

BOARD MEETING DATE: January 6, 2023

AGENDA NO. 2

MINUTES: Governing Board Monthly Meeting

SYNOPSIS: Attached are the Minutes of the December 2, 2022
Board Meeting.

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

Approve the December 2, 2022 Board Meeting Minutes.

Faye Thomas
Clerk of the Boards

FT

FRIDAY, DECEMBER 2, 2022

Notice having been duly given, the regular meeting of the South Coast Air Quality Management District Board was conducted in a hybrid format (in person and remotely via videoconferencing and telephone). Members present:

Mayor Ben J. Benoit, Chair
Cities of Riverside County

Senator Vanessa Delgado (Ret.), Vice Chair
Senate Rules Committee Appointee

Mayor Michael A. Cacciotti
Cities of Los Angeles County – Eastern Region

Gideon Kracov
Governor's Appointee

Supervisor Sheila Kuehl
County of Los Angeles

Mayor Larry McCallon
Cities of San Bernardino County

Veronica Padilla-Campos
Speaker of the Assembly Appointee

Supervisor V. Manuel Perez
County of Riverside

Council Member Nithya Raman
City of Los Angeles

Mayor Carlos Rodriguez
Cities of Orange County

Supervisor Janice Rutherford
County of San Bernardino

Members Absent: Supervisor Andrew Do
Vice Mayor Rex Richardson

For additional details of the Governing Board Meeting, please refer to the recording of the Webcast at: Live Webcast (aqmd.gov)

CALL TO ORDER: Chair Benoit called the meeting to order at 9:08 a.m.

- Pledge of Allegiance: Led by Mayor McCallon
- Roll Call
- Opening Comments

Supervisor Rutherford requested that everyone observe a moment of remembrance to mark the seventh anniversary of the December 2, 2015 terrorist attack in San Bernardino County and honor the 14 people who lost their lives that day: Robert Adams, Isaac Amanios, Bennetta Betbadal, Harry Bowman, Sierra Clayborn, Juan Carlos Espinosa, Aurora Luz Godoy, Shannon Johnson, Daniel Kaufman, Damian Meins, Tin Nguyen, Nicholas Thalasinis, Yvette Velasco, and Michael Wetzel.

Mayor Rodriguez announced the departure of Board Consultant Matt Holder to serve as the Chief of Staff for Andrew Hamilton, the Orange County Auditor-Controller. He thanked Mr. Holder for serving over the years.

Wayne Nastri, Executive Officer, stated that the Clean Air Awards will be held in January 2023 and invited everyone to participate. He reminded everyone that the general public comment period is for items not on the agenda and that comments on the Draft 2022 AQMP will be taken under Agenda Item No. 26. He also acknowledged and expressed appreciation to the staff that worked on the 2022 AQMP.

- Recognize Employees with 20, 25, 30, and 35 Years of Service

John Olvera, Deputy Executive Officer/Administrative & Human Resources, introduced a video presentation of employees that have reached the following employment milestones.

20 Years: Candy Boyajian, Diane Casas, Rodolfo Chacon, Heather Farr, Kambiz Hadjforoosh, John Kampa, Patricia Kwon, Thomas Lee, Khang Nguyen, John Olvera, Kevin Pahl, Shawn Perry, Marilyn Potter, Cynthia Ravenstein, Angelica Reyes, Noe Sosa, Lora Trapp, and Gregory Ushijima

25 Years: Hariyanto Janto, Donald Kho, Robert Paud and Hoan Thai

30 Years: David Madsen and Paul Wright

35 Years: Kimberly Bolander, Scott Caso, George Haddad, Kathryn Higgins, Linda Dejbakhsh, Lisa Dowyak, Laurance Israel, Tom Lee, Matthew Mackenzie, Kenny Matsuda, Velisa Ramos, Ricardo Rivera, and Mark Von Der Au

Chair Benoit expressed appreciation to the employees for their years of service and commitment to the South Coast AQMD.

PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD – (Public Comment on Non-Agenda Items, Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3)

The Public Comment Period was opened. There being no requests to speak, the Public Comment Period was closed.

