

BOARD MEETING DATE: February 4, 2022

AGENDA NO. 21

REPORT: Stationary Source Committee

SYNOPSIS: The Stationary Source Committee held a meeting remotely on Friday, January 21, 2022. The following is a summary of the meeting.

RECOMMENDED ACTION:  
Receive and file.

Ben J. Benoit, Chair  
Stationary Source Committee

JA:cr

---

**Committee Members**

Present: Mayor Ben J. Benoit (Chair)  
Supervisor Sheila Kuehl (Vice Chair)  
Board Member Veronica Padilla-Campos  
Senator Vanessa Delgado (Ret.)  
Vice Mayor Rex Richardson  
Supervisor Janice Rutherford

**Call to Order**

Chair Benoit called the meeting to order at 10:30 a.m.

**INFORMATIONAL ITEM:**

**1. Rule 1146.2 – Emissions of Oxides of Nitrogen From Large Water Heaters and Small Boilers and Process Heaters**

Michael Krause, Assistant Deputy Executive Officer/Planning Rule Development and Area Sources, presented the initial findings of staff's technology assessment for potentially lowering the NOx emission limit for heaters and boilers subject to Rule 1146.2, and discussed staff's recommendations to proceed with rulemaking.

Supervisor Rutherford inquired about upcoming proposals for residential water heaters. in the AQMD Chair Benoit confirmed that water heaters regulated by Rule 1146.2 are not used in residential settings and requested that staff evaluate impacts on high altitude areas as part of the upcoming Rule 1146.2 rulemaking.

There were no public comments.

**2. Summary of Proposed Amended Rule 1115 – Motor Vehicle Assembly Line Coating Operations**

Michael Morris, Planning and Rules Manager Planning Rule Development and Area Sources, provided a summary on Proposed Amended Rule 1115.

Board Member Padilla-asked how compliance is assured for autobody shops. Mr. Morris replied that Rule 1115 covers motor vehicle assembly facilities, which is different than another rule that addresses autobody shops, which are smaller and more numerous. He explained that the nine facilities subject to Rule 1115 are routinely inspected by the compliance staff who also respond to complaints and do inspections of gas stations.

There were no public comments.

**3. RECLAIM Quarterly Report – 12th Update**

Michael Morris, Planning and Rules Manager/Planning Rule Development and Area Sources, provided an update on the NOx RECLAIM program transition to a command-and-control regulatory structure.

Supervisor Kuehl asked how realistic it is to adopt the remaining landing rules and amend Regulations XIII and XX this year. Mr. Morris responded that staff is confident about bringing the remaining landing rules to the Board in 2022, but amendments to Regulations XIII and XX will be more challenging. Susan Nakamura, Chief Operating Officer, elaborated that staff is working with U.S EPA to ensure amendments are SIP approvable and working to amend Regulations XIII and XX this year, but the amendments could potentially occur in early 2023.

There were no public comments.

**4. Twelve-month and Three-month Rolling Average Price of Compliance Years 2021 and 2022 NOx and SOx RTCs (October – December 2021)**

David Ono, Senior Engineering Manager/ Engineering and Permitting, presented the three-month and twelve-month rolling average prices of NOx and SOx RECLAIM Trading Credits (RTCs) and the actions required under Rule 2002 - Allocations for Oxides of Nitrogen (NOx) and Oxides of Sulfur (SOx) and Rule 2015 – Backstop

Provisions resulting from NOx RTC price increases reflected in the recent quarterly update.

Supervisor Kuehl commented that the RECLAIM program appears to be working as intended because the RTC market is driving control technology installations as required under the RECLAIM landing rules, and as part of the RECLAIM NOx shave. Although the results of the assessment and evaluation under Rules 2002 and 2015 are pending, the higher prices may accelerate the installation schedule.

There were no public comments.

**5. Status Report on Reg. XIII – New Source Review**

Jason Aspell, Deputy Executive Officer/Engineering and Permitting, gave a status report on Regulation XIII, New Source Review (NSR) Equivalency for Calendar Year (CY) 2020. The preliminary determination for South Coast AQMD's NSR progress is equivalent to federal and state NSR requirements on an aggregate basis and is projected to maintain equivalency for CY 2021 and 2022.

There were no public comments.

**WRITTEN REPORTS:**

**6. AQMD Advisory Group Minutes**

The report was acknowledged by the committee.

**7. Notice of Violation Penalty Summary**

The report was acknowledged by the committee.

**OTHER MATTERS:**

**8. Other Business**

Senator Delgado has noticed an increase in complaints related to rendering facilities and asked that an update on the implementation of Rule 415 be provided to the Committee. Executive Officer Wayne Nastri agreed that can be done.

**9. Public Comment Period**

Duncan McKee expressed concerns about Quemetco increasing their throughput and recommended this issue be placed on the agenda, so the Board could take a closer look at the facility. He also suggested that a plan to build another battery recycling facility should be considered, instead of increasing the amount being processed at Quemetco.

Harvey Eder, Public Solar Power Coalition, supported Mr. McKee's comments. He noted the health effects of benzene, expressed concerns about overlapping

Committee meetings, climate change and cited a LA Times editorial which was published earlier this month.

**10. Next Meeting Date**

The next Stationary Source Committee meeting is scheduled for Friday, February 18, 2022 at 10:30 a.m.

**Adjournment**

The meeting was adjourned at 11:20 a.m.

**Attachments**

1. Attendance Record
2. AQMP Advisory Group Minutes
3. Notice of Violation Penalty Summary

**ATTACHMENT 1**

**SOUTH COAST AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT  
STATIONARY SOURCE COMMITTEE**

**Attendance –January 21, 2022**

Mayor Ben J. Benoit .....	South Coast AQMD Board
Senator Delgado (Ret.) .....	South Coast AQMD Board
Supervisor Sheila Kuehl .....	South Coast AQMD Board
Board Member Veronica Padilla-Campos.....	South Coast AQMD Board
Vice Mayor Rex Richardson .....	South Coast AQMD Board
Supervisor Janice Rutherford .....	South Coast AQMD Board
Ruthanne Taylor Berger .....	Board Consultant (Benoit)
Matthew Hamlett .....	Board Consultant (Richardson)
Loraine Lundquist .....	Board Consultant (Kuehl)
Debra Mendelsohn.....	Board Consultant (Rutherford)
Mark Taylor.....	Board Consultant (Rutherford)
Amy Wong .....	Board Consultant (Padilla-Campos)
Ross Zelen .....	Board Consultant (Kracov)
Mark Abramowitz .....	Community Environmental Services
Ramine Cromartie .....	WSPA
Curtis Coleman.....	Southern California Air Quality Alliance
Harvey Eder.....	Public Solar Power Coalition
Bridget McCann .....	Chevron
David Pettit.....	Natural Resources Defense Council
Bethmarie Quiambao.....	Southern California Edison
Patty Senecal .....	WSPA
Janet Whittick.....	CCEEB
Peter Whittingham.....	Whittingham Public Affairs Advisors
Jason Aspell.....	South Coast AQMD staff
Derrick Alatorre.....	South Coast AQMD staff
Barbara Baird.....	South Coast AQMD staff
Bayron Gilchrist .....	South Coast AQMD staff
Anissa Heard-Johnson .....	South Coast AQMD staff
Mark Henninger.....	South Coast AQMD staff
Michael Krause.....	South Coast AQMD staff
Terrence Mann.....	South Coast AQMD staff
Ian MacMillan .....	South Coast AQMD staff
Matt Miyasato.....	South Coast AQMD staff
Michael Morris .....	South Coast AQMD staff
Ron Moskowitz .....	South Coast AQMD staff
Wayne Nastri .....	South Coast AQMD staff
Susan Nakamura.....	South Coast AQMD staff
Lisa Tanaka O’Malley .....	South Coast AQMD staff
David Ono .....	South Coast AQMD staff
Sarah Rees .....	South Coast AQMD staff
Jill Whynot .....	South Coast AQMD staff
Jillian Wong.....	South Coast AQMD staff
Paul Wright.....	South Coast AQMD staff
Victor Yip.....	South Coast AQMD staff



# South Coast Air Quality Management District

21865 Copley Drive, Diamond Bar, CA 91765-4178  
(909) 396-2000 • www.aqmd.gov

## AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT PLAN ADVISORY GROUP MEETING MINUTES

**Thursday April 16, 2020  
2:00 p.m. to 4:00 p.m.**

### **1. Welcome, Introductions, Approval of Minutes, and Updates**

Mr. Zorik Pirveysian, Planning and Rules Manager of South Coast Air Quality Management District's (South Coast AQMD) Planning, Rule Development, and Area Sources Division, called the Zoom videoconference meeting to order at 2:05 p.m. Dr. Philip Fine, Deputy Executive Officer of South Coast AQMD's Planning, Rule Development, and Area Sources Division, welcomed all participants. Self-introductions were skipped due to the Zoom videoconferencing. Dr. Fine asked if there were any comments on the previous meeting's minutes which there were none. Dr. Fine then provided an update on the 2016 AQMP related activities, including the U.S. EPA actions on the PM2.5 and Ozone State Implementation Plans (SIP) and Rule 445 amendments to address the contingency measure requirements for PM2.5 standards.

### **2. Upcoming State Implementation Plan Obligations**

Dr. Sarah Rees, Assistant Deputy Executive Officer of South Coast AQMD's Planning, Rule Development, and Area Sources Division, provided updates on the attainment status of the 2006 24-hour PM2.5 standard for the South Coast Air Basin and the 1997 8-hour ozone standard for the Coachella Valley. Dr. Rees explained that based on the 2017–2019 monitoring data, the South Coast Air Basin did not attain the 24-hour PM2.5 standard by the 2019 attainment date. A SIP revision is due to the U.S. EPA by December 31, 2020. Elements of the SIP revision include emissions inventory update, attainment demonstration, five percent annual reductions of PM2.5 or PM2.5 precursors, additional feasible measures analysis, reasonable further progress (RFP), and contingency measures. A draft plan is scheduled to be released in fall 2020. Regarding the 1997 8-hour ozone standard in Coachella Valley, Dr. Rees mentioned that a request to reclassify the Coachella Valley from Severe to Extreme nonattainment was submitted in June 2019 which was subsequently approved by the U.S. EPA. The attainment date for the Coachella Valley as an Extreme nonattainment area is June 15, 2024. A SIP revision is due to the U.S. EPA by February 14, 2021. Key SIP elements include emissions inventory update, attainment demonstration, reasonably available control technology/measure (RACT/RACM), RFP, and contingency measures. Release of the draft plan is scheduled for fall 2020.

#### Comments from Advisory Group and Staff Responses:

*Timing when the federal implementation plan (FIP) is triggered.* Staff responded that the FIP would only be triggered upon a failure to submit a required SIP, or disapproval of a SIP submittal that was not remedied on time, or upon a failure to implement a SIP as approved.

### **3. 2022 AQMP Schedule and Overview**

Mr. Pirveysian presented the SIP requirements for addressing the 2015 8-hour ozone standard (70 ppb) for the South Coast Air Basin (Extreme nonattainment) and Coachella Valley (Severe nonattainment) by the required deadlines. The key elements due to the U.S. EPA by August 2020 include an emissions statement certification, RACT demonstration, base year emissions inventory and vehicle miles traveled offset demonstration. The 2022 AQMP will be the next comprehensive plan which will address the other SIP requirements for the 2015 8-hour ozone standard including the attainment demonstration, RACM, RFP, transportation conformity budgets, and contingency measures. Mr. Pirveysian concluded his presentation with a draft schedule for the 2022 AQMP which is due to the U.S. EPA by August 2022.

#### Comments from Advisory Group and Staff Responses:

*Whether the Scientific, Technical, and Modeling Peer Review (STMPR) meeting could occur earlier than June/July 2020 because baseline emissions inventory is scheduled to be submitted in August 2020.* Staff responded that efforts are currently underway to prepare the updated 2017 base year inventory to meet the U.S. EPA's due date. However, staff will continue updating the emissions inventory for the base and the forecast years for the 2022 AQMP and will present the updated inventories to the STMPR and the AQMP Advisory Groups.

