



# South Coast Air Quality Management District

21865 Copley Drive, Diamond Bar, CA 91765-4178  
(909) 396-2000 • [www.aqmd.gov](http://www.aqmd.gov)

## AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT PLAN ADVISORY GROUP MEETING MINUTES

Wednesday, February 3, 2021  
10:00 a.m.

### 1. Welcome, Introductions, Approval of Minutes, and 2016 AQMP Updates

Mr. Zorik Pirveysian, Planning and Rules Manager of South Coast Air Quality Management District's (South Coast AQMD) Planning, Rule Development, and Area Sources Division, called the Zoom videoconference meeting to order at 10:00 a.m. Dr. Sarah Rees, Deputy Executive Officer of South Coast AQMD's Planning, Rule Development, and Area Sources Division, welcomed all participants and introduced South Coast AQMD and California Air Resources Board (CARB) staff present. Since there were no comments on the previous meeting's minutes, the minutes were approved. Dr. Rees provided an update on the 2016 AQMP related activities including the recent U.S. EPA actions on the PM<sub>2.5</sub> and Ozone State Implementation Plans (SIPs), CARB's South Coast On-Road Heavy-Duty Vehicle Incentive Measure, and contingency measure requirements.

#### Comments from Advisory Group and Staff Responses:

*Whether the reduction for the on-road vehicle incentive measure is above and beyond the existing regulations that CARB has in effect.* Staff confirmed that the reductions for this measure are beyond CARB's existing Truck and Bus Regulation.

#### Comments from Public and Staff Responses:

No comments from the public members on this agenda item.

### 2. Update on Other SIP Activities

Mr. Pirveysian provided updates on recent SIP-related activities. For the 2006 24-hour PM<sub>2.5</sub> standard, the South Coast Air Basin (Basin) is classified as a Serious nonattainment area with an attainment date of 2019. Based on the 2017–2019 monitoring data, the Basin failed to attain the PM<sub>2.5</sub> standard by the required deadline. Accordingly, the PM<sub>2.5</sub> Attainment Plan (PM<sub>2.5</sub> Plan) was prepared to address the Clean Air Act (CAA) requirements. Based on the updated emissions inventory and modeling analysis, the attainment is expected by 2023 (or earlier) based on ongoing emission reductions from implementation of adopted rules and regulations. The PM<sub>2.5</sub> Plan was approved by the South Coast AQMD Governing Board in December 2020 and subsequently submitted to the U.S. EPA through CARB. Based on the preliminary PM<sub>2.5</sub> design value for 2018–2020, the Basin actually met the 2006 PM<sub>2.5</sub> standard by end of 2020. Exceptional event demonstrations such as wildfires or fireworks need to be submitted to the U.S. EPA. Once the U.S. EPA approves the exceptional event demonstrations and finalizes a clean data determination, attainment-related SIP requirements would be suspended.

For the 1997 8-hour ozone standard, the Coachella Valley was classified as Severe nonattainment with an attainment deadline of June 2019. Based on the monitoring data from 2016–2018, the Coachella Valley did not meet the standard by the required deadline and was subsequently

## Air Quality Management Plan Advisory Group Minutes for February 3, 2021 Meeting

reclassified as an Extreme nonattainment area with a new attainment date of June 2024. The Coachella Valley Extreme Area Ozone Plan was developed to address the CAA requirements for the Extreme classification. Based on the updated emissions inventory and modeling, the attainment is expected by 2023 based on ongoing emission reductions from adopted rules and regulations. The Extreme Area Ozone Plan was approved by the Governing Board in December 2020 and subsequently submitted to the U.S. EPA through CARB. Contingency measures will be addressed in a separate rulemaking process and vehicle miles traveled (VMT) offset demonstration will be addressed by CARB.

### Comments from Advisory Group and Staff Responses:

No comments from the Advisory Group members on this agenda item.

### Comments from Public and Staff Responses:

*Comments on SCAG's VMT estimates for the region. Projections of lower VMTs are unrealistic and could adversely impact the SIP process and motor vehicle emissions budget.* CARB staff responded that VMT offset is a specific requirement in the CAA demonstrating that the VMT increase is offset by transportation control strategies/measures. For the Coachella Valley, the demonstration shows that control programs in place would offset the increases in VMT. SCAG staff responded that SCAG's Regional Transportation Plan/Sustainable Community Strategy (RTP/SCS) development is an extensive process and reflects local inputs. The U.S. EPA staff also added that the VMT offset requirement dates back to the 1990 CAA Amendments and it only focuses on VOC. More information is provided in the staff report prepared by CARB.