The following comment was mistakenly made during the comment period for Agenda Item No. 10, and subsequently moved under the public comment period for non-agenda items.

Eva Escobar, a member of the public, expressed concerns regarding allegations made about the business and employment practices of the firm that provides security guard services at the South Coast AQMD Diamond Bar headquarters.



CONSENT AND BOARD CALENDAR

Items 1 Through 3 – Action Items/No Fiscal Impact

1. Comply with AB 361 Requirements to Allow South Coast AQMD Board and South Coast AQMD Brown Act Committees to Continue to Meet Remotely
2. Approve Minutes of November 4, 2022 Board Meeting
3. Set Public Hearings January 6, 2023 to Consider Adoption of and/or Amendments to South Coast AQMD Rules and Regulations:
 - A. Determine That Proposed Amended Rule 1106 – Marine and Pleasure Craft Coatings, and Proposed Amended Rule 1107 – Coating of Metal Parts and Products, Are Exempt from CEQA; and Amend Rule 1106 and Rule 1107
 - B. Determine That Proposed Amended Rule 1118 – Control of Emissions from Refinery Flares Is Exempt from CEQA; and Amend Rule 1118

Items 4 through 10 -- Budget/Fiscal Impact

4. Appropriate Funds and Authorize Execution of Grant Agreements to Replace Onboard CNG Fuel Tanks on School Buses, and Recognize Funds, Execute Contracts and Reimburse the General Fund for Zero-Emission School Bus Funding Using CARB Supplemental Environmental Project Funds
5. Issue RFPs, Execute Contracts and Approve Vouchers for Commercial Electric Lawn and Garden Equipment Incentive and Exchange Program Projects
6. Adopt Resolution Recognizing Funds for FY 2022-23 Carl Moyer Program and Issue Program Announcements for Carl Moyer and SOON Programs

7. Recognize Revenue, Appropriate Funds, Issue Solicitations and Purchase Orders for Air Monitoring Equipment and One Vehicle
8. Transfer Funds and Authorize Executive Officer to Initiate a Contract with Shah Dabirian for Socioeconomic Analysis Consulting Services
9. Appropriate Funds and Amend Contract with Strumwasser & Woocher, LLP to Provide Representation and Advice to South Coast AQMD Hearing Board
10. Transfer and Appropriate Funds, Issue Purchase Orders for Building-Related Equipment, and Execute Sole Source Contract for Replacement of Pollution Control Unit Exhaust Systems

Items 11 through 17 – Information Only/Receive and File

11. Legislative, Public Affairs and Media Report
12. Hearing Board Report
13. Civil Filings and Civil Penalties Report
14. Lead Agency Projects and Environmental Documents Received
15. Rule and Control Measure Forecast
16. Annual Audited Financial Statements for FY Ended June 30, 2022
17. Status Report on Major Ongoing and Upcoming Projects for Information Management

Item 18 – Staff Presentation/Board Discussion/Receive and File

18. Address AB 2449 Requirements to Allow Members of South Coast AQMD Governing Board and South Coast AQMD Brown Act Committees and Groups to Meet Remotely in Cases of Emergency or for Just Cause

Items 19 through 24 -- Reports for Committees and CARB

19. Administrative Committee
20. Investment Oversight Committee
21. Legislative Committee
22. Stationary Source Committee
23. Technology Committee
24. California Air Resources Board Monthly Report
25. Items Deferred from Consent and Board Calendar

There were no items pulled for discussion.

Disclosures

Mayor Rodriguez reported through General Counsel Bayron Gilchrist that he had no financial interest in Agenda Item No. 4 but is required to identify for the record that he is a committee member for the Placentia-Yorba Linda Unified School District, which is involved in this item.

Board Member Kracov reported through Mr. Gilchrist that he had no financial interest in Agenda Item Nos. 4 and 6 but is required to identify for the record that he is a board member of CARB, which is involved in this item.



Agenda Item Nos. 1-24 were opened for public comment; and the following individuals addressed the Board.