### **4. Reasonably Available Control Technology (RACT) Demonstration**

Dr. Kalam Cheung, Program Supervisor of Policy/Climate/Energy/Incentives section of South Coast AQMD's Planning, Rule Development, and Area Sources Division, presented the analysis for the RACT Demonstration for the 2015 8-hour ozone standard. Dr. Cheung presented the regulatory history of RACT submittals, detailed approach for conducting the RACT Demonstration, and the summary of findings. Based on the RACT analysis, with the exception of Rule 1115 (Motor Vehicle Assembly Line Coating Operations), South Coast AQMD's current rules meet or exceed federal RACT requirements. Dr. Cheung also presented the public process and schedule for the RACT Demonstration.

#### Comments from Advisory Group and Staff Responses:

*Assessment of economic impacts from Covid-19 pandemic on regulated community.* Staff responded that it was too early to assess the corresponding economic impacts, but staff is looking at the economic outlook in terms of what it means for the regulated community and in terms of the assumptions used for future years inventory projections based on SCAG's Regional Transportation Plan (RTP). SCAG has the ability to amend their RTP after adoption.

### **5. 70 ppb 8-Hour Ozone Standard Baseline Inventory**

Tiffany Be, Air Pollution Specialist in the Emissions Inventory Development Section of California Air Resources Board (CARB) presented the baseline emissions inventory for the 2015 8-hour ozone standard. Ms. Be went over the Clean Air Act (CAA) planning requirements for the baseline inventory for ozone nonattainment areas, the rationale for selecting 2017 as the baseline inventory year, and the major updates to the inventory including the 2013–2015 consumer and commercial product survey, EMFAC2017 on-road emissions, and off-road emissions updates. She then presented

the 2017 baseline inventory summary for the South Coast Air Basin and Coachella Valley and a comparison with the previous inventory.

Comments from Advisory Group and Staff Responses:

*The impacts of Short-Lived Climate Pollutant Reduction Strategies (SB 1383) on VOC emissions from organic composting and whether there could be new standards or new technologies to reduce VOC emissions from this source category.* Staff responded the implications of the changes in those regulations would be for both the control strategy and projected inventory in the future.

*Inquiry on the old and new baseline NOx inventories for South Coast Air Basin and Coachella Valley. The new inventory of the NOx emissions in South Coast from on-road vehicles decreases, whereas NOx emissions increases in the Coachella Valley.* Staff clarified that there are differences in emissions between what was projected in the last AQMP and the updated emissions in 2017. Therefore, the changes are not necessarily an actual increase or decrease but emissions are updated based on the latest available information. CARB staff further explained that the changes in on-road emissions were based on the differences between EMFAC2014 used in the last plan and the new EMFAC2017 used for the 2017 baseline inventory.

## **6. VMT Emissions Offset Demonstration**

Nesamani Kalandiyur, Manager of Transportation Analysis Section at CARB gave a presentation on Vehicle Miles Traveled (VMT) offset demonstration. He described the methodology and presented the results for the on-road VMT offset demonstration for the South Coast Air Basin and Coachella Valley. For the 2032 attainment year for Coachella Valley and the 2037 attainment year for South Coast Air Basin, VOC emissions with baseline controls and VMT growth are equal to or less than those with no new measures and no VMT growth. These results indicate that the CAA requirements for VMT emissions offset demonstrations are satisfied for both South Coast Air Basin and Coachella Valley.

Comments from Advisory Group and Staff Responses:

*Clarification of control measures considered in Step 4 in the methodology of the VMT Offset Demonstration.* CARB staff clarified that the control measures included all the regulations adopted by CARB as well as the Transportation Control Strategies (TCS) and Transportation Control Measures (TCM) measures adopted by SCAG as part of their RTP are reflected in the attainment years on-road emissions. CARB staff further explained that Part 1 of, SAFE Vehicle Rule, is also reflected in this calculation.

*Whether the same analysis was done for NOx on the VMT offset demonstration.* CARB staff responded that per CAA requirements, the VMT offset demonstration is done only for VOC emissions.

## **7. Other Business**

No additional comments, announcements, or reports from the Advisory Group members.

## **8. Public Comments**

*Municipalities in California are not taking any initiatives whether they operate the fleet of passenger cars or street sweepers or trash vehicles, and that it may be good to have a focus on the municipalities to do the same job as we expect from the rest of the industry.* Staff responded that public fleets are subject to South Coast AQMD's fleet rules. Currently several categories of motor vehicles are subject to these fleet rules which are somewhat outdated. Staff is continuing to seek for additional legislative authority to be able to update these fleet rules to require the cleanest available technologies for the fleet vehicles.

**9. Next Meeting tentatively planned for July/August 2020**

**Members Present (38)**

Adrian Martinez, Earthjustice  
Alexander Fung, San Gabriel Valley Council of Governments  
Amy Zimpfer, United States Environmental Protection Agency (U.S. EPA), Region 9  
Andy Silva, San Bernardino County Administrative Office  
Bridget McCann, Western States Petroleum Association  
Carlo De La Cruz, Sierra Club  
Christopher Chavez, Coalition for Clean Air  
Curtis Coleman, Southern California Air Quality Alliance  
Dan McGivney, Southern California Gas  
David Darling, American Coatings Association  
David Rothbart, Southern California Alliance of Publicly Owned Treatment Works  
Dawn Fenton, Volvo  
Duane Baker, San Bernardino County Transportation Authority/San Bernardino Council of Governments  
Frances Keeler, California Council for Environmental and Economic Balance  
Greg Nord, Orange County Transportation Authority  
Greg Osterman, Jet Propulsion Laboratory/NASA  
John Ungvarsky, U.S. EPA  
Kendal Asuncion, Los Angeles Area Chamber of Commerce  
Lakshmi Jayaram, Future Ports  
Lauren Nevitt, Southern California Gas  
Lori Huddleston, Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority  
Lucetta Dunn, Orange County Business Council  
Marc Carrel, Breathe LA  
Marcos Holguin, International Longshore and Warehouse Union Locals 13, 63, and 94  
Martha Masters, Riverside County Transportation Commission  
Mike Carroll, Latham & Watkins  
Patty Senecal, Western States Petroleum Association  
Paul Ryan, California Refuse Recycling Council  
Peter Okurowski, Association of American Railroads  
Rhett Cash, American Coatings Association  
Rita Loof, RadTech  
Ryan Kenny, Clean Energy

Sarah Wiltfong, BizFed  
Stephanie Cadena, Gateway Cities Council of Governments  
Thomas Jelenic, Pacific Merchant Shipping Association  
Tim DeMoss, Port of Los Angeles  
Todd Campbell, Clean Energy  
William La Marr, California Small Business Alliance

**Public Attendees and Interested Parties**

Abas Goodarzi, US Hybrid  
Alex Guenther, University of California, Irvine  
Alyssa Rodriguez  
Amy Jeffries  
Bobby Gustafson  
Cory Parmer, CARB  
Carol Sutkus, CARB  
Cynthia Pinto-Cabrera  
Evelyn Kripal  
Faisal Braish  
Fang Yan, CARB  
Francisco Donez, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
Frank Forbes  
Gabriele Pfister  
Gary Fensel  
Gideon Kracov, South Coast AQMD Governing Board  
Greg Bush, Marathon Petroleum Corporation  
Greg Roche, Clean Energy  
Hao Jiang  
Howard Berman  
Jeff Serfass, California Hydrogen Business Council  
Julia Lester, Ramboll  
K Ni  
Karen Calderon, Southern California Association of Governments  
Lin Wang  
Lisa Wunder, Port of Los Angeles  
Mark Taylor  
Morgan Caswell, Port of Long Beach  
Nesamani Kalandiyur, CARB  
Priscilla Hamilton, Southern California Gas Company  
Ralph Morris, Ramboll Environ  
Ross Zelen  
Sam Emmerson  
Scott King, Ph.D., CARB  
Scott Weaver, Ramboll Environ  
Sean Okamoto, Worley  
Susan Collet, Toyota Motor North America, Inc.  
Sylvia Vanderspek, CARB

Tiffanie Be, CARB  
Tim Pohle, Airlines for America  
Yasaman Azar Houshang, Alta Environmental

**South Coast AQMD Staff Present**

Barbara Baird, Chief Deputy Counsel  
Barbara Radlein, Program Supervisor  
Brian Choe, Program Supervisor  
Cristina Lopez, Sr. Public Information Specialist  
Jeanette Short, Sr. Public Information Specialist  
Jong Hoon Lee, Ph.D., AQ Specialist  
Kalam Cheung, Ph.D., Program Supervisor  
Leeor Alpern, Sr. Public Information Specialist  
Marc Carreras-Sospedra, Ph.D., AQ Specialist  
Michael Morris, Planning and Rules Manager  
Anthony Tang, Information Technology Specialist II  
Philip Fine, Ph.D., Deputy Executive Officer  
Rosalee Mason, Secretary  
Sang-Mi Lee, Ph.D., Program Supervisor  
Sarah Rees, Ph.D., Assistant Deputy Executive Officer  
Scott Epstein, Ph.D., Program Supervisor  
Tracy Goss, Planning and Rules Manager  
Zorik Pirveysian, Planning and Rules Manager



# South Coast Air Quality Management District

21865 Copley Drive, Diamond Bar, CA 91765-4178  
(909) 396-2000 • www.aqmd.gov

## AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT PLAN ADVISORY GROUP MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, September 3, 2020  
10:30 a.m. to 12:30 p.m.

### 1. Welcome, Introductions, Approval of Minutes, and Updates

Mr. Zorik Pirveysian, Planning and Rules Manager of South Coast Air Quality Management District's (South Coast AQMD) Planning, Rule Development, and Area Sources Division, called the Zoom videoconference meeting to order at 10:30 a.m. Dr. Sarah Rees, Assistant Deputy Executive Officer of South Coast AQMD's Planning, Rule Development, and Area Sources Division, welcomed all participants and introduced South Coast AQMD staff present. Dr. Rees asked if there were any comments on the previous meeting's minutes. Since there were no comments, the minutes were approved. Dr. Rees then provided an update on the 2016 AQMP related activities, including the recent U.S. EPA actions on the PM<sub>2.5</sub> and Ozone State Implementation Plans (SIP) and Rule 445 amendments to address the contingency measure requirements for PM<sub>2.5</sub> standards.

#### Comments from Advisory Group and Staff Responses:

No comments from the Advisory Group members on this agenda item.

#### Comments from Public and Staff Responses:

*Comments on the implementation of solar technology, the effects of COVID-19, and the impacts of wild fires on the attainment status.* Staff thanked the individual and appreciated the comments.

### 2. Attainment Plan for the 2006 24-hour PM<sub>2.5</sub> Standard for the South Coast Air Basin

Dr. Rees provided updates on the draft attainment plan of the 2006 24-hour PM<sub>2.5</sub> standard for the South Coast Air Basin. On July 10, 2020, the U.S. EPA proposed to determine that the South Coast Air Basin failed to attain the 24-hour PM<sub>2.5</sub> standard by the 2019 attainment date based on the 2017–2019 monitoring data. Two sites, Mira Loma and Compton, exceeded the 24-hour PM<sub>2.5</sub> standard. Due to the failure to attain by the deadline, a SIP revision is due to the U.S. EPA by December 31, 2020. Elements of the SIP revision include emissions inventory, attainment demonstration, five percent annual reductions of PM<sub>2.5</sub> or PM<sub>2.5</sub> precursors, additional feasible measures analysis, reasonable further progress (RFP), and contingency measures. The attainment demonstration includes a two-fold approach. The attainment demonstration for Mira Loma and other monitoring stations (except Compton) is based on the updated emissions inventory and regional air quality modeling analysis. The attainment demonstration for Compton relies on supplemental weight of evidence and air quality trend analysis based on monitoring data. Attainment is expected by 2023 relying on emission reductions from existing regulations included in the baseline. A draft plan will be released on or before September 18, 2020.

#### Comments from Advisory Group and Staff Responses:

No comments from the Advisory Group members on this agenda item.