*Question on potential consequences or penalties to the region as a result of not meeting the PM<sub>2.5</sub> standard.* Staff responded that when the region fails to meet a standard, the U.S. EPA will issue a failure to attain notice which requires a new SIP that shows expeditious attainment of the standard as early as possible. The PM<sub>2.5</sub> Plan was developed to fulfil this requirement. Potential sanctions can be triggered for failing to implement the plan.

## **3. Update on 2022 AQMP Development**

Mr. Pirveysian presented updates on the development of the 2022 AQMP which primarily focuses on demonstrating attainment of the 2015 8-hour ozone standard of 70 ppb for which the Basin is classified as an Extreme nonattainment area with an attainment date of August 3, 2038, and the Coachella Valley is classified as a Severe nonattainment area with an attainment date of August 3, 2033. The 2022 AQMP is required to be submitted to the U.S. EPA by August 3, 2022. The other required SIP elements are the certifications for the New Source Review (NSR) and Clean Fuel for Boilers, which is due to the U.S. EPA in August 2021.

Dr. Sang-Mi Lee, Program Supervisor of Air Quality Modeling and Emissions Inventory Development, provided updates on the 2022 AQMP design values, emissions inventory, and regional modeling. Dr. Lee discussed the updated emissions inventory reflecting EMFAC2017, air quality modeling for the COVID-19 shelter-in-place period (March to May 2020) and the impact of meteorology on the Basin's ozone and PM<sub>2.5</sub> levels. Dr. Lee reiterated that the NO<sub>x</sub> control path would provide the optimum path to attain the 8-hour ozone standards.

Mr. Pirveysian also provided quick updates on the AQMP stationary source working group (Residential and Commercial Buildings) and mobile source working groups (Heavy-Duty Trucks,

## Air Quality Management Plan Advisory Group Minutes for February 3, 2021 Meeting

Construction and Industrial Equipment, Ocean-Going Vessels, and Aircraft). Mr. Pirveysian concluded his presentation with the overall AQMP schedule and contact information.

### Comments from Advisory Group and Staff Responses:

*Question on the updated inventory for composting processes for the 2022 AQMP.* Staff responded that area source inventories are reviewed and updated when applicable as part of the AQMP emissions inventory development. For the 2022 AQMP, emissions from composting processes are updated based on the latest activity data.

*Inquiry on how quickly zero-emission vehicles (ZEVs) technology would come to fruition, and the need to revisit Rule 317 to avoid unintended consequences with penalties for not achieving attainment.* Staff responded that the 2037 attainment date gives a longer horizon to implement clean technologies. The goal for the 2022 AQMP is to come up with specific defined measures and feasible technologies that can be implemented over this timeframe. CARB has recently adopted several regulations including the Omnibus and the Advanced Clean Truck Regulations. CARB is working with vehicle manufacturers on the supply side and with fleet vehicles on the demand side to bring as many ZEVs as possible into the market. CARB staff also explained that there are certain sources that are within federal authority such as federally-certified trucks operating in California, which account for almost 50 percent of California heavy-duty VMT, as well as construction equipment less than 175 horsepower preempted under federal law. CARB is hopeful to work with the U.S. EPA for the sources that are under CARB or federal authority to reduce emissions from heavy-duty trucks and also promote zero emission technologies at the national level.

*Inquiry on South Coast AQMD's approach on the RACT demonstration for the 2022 AQMP.* Staff responded that some of the U.S. EPA guidelines may be outdated and a letter was recently submitted to the U.S. EPA for consideration of updating the Control Techniques Guidelines (CTGs) for several outdated CTG categories. Staff will be looking at all available technologies and measures that have been adopted by other agencies and districts in the upcoming RACT analysis to evaluate whether there is any opportunity for further emission reductions.

*Question on why the 2022 AQMP focuses only on 2015 8-hour ozone standard while there are closer deadlines for 80 ppb (2023) and 75 ppb (2031) ozone standards.* Staff responded that the primary focus of this 2022 AQMP is to meet the 2015 8-hour ozone standard (70 ppb) with an attainment deadline of 2037 for the Basin and 2032 for the Coachella Valley which is statutorily required by the CAA. As strategies are developed to meet the 2015 ozone standard by 2037, staff will evaluate the benefits of the AQMP measures in the interim years.