Agenda Item No. 15

Fernando Gaytan, Earthjustice, thanked staff for their work in promulgating important rules this year. He was pleased to see that the Railyard and Port indirect source rules (ISR) were on the Rule Forecast Report and hoped that staff would stick to the timeline as those rules are essential to meeting air quality needs. He commented on the need to hasten the rule development schedule for rules that will accelerate the transition to zero emissions. For additional details, please refer to the Webcast beginning at 20:33.

Yassi Kavezade, Sierra Club, expressed support for Mr. Gaytan's comments and encouraged staff to stay timely with the rule development for the Railyard and Port ISRs. She emphasized the need for zero-emission building measures to be consistent with agencies across the state. For additional details, please refer to the Webcast beginning at 21:57.

Theral Golden, West Long Beach Association, expressed support for statements made by the two previous commenters and commented on the negative health impacts that results from delaying efforts aimed at achieving clean air.

Agenda Item No. 3A

Rita Loof, RadTech, expressed opposition to the staff proposal for Rules 1106 and 1107. She stated that the decision to remove the definition of energy curable materials to avoid disapproval by the U.S. EPA is premature because U.S. EPA has not issued a final action of disapproval, but rather has asked for public comments on a proposed disapproval. Furthermore, the South Coast AQMD should retain the definition of energy curable materials because U.S. EPA has never questioned the actual definition, which contains the reference to the test method. Since the UV/EB technology association has submitted formal comments to U.S. EPA on this matter, she requested that the rules be delayed to allow U.S. EPA to review their comments. For additional details, please refer to the Webcast beginning at 22:53.

Supervisor Rutherford stated that she believes Ms. Loof's request is reasonable and requested this item be tabled until such time as U.S. EPA has had the opportunity to hear from new members of Congress who might be able to have an influence on U.S. EPA. She requested a separate vote on Agenda Item No. 3A. For additional details, please refer to the Webcast beginning at 27:55.

Mr. Nastri pointed out the mischaracterization of the facts on this issue and noted that it is unlikely that a new Congress would change the definition. For additional details, please refer to the Webcast beginning at 28:41.

Dr. Sarah Rees, Deputy Executive Officer/Planning, Rule Development and Implementation, acknowledged that U.S. EPA has not taken final action yet but based on subsequent conversations, U.S. EPA confirmed that there is a specified timeframe to correct the deficiency before sanctions are imposed. For additional details, please refer to the Webcast beginning at 29:24.

In response to Senator Delgado's inquiry regarding future development of a test method, Mr. Nastri responded that there is nothing preventing the UV/EB industry from working with U.S. EPA to develop a new test method and then staff could revise the rule for the Board's consideration. For additional details please refer to the Webcast beginning at 30:28.

Mayor Rodriguez expressed support for Supervisor Rutherford's request to pull Agenda Item No. 3A for a separate vote.

Agenda Item No. 10

Eva Escobar (This public comment was not relevant to Agenda Item No. 10 and was therefore moved to the public comment period for non-agenda items.)

There being no further comments, the Public Comment Period was closed

Board Action (Items 1-2; 3B; and 4-24)

MOVED BY MCCALLON, SECONDED BY CACCIOTTI TO APPROVE AGENDA ITEMS 1, 2, 3B, AND 4 THROUGH 24 AS RECOMMENDED TO:

ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. 22-37, RECOGNIZING THE PROCLAMATION OF A STATE OF EMERGENCY BY GOVERNOR NEWSOM ON MARCH 4, 2020 AND THAT LOCAL OFFICIALS CONTINUE TO RECOMMEND MEASURES TO PROMOTE SOCIAL DISTANCING; AND AUTHORIZING FULLY OR PARTIALLY REMOTE TELECONFERENCE MEETINGS OF THE GOVERNING BOARD OF THE SOUTH COAST AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT, AND SOUTH COAST AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT COMMITTEES SUBJECT TO THE BROWN ACT, FOR THE PERIOD DECEMBER 2, 2022 THROUGH JANUARY 1, 2023 PURSUANT TO PROVISIONS OF THE BROWN ACT; AND

ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. 22-38, RECOGNIZING UPON RECEIPT UP TO \$47 MILLION IN FY 2022-23 CARL MOYER PROGRAM FUNDS FROM CARB INTO THE CARL MOYER PROGRAM SB 1107 FUND (32); AND

RECEIVE AND FILE THE COMMITTEE REPORTS AND CARB REPORT.