Comments from Public and Staff Responses:

*Inquiry on whether Compton's proximity to major surrounding freeways could have had an influence on the abnormally high PM2.5 readings in 2017.* Staff responded that while higher PM2.5 levels can occur close to freeways, South Coast AQMD has near-roadway monitoring sites to quantify these impacts. The near-road site located close to Compton and adjacent to freeway I-710 measured lower PM2.5 concentrations when the Compton monitoring site experienced the peak readings in 2017, indicating the high PM2.5 levels in Compton were likely due to local human activity such as wood burning or fireworks.

*Comments about concerns over fossil fuels, natural gas, and methane emissions, and that solar is competitive and should be incorporated into the new plan.* Staff thanked the individual and appreciated the comments.

*Inquiry regarding South Coast AQMD's plans to get low NOx trucks on the road, and the opportunities from CARB's mobile source strategy and cap and trade program.* Staff responded that extensive penetration of near-zero and zero emission technology is needed to attain the ozone standards. Working groups are being established to develop specific mobile source control strategies over the next year for 2022 AQMP.

*Inquiry regarding how wildfires started on government land or by arsonists affect 2006 PM2.5 attainment goals.* Staff responded that South Coast AQMD works with other agencies including CALFIRE on wildfire management and prescribed burn management plans to minimize smoke impacts. While smoke from wildfires affects air quality, the days when air quality is strongly impacted by wildfire are eligible to be considered as exceptional events and be excluded from attainment determination calculations based on U.S. EPA's guidelines.

### **3. Coachella Valley Extreme Area Plan for the 1997 8-hour Ozone Standard**

Dr. Rees provided updates on the draft attainment plan of the 1997 8-hour ozone standard for Coachella Valley. On July 10, 2019, the U.S. EPA granted South Coast AQMD's request to reclassify Coachella Valley from Serious to Extreme nonattainment, with a new attainment deadline of June 15, 2024. A SIP revision is due to the U.S. EPA by February 2021. Regional air quality modeling shows that existing rules provide the emission reductions needed for Coachella Valley to reach attainment by the deadline while recently-adopted rules and regulations since 2016 AQMP will provide additional assurance of attainment. Key SIP elements in the draft plan include emissions inventory update, attainment demonstration, reasonably available control technology/reasonably available control measure (RACT/RACM) analysis, RFP, and contingency measures. The draft plan will be released on or before September 11, 2020.

Comments from Advisory Group and Staff Responses:

*Inquiry on whether the plan is specific to Coachella Valley and clarifications on the process of the RACT analysis.* Staff clarified that the plan is specific to Coachella Valley. On the RACT analysis, staff explained that attainment by 2023 is expected to be achieved based on existing baseline emissions, and other recently adopted regulations provide additional emission reductions that will further ensure attainment. The RACM demonstration included in the Coachella Valley Plan builds upon the last AQMP and provides an update in some areas where there are new developments since the last AQMP. Emission reductions from all RACM, if identified, should advance the attainment

date by one year. Staff evaluated the recently adopted rules and regulations in other air agencies for additional possible control measures but did not identify any new feasible RACM.

*Inquiry on whether South Coast Air Basin will need further control measures in order to reduce ozone levels in Coachella Valley, and if there will be an assessment of how COVID-19 affects ozone levels.* Staff responded that modeling shows that existing regulations from 2016 AQMP for the South Coast Air Basin and regulations reflected in EMFAC 2017 are sufficient to attain the standard in Coachella Valley without additional controls. Staff is currently evaluating the impacts of COVID-19, but emission perturbations from the COVID-19 situation will not affect future attainment strategy.

Comments from Public and Staff Responses:

*Inquiry on the whether the two ground ozone monitors (Palms Springs and Indio) are representative of all of Coachella Valley.* Staff explained that ozone is a regional pollutant, and these two monitors are representative of a large area and are in locations consistent with U.S. EPA siting criteria. The monitors are placed where modeling shows the highest expected ozone concentrations. Due to meteorology and the closer proximity to South Coast Air Basin, Palm Springs, located further west of the Coachella Valley, shows higher levels of ozone than Indio which is located southeast of Palm Springs. Staff expects peak ozone levels to occur in northern and western Coachella Valley with concentrations decreasing further south and east. Therefore, the two existing monitors should represent the higher ozone levels in Coachella Valley.

*Inquiry on who to contact regarding air quality modeling.* Staff responded that Zorik Pirveysian and Sang-Mi Lee are the points of contact.

*Inquiry regarding how wildfires are classified if they are started by people on government land.* Staff responded that it is outside of South Coast AQMD's range of responsibilities to classify wildfires, but that smoke impacts have not been seen in Coachella Valley.

*Comment that using modeling will not help reach the 2023 attainment deadline, and the transition to solar power will help climate and other problems.* Staff thanked the individual and appreciated the comments.

#### **4. 2022 AQMP Control Measure Development**

Mr. Pirveysian presented updates for the 2022 AQMP, South Coast AQMD's next comprehensive plan to address the 2015 8-hour ozone standard (70 ppb) for the South Coast Air Basin (Extreme nonattainment) and Coachella Valley (Severe nonattainment). Four SIP requirements for the 2015 8-hour ozone standard that were due to the U.S. EPA on August 3, 2020, namely the base year emissions inventory, emissions statement certification, RACT demonstration, and VMT demonstration, have been adopted and submitted to the U.S. EPA by the August 3<sup>rd</sup> deadline. Other SIP requirements for the 2015 8-hour ozone standard include the attainment demonstration, RACM, RFP, transportation conformity budgets, and contingency measures. In addition to the AQMP Advisory Group, working groups for on-road mobile sources, off-road mobile sources, and residential and commercial buildings are being established to have focused discussions on potential control measures in these areas. The working groups are scheduled to meet regularly starting soon. The draft AQMP is scheduled to be released next fall, and a final AQMP is due to the U.S. EPA by August 2022.

Comments from Advisory Group and Staff Responses:

*Inquiry on whether 2022 AQMP will focus specifically on 2015 ozone standard, or will it include other standards, and when will black box measures be identified.* Staff responded that while the 2022 AQMP will focus on the 2015 standard, the 1997 and 2008 ozone standards will be addressed to the extent possible. South Coast AQMD submitted a Contingency Measure Plan in December 2019 to address black box reductions for the 1997 ozone standard.

*Inquiry on how much NOx reductions are needed for attainment and how reliant the plan will be on new sources of funding; also, when additional provisions for NOx and VOCs need to be implemented via Clean Air Act Section 185(b).* Staff is currently in the process of updating emissions inventory. The 2016 AQMP highlighted the need for near zero and zero emission technologies with 55% NOx reductions needed by 2031. Based on air quality modeling analysis, NOx controls are the fastest and most effective way for ozone attainment. The emission reductions from existing and future regulations and new measures will be estimated with incentives helping achieve the remaining balance of reductions needed for attainment. On the Section 185(b) requirement, staff responded that a program needs to be in place by 2028, 10 years prior to the attainment date of 2038, for non-attainment fees. The program will go into effect if South Coast Air Basin fails to reach attainment.

*Inquiry on while NOx emissions were reduced in the spring during the first part of the COVID-19 shutdown, a similar reduction in ozone did not take place.* Staff responded that initially there were lower NOx emissions due to reduced traffic during the COVID-19 shutdown. However, changes in weather and frequent precipitation affect the ozone levels. The rain was followed by high temperature days that promote ozone formation which also played a pivotal role in the high ozone episodes. Marginal level of NOx reductions could result in a temporary increase of ozone due to ozone chemistry. However, significant amount of NOx reductions would overcome this increase and result in ozone reductions. Staff is currently conducting air quality modeling for the COVID-19 shutdown period, which provides a unique opportunity to evaluate the modeling performance and attainment strategy. During COVID-19 period, there are also uncertainties regarding VOC emissions, such as increased use of disinfectant and hand sanitizers. VOCs are generally more difficult to measure, and the NOx-to-VOC ratio is also an important factor governing ozone formation and chemistry.

*Inquiry about what South Coast AQMD can do with regard to zero-emissions and near zero emissions mobile sources as well as facility-based indirect sources.* Staff is continuing its efforts on facility-based mobile source measures despite South Coast AQMD's limited authority over mobile sources for indirect source rules. Staff considers an all-inclusive approach utilizing incentives, regulatory programs, leveraging CARB regulations, and voluntary commitments.

*A study by Ramboll Engineering addresses the issue of no changes/increase in ozone emissions when NOx concentrations significantly decreased.* Staff is aware of the study and has had extensive discussion with the scientific community, other regulatory agencies, and the industry on the impact of NOx since the 2016 AQMP. South Coast AQMD's strategy reflects the best-known practices to attain the ozone standards. A small reduction in NOx results in a temporary increase in ozone, but substantial NOx reductions will attain the ozone standard.

*Comment that CARB's focus is on long-term goals, and that the 2023 attainment deadline is not a priority.* Staff acknowledged the comment and thanked the individual.

Comments from Public and Staff Responses:

*Inquiry on equity implications associated with pollution and near-zero emission technology and how closely South Coast AQMD works with SCAG regarding growth projections of commuters.* Staff responded that the latest growth projections from 2020 RTP provided by SCAG will be used in the 2022 AQMP. South Coast AQMD sees the extensive need for near-zero technologies and will work with all levels of governments to promote and implement these technologies. Rongsheng Luo, Advisory Group member representing SCAG, responded that SCAG works closely with local jurisdictions, the public, and major stakeholders to develop growth projections and develop sustainability strategies to forecast regional trends.

*Inquiry on whether South Coast AQMD can use the COVID-19 mandated shutdown to promote more telecommuting programs, if South Coast AQMD will deploy more air monitoring stations in the future, how many community members are in this group, and if more tree planting and greenspace programs can be implemented.* Staff is monitoring changes in emissions due to COVID-19, and while there was a sharp decline in light duty passenger vehicles during COVID-19 shutdown, truck traffic remained at a similar level with truck emissions responsible for a significant portion of NOx emissions. Regulations are already in place for employee commute trip reductions, applicable to businesses over 250 employees. Teleworking is an option to comply with this regulation. Staff is evaluating how to further encourage telecommuting. Monitoring stations are subject to U.S. EPA siting requirements and are re-evaluated every 5 years. Biogenic emissions, including VOC emissions from trees, are already included in modeling. Low VOC tree planting programs as well as other greenhouse gas regulations from local cities are being investigated for co-benefits.

*Inquiry on if there is a modeling working group, if the previously referenced in-house analysis on the relationship between NOx and ozone will be publicly available, and if emissions reductions from industries significantly affected by COVID-19, such as the airline sector, will be considered and reflected in the inventories.* Staff responded that the off-road mobile source working group will address aircraft emissions and is open to ideas on how to move forward with improving modeling; the Scientific, Technical & Modeling Peer Review Advisory Group also addresses modeling at South Coast AQMD. VOC white papers developed during 2016 AQMP discuss temporary increases of ozone on the path to attainment. Temporary disbenefit is widely known in several publications. The 2022 AQMP is under development based on SCAG's growth projections. Rongsheng Luo, Advisory Group member representing SCAG, stated that long-term COVID-19 impacts will be reflected in 2024 growth projections and forecasts, but not the 2020 Regional Transportation Plan that is scheduled for adoption on the same day.

*Comment that the environment is not in a clean state and renewable natural gas is not clean.* Staff acknowledged the comment and thanked the individual.

## **5. Other Business**

No additional comments, announcements, or reports from the Advisory Group members.

## **6. Public Comments**

*Comment that the incentive funding should benefit the communities.* Staff acknowledged the comment and thanked the individual.