*Question on whether the ozone isopleth will change with the 2020 meteorology data.* Staff responded that the ozone isopleths will be updated with 2018 meteorology data because 2018 is the base year for the 2022 AQMP. If the 2020 meteorology is used, isopleths may have different shapes, because factors affecting ambient measurement values (e.g., atmospheric transport, photochemistry, biogenic emissions and manmade emissions) are different from 2018.

*Comments on the incorporation of green and renewable hydrogen and battery electric technologies for mobile transportation and building sectors into AQMP, which will help develop the infrastructure in the market and achieve reductions.* Staff thanked the commenter and noted the comments.

## Air Quality Management Plan Advisory Group Minutes for February 3, 2021 Meeting

*Question on the importance of NOx reductions compared to VOC reductions in meeting the 70 ppb ozone standard.* Staff responded that NOx control strategy is the pathway to meet the 70 ppb standard.

*Comments on the efficacy of continued focus on NOx reductions from stationary sources which have been well controlled over the past decades and are a small slice of total NOx emissions.* Staff acknowledged that stationary sources contribute to about 20 percent of NOx emissions while mobile sources account for 80 percent of NOx emissions. To achieve the level of reductions needed for 2037 attainment, potential feasible reductions from stationary and mobile sources will be evaluated during the AQMP process.

*Comments on the effects of the shifting meteorology and NOx-VOC chemistry on the ozone isopleth and on control approaches.* Staff responded that per the U.S. EPA's guidelines, 2018 was chosen as the base year which represented typical ozone conditions for the Basin. Isopleth is used as general guidance to identify the best and the most effective control strategy. The U.S. EPA does not have official guidance on incorporating the impact of long-term change in meteorology on regional modeling. Staff is working with the U.S. EPA and other academic research groups to best address the impact of long-term change in meteorology on air quality.

*Comments on the inclusion of strategy to meet the State 1-hour ozone standard (90 ppb) in addition to the federal 8-hour ozone standard (70 ppb).* Staff responded that the primary focus of the 2022 AQMP is the 70 ppb ozone attainment as required by the federal CAA. California CAA requires nonattainment areas to continue to make progress towards achieving the state's air quality standards, but there are no fixed attainment deadlines. Staff noted the comment and would work with CARB to address the State 1-hour ozone standard.

### Comments from Public and Staff Responses:

No comments from the public members on this agenda item.

## **4. Other Business**

No additional comments, announcements, or reports from the Advisory Group members.

## **5. Public Comments**

No additional comments from the public other than made above.

## **6. Next Meeting tentatively planned for May/June 2021**

### **Members Present (32)**

Andy Henderson, Building Industry Association (BIA)

Chris Shimoda, California Trucking Association

Curtis Coleman, Southern California Air Quality Alliance

Dan McGivney, Southern California Gas (SoCalGas)

David Darling, American Coatings Association

David Pettit, Natural Resources Defense Council, Inc. (NRDC)

David Rothbart, Southern California Alliance of Publicly Owned Treatment Works (SCAP)

## Air Quality Management Plan Advisory Group Minutes for February 3, 2021 Meeting

Frances Keeler, California Council for Environmental and Economic Balance  
Greg Nord, Orange County Transportation Authority (OCTA)  
Greg Osterman, Jet Propulsion Laboratory/NASA  
John Ungvarsky, U.S. EPA  
Kendal Asuncion, Los Angeles Area Chamber of Commerce  
Kim Fuentes, South Bay Cities Council of Governments  
Lori Huddleston, Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority (LA Metro)  
Marc Carrel, Breathe LA  
Marcos Holguin, International Longshore and Warehouse Union (ILWU) Locals 13, 63, and 94  
Michael Lewis, Southern California Contractors Association  
Patty Senecal, Western States Petroleum Association (WSPA)  
Paul Ryan, California Refuse Recycling Council  
Peter Herzog, NAIOP, Commercial Real Estate Development Association, SoCal Chapter  
Peter Okurowski, Association of American Railroads  
Priscilla Hamilton, Southern California Gas (SoCalGas)  
Richard Parks, Redeemer Community Partnership  
Rita Loof, RadTech  
Rongsheng Luo, Southern California Association of Governments  
Samuel McLaughlin, Volvo  
Tammy Yamasaki, Southern California Edison (SCE)  
Teresa Pisano, Port of Los Angeles  
Thomas Jelenić, Pacific Merchant Shipping Association (PMSA)  
Tim DeMoss, Port of Los Angeles  
Todd Campbell, Clean Energy  
William Zobel, California Hydrogen Business Council