THE MOTION CARRIED BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

AYES: Benoit, Cacciotti, Delgado, Kracov, Kuehl, McCallon, Padilla-Campos, Perez, Raman, Rodriguez, and Rutherford

NOES: None

ABSENT: Do and Richardson

Board Action (Item 3A)

MOVED BY MCCALLON, SECONDED BY CACCIOTTI TO SET THE PUBLIC HEARING ON JANUARY 6, 2023 TO DETERMINE THAT PROPOSED AMENDED RULE 1106 – MARINE AND PLEASURE CRAFT COATINGS, AND PROPOSED AMENDED RULE 1107 – COATING OF METAL PARTS AND PRODUCTS, ARE EXEMPT FROM CEQA; AND AMEND RULE 1106 AND RULE 1107.

THE MOTION CARRIED BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

AYES: Benoit, Cacciotti, Delgado, Kracov, Kuehl, McCallon, Padilla-Campos, Perez, and Raman

NOES: Rodriguez and Rutherford

ABSENT: Do and Richardson



26. Certify Final Program Environmental Impact Report for 2022 AQMP and Adopt Draft Final 2022 AQMP

Dr. Sarah Rees, Deputy Executive Officer/Planning, Rule Development and Implementation, gave the staff presentation on this item.

Board members expressed appreciation to staff for their hard work and robust public engagement in the development of the Draft 2022 AQMP.

Agenda Item No. 26 was opened for public comment; and the following individuals addressed the Board.

Fernando Gaytan, Earthjustice, expressed support for an AQMP that focuses on zero emissions but was concerned with attempts to delay its adoption. He commented on the importance of the 2022 AQMP to the community and the substantial public health benefits it will deliver. He emphasized the need to start pivoting towards implementing rules that address large combustion sources and indirect source rules for railyards and the Ports. For additional details please refer to the Webcast beginning at 56:51.

John Heinz, Regulatory Flexibility Group, expressed concerns with the proposed fundamental shift from the tiered cost effectiveness approach based on control measure cost. Without the benefit of an established tiered cost effectiveness analysis at a reasonable threshold, there is concern that future rulemakings could fail under the Health and Safety Code. Therefore, he requested that the Board retain the control measure based on cost effectiveness threshold approach for stationary sources. For additional details please refer to the Webcast beginning at 58:14.

Yassi Kavezade, Sierra Club, expressed support for the staff recommendation to use the health-based screening threshold of \$325,000 per ton NOx for future rulemakings. She commented on the role of the South Coast AQMD to influence the transition of the building, energy and transportation markets towards zero emissions by funding technologies that exhibit clean air benefits. For additional details please refer to the Webcast beginning at 59:39.

Michael Carroll, Latham and Watkins on behalf of the Western States Petroleum Association, expressed concerns about the extent to which the Draft 2022 AQMP relies on zero-emission technology, and whether deployment of zero-emission technologies will be commensurate with what is anticipated in the Draft 2022 AQMP. He expressed additional concerns about whether improvements to the grid will be sufficient to support the technology and requested that guardrails be put in place to address those contingencies. To analyze the pace of technology development and the costs, he circulated two proposed provisions that he requested the Board include in the 2022 AQMP Resolution. For additional details please refer to the Webcast beginning at 1:01:23.

In response to Chair Benoit's request, Mr. Carroll explained that the provisions he presented would require annual reporting to the Mobile Source Committee on the status of the development and deployment of zero-emission technology called for in the 2022 AQMP, and the infrastructure necessary to support it, and the associated costs. The second provision addresses the uncertainty regarding the cost of some of the technologies and requires that the South Coast AQMD evaluate technology feasibility and cost effectiveness for subsequent rulemakings consistent with the Health and Safety Code. For additional details please refer to the Webcast beginning at 1:03:02.