**7. Next Meeting tentatively planned for November/December 2020**

**Members Present (43)**

Adrian Martinez, Earthjustice  
Alexander Fung, San Gabriel Valley Council of Governments  
Amy Zimpfer, United States Environmental Protection Agency (U.S. EPA), Region 9  
Bill LaMarr, California Small Business Alliance  
Bridget McCann, Western States Petroleum Association  
Carol Bohnenkamp, United States Environmental Protection Agency (U.S. EPA), Region 9  
Christopher Chavez, Coalition for Clean Air  
Chris Shimoda, California Trucking Association  
Curtis Coleman, Southern California Air Quality Alliance  
Dan McGivney, Southern California Gas  
David Darling, American Coatings Association  
David Rothbart, Southern California Alliance of Publicly Owned Treatment Works  
David Pettit, Natural Resources Defense Counsel, Inc.  
Dawn Fenton, Volvo  
Frances Keeler, California Council for Environmental and Economic Balance  
Greg Osterman, Jet Propulsion Laboratory/NASA  
James Breitling, Southern California Contractors Association  
Jeremy Avise, California Air Resources Board  
Josh LaFarga, Laborers Local 1309  
Kendal Asuncion, Los Angeles Area Chamber of Commerce  
Lakshmi Jayaram, Future Ports  
Lori Huddleston, Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority  
Marc Carrel, Breathe LA  
Martha Masters, Riverside County Transportation Commission  
Marcos Holguin, International Longshore and Warehouse Union  
Margot Molloy, Association of American Railroads  
Marisol Monge, Kenworth Truck Company  
Michael Benjamin, California Air Resources Board  
Michael Lewis, Southern California Contractors Association  
Otis Greer, County of San Bernardino  
Paul Ryan, California Refuse Recycling Council  
Peter Herzog, NAIOP, Commercial Real Estate Development Association, SoCal Chapter  
Peter Okurowski, Association of American Railroads  
Richard Parks, Redeemer Community Partnership  
Rita Loof, RadTech  
Rongsheng Luo, Southern California Association of Governments  
Ryan Kenny, Clean Energy  
Priscilla Hamilton, Southern California Gas Company  
Sarah Wiltfong, BizFed  
Tammy Yamaski, Southern California Edison  
Thomas Jelenic, Pacific Merchant Shipping Association  
Tim DeMoss, Port of Los Angeles  
Todd Campbell, Clean Energy

**Public Attendees and Interested Parties**

Aaron Rojas  
Abas Goodarzi, US Hybrid  
Alek Van Houghton  
Alison Torres  
Amber Coluso  
Amy Jeffries  
Charles Williams  
Christine B.  
Claire Garcia  
Craig Sakamoto  
E. Anderson  
Florence Gharibian  
Frank Forbes  
Georgia Seivright  
Greg Busch, Marathon Petroleum Corporation  
Harvey Eder  
Howard Berman  
IBI Group  
Jacqueline Moore  
James Perez  
Johnathan Burkett  
Karin Fickerson  
Kiersten Melville  
Lauren Paladino  
Lee Kindberg-Maersk  
Lin Wang  
Lisa Wunder, Port of Los Angeles  
Mark Abramowitz  
Marshall Waller  
Matthew Densberger  
Nancy Matson  
Nicolas Serieys  
Philip John Johnson  
Robert Nguyen  
Ron Brugger  
Ross Zelen  
Ryan McMullan  
Rynda Kay  
Scott King, Ph.D., CARB  
Scott Weaver, Ramboll Environ  
Shawn Weaver  
Stephanie Bream  
Tanya Seneviratne  
Taylor Collison  
Teja Ganapa  
Tim French  
Tim Pohle, Airlines for America

Tom Williams  
Tyler Harris  
Yasaman Azar Houshang, Alta Environmental

**South Coast AQMD Staff Present**

Anthony Tang, Information Technology Supervisor  
Barbara Baird, Chief Deputy Counsel  
Barbara Radlein, Program Supervisor  
Cristina Lopez, Sr. Public Information Specialist  
Cui Ge, Ph.D., AQ Specialist  
Dan Garcia, Planning and Rules Manager  
Diana Thai, Program Supervisor  
Elham Baranizadeh, Ph.D., AQ Specialist  
Elliott Popel, AQ Specialist  
Evelyn Aguilar, AQ Specialist  
Ian MacMilian, Planning and Rules Manager  
Jeanette Short, Sr. Public Information Specialist  
Jo Kay Ghosh, Health Effects Officer  
Kalam Cheung, Ph.D., Program Supervisor  
Kathryn Roberts, Deputy District Counsel II  
Kayla Jordan, Assistant AQ Specialist  
Kelly Gamino, Program Supervisor  
Lane Garcia, Program Supervisor  
Marc Carreras-Sospedra, Ph.D., AQ Specialist  
Melissa Maestas, Ph.D., AQ Specialist  
Naveen Berry, Assistant Deputy Executive Officer  
Paul Stroik, Ph.D., AQ Specialist  
Pedro Piqueras, Ph.D., AQ Specialist  
Philip Fine, Ph.D., Deputy Executive Officer  
Rui Zhang, Ph.D., AQ Specialist  
Ryan Finseth, Ph.D., AQ Specialist  
Rosalee Mason, Secretary  
Sang-Mi Lee, Ph.D., Program Supervisor  
Sarah Rees, Ph.D., Assistant Deputy Executive Officer  
Scott Epstein, Ph.D., Program Supervisor  
Shah Dabirian, Ph.D., Program Supervisor  
Veera Tyagi, Principal Deputy District Counsel  
Xiang Li, Ph.D., AQ Specialist  
Xinqiu Zhang, Ph.D., Senior Staff Specialist  
Zorik Pirveysian, Planning and Rules Manager



# South Coast Air Quality Management District

21865 Copley Drive, Diamond Bar, CA 91765-4178  
(909) 396-2000 • www.aqmd.gov

## AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT PLAN ADVISORY GROUP MEETING MINUTES

Wednesday, February 3, 2021  
10:00 a.m.

### 1. Welcome, Introductions, Approval of Minutes, and 2016 AQMP Updates

Mr. Zorik Pirveysian, Planning and Rules Manager of South Coast Air Quality Management District's (South Coast AQMD) Planning, Rule Development, and Area Sources Division, called the Zoom videoconference meeting to order at 10:00 a.m. Dr. Sarah Rees, Deputy Executive Officer of South Coast AQMD's Planning, Rule Development, and Area Sources Division, welcomed all participants and introduced South Coast AQMD and California Air Resources Board (CARB) staff present. Since there were no comments on the previous meeting's minutes, the minutes were approved. Dr. Rees provided an update on the 2016 AQMP related activities including the recent U.S. EPA actions on the PM<sub>2.5</sub> and Ozone State Implementation Plans (SIPs), CARB's South Coast On-Road Heavy-Duty Vehicle Incentive Measure, and contingency measure requirements.

#### Comments from Advisory Group and Staff Responses:

*Whether the reduction for the on-road vehicle incentive measure is above and beyond the existing regulations that CARB has in effect.* Staff confirmed that the reductions for this measure are beyond CARB's existing Truck and Bus Regulation.

#### Comments from Public and Staff Responses:

No comments from the public members on this agenda item.

### 2. Update on Other SIP Activities

Mr. Pirveysian provided updates on recent SIP-related activities. For the 2006 24-hour PM<sub>2.5</sub> standard, the South Coast Air Basin (Basin) is classified as a Serious nonattainment area with an attainment date of 2019. Based on the 2017–2019 monitoring data, the Basin failed to attain the PM<sub>2.5</sub> standard by the required deadline. Accordingly, the PM<sub>2.5</sub> Attainment Plan (PM<sub>2.5</sub> Plan) was prepared to address the Clean Air Act (CAA) requirements. Based on the updated emissions inventory and modeling analysis, the attainment is expected by 2023 (or earlier) based on ongoing emission reductions from implementation of adopted rules and regulations. The PM<sub>2.5</sub> Plan was approved by the South Coast AQMD Governing Board in December 2020 and subsequently submitted to the U.S. EPA through CARB. Based on the preliminary PM<sub>2.5</sub> design value for 2018–2020, the Basin actually met the 2006 PM<sub>2.5</sub> standard by end of 2020. Exceptional event demonstrations such as wildfires or fireworks need to be submitted to the U.S. EPA. Once the U.S. EPA approves the exceptional event demonstrations and finalizes a clean data determination, attainment-related SIP requirements would be suspended.

For the 1997 8-hour ozone standard, the Coachella Valley was classified as Severe nonattainment with an attainment deadline of June 2019. Based on the monitoring data from 2016–2018, the Coachella Valley did not meet the standard by the required deadline and was subsequently

## Air Quality Management Plan Advisory Group Minutes for February 3, 2021 Meeting

reclassified as an Extreme nonattainment area with a new attainment date of June 2024. The Coachella Valley Extreme Area Ozone Plan was developed to address the CAA requirements for the Extreme classification. Based on the updated emissions inventory and modeling, the attainment is expected by 2023 based on ongoing emission reductions from adopted rules and regulations. The Extreme Area Ozone Plan was approved by the Governing Board in December 2020 and subsequently submitted to the U.S. EPA through CARB. Contingency measures will be addressed in a separate rulemaking process and vehicle miles traveled (VMT) offset demonstration will be addressed by CARB.

### Comments from Advisory Group and Staff Responses:

No comments from the Advisory Group members on this agenda item.

### Comments from Public and Staff Responses:

*Comments on SCAG's VMT estimates for the region. Projections of lower VMTs are unrealistic and could adversely impact the SIP process and motor vehicle emissions budget.* CARB staff responded that VMT offset is a specific requirement in the CAA demonstrating that the VMT increase is offset by transportation control strategies/measures. For the Coachella Valley, the demonstration shows that control programs in place would offset the increases in VMT. SCAG staff responded that SCAG's Regional Transportation Plan/Sustainable Community Strategy (RTP/SCS) development is an extensive process and reflects local inputs. The U.S. EPA staff also added that the VMT offset requirement dates back to the 1990 CAA Amendments and it only focuses on VOC. More information is provided in the staff report prepared by CARB.

*Question on potential consequences or penalties to the region as a result of not meeting the PM2.5 standard.* Staff responded that when the region fails to meet a standard, the U.S. EPA will issue a failure to attain notice which requires a new SIP that shows expeditious attainment of the standard as early as possible. The PM2.5 Plan was developed to fulfil this requirement. Potential sanctions can be triggered for failing to implement the plan.

### **3. Update on 2022 AQMP Development**

Mr. Pirveysian presented updates on the development of the 2022 AQMP which primarily focuses on demonstrating attainment of the 2015 8-hour ozone standard of 70 ppb for which the Basin is classified as an Extreme nonattainment area with an attainment date of August 3, 2038, and the Coachella Valley is classified as a Severe nonattainment area with an attainment date of August 3, 2033. The 2022 AQMP is required to be submitted to the U.S. EPA by August 3, 2022. The other required SIP elements are the certifications for the New Source Review (NSR) and Clean Fuel for Boilers, which is due to the U.S. EPA in August 2021.

Dr. Sang-Mi Lee, Program Supervisor of Air Quality Modeling and Emissions Inventory Development, provided updates on the 2022 AQMP design values, emissions inventory, and regional modeling. Dr. Lee discussed the updated emissions inventory reflecting EMFAC2017, air quality modeling for the COVID-19 shelter-in-place period (March to May 2020) and the impact of meteorology on the Basin's ozone and PM2.5 levels. Dr. Lee reiterated that the NOx control path would provide the optimum path to attain the 8-hour ozone standards.

Mr. Pirveysian also provided quick updates on the AQMP stationary source working group (Residential and Commercial Buildings) and mobile source working groups (Heavy-Duty Trucks,

## Air Quality Management Plan Advisory Group Minutes for February 3, 2021 Meeting

Construction and Industrial Equipment, Ocean-Going Vessels, and Aircraft). Mr. Pirveysian concluded his presentation with the overall AQMP schedule and contact information.

### Comments from Advisory Group and Staff Responses:

*Question on the updated inventory for composting processes for the 2022 AQMP.* Staff responded that area source inventories are reviewed and updated when applicable as part of the AQMP emissions inventory development. For the 2022 AQMP, emissions from composting processes are updated based on the latest activity data.

*Inquiry on how quickly zero-emission vehicles (ZEVs) technology would come to fruition, and the need to revisit Rule 317 to avoid unintended consequences with penalties for not achieving attainment.* Staff responded that the 2037 attainment date gives a longer horizon to implement clean technologies. The goal for the 2022 AQMP is to come up with specific defined measures and feasible technologies that can be implemented over this timeframe. CARB has recently adopted several regulations including the Omnibus and the Advanced Clean Truck Regulations. CARB is working with vehicle manufacturers on the supply side and with fleet vehicles on the demand side to bring as many ZEVs as possible into the market. CARB staff also explained that there are certain sources that are within federal authority such as federally-certified trucks operating in California, which account for almost 50 percent of California heavy-duty VMT, as well as construction equipment less than 175 horsepower preempted under federal law. CARB is hopeful to work with the U.S. EPA for the sources that are under CARB or federal authority to reduce emissions from heavy-duty trucks and also promote zero emission technologies at the national level.

