BOARD MEETING DATE: October 3, 2025 AGENDA NO. 1

MINUTES: Governing Board Monthly Meeting

SYNOPSIS: Attached are the Minutes of the September 5, 2025

Board Meeting.

# **RECOMMENDED ACTION:**

Approve the September 5, 2025 Board Meeting Minutes.

Faye Thomas Clerk of the Boards

FT

#### FRIDAY, SEPTEMBER 5, 2025

Notice having been duly given, the meeting of the South Coast Air Quality Management District Board was conducted in a hybrid format of in-person attendance in the Dr. William A. Burke Auditorium at the South Coast AQMD Headquarters, 21865 Copley Drive, Diamond Bar, California 91765, and remotely via videoconferencing and telephone.

Members Present:

Senator Vanessa Delgado (Ret.), Chair Senate Rules Committee Appointee

Councilmember Michael A. Cacciotti, Vice Chair Cities of Los Angeles County – Eastern Region

Supervisor Curt Hagman County of San Bernardino

Mayor Pro Tem Larry McCallon Cities of San Bernadino County

Supervisor Holly J. Mitchell County of Los Angeles

Supervisor Janet Nguyen County of Orange

Vice Mayor Brenda Olmos (Left at ~11:10 a.m.) Cities of Los Angeles County – Western Region

Board Member Veronica Padilla-Campos Speaker of the Assembly Appointee

Supervisor V. Manuel Perez County of Riverside

Councilmember Nithya Raman City of Los Angeles

Mayor Pro Tem Carlos Rodriguez
Cities of Orange County

Absent: Mayor Patricia Lock Dawson

Cities of Riverside County

Vacant: Governor's Appointee

For additional details of the Governing Board Meeting, please refer to the recording of the Webcast at: Live Webcast (aqmd.gov)

**CALL TO ORDER**: Chair Delgado called the meeting to order at 9:05 a.m.

- Pledge of Allegiance: Led by Supervisor Holly J. Mitchell
- Roll Call

Chair Delgado, Board Member Padilla-Campos, Councilmember Raman, and Mayor Pro Tem Rodriguez were not present for roll call. Councilmember Raman joined the meeting at 9:08 a.m., Chair Delgado and Mayor Pro Tem Rodriguez joined at 9:09 a.m., and Board Member Padilla-Campos joined at 9:12 a.m.

# Opening Comments

Executive Officer Wayne Nastri provided an update on ongoing negotiations with the Ports of Los Angeles and Long Beach regarding the cooperative agreement, as well as the August 28, 2025 virtual community meeting. Community members expressed concerns about the agreement, while industry representatives voiced support for continuing the negotiations. The parties are working toward reaching an agreement by the September 19, 2025 Mobile Source Committee meeting; however, the Ports have indicated they may withdraw from the negotiations if the 75-day rule package is released.

Executive Officer Nastri also highlighted the launch of the INVEST CLEAN and GO ZERO incentive programs, as well as the Habitat for Humanity Build events being hosted by South Coast AQMD staff on October 11. For additional details, please refer to the Webcast beginning at 8:32.

Supervisor Hagman asked what percentage of the negotiations had been completed. Executive Officer Nastri responded that infrastructure planning is the primary focus during these negotiations and staff is about 60 percent complete. For additional details, please refer to the <u>Webcast</u> beginning at 13:02.

Supervisor Hagman commented that there is interest from San Bernardino County and its cities regarding the infrastructure component of the INVEST CLEAN and asked about the short application deadline. Executive Officer Nastri explained that it is critical that staff stays within the terms and conditions of this U.S. EPA grant, adding that it does have a short implementation timeline of five years. For additional details, please refer to the Webcast beginning at 13:52.

Supervisor Mitchell requested clarification on comments about the Ports' potential withdrawal from negotiations and the Board's directive at the August 1, 2025 meeting regarding the release of the 75-day rule package on September 19. For additional details, please refer to the <u>Webcast</u> beginning at 15:44.

Executive Officer Nastri responded that if staff was not in substantial agreement, the 75-day rule package for Proposed Rule 2304 would need to be released. Executive Officer Nastri explained that if negotiations are close, that staff could bring a cooperative agreement and Proposed Rule 2304 to the Board for their consideration in December. For additional details, please refer to the <u>Webcast</u> beginning at 16:30.

Supervisor Mitchell expressed disappointment in the Ports' position and highlighted that the decision at the August meeting to delay action was made in good faith to allow for negotiations. She was hopeful that the Ports would recognize this and allow the process to proceed as the Board directed. For additional details, please refer to the Webcast beginning at 17:27.

