announcements, or reports from the Advisory Group members.

6. Public Comments

Comment that the incentive funding should benefit the communities. Staff acknowledged the comment and thanked the individual.

7. Next Meeting tentatively planned for November/December 2020

Members Present (43)
Adrian Martinez, Earthjustice
Alexander Fung, San Gabriel Valley Council of Governments
Amy Zimpfer, United States Environmental Protection Agency (U.S. EPA), Region 9
Bill LaMarr, California Small Business Alliance
Bridget McCann, Western States Petroleum Association
Carol Bohnenkamp, United States Environmental Protection Agency (U.S. EPA), Region 9
Christopher Chavez, Coalition for Clean Air
Chris Shimoda, California Trucking Association
Curtis Coleman, Southern California Air Quality Alliance
Dan McGivney, Southern California Gas
David Darling, American Coatings Association
David Rothbart, Southern California Alliance of Publicly Owned Treatment Works
David Pettit, Natural Resources Defense Counsel, Inc.
Dawn Fenton, Volvo
Frances Keeler, California Council for Environmental and Economic Balance
Greg Osterman, Jet Propulsion Laboratory/NASA
James Breitling, Southern California Contractors Association
Jeremy Avise, California Air Resources Board
Josh LaFarga, Laborers Local 1309
Kendal Asuncion, Los Angeles Area Chamber of Commerce
Lakshmi Jayaram, Future Ports
Lori Huddleston, Los Angeles Country Metropolitan Transportation Authority
Marc Carrel, Breathe LA
Martha Masters, Riverside County Transportation Commission
Marcos Holguin, International Longshore and Warehouse Union
Margot Molloy, Association of American Railroads
Marisol Monge, Kenworth Truck Company
Michael Benjamin, California Air Resources Board
Michael Lewis, Southern California Contractors Association
Otis Greer, County of San Bernardino
Paul Ryan, California Refuse Recycling Council
Peter Herzog, NAIOP, Commercial Real Estate Development Association, SoCal Chapter
Peter Okurowski, Association of American Railroads
Richard Parks, Redeemer Community Partnership
Rita Loof, RadTech
Rongsheng Luo, Southern California Association of Governments
Ryan Kenny, Clean Energy
Priscilla Hamilton, Southern California Gas Company
Sarah Wiltfong, BizFed
Tammy Yamaski, Southern California Edison
Thomas Jelenic, Pacific Merchant Shipping Association
Tim DeMoss, Port of Los Angeles
Todd Campbell, Clean Energy

Public Attendees and Interested Parties

Aaron Rojas
Abas Goodarzi, US Hybrid
Alek Van Hougton
Alison Torres
Amber Coluso
Amy Jeffries
Charles Williams
Christine B.
Claire Garcia
Craig Sakamoto
E. Anderson
Florence Gharibian
Frank Forbes
Georgia Seivright
Greg Busch, Marathon Petroleum Corporation
Harvey Eder
Howard Berman
IBI Group
Jacqueline Moore
James Perez
Johnathan Burkett
Karin Fickerson
Kiersten Melville
Lauren Paladino
Lee Kindberg-Maersk
Lin Wang
Lisa Wunder, Port of Los Angeles
Mark Abramowitz
Marshall Waller
Matthew Densberger
Nancy Matson
Nicolas Serieys
Philip John Johnson
Robert Nguyen
Ron Brugger
Ross Zelen
Ryan McMullan
Rynda Kay
Scott King, Ph.D., CARB
Scott Weaver, Ramboll Environ
Shawn Weaver
Stephanie Bream
Tanya Seneviratne
Taylor Collison
Teja Ganapa
Tim French
Tim Pohle, Airlines for America

Tom Williams
Tyler Harris
Yasaman Azar Houshang, Alta Environmental

South Coast AQMD Staff Present
Anthony Tang, Information Technology Supervisor
Barbara Baird, Chief Deputy Counsel
Barbara Radlein, Program Supervisor
Cristina Lopez, Sr. Public Information Specialist
Cui Ge, Ph.D., AQ Specialist
Dan Garcia, Planning and Rules Manager
Diana Thai, Program Supervisor
Elham Baranizadeh, Ph.D., AQ Specialist
Elliott Popel, AQ Specialist
Evelyn Aguilar, AQ Specialist
Ian MacMilian, Planning and Rules Manager
Jeanette Short, Sr. Public Information Specialist
Jo Kay Ghosh, Health Effects Officer
Kalam Cheung, Ph.D., Program Supervisor
Kathryn Roberts, Deputy District Counsel II
Kayla Jordan, Assistant AQ Specialist
Kelly Gamino, Program Supervisor
Lane Garcia, Program Supervisor
Marc Carreras-Sospedra, Ph.D., AQ Specialist
Melissa Maestas, Ph.D., AQ Specialist
Naveen Berry, Assistant Deputy Executive Officer
Paul Stroik, Ph.D., AQ Specialist
Pedro Piqueras, Ph.D., AQ Specialist
Philip Fine, Ph.D., Deputy Executive Officer
Rui Zhang, Ph.D., AQ Specialist
Ryan Finseth, Ph.D., AQ Specialist
Rosalee Mason, Secretary
Sang-Mi Lee, Ph.D., Program Supervisor
Sarah Rees, Ph.D., Assistant Deputy Executive Officer
Scott Epstein, Ph.D., Program Supervisor
Shah Dabirian, Ph.D., Program Supervisor
Veera Tyagi, Principal Deputy District Counsel
Xiang Li, Ph.D., AQ Specialist
Xinqiu Zhang, Ph.D., Senior Staff Specialist
Zorik Pirveysian, Planning and Rules Manager