*Inquiry on South Coast AQMD's approach on the RACT demonstration for the 2022 AQMP.* Staff responded that some of the U.S. EPA guidelines may be outdated and a letter was recently submitted to the U.S. EPA for consideration of updating the Control Techniques Guidelines (CTGs) for several outdated CTG categories. Staff will be looking at all available technologies and measures that have been adopted by other agencies and districts in the upcoming RACT analysis to evaluate whether there is any opportunity for further emission reductions.

*Question on why the 2022 AQMP focuses only on 2015 8-hour ozone standard while there are closer deadlines for 80 ppb (2023) and 75 ppb (2031) ozone standards.* Staff responded that the primary focus of this 2022 AQMP is to meet the 2015 8-hour ozone standard (70 ppb) with an attainment deadline of 2037 for the Basin and 2032 for the Coachella Valley which is statutorily required by the CAA. As strategies are developed to meet the 2015 ozone standard by 2037, staff will evaluate the benefits of the AQMP measures in the interim years.

*Question on whether the ozone isopleth will change with the 2020 meteorology data.* Staff responded that the ozone isopleths will be updated with 2018 meteorology data because 2018 is the base year for the 2022 AQMP. If the 2020 meteorology is used, isopleths may have different shapes, because factors affecting ambient measurement values (e.g., atmospheric transport, photochemistry, biogenic emissions and manmade emissions) are different from 2018.

*Comments on the incorporation of green and renewable hydrogen and battery electric technologies for mobile transportation and building sectors into AQMP, which will help develop the infrastructure in the market and achieve reductions.* Staff thanked the commenter and noted the comments.

## Air Quality Management Plan Advisory Group Minutes for February 3, 2021 Meeting

*Question on the importance of NOx reductions compared to VOC reductions in meeting the 70 ppb ozone standard.* Staff responded that NOx control strategy is the pathway to meet the 70 ppb standard.

*Comments on the efficacy of continued focus on NOx reductions from stationary sources which have been well controlled over the past decades and are a small slice of total NOx emissions.* Staff acknowledged that stationary sources contribute to about 20 percent of NOx emissions while mobile sources account for 80 percent of NOx emissions. To achieve the level of reductions needed for 2037 attainment, potential feasible reductions from stationary and mobile sources will be evaluated during the AQMP process.

*Comments on the effects of the shifting meteorology and NOx-VOC chemistry on the ozone isopleth and on control approaches.* Staff responded that per the U.S. EPA's guidelines, 2018 was chosen as the base year which represented typical ozone conditions for the Basin. Isopleth is used as general guidance to identify the best and the most effective control strategy. The U.S. EPA does not have official guidance on incorporating the impact of long-term change in meteorology on regional modeling. Staff is working with the U.S. EPA and other academic research groups to best address the impact of long-term change in meteorology on air quality.

*Comments on the inclusion of strategy to meet the State 1-hour ozone standard (90 ppb) in addition to the federal 8-hour ozone standard (70 ppb).* Staff responded that the primary focus of the 2022 AQMP is the 70 ppb ozone attainment as required by the federal CAA. California CAA requires nonattainment areas to continue to make progress towards achieving the state's air quality standards, but there are no fixed attainment deadlines. Staff noted the comment and would work with CARB to address the State 1-hour ozone standard.

### Comments from Public and Staff Responses:

No comments from the public members on this agenda item.

#### **4. Other Business**

No additional comments, announcements, or reports from the Advisory Group members.

#### **5. Public Comments**

No additional comments from the public other than made above.

#### **6. Next Meeting tentatively planned for May/June 2021**

### **Members Present (32)**

Andy Henderson, Building Industry Association (BIA)

Chris Shimoda, California Trucking Association

Curtis Coleman, Southern California Air Quality Alliance

Dan McGivney, Southern California Gas (SoCalGas)

David Darling, American Coatings Association

David Pettit, Natural Resources Defense Council, Inc. (NRDC)

David Rothbart, Southern California Alliance of Publicly Owned Treatment Works (SCAP)

## Air Quality Management Plan Advisory Group Minutes for February 3, 2021 Meeting

Frances Keeler, California Council for Environmental and Economic Balance  
Greg Nord, Orange County Transportation Authority (OCTA)  
Greg Osterman, Jet Propulsion Laboratory/NASA  
John Ungvarsky, U.S. EPA  
Kendal Asuncion, Los Angeles Area Chamber of Commerce  
Kim Fuentes, South Bay Cities Council of Governments  
Lori Huddleston, Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority (LA Metro)  
Marc Carrel, Breathe LA  
Marcos Holguin, International Longshore and Warehouse Union (ILWU) Locals 13, 63, and 94  
Michael Lewis, Southern California Contractors Association  
Patty Senecal, Western States Petroleum Association (WSPA)  
Paul Ryan, California Refuse Recycling Council  
Peter Herzog, NAIOP, Commercial Real Estate Development Association, SoCal Chapter  
Peter Okurowski, Association of American Railroads  
Priscilla Hamilton, Southern California Gas (SoCalGas)  
Richard Parks, Redeemer Community Partnership  
Rita Loof, RadTech  
Rongsheng Luo, Southern California Association of Governments  
Samuel McLaughlin, Volvo  
Tammy Yamasaki, Southern California Edison (SCE)  
Teresa Pisano, Port of Los Angeles  
Thomas Jelenić, Pacific Merchant Shipping Association (PMSA)  
Tim DeMoss, Port of Los Angeles  
Todd Campbell, Clean Energy  
William Zobel, California Hydrogen Business Council

### **Public Attendees and Interested Parties**

Alan De Salvio, Mojave Desert AQMD  
Alek Van Houghton, Ramboll  
Amber Coluso, Port of Los Angeles  
Annaleigh Ekman  
Benjamin Leers  
Bertrand Gaschot, Mojave Desert AQMD  
Betsy Brien, PBF Energy  
Bill LaMarr  
Bobby Gustafson, Riverside County  
Carlo Gavina  
Charles Williams, The Lion Electric  
Chris Gabelich, Metropolitan Water District of Southern California  
Christine Batikian, Port of Los Angeles  
Claire Garcia, The Lion Electric  
Craig Sakamoto, PBF Energy  
Cynthia Rollins, CoolSys, Inc.  
Danielle Morone, Gatzke Dillon & Ballance LLP  
Dianne Brickman, Sherwin-Williams  
Elio Torrealba, SA Recycling  
Eric Anderson, Toyota  
Erin Berger, Southern California Gas (SoCalGas)

Air Quality Management Plan Advisory Group Minutes for February 3, 2021 Meeting

Greg Busch, Marathon Petroleum  
Howard Berman, E4 Strategic Solutions  
Janet Baad, Alaska Airlines  
Jessica Coria, San Joaquin Valley APCD  
Joe Leighton, Chevron  
John Cho, Southern California Association of Governments  
Lakshmi Jayaram, Ramboll/Future Ports  
Lin Wang, Los Angeles World Airports  
Loraine Lundquist  
Madison Perkins, San Joaquin Valley APCD  
Mana Sangkapichai, Southern California Association of Governments  
Mark Abramowitz, Community Environmental Services, Inc. (CES)  
Mark Taylor, San Bernardino County  
Marshall Waller, Phillips 66  
Michael Corder, San Joaquin Valley APCD  
Mike Tunnell, American Trucking Associations  
Mugi Lukito, Southern California Gas (SoCalGas)  
Noel Muyco  
Pat Dewey, Bosch  
Ramine Cromartie, Western States Petroleum Association (WSPA)  
Renee Nygaard, PBF Energy  
Sam Pournazeri, CARB  
Scott King, CARB  
Scott Weaver, Ramboll  
Susie Rodriguez, APM Terminals  
Sylvia Vanderspek, CARB  
Teja Ganapa, Los Angeles Department of Water and Power (LADWP)/University of Southern California  
Tim French, Chicago Law Partners, LLC  
Timothy Pohle, Airlines for America  
Tom Swenson, Cummins  
Tyler Harris, Ventura County APCD

**South Coast AQMD Staff Present**

Anthony Tang, Information Technology Supervisor  
Carol Gomez, Planning and Rules Manager  
Cristina Lopez, Sr. Public Information Specialist  
Cui Ge, Air Quality Specialist  
Elliott Popel, Air Quality Specialist  
Eric Praske, Air Quality Specialist  
Jong Hoon Lee, Air Quality Specialist  
Josephine Lee, Sr. Deputy District Counsel  
Kalam Cheung, Program Supervisor  
Kathryn Roberts, Deputy District Counsel  
Kayla Jordan, Air Quality Specialist  
Kelly Gamino, Program Supervisor  
Lane Garcia, Program Supervisor  
Laurence Brown, Air Quality Specialist

Air Quality Management Plan Advisory Group Minutes for February 3, 2021 Meeting

Matt Miyasato, Deputy Executive Officer  
Michael Krause, Planning and Rules Manager  
Naveen Berry, Assistance Deputy Executive Officer  
Paul Wright, Sr. Information Technology Specialist  
Ricky Lai, Air Quality Specialist  
Rosalee Mason, Secretary  
Rui Zhang, Air Quality Specialist  
Sang-Mi Lee, Program Supervisor  
Sarah Rees, Deputy Executive Officer  
Scott Epstein, Program Supervisor  
Shah Dabirian, Program Supervisor  
Veera Tyagi, Principal Deputy District Counsel  
Wei Li, Air Quality Specialist  
Xinqiu Zhang, Sr. Staff Specialist  
Yanrong Zhu, Air Quality Specialist  
Zorik Pirveysian, Planning and Rules Manager



# South Coast Air Quality Management District

21865 Copley Drive, Diamond Bar, CA 91765-4178  
(909) 396-2000 • www.aqmd.gov

## AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT PLAN ADVISORY GROUP MEETING MINUTES

**Tuesday May 18, 2021**

**1:00 p.m.**

### **1. Welcome, Introductions, Approval of Minutes, and 2016 AQMP Updates**

Dr. Sarah Rees, Deputy Executive Officer of South Coast AQMD's Planning, Rule Development, and Area Sources Division, called the virtual meeting to order at 1:00 pm, welcomed all participants and introduced South Coast AQMD staff present. Dr. Rees asked if there were any comments on the previous meeting's minutes. Since there were no comments, the minutes were approved. Dr. Rees then provided an update on the 2016 AQMP implementation including several regulatory actions adopted by South Coast AQMD and the California Air Resources Board (CARB).

#### Comments from Advisory Group and Staff Responses:

*Inquiry on whether South Coast AQMD will attain the 2023 ozone standard, and if South Coast AQMD or CARB is responsible for attainment; stationary sources should not be penalized for nonattainment attributable to small reductions from mobile sources.* Staff responded that it would be challenging to meet the 2023 standard based on the level of reductions needed for attainment. South Coast AQMD and CARB share this obligation. Section 185 fee requirement for major stationary sources is part of the federal Clean Air Act (CAA) provisions for not attaining the NAAQS.

#### Comments from Public and Staff Responses:

No comments from the Public on this agenda item.