Sarah Wiltfong, Los Angeles County Business Federation (BizFed), commented on the need for South Coast AQMD to remain technology- and fuel-neutral and the importance of competition and innovation to reducing emissions in a way that is

cost effective, affordable and practical. She expressed concern that the grid infrastructure is not ready and capable of sustaining widespread deployment of electrification, the costs related to the installation of zero-emission infrastructure, and the estimated 29,000 jobs per year that will be lost. For additional details please refer to the Webcast beginning at 1:05:21.

For additional details, please refer to the Webcast beginning at the times shown below.

Whitney Amaya, East Yard Communities for Environmental Justice (EYCEJ) and West Long Beach resident ([1:28:07](#))
Jan Victor Andasan, EYCEJ ([1:34:36](#))
Angie Balderas, Sierra Club and Inland Empire resident ([1:54:43](#))
Sylvia Betancourt, Long Beach Alliance for Children with Asthma ([1:36:22](#))
Renate Boronowsky, EYCEJ and Long Beach resident ([1:46:07](#))
Chris Chavez, Coalition for Clean Air ([1:06:48](#))
Jocelyn Del Real, EYCEJ ([1:56:20](#))
Theral Golden, West Long Beach Association ([1:15:37](#))
Jed Holtzman, California Office of RMI ([1:11:56](#))
Lizbeth, Sierra Club ([1:32:20](#))
Marcos Lopez, EYCEJ and Long Beach resident ([1:26:55](#))
Jennifer Cardenas, Sierra Club and Fontana resident ([1:50:47](#))
*Julia May, Communities for a Better Environment ([1:41:16](#))
Diego Mayen, Active Streets and West Long Beach resident ([1:44:22](#))
Rodry Sosa, Fontana resident, ([1:53:10](#))
Kathleen Woodfield, San Pedro Peninsula Homeowners Coalition ([1:25:20](#))
*(Submitted Written Comments)

These commenters provided testimony on the Draft 2022 AQMP regarding the following issues:

- Support adoption of a strong AQMP
- Urge aggressive widespread adoption of zero-emissions technology
- Reject attempts to delay or weaken the Draft 2022 AQMP
- Emphasized the need to:
 - Ensure that the Draft 2022 AQMP has stronger emission reduction commitments with measurable targets
 - Address federal sources
 - Adopt and implement indirect source rules as soon as possible
 - Expedite the replacement of diesel-powered equipment and vehicles with the cleanest available technologies
- Support efforts to reduce emissions from residential commercial buildings in an equitable manner
- Ensure fuel sources are clean
- Questioned the last-minute provisions that Mike Carroll presented

Gabrielle Alvira, Pacific Environment, expressed support for the adoption of a stronger AQMP with necessary revisions to address the urgent climate and health risks posed by emissions in the South Coast Air Basin. She urged strong emission reduction targets for commercial marine ports, a zero-emission standard by 2040 for all vessel

categories, and an interim mandate to allow Tier 3 main engines to visit the San Pedro Bay Ports by 2025. She also called for the acceleration of At-Berth requirements for tanker vessels and a zero-emission standard for commercial harbor craft by 2035. For additional details please refer to the Webcast beginning at 1:08:33.

Bill Quinn, California Council for Environmental and Economic Balance, expressed concerns that the Draft 2022 AQMP relies heavily on zero-emission technologies that may not exist in the time frame necessary. He further raised concerns with the increase of the cost effectiveness threshold to \$325,000 per ton NOx that would eliminate additional public meeting options at or below the cost-effectiveness threshold. Mr. Quinn suggested a screening cost effectiveness threshold of \$162,500 or 50 percent of the proposed cost effectiveness threshold. He also suggested that a process with an additional public meeting should be retained. For additional details please refer to the Webcast beginning at 1:10:14.

Topher Mathers, Active San Gabriel Valley, expressed support for the adoption of a strong AQMP that calls out zero-emission technology solutions across the sectors. He commented on the health impacts of indoor air pollution from gas appliances, noting that funding sources are available to help communities with less resources transition to zero emissions. For additional details please refer to the Webcast beginning at 1:13:52.

Resa Barillas, California Environmental Voters, expressed support for a strong AQMP, noting that the Plan could be more aggressive on timelines and technologies. She emphasized the need to abandon subsidies for combustion or provide greater incentives to programs promoting zero emissions. She expressed disappointment that last minute amendments are being proposed to the Resolution. For additional details please refer to the Webcast beginning at 1:17:16.