### **Public Attendees and Interested Parties**

Alan De Salvio, Mojave Desert AQMD  
Alek Van Houghton, Ramboll  
Amber Coluso, Port of Los Angeles  
Annaleigh Ekman  
Benjamin Leers  
Bertrand Gaschot, Mojave Desert AQMD  
Betsy Brien, PBF Energy  
Bill LaMarr  
Bobby Gustafson, Riverside County  
Carlo Gavina  
Charles Williams, The Lion Electric  
Chris Gabelich, Metropolitan Water District of Southern California  
Christine Batikian, Port of Los Angeles  
Claire Garcia, The Lion Electric  
Craig Sakamoto, PBF Energy  
Cynthia Rollins, CoolSys, Inc.  
Danielle Morone, Gatzke Dillon & Ballance LLP  
Dianne Brickman, Sherwin-Williams  
Elio Torrealba, SA Recycling  
Eric Anderson, Toyota  
Erin Berger, Southern California Gas (SoCalGas)

## Air Quality Management Plan Advisory Group Minutes for February 3, 2021 Meeting

Greg Busch, Marathon Petroleum  
Howard Berman, E4 Strategic Solutions  
Janet Baad, Alaska Airlines  
Jessica Coria, San Joaquin Valley APCD  
Joe Leighton, Chevron  
John Cho, Southern California Association of Governments  
Lakshmi Jayaram, Ramboll/Future Ports  
Lin Wang, Los Angeles World Airports  
Loraine Lundquist  
Madison Perkins, San Joaquin Valley APCD  
Mana Sangkapichai, Southern California Association of Governments  
Mark Abramowitz, Community Environmental Services, Inc. (CES)  
Mark Taylor, San Bernardino County  
Marshall Waller, Phillips 66  
Michael Corder, San Joaquin Valley APCD  
Mike Tunnell, American Trucking Associations  
Mugi Lukito, Southern California Gas (SoCalGas)  
Noel Muyco  
Pat Dewey, Bosch  
Ramine Cromartie, Western States Petroleum Association (WSPA)  
Renee Nygaard, PBF Energy  
Sam Pournazeri, CARB  
Scott King, CARB  
Scott Weaver, Ramboll  
Susie Rodriguez, APM Terminals  
Sylvia Vanderspek, CARB  
Teja Ganapa, Los Angeles Department of Water and Power (LADWP)/University of Southern California  
Tim French, Chicago Law Partners, LLC  
Timothy Pohle, Airlines for America  
Tom Swenson, Cummins  
Tyler Harris, Ventura County APCD

### **South Coast AQMD Staff Present**

Anthony Tang, Information Technology Supervisor  
Carol Gomez, Planning and Rules Manager  
Cristina Lopez, Sr. Public Information Specialist  
Cui Ge, Air Quality Specialist  
Elliott Popel, Air Quality Specialist  
Eric Praske, Air Quality Specialist  
Jong Hoon Lee, Air Quality Specialist  
Josephine Lee, Sr. Deputy District Counsel  
Kalam Cheung, Program Supervisor  
Kathryn Roberts, Deputy District Counsel  
Kayla Jordan, Air Quality Specialist  
Kelly Gamino, Program Supervisor  
Lane Garcia, Program Supervisor  
Laurence Brown, Air Quality Specialist

## Air Quality Management Plan Advisory Group Minutes for February 3, 2021 Meeting

Matt Miyasato, Deputy Executive Officer  
Michael Krause, Planning and Rules Manager  
Naveen Berry, Assistance Deputy Executive Officer  
Paul Wright, Sr. Information Technology Specialist  
Ricky Lai, Air Quality Specialist  
Rosalee Mason, Secretary  
Rui Zhang, Air Quality Specialist  
Sang-Mi Lee, Program Supervisor  
Sarah Rees, Deputy Executive Officer  
Scott Epstein, Program Supervisor  
Shah Dabirian, Program Supervisor  
Veera Tyagi, Principal Deputy District Counsel  
Wei Li, Air Quality Specialist  
Xinqiu Zhang, Sr. Staff Specialist  
Yanrong Zhu, Air Quality Specialist  
Zorik Pirveysian, Planning and Rules Manager