### **2. Certification of Nonattainment New Source Review and Clean Fuels for Boilers Compliance Demonstration**

Dr. Kalam Cheung, Program Supervisor of Policy, Climate, Energy, and Incentives provided an update on the specific SIP requirements for the 2015 8-hour ozone standard (70 ppb) for the South Coast Air Basin (Extreme nonattainment) and Coachella Valley (Severe nonattainment) related to Nonattainment New Source Review (NSR) and Clean Fuels for Boilers. Under NSR requirements, new sources must install the lowest achievable emission rate (LAER), offset emissions increases from new or modified sources, and have public participation in the permitting process. Based on staff's evaluation, the South Coast AQMD's NSR program is at least as stringent as the CAA requirements. In January 2021, the D.C. Circuit Court of Appeals ruled that Interpollutant Trading violates the CAA. As such, South Coast AQMD certifies not to use the IPT provision in the NSR program and commits to remove the IPT provision from Rule 1309 in a future rule amendment. The Clean Fuels for Boilers SIP element requires the use of clean fuels or advanced control technologies for electric utility and industrial and commercial boilers that emit more than 25 tons/year of NO<sub>x</sub> in extreme nonattainment areas. South Coast AQMD meets this requirement through Rules 1146, 2002, 2004, and 1303. A certification was prepared to demonstrate that South Coast AQMD's rules and regulations meet the CAA requirements for Nonattainment NSR and Clean Fuels for Boilers for the 2015 8-hour ozone NAAQS. The Draft Final

Certification was released on May 4<sup>th</sup> and will be presented to the South Coast AQMD Governing Board on June 4<sup>th</sup> for approval and submission to U.S. EPA through CARB.

Comments from Advisory Group and Staff Responses:

*Inquiry on what Reasonably Available Control Measures (RACM) process entails.* Staff responded that RACM is due to the U.S. EPA in August 2022, and the evaluation will be included as part of the 2022 AQMP. RACM applies to both stationary and mobile sources. In general, RACM analysis includes an evaluation of rules and regulations from other agencies as well as the latest technologies that are available, feasible, and cost effective. More details will be provided in the next two Advisory Group meetings.

Comments from Public and Staff Responses:

No comments from the Public on this agenda item.

### **3. Update on 2022 AQMP Emissions Inventory**

Dr. Sang-Mi Lee, Program Supervisor of Air Quality Modeling and Emissions Inventory Development provided updates on the preliminary emissions inventory for the 2018 base year and future attainment years' emissions. Emissions inventory is categorized into point, area, on-road mobile and off-road mobile sources, each developed with category-specific methodologies. While total NO<sub>x</sub> continues to decrease over time, the preliminary 2022 AQMP NO<sub>x</sub> inventory is higher in future years (2023 and 2031) compared to the 2016 AQMP inventory. Stationary point and area source emissions are estimated to be lower than the 2016 inventory, while off-road emissions are higher in the 2022 update. Both plans indicate stationary sources are the major contributor of VOCs, increasing in future years due to population and economic growth. Travel activity data and vehicle emissions rates are the main inputs to determine on-road emissions. The 2022 AQMP inventory uses travel activity data from the 2020 Regional Transportation Plan for on-road emissions, resulting in a slower rate of increase for Heavy Duty vehicles' Vehicle Miles Traveled (VMT) compared to the 2016 AQMP. The use of EMFAC 2017 in 2022 AQMP results in higher NO<sub>x</sub> (lower VOC) vehicle emissions rates and increased NO<sub>x</sub> (decreased VOC) emissions relative to EMFAC 2014. The slower VMT growth and higher NO<sub>x</sub> emissions rate offset each other and resulted in the 2022 AQMP on-road NO<sub>x</sub> emissions similar to the 2016 AQMP inventory. VOC emissions from on-road mobile sources are slightly lower in the 2022 AQMP inventory. Several off-road mobile source categories are still under development and will be updated in the near future.

Comments from Advisory Group and Staff Responses:

*Inquiry on the cause of increase in VOCs from stationary sources.* Staff responded that most of the increase is due to area source categories, which are linked to population growth, industry growth, and economic growth. A significant portion of the increase in VOCs is from consumer products such as hairsprays and cleaning detergents.

*Inquiry on what category construction equipment emissions fall under.* Staff responded that construction equipment is included in the off-road mobile source category. This category is currently being updated and there will be more information at future AQMP Advisory Group meetings.

*Inquiry on why the 2018 Emissions Inventory uses EMFAC2017 instead of EMFAC2021.* Staff responded that South Coast AQMD must use the U.S. EPA-approved version of EMFAC, which is

EMFAC2017. Impacts from regulations adopted since EMFAC2017 are accounted for through external adjustment factors.

Comments from Public and Staff Responses:

No comments from the Public on this agenda item.

**4. Update on 2022 AQMP Working Groups**

Mr. Zorik Pirveysian, Planning and Rules Manager of South Coast AQMD's Planning, Rule Development, and Area Sources Division, introduced the five Working Groups established to identify specific strategies for the 2022 AQMP attainment demonstration. These Working Groups are Residential and Commercial Buildings, Heavy-Duty Trucks, Construction and Industrial Equipment, Ocean-Going Vessels, and Aircraft. Other mobile sources not covered in these groups are going through their own public processes by South Coast AQMD and CARB. Mr. Michael Krause, Planning and Rules Manager of South Coast AQMD's Planning, Rule Development, and Area Sources Division provided an update on the Residential and Commercial Buildings Working Group. Mr. Pirveysian continued the presentation on current and proposed regulations as well as potential strategies for the heavy-duty trucks, construction and industrial equipment, ocean-going vessels, and aircraft. The next series of working group meetings are planned for June to continue evaluation of control strategies.

Comments from Advisory Group and Staff Responses:

*Inquiry on reductions for adopted regulations for heavy duty trucks.* Staff responded that emission reductions for CARB's adopted regulations were provided by CARB staff.

*Inquiry on the process of translating concepts into actual proposals for OGVs.* Staff responded that the purpose of working groups is to work with all stakeholders to define specific strategies for different categories for the 2022 AQMP, including OGVs.

*Comment that reductions from Advanced Clean Trucks (ACT) regulation and reductions from Advanced Clean Fleet (ACF)/Zero Emissions Drayage regulation appear to be double counted.* CARB staff responded that ACT requires manufacturers to sell a certain percentage of ZE trucks starting from model year 2024, while ACF is a regulation for fleet owners. Emissions reductions from ACF above and beyond ACT are due to additional ZEVs. The reductions are still preliminary and will continue to be refined.

*Inquiry on if there will be a technical report for mobile source strategy to understand how numbers were derived and what assumptions were made, and if there was any analysis on feasibility.* Staff responded that the CARB's Mobile Source Strategy is the basis for developing the State SIP strategy which will have more specific strategies and targets as a part of the 2022 AQMP. CARB staff responded that the Mobile Source Strategy is more of a long-term scoping document. It provides the potential pathways forward while considering feasibility to balance long-term air quality and climate goals with the state of technology. Over the next few months, CARB will identify the elements of the Mobile Source Strategy to be incorporated into the 2022 AQMP and State SIP Strategy as specific control measures for mobile sources.

*Inquiry if specific components of various aspirational future scenarios will be in SIP Strategy or are emissions reductions changes anticipated from each individual element.* CARB staff responded that it

can be a combination of both as plans are developed. The broader vision of Mobile Source Strategy will be captured and reflected in these more specific planning documents. South Coast AQMD staff added that over the next few months, the emissions inventory and forecast will be updated, and modeling will be conducted to determine preliminary carrying capacity and the needed emission reductions by 2037. Significant NO<sub>x</sub> reductions will likely be required for attainment demonstration similar to the results in the 2016 AQMP.

*Inquiry about CEQA implications and what impacts electrification could have on electrical transmission requirements, mining lithium or rare earths, outsource mining, and who is responsible for assessing these impacts.* Staff responded that electrification impacts were considered and estimated in the 2016 AQMP. A CEQA analysis and an Environmental Impact Report (EIR) will be done for the 2022 AQMP. CARB staff also responded that a CEQA analysis is done for all air quality planning documents, including the 2022 State SIP Strategy and Mobile Source Strategy. There are also federal regulations on mining critical minerals and rare earths.

Comments from Public and Staff Responses:

No comments from the Public on this agenda item.

**5. South Coast Air Basin PM<sub>10</sub> Maintenance Plan for 1987 24-hour PM<sub>10</sub> Standard**

Dr. Scott Epstein, Program Supervisor of Air Quality Assessment, presented the PM<sub>10</sub> Maintenance Plan for the 1987 24-hour PM<sub>10</sub> Standard. In July 2013, South Coast Air Basin attained the PM<sub>10</sub> standard and has been in attainment since then. The Maintenance Plan, due to EPA in July 2021, demonstrates how South Coast AQMD will continue to attain through two successive parts. The first part of the Plan covers 2013-2023, and the second part covers 2023-2035. The Plan addresses 5 key elements including meteorology and air quality technical analysis, a Maintenance Demonstration to show continued attainment, a commitment to maintain future monitoring network, a commitment to verify continued attainment, and establishment of a contingency plan. South Coast Air Basin has maintained attainment of the PM<sub>10</sub> Standard in the first period, after the exclusion of exceptional events. Road dust and construction and demolition are the most significant direct sources of PM<sub>10</sub>, while NO<sub>x</sub> and VOCs are precursors and indirect sources of PM. South Coast Air Basin is expected to maintain attainment through 2035. The Contingency Plan will be activated if the standard is exceeded, with exclusion of exceptional events. The Final Draft Maintenance Plan was released on May 4<sup>th</sup> and will be presented to the South Coast AQMD Governing Board on June 4<sup>th</sup> for approval and submission to U.S. EPA through CARB.

Comments from Advisory Group and Staff Responses:

*Inquiry on whether drought is considered an exceptional event.* Staff responded that drought is explicitly not considered an exceptional event. The most common exceptional event for PM<sub>10</sub> is high winds. If the soil becomes dry from drought, high PM<sub>10</sub> episodes are more likely to occur with high winds.

Comments from Public and Staff Responses:

*Inquiry on whether South Coast AQMD models future PM<sub>10</sub> emissions from the operation of newly installed SCRs under Rule 1109.1.* Staff responded that while installing new SCRs under 1109.1 may increase PM emissions, this type of modeling was not done specifically for the PM<sub>10</sub> Maintenance Plan. Emissions from major facilities are required to be reported to South Coast AQMD through Annual Emissions Reporting (AER) and these reported emissions are included in the PM<sub>10</sub> Maintenance Plan.

Regulations on PM precursors have created a large margin in the emissions inventory to maintain PM10 attainment. So even if there is an increase in PM10, and more likely PM2.5 from the use of SCRs, it will not interfere with the maintenance attainment status. Any potential increase in newly installed SCRs will be reported in AER and accounted for in the inventory.

## **6. Other Business**

No additional comments, announcements, or reports from the Advisory Group members.

## **7. Public Comment**

No additional comments, announcements, or reports from the Public.

## **8. Next Meeting tentatively planned for July/August 2021**

### **Members Present (23)**

Bill LaMarr, California Small Business Alliance  
Bridget McCann, Western States Petroleum Association  
Christopher Chavez, Coalition for Clean Air  
Chris Shimoda, California Trucking Association  
Curtis Coleman, Southern California Air Quality Alliance  
Dan McGivney, Southern California Gas  
David Rothbart, Southern California Alliance of Publicly Owned Treatment Works  
Dawn Fenton, Volvo  
Frances Keeler, California Council for Environmental and Economic Balance  
Greg Osterman, Jet Propulsion Laboratory/NASA  
Jeremy Avise, California Air Resources Board  
Marc Carrel, Breathe LA  
Martha Masters, Riverside County Transportation Commission  
Marcos Holguin, International Longshore and Warehouse Union  
Michael Benjamin, California Air Resources Board  
Paul Ryan, California Refuse Recycling Council  
Peter Herzog, NAIOP, Commercial Real Estate Development Association, SoCal Chapter  
Peter Okurowski, Association of American Railroads  
Rita Loof, RadTech  
Tammy Yamaski, Southern California Edison  
Teresa Pisano, Port of Los Angeles  
Thomas Jelenic, Pacific Merchant Shipping Association  
Tim DeMoss, Port of Los Angeles

### **Public Attendees and Interested Parties (54)**

Abas Goodarzi, US Hybrid  
Alan De Salvio  
Alison Torres  
Allison Skidd  
Andy Henderson