Mayor Pro Tem McCallon asked if the release of the 75-day package is automatic or would be decided by the Mobile Source Committee. Chair Delgado responded that the only issue the Mobile Source Committee may decide is how to define "substantial" progress, to determine how close the parties are to an agreement. For additional details, please refer to the <u>Webcast</u> beginning at 18:40.

Supervisor Perez announced an upcoming Dust Summit scheduled for November 6, 2025 to be held at the University of California, Riverside that will feature a panel of experts discussing the environmental, health, and economic impacts from windblown dust in the Coachella Valley. For additional details, please refer to the <a href="Webcast">Webcast</a> beginning at 19:41.

In response to Supervisor Mitchell's inquiry about funding for the GO ZERO program, Executive Officer Nastri explained that the Board approved \$20 million for the pilot program and that there are more funds available from the Rule 1111 mitigation fees. Staff will be reporting to the Board as the GO ZERO pilot program progresses. For additional details, please refer to the <a href="Webcast">Webcast</a> beginning at 24:46.

# <u>PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD</u> – (Public Comment on Non-Agenda Items, Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3)

The Public Comment Period on Non-Agenda Items was opened. The following individuals addressed the Board. For additional details, please refer to the Webcast beginning at 26:26.

Heather Tomley, Port of Long Beach David Libatique, Port of Los Angeles

Key comments from the above speakers included:

- Expressed gratitude to the Board for allowing the cooperative agreement negotiation process;
- Reaffirmed their commitment to finalizing a cooperative agreement as an alternative to a regulatory rule;
- Commented on recent meetings held with South Coast AQMD staff on the cooperative agreement and highlighted the progress made on key issues; and
- Emphasized the need to set aside the rule, focus on the cooperative agreement, and continue negotiations in good faith.

Marven Norman, Center for Community Action and Environmental Justice (CCAEJ)

Shane Ysais, CCAEJ

Jennifer Cardenas, Sierra Club

Lindsey Escamilla, CCAEJ

Kathy Ramirez, MoveLA

Chris Chavez. Coalition for Clean Air

Fernando Gaytan, Earthjustice

Alison Hahm, Natural Resources Defense Council

Gracyna Mohabir, California Environmental Voters

Christian Tapia-Delgado, Pacific Environment and Long Beach resident

Fernando Marquez Duarte, People's Collective for Environmental Justice

Martin Dawoodijee Vargas, Long Beach healthcare worker

Key comments from the above speakers included:

- Expressed frustration with the ongoing delays surrounding PR 2304 and the negotiations for a cooperative agreement;
- Cautioned that ongoing negotiations on the cooperative agreement will be used to stall rulemaking efforts;
- Expressed concerns that the cooperative agreement proposes a 10-year ban on rulemaking;
- Called for a transparent public review of the cooperative agreement;
- Urged release of the 75-day rule package by the September 19, 2025 deadline set by the Board at the August 1, 2025 meeting;
- Emphasized the need to move forward with a Port ISR that sets enforceable emission reduction targets and ensures accountability;
- Stressed that public health must remain the top priority and warned that continued delays in implementing preventive measures will only increase the risk to vulnerable communities.

Ranji George, a member of the public, expressed concern with the current bias toward battery technologies and commented on the significant environmental harm during the production and disposal of electric batteries. He advocated for the inclusion of hydrogen and solar power energy, including solar thermal technologies, as viable alternatives.

Harvey Eder, Public Solar Power Coalition, announced his intent to pursue legal action, citing lack of transparency, procedural issues, and Brown Act violations.

Al Sattler, a member of the public, commented on the harmful effects of poor air pollution on humans, animals, and plants. He emphasized that port operators should not unilaterally set their own timelines and stressed the importance of establishing clear, enforceable deadlines to ensure accountability and timely action.

Thomas Jelenić, Pacific Merchant Shipping Association, thanked the Board for allowing the cooperative agreement process, noting that the cooperative agreement has the support of the maritime industry, Ports, and the Mayors of Long Beach and Los Angeles. He highlighted the advantages of the cooperative agreement over traditional rulemaking and expressed confidence that substantial agreement can be reached by the September 19, 2025 deadline.

Daryl Gale, Los Angeles resident, shared her personal experience living near rail corridors and the daily impact from exposure to freight and commuter trains. She described the impact of air pollution on daily life and noted that harmful air pollution affects not only communities near the ports but also all residents throughout the region.