Vice Chair Delgado announced that she read the additional provisions proposed for the Resolution and noted that the changes seem minimal but asked for staff to clarify. For additional details please refer to the Webcast beginning at 1:18:41.

Mr. Nastri agreed and noted that the first proposed provision is to comply with the existing law, which the South Coast AQMD already does. He then read the second proposed provision that would direct staff to report to the Mobile Source Committee beginning in March 2024, and every 12 months thereafter, the status of the pace of development and deployment of zero-emission technology, the infrastructure necessary to support it, and the associated costs. He suggested that the Board take a short recess to allow staff to determine where within the Resolution it would be appropriate to include the two proposed provisions. He added that the proposed provisions would be posted on the website and distributed to the board members, board assistants and the public. For additional details please refer to the Webcast beginning at 1:19:10.

Rubina Suwol, California Safe Schools and Los Angeles Environmental Justice Network, urged to prioritize zero-NOx emissions for residential and commercial sources, noting that the technology is readily available and is necessary for the region to reach attainment under the federal Clean Air Act. She emphasized the need to target environmental justice communities for incentives and subsidies. For additional details please refer to the Webcast beginning at 1:21:09.

In response to Council Member Raman's request, Mr. Nastri read the first proposed provision, noting that it does not change the existing process as the South Coast AQMD is bound to comply with the Health and Safety Code 40920.6. For additional details please refer to the Webcast beginning at 1:22:17.

Board Member Kracov suggested taking a break after public comments to give staff time to digest the provisions and report back to the Board with details. For additional details please refer to the Webcast beginning at 1:24:07.

Adrian Martinez, Earthjustice, on behalf of the Los Angeles County Electric Truck and Bus Coalition commented that the Draft 2022 AQMP focuses on zero-emission technology because the science supports zero emissions to achieve clean air. He recommended that staff be directed to provide regular reports to the Stationary Source Committee as they are provided to the Mobile Source Committee.

Mr. Nastri explained that briefing more than one committee on the same item would be a violation of the Brown Act. For additional details please refer to the Webcast beginning at 1:31:20.

Mark Abramowitz, Community Environmental Services, commended the Draft 2022 AQMP for its focus on zero-emission technologies. He emphasized the need to quantify the costs and benefits and recommended that staff seek changes to eliminate the incremental cost effectiveness in the Health and Safety Code. For additional details please refer to the Webcast beginning at 1:33:11.

Bill LaMarr, California Small Business Alliance, expressed concerns that the Draft 2022 AQMP will not achieve its intended purpose because it is over reliant on the timely actions by other government agencies and entities, and radical improvements in our electrical grid and infrastructure, which are unlikely to be completed by the attainment deadlines. He cautioned about approving a plan that requires stationary sources to invest substantial sums of money in a host of costly technologies knowing that it will not be sufficient to achieve attainment goals. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 1:37:53.

Al Sattler, a member of the public, commented on the importance of the costs and benefits, as well as co-benefits from reducing ozone. For additional details please refer to the Webcast beginning at 1:39:30.

Bethmarie Quiambao, Southern California Edison, commended the significant efforts South Coast AQMD staff has taken leading up to an innovative and effective AQMP. She expressed support for the rapid transition to zero-emissions technology but urged that while doing so, the South Coast AQMD should balance technological feasibility, maturity, availability, and cost effectiveness. She also expressed support for the increase in cost effectiveness threshold amounts but remains concerned how they would be applied. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 1:42:59.

Harvey Eder, Public Solar Power Coalition, advocated for a Plan that focuses on total solar conversion and commented on the threat of climate change.

Curtis Coleman expressed support for the additions to the Resolution proposed by Mike Carroll. He commented on the significant costs to implement the 2022 AQMP, emphasizing the need to track the costs as the electrification movement moves forward. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 1:49:16.

Many of the commenters commended staff for their hard work and the extensive stakeholder process and public engagement.

There being no further requests to speak, the public comment period for Agenda Item No. 26 was closed.