Air Quality Management Plan Advisory Group Minutes for May 18, 2021

Annaleigh Ekman  
Archana  
Ariel Fideldy  
Ben Leers  
Bernadette Shahin  
Bertrand Gaschot, MDAQMD  
Billy Leung  
Chenxia Cai  
Christine Batikian  
Cory Parmer, CARB  
Craig Sakamoto  
Duane Baker  
Eric Anderson  
Erin Berger, Southern California Gas  
Fang Yan, CARB  
Fernando Gaytan, Earth Justice  
Greg Nord  
Howard Berman  
Hsi-Hwa Hu, SCAG  
Jacqueline Moore  
James Perez  
Janet Whittick  
Jennifer K  
Julia Lester, Ramboll  
Melissa McMeechan  
Michael Corder  
Michelle Zumwalt - MDAQMD  
Kiersten Melville  
Kim Fuentes  
Leonardo Ramirez  
Mana Sangkapichai, SCAG  
Mark Abramowitz  
Marshall Waller  
Mathew Watson  
Morgan Caswell  
Nicole Sanoski  
Robert Freeman  
Ramine Cromartie  
Rynda Kay  
Scott King, Ph.D., CARB  
Scott Weaver, Ramboll Environ  
Shawn Tieu  
Sheilla Hadayat  
Stephanie Ng  
Steven Wadding  
Sylvia Vanderspek  
Tim French

Tim Pohle, Airlines for America  
Tyler Nguyen

**South Coast AQMD Staff Present (31)**

Anthony Tang, Information Technology Supervisor  
Barbara Baird, Chief Deputy Counsel  
Brian Choe, Program Supervisor  
Cui Ge, Ph.D., AQ Specialist  
Eric Praske, Ph.D., AQ Specialist  
Gary Quinn, Program Supervisor  
Ian MacMillan, Assistant Deputy Executive Officer  
Jong Hoon Lee, Ph.D., AQ Specialist  
Kalam Cheung, Ph.D., Program Supervisor  
Kathryn Roberts, Deputy District Counsel II  
Kayla Jordan, Assistant AQ Specialist  
Lisa Tanaka O'Malley, Assistant Deputy Executive Officer  
Marc Carreras-Sospedra, Ph.D., AQ Specialist  
Mark Henninger, Information Technology Manager  
Matt Miyasato, Ph.D., Deputy Executive Officer  
Michael Krause, Planning and Rules Manager  
Nico Schulte, Ph.D., AQ Specialist  
Paul Stroik, Ph.D., AQ Specialist  
Paul Wright, Senior Information Technology Specialist  
Ricky Lai, AQ Specialist  
Rosalee Mason, Secretary  
Rui Zhang, Ph.D., AQ Specialist  
Sang-Mi Lee, Ph.D., Program Supervisor  
Sarah Rees, Ph.D., Deputy Executive Officer  
Scott Epstein, Ph.D., Program Supervisor  
Shah Dabirian, Ph.D., Program Supervisor  
Veera Tyagi, Principal Deputy District Counsel  
Vicki White, Technology Implementation Manager  
Wei Li, Ph.D. AQ Specialist  
Xinqiu Zhang, Ph.D., Senior Staff Specialist  
Zorik Pirveysian, Planning and Rules Manager



# South Coast Air Quality Management District

21865 Copley Drive, Diamond Bar, CA 91765-4178  
(909) 396-2000 • www.aqmd.gov

## AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT PLAN ADVISORY GROUP MEETING MINUTES

Friday, August 27, 2021  
1:00 p.m.

### 1. Welcome, Introductions, and Approval of Minutes

Ian MacMillan, Assistant Deputy Executive Officer of South Coast AQMD's Planning, Rule Development, and Area Sources Division, called the virtual meeting to order at 1:00 pm, welcomed all participants and introduced South Coast AQMD staff and Advisory Group members present. Mr. MacMillan asked if there were any comments on the previous meeting's minutes. Since there were no comments, the minutes were approved.

#### Comments from Advisory Group and Staff Responses:

No comments from the Advisory Group on this agenda item.

#### Comments from Public and Staff Responses:

No comments from the Public on this agenda item.

### 2. 2022 AQMP Reasonably Available Control Measures (RACM) Demonstration Methodology for Stationary Sources

Dr. Kalam Cheung, Program Supervisor of Policy, Climate, Energy, and Incentives presented the methodology for RACM demonstration for stationary sources. Dr. Cheung provided the overview of RACM requirements, and presented the seven-step analysis for RACM which includes (i) Updated RACT/Prior RACM, (ii) EPA's Technical Support Documents, (iii) Control Measures Beyond RACM in 2016 AQMP, (iv) Other Districts' Control Measures, (v) EPA's Menu of Control Measures, (vi) EPA's Guidance Documents, and (vii) Control Measures Workshop and Working Group.

#### Comments from Advisory Group and Staff Responses:

*Inquiry on how cost-effectiveness is calculated for mobile sources compared to stationary sources and availability of a cost-effectiveness number for mobile source measures.* Staff responded that in the 2016 AQMP, \$50,000 per ton of NO<sub>x</sub> reduced was used as threshold that triggers additional economic studies. The approach for cost effectiveness thresholds for the 2022 AQMP has not yet been determined. CARB staff responded that CARB uses a similar approach to South Coast AQMD for mobile source measures. Cost-effectiveness and technological feasibility assessment will be conducted for all measures included in CARB's 2022 State SIP strategy. Future workshops will propose specific dollar-per-ton cost-effectiveness thresholds for mobile sources.

*Comment that South Coast AQMD needs to partner with U.S. EPA to revise the outdated Control Technique Guidelines (CTG) for ultraviolet/electron beam (UV/EB) technology.* Staff responded that South Coast AQMD staff submitted a comment letter in June 2020 to recommend U.S. EPA to consider revisiting and updating all outdated CTGs. Once U.S. EPA's CTG documents are revised, staff will update the RACT analysis to reflect the current state of technology. The comparisons with recently adopted rules and regulations by other agencies, as well as the most recent versions of U.S. EPA

guidance documents and their technical support documents, would capture the latest technology development in this source category.

*Inquiry on potential RACM rejected in 2016 AQMP.* Staff responded that in the 2016 AQMP, a seven-step analysis was conducted to identify potential RACM. Based on the analysis, 20 potential RACM were identified and evaluated in more detail. Ten of the 20 measures were rejected as RACM because they were not technologically feasible or cost-effective to implement at the time of the evaluation. As technology evolves and cost of control is updated, these 10 measures will be evaluated again in this AQMP to re-assess feasibility based on updated information.

Comments from Public and Staff Responses:

*Comment regarding the need for evaluation of solar technology for the 2022 AQMP.* Staff thanked the individual and noted the comment.

*Comment to evaluate permits and literature search to determine RACM and reevaluate traditional cost-effectiveness criteria to determine economic feasibility.* Staff thanked the individual and noted the comments.

### **3. Updates on 2022 AQMP Emissions Inventory and Air Quality Modeling**

Dr. Sang-Mi Lee, Program Supervisor of Air Quality Modeling and Emissions Inventory Development presented preliminary emissions inventory for the 2022 AQMP. The presentation included emissions from stationary, on-road mobile, and off-road mobile sources for the base (2018) and future milestone years (2023, 2031 and 2037). Dr. Lee provided comparisons between the preliminary emissions inventory and the 2016 AQMP emissions inventory, which were due to updated economic growth scalars, recently adopted regulations, and update methodologies where applicable. She also provided updates on air quality modeling to predict ozone and PM<sub>2.5</sub> levels for the Basin, the Coachella Valley and adjacent air basins. Specifically, state-of-the-art tools were developed to allocate emissions from on-road mobile sources, ocean going vessels and aircraft to a modeling grid. These approaches utilize big data collected via remote sensing, sensors, and satellite-based communication.

Comments from Advisory Group and Staff Responses:

*Comment that as more sources enter the Annual Emissions Reporting (AER) program in future years, projected contribution to total NO<sub>x</sub> emissions from area sources versus point sources may change in the future.* Staff responded that the distinction between area source and point source might be different depending on geographical areas. Point source emissions are reported data by facilities subject to AER. Area sources include permitted sources which are not included in point sources and aggregated sources that cannot be tracked individually. Emissions from residential fuel combustion or personal use products (consumer products) are example of area sources. Staff ensured emissions are not double counted in both area and point sources inadvertently through a “point-area source reconciliation” process.

Comments from Public and Staff Responses:

No comments from the Public on this agenda item.

#### **4. Meteorological Impact on High Ozone Episodes in South Coast Air Basin**

Dr. Sang-Mi Lee gave a presentation on the meteorological impact on high ozone episodes, which includes two independent approaches – one approach is based on a study conducted by external consultants and the other is an in-house approach conducted by South Coast AQMD staff. The results showed that ozone levels in the Basin are highly sensitive to meteorology, which fluctuates every year due to atmospheric dynamics. She also noted that it is challenging to precisely quantify the impact due to large uncertainties in emissions and volatile precursor levels in a large, heterogeneous urban air shed. Dr. Lee explained that high ozone concentrations for the next three decades show a marginally decreasing trend with the baseline emissions, while reduced emissions scenarios were predicted to show attainment of ozone standards, despite climate change.

##### Comments from Advisory Group and Staff Responses:

*Inquiry on South Coast AQMD's next steps to analyze meteorological impact over a longer time frame than five years in the future, provided U.S. EPA recommends a span of no less than 20 years to account for climate signal in attainment demonstration.* Staff responded that U.S. EPA does not recommend reflecting climate changes on attainment demonstration which has less than 20 year time span. Staff is working very closely with scientists in U.S. EPA, and CARB to address the long-term meteorological impact in the 2022 AQMP. Key factors such as long-range transport, background ozone, biogenic emissions, and other uncertainties, would be considered in the weight of evidence discussion.

##### Comments from Public and Staff Responses:

*Inquiry on how real-world ozone levels in the South Coast Air Basin decreased while the number of exceedances was highest in 2020 since 1997.* Staff explained there are different metrics to evaluate ozone air quality. Common metrics include U.S. EPA's standard using the 4<sup>th</sup> highest concentration in a year, averaged over a three-year period (design value), or the number of days exceeding this standard. Although exceedances and the design value have not reduced as much as desired in recent years, other metrics show that progress is still being made. For example, emissions levels continue to decline, and modeling demonstrates that this approach will overcome any natural fluctuation due to year-to-year meteorological variability. This fluctuation is expected to impact each metric differently, but overall there is a strong correlation between the significant reductions in NO<sub>x</sub> and VOC emissions at a multi-decade scale and subsequent reduced ozone levels.

*Comment that zero-emission solar conversion should be considered.* Staff thanked the individual and noted the comment.

#### **5. Update on 2022 AQMP Working Groups**

Mr. Michael Krause, Planning and Rules Manager, provided updates on Residential and Commercial Buildings Working Group for the 2022 AQMP. Mr. Zorik Pirveysian, Planning and Rules Manager, provided updates on Mobile Source Working Groups, including Heavy-Duty Trucks, Construction and Industrial Equipment, Ocean-Going Vessels, and Aircraft Working Groups, and introduced potential control strategies for each of these mobile sources.

##### Comments from Advisory Group and Staff Responses:

*Inquiry on whether funding strategies for incentive measures are specific to source categories.* Staff responded that there will be a separate working group to discuss funding requirements, including how much funding is needed and the sources of funding.

*Inquiry on the information on the cargo handling equipment working group.* CARB staff answered that there is no specific working group on cargo handling equipment. As part of the regulatory development for cargo handling equipment, workshops and working group meetings where stakeholders can provide feedback will soon take place. CARB is updating the emissions inventory for cargo handling equipment with more up-to-date information through a public process.

*Comment to consider additional working group process for statewide activity to address infrastructure needs.* CARB staff responded that CARB would host future State SIP Strategy workshops for both hydrogen and zero-emission infrastructure. Staff will look at infrastructure holistically, including the grid reliability, grid connections, and cost at the statewide level.

Comments from Public and Staff Responses:

No comments from the Public on this agenda item.

**6. Other Business**

No additional comments, announcements, or reports from the Advisory Group members.

**7. Public Comment**

No additional comments, announcements, or reports from the Public.