There being no further requests to speak, the Public Comment Period on Non-Agenda Items was closed.

<u>Written Comments Regarding Proposed Ports Cooperative Agreement Update – August</u> 13, 2025

-Dr. Noel Hacegaba, Port of Long Beach

<u>Written Comments Regarding Proposed Ports Cooperative Agreement Update – August 21, 2025</u>

-Dr. Noel Hacegaba, Port of Long Beach

Written Comments Regarding South Coast AQMD Working Group Meeting to Discuss Proposed Amendment to 12 VOC Rules

-Rhett Cash and Annebelle Klein, American Coatings Association

<u>Written Comments Regarding Action Needed to Address Los Angeles' Air Pollution Crisis – Strengthening Rules 1146 and 1146.1</u>

-One letter signed by the following organizations: Angela Albay-Yenney, Inland Empire; Amani Allen-Beale, Girl Plus Environment; Lisa Bain, Global Communities; Belen Bernal, Nature for All; Christopher Chavez, Coalition for Clean Air; Teresa Cheng, Industrious Labs; Ayn Craciun, Climate Action Campaign; David Diaz, ActiveSGV; Andrew Ellis, Los Angeles Chapter, The Climate Reality Project; Alison Elsner, San Bernardino County Medical Society; Nicolas Gardner Serna, Sunrise Movement Los Angeles; Ana Gonzalez, Center for Community Action and Environmental Justice; Teto Huezo; Jobs to Move America; Ashley Jackson, California Environmental Voters; Michelle Kinman, Market Transformation, Los Angeles Cleantech Incubator; Jenna LeComte-Hinely, HARC, Inc.; Michelle Lewis, Sunrise Movement, Long Beach; Eli Lipmen, Move LA; Tiffany Lwin, Sunrise Orange County; Dr. Ashley McClure, Climate Health Now; Ashley Mercado, Day One; Patty Oh, Cool OC; Luis Olmedo, Comite Civico del Valle; Aydee Palomino, Alianza Coachella Valley; Richard Parks, Redeemer Community Partnership; Hector Pereyra, Inland Coalition for Immigrant Justice; Stephen Rosenblum, Climate Action California; Dr. Javier M. Sanchez, Inland Empire Climate Health Action Coalition; Ben Stapleton, U.S. Green Building Council California; Lisa Swanson, Climate Reality Project Orange Co Chapter; Taylor Thomas, East Yard Communities for Environmental Justice; Vanessa Rivas Villanueva, Earthjustice; Shante Walker, The Niles Foundation; Mandeera Wijetunga, Sierra Club; Dr. Stuart Wood, Sustainable Claremont; Lucas Zucker, Central Coast Alliance United for a Sustainable Economy (CAUSE); 5C Environmental Justice Club (Claremont Colleges)

# CONSENT AND BOARD CALENDAR

# Items 1 and 2 - Action Items/No Fiscal Impact

- 1. Approve Minutes of August 1, 2025 Board Meeting
- 2. Set Public Hearing October 3, 2025 to Consider Adoption of and/or Amendments to South Coast AQMD Rules and Regulations:

Determine That Proposed Amended Rule 301 - Permitting and Associated Fees, Is Exempt from CEQA; Amend Rule 301; and Recognize Revenue Into FY 2025-26 General Fund for Increase of Rule 1180 Fees That Were Not Included in FY 2025-26 Adopted Budget

## Items 3 through 12 - Budget/Fiscal Impact

- 3. Approve Funds for Commercial Lawn & Garden and EV Charging Incentive Programs, and Adopt Resolution Recognizing Funds for FY 2024-25 Carl Moyer State Reserve
- 4. Execute Agreement and Transfer Funds in Support of INVEST CLEAN Program Implementation
- Issue RFP and Execute Contracts for Workforce Development and Training for CARE4Kids and ELECTRIC Programs
- 6. Authorize Carl Moyer and VW Programs to Fund Truck Projects With Program Eligible Low NOx Engines
- 7. Approve Payments for Completed Contracts
- Amend Agreement With Phillips 66 Company for Continued Fenceline Air Monitoring at Phillips 66 Wilmington Refinery Using Optical Tent, Recognize Revenue, Appropriate Funds and Amend Contract
- 9. Adopt Resolution and Recognize Revenue for Continued AB 617 Implementation
- 10. Authorize Purchase of Microsoft Cloud Services
- 11. Approve Increases to Employer Contributions for Health Insurance Premiums for Represented Employees in Office Clerical & Maintenance and Technical & Enforcement Bargaining Units and for Non-Represented Employees