Written Comments Submitted by

- Airlines for America (letter dated November 29, 2022)
- One letter (dated November 30, 2022) signed by the following organizations: Earthjustice, California Safe Schools, Center for Community Action and Environmental Justice, Coalition for A Safe Environment, Communities for a Better Environment, East Yard Communities for Environmental Justice, Jobs to Move America, Los Angeles County Electric Truck and Bus Coalition, and People's Collective for Environmental Justice

Further discussion among the Board Members ensued regarding how to address the additional provisions to the Resolution that Mike Carroll proposed and the concerns that many of the commenters expressed about the proposal.

Mike Carroll notified the Board that he was withdrawing his proposal, to avoid any perception of dishonest activity or special treatment. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 2:00:47

Chair Benoit expressed his opinion that the two proposed provisions seem to be minor and are actions that staff would otherwise take without them included in the Resolution. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 2:01:46

Council Member Raman expressed gratitude to Mr. Carroll for withdrawing his request and highlighted the spirit of collaboration and significant public engagement that went into developing the Draft Plan that was presented today. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 2:02:46

Supervisor Perez made a motion to approve Agenda Item No. 26 as recommended by staff, seconded by Mayor Cacciotti.

Mayor McCallon expressed his continued concern about the conversion of residential appliances and its negative impact on lower income communities and seniors who typically live in older neighborhoods, as well as the costs that will have to be incurred to make those upgrades. He also expressed concern with pursuing a railyard ISR instead of an MOU approach. He added that despite those concerns he would be supporting the adoption of the Draft 2022 AQMP. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 2:05:34

Mayor Rodriguez expressed concern about the estimated 29,000 jobs that would be foregone and the \$34.1 billion in total incremental cost, the cost implications for the decarbonization of buildings, and the uncertainty about the infrastructure needed

and its cost to meet the enormous demands of electrification. He added that he would not be voting in favor of adopting the Draft 2022 AQMP. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 2:07:05

Supervisor Rutherford also expressed concern about the significant costs that will be required to implement the Plan, its reliance on technology that does not exist, the grid infrastructure needed to support the transition to zero-emission technology, and that it does not balance cost effectiveness with technological feasibility. Additionally, instead of relying on ISRs the federal government needs to deal with the largest sources of emissions under their purview. Supervisor Rutherford noted that for these reasons she would be voting no. For additional details, please refer to the [Webcast](#) beginning at 2:09:08

Board Action (Agenda Item 26)

MOVED BY PEREZ, SECONDED BY CACCIOTTI TO APPROVE AGENDA ITEM NO. 26 AS RECOMMENDED TO:

CERTIFY THE FINAL PROGRAM ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT FOR THE 2022 AQMP;

ADOPT THE 2022 AQMP IN ACCORDANCE WITH RESOLUTION 22-39;

AUTHORIZE THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER TO MAKE APPROPRIATE CHANGES TO THE ADOPTED 2022 AQMP AND ITS APPENDICES, IF NECESSARY, TO REFLECT AMENDMENTS ADOPTED AT THE PUBLIC HEARING;

DIRECT THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER TO SUBMIT THE ADOPTED 2022 AQMP INCLUDING ITS APPENDICES TO CARB FOR ITS APPROVAL AND SUBSEQUENT SUBMITTAL TO U.S. EPA FOR INCLUSION IN THE STATE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN.

THE MOTION CARRIED BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

AYES: Benoit, Cacciotti, Delgado, Kracov, Kuehl, McCallon, Padilla-Campos, Raman, and Perez

NOES: Rodriguez and Rutherford

ABSENT: Do and Richardson



CLOSED SESSION

The Board did not adjourn to Closed Session.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned by Mr. Gilchrist at 12:29 p.m.

The foregoing is a true statement of the proceedings held by the South Coast Air Quality Management District Board on December 2, 2022.

Respectfully Submitted,

Faye Thomas
Clerk of the Boards

Date Minutes Approved: _____

Ben J. Benoit, Chair

ACRONYMS

AQMP = Air Quality Management Plan
CARB = California Air Resources Board
CEQA = California Environmental Quality Act
FY = Fiscal Year