**8. Next Meeting tentatively planned for October/November 2021**

**Members Present (21)**

Curtis Coleman, Sothern California Air Quality Alliance  
Dan McGivney, Southern California Gas (SoCalGas)  
David Rothbart, Southern California Alliance of Publicly Owned Treatment Works  
David Darling, American Coatings Association  
Greg Nord, Orange County Transportation Authority (OCTA)  
Janet Whittick, California Council for Environmental and Economic Balance (CCEEB)  
John Ungvasky, United States Environmental Protection Agency (U.S. EPA), Region 9  
Kim Fuentes, South Bay Cities Council of Governments  
Lakshmi Jayaram, Future Ports  
Lori Huddleston, Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority (LA Metro)  
Marcos R. Holguin, International Longshore and Warehouse Union (ILWU) Locals 13, 63, and 94  
Martha Masters, Riverside County Transportation Commission (RCTC)  
Michael Carroll, Latham & Watkins LLP  
Michael Lewis, Southern California Contractors Association  
Paul Ryan, California Refuse Recycling Council  
Peter Okurowski, Association of American Railroads  
Ramine Cromartie, Western States Petroleum Association (WSPA)

Rita Loof, RadTech  
Rongsheng Luo, Southern California Association of Governments (SCAG)  
Thomas Jelenić, Pacific Merchant Shipping Association (PMSA)  
William La Marr, California Small Business Alliance

**Public Attendees and Interested Parties (45)**

Abas Goodarzi, US Hybrid  
Alek Van Houghton, Ramboll  
Ali Ghasemi, Ventura County APCD  
Amy Dryden, Association for Energy Affordability Inc.  
Amy Jeffries, Boeing  
Anjali Deodhar, Viatec Inc.  
Annaleigh Ekman, SCAG  
Anthony Endres  
Ariel Fideldy, CARB  
Austin Hicks, CARB  
Bertrand Gaschot, Mojave Desert AQMD  
Bethmarie Quiambao, Southern California Edison (SCE)  
Claire Garcia, Lion Electric  
Chadwick Collins, Kellen Company  
Chris Dugan, MIG Inc.  
Dustin Rice, Fedex  
Eric Anderson, Toyota  
Eric Berger, SoCalGas  
Fernando Gaytan, Earthjustice  
Ginger Vagenas, U.S. EPA  
Harvey Eder  
John Henkelman, Ventura County APCD  
John Larrea, California League of Food Process (CLFP)  
Ken Dami, Phillips 66  
Laura Iannaccone, County of Los Angeles  
Lauren Paladino, Los Angeles World Airports (LAWA)  
Leah Louis-Prescott, Rocky Mountain Institute (RMI)  
Leela Rao, Port of Long Beach  
Les Swizer, California New Car Dealers Association (CNCDA)  
Lin Wang, LAWA  
Luis Amezcua, Building Decarbonation Coalition  
Mark Abramowitz, Community Environmental Services  
Patricio Portillo, Natural Resources Defense Council (NRDC)  
Julia Lester, Ramboll  
Resa Barillas, California Environmental Voters  
Rynda Kay, U.S. EPA, Region 9  
Sam Pournazeri, CARB  
Scott King, CARB  
Scott Weaver, Ramboll  
Sylvia Vanderspek, CARB  
Teja Ganapa, Los Angeles Department of Water and Power (LADWP)

Terry Ahn, Orange County Sanitation District  
Timothy French, Chicago Law Partners LLC  
Tyler Harris, Ventura County APCD  
Xico Manarolla, Clean Power Alliance (CPA)

**South Coast AQMD Staff Present (34)**

Brian Choe, Program Supervisor  
Carol Gomez, Planning and Rules Manager  
Cui Ge, Ph.D., AQ Specialist  
Elliott Popel, AQ Specialist  
Eric Praske, Ph.D., AQ Specialist  
Eugene Kang, Program Supervisor  
Gary Quinn, Program Supervisor  
Ian MacMillan, Assistant Deputy Executive Officer  
Jong Hoon Lee, Ph.D., AQ Specialist  
Josephine Lee, Senior Deputy District Counsel  
Kalam Cheung, Ph.D., Program Supervisor  
Kathryn Roberts, Deputy District Counsel II  
Kayla Jordan, Assistant AQ Specialist  
Lane Garcia, Program Supervisor  
Laurence Brown, AQ Specialist  
Marc Carreras Sospedra, Ph.D., AQ Specialist  
Mary Reichert, Senior Deputy District Counsel  
Mei Wang, Program Supervisor  
Michael Krause, Planning and Rules Manager  
Nico Schulte, Ph.D., AQ Specialist  
Paul Wright, Senior Information Technology Specialist  
Ricky Lai, AQ Specialist  
Rosalee Mason, Secretary  
Ross Zelen, Assistant to Board Member Kracov  
Rui Zhang, Ph.D., AQ Specialist  
Sang-Mi Lee, Ph.D., Program Supervisor  
Sarah Rees, Ph.D., Deputy Executive Officer  
Scott Epstein, Ph.D., Program Supervisor  
Sheri Hanizavareh, Senior Deputy District Counsel  
Veera Tyagi, Principal Deputy District Counsel  
Wei Li, Ph.D., AQ Specialist  
Xiang Li, Ph.D., AQ Specialist  
Xinqiu Zhang, Ph.D., Senior Staff Specialist  
Zorik Pirveysian, Planning and Rules Manager

**SOUTH COAST AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT  
General Counsel's Office**

**Settlement Penalty Report (12/01/2021 - 12/31/2021)**

**Total Penalties**

Civil Settlement:     \$613,664.00  
Criminal Referral Settlement:     \$9,646.36  
MSPAP Settlement:     \$21,011.00  
Hearing Board Settlement:     \$20,000.00

**Total Cash Settlements:     \$664,321.36**

**Fiscal Year through 12/31/2021 Cash Total :     \$2,268,534.35**

<b>Fac ID</b>	<b>Company Name</b>	<b>Rule Number</b>	<b>Settled Date</b>	<b>Init</b>	<b>Notice Nbrs</b>	<b>Total Settlement</b>
<b>Civil</b>						
189870	BAJA RANCH MARKET #5	1415.1	12/16/2021	JL	P66965	\$3,500.00
47771	DELEO CLAY TILE CO INC	2012	12/29/2021	VT	P68309	\$500.00
170682	LOAN DEPOT	2202	12/29/2021	RL	P64782	\$28,500.00
177219	PROLOGIS	403	12/29/2021	SH	P64770	\$1,750.00
189622	READY SEAL, INCORPORATION	314, 1113	12/03/2021	WW	P66963	\$566,664.00
800113	ROHR, INC.	2004	12/29/2021	DH	P64388	\$3,500.00
134013	SIMAAN SERVICES/ VALLERO	203(b), 461, H&S 41960.2	12/29/2021	SP	P67681, P67692	\$250.00
800128	SO CAL GAS CO	1110.2, 3002(C)(1)	12/15/2021	NS	P67925	\$5,000.00
164237	USA COLLISION CENTER	203, 1151	12/16/2021	DH	P68258, P68708	\$4,000.00
<b>Total Civil Settlements: \$613,664.00</b>						
<b>Criminal Referral</b>						
164111	COASTAL RISK MANAGEMENT INC	1403	12/30/2021	GV	P69409	\$4,709.92
188909	SYSTEM 1 INTERIORS	1403, 40 CFR 61.145	12/30/2021	GV	P66480	\$4,936.44
<b>Total Criminal Referral Settlements: \$9,646.36</b>						

Fac ID	Company Name	Rule Number	Settled Date	Init	Notice Nbrs	Total Settlement
<b>Hearing Board</b>						
104234	SCAQMD v. Mission Foods	1153.1, 1303, 202, 203(b)	12/29/2021	KCM	5400-4	\$20,000.00
<b>Total Hearing Board Settlements: \$20,000.00</b>						
<b>MSPAP</b>						
147565	ANB GAS MART#1, TRISHA ENT. INC.	203(b)	12/14/2021	GC	P66384	\$810.00
139541	AT CORPORATION	461, H&S 41960.2	12/29/2021	GC	P66388	\$553.00
168901	AUTOCRAFT ON SANTA MONICA	1151(e)(1)	12/14/2021	TCF	P66821	\$800.00
9366	BACHEM INC.	203	12/14/2021	GC	P50746	\$680.00
156561	BLESS AUTO COLLISION	1151(e)(1)	12/29/2021	GC	P65220	\$400.00
122538	CHEVRON PRODUCTS CO, STATION #91733	461, H&S 41960.2	12/29/2021	GC	P66018	\$750.00
162374	CITY OF DUARTE	203(b)	12/29/2021	GC	P66564	\$1,200.00
191621	COASTLINE DEVELOPMENT INC	1403, 40 CFR 61.145	12/29/2021	GC	P65532, P65533	\$1,600.00
171206	CORONA AIR PAINT, NORBERTO SEIDE	203(b), 1171	12/14/2021	TCF	P65389	\$1,600.00
134828	FERNANDO'S BODY SHOP, FERNANDO GONZALEZ	1151, 1171	12/29/2021	GC	P68512	\$800.00
181514	H & H GASOLINE	203(b), 461	12/29/2021	GC	P69602	\$1,200.00
100758	HARBOR CLEANERS	1402	12/15/2021	GC	P65654	\$640.00
23401	HOOD MFG INC	3002(c)(1)	12/15/2021	GC	P68904	\$850.00
175427	KAZI ASSOCIATES, INC.	203(a), 461	12/29/2021	GC	P69027	\$728.00
149722	MATRIX ENVIRONMENTAL, INC	1403	12/15/2021	TCF	P69445	\$500.00
189508	OTO CUSTOMS AUTOBODY AND PAINT	1151(e)(1)	12/29/2021	TCF	P65074	\$1,000.00
154633	RAAM INC DBA CYPRESS UNION	461	12/15/2021	GC	P68140	\$300.00
179544	SUNOIL RETAIL GROUP INC	203(A), 461(E)(2)	12/29/2021	TCF	P70165, P70172	\$4,000.00
152974	UNITED EXCAVATION	403	12/29/2021	TCF	P68644	\$1,000.00
170210	UNITED HEALTHCARE/JONES LANG LASALLE	1415	12/15/2021	TCF	P63892	\$1,600.00
<b>Total MSPAP Settlements: \$21,011.00</b>						

**SOUTH COAST AQMD'S RULES AND REGULATIONS INDEX  
FOR DECEMBER 2021 PENALTY REPORT**

**REGULATION II - PERMITS**

- Rule 202 Temporary Permit to Operate
- Rule 203 Permit to Operate

**REGULATION III - FEES**

- Rule 314 Fees for Architectural Coatings

**REGULATION IV - PROHIBITIONS**

- Rule 403 Fugitive Dust
- Rule 461 Gasoline Transfer and Dispensing

**REGULATION XI - SOURCE SPECIFIC STANDARDS**

- Rule 1110.2 Emissions from Gaseous- and Liquid-Fueled Internal Combustion Engines
- Rule 1113 Architectural Coatings
- Rule 1151 Motor Vehicle and Mobile Equipment Non-Assembly Line Coating Operations
- Rule 1153.1 Emissions of Oxides of Nitrogen from Commercial Food Ovens
- Rule 1171 Solvent Cleaning Operations

**REGULATION XIII - NEW SOURCE REVIEW**

- Rule 1303 Requirements

**REGULATION XIV - TOXICS**

- Rule 1402 Control of Toxic Air Contaminants from Existing Sources
- Rule 1403 Asbestos Emissions from Demolition/Renovation Activities
- Rule 1415 Reduction of Refrigerant Emissions from Stationary Refrigeration and Air Conditioning Systems
- Rule 1415.1 Reduction of Refrigerant Emissions from Stationary Refrigeration Systems

**REGULATION XX REGIONAL CLEAN AIR INCENTIVES MARKET (RECLAIM)**

- Rule 2004 Requirements
- Rule 2012 Requirements for Monitoring, Reporting, and Recordkeeping for Oxides of Nitrogen (NOx) Emissions

**REGULATION XXII ON-ROAD MOTOR VEHICLE MITIGATION**

- Rule 2202 On-Road Motor Vehicle Mitigation Options

**REGULATION XXX - TITLE V PERMITS**

Rule 3002 Requirements for Title V Permits

**CALIFORNIA HEALTH AND SAFETY CODE**

41960.2 Gasoline Vapor Recovery

**CODE OF FEDERAL REGULATIONS**

40 CFR 61.145 Standard for Demolition and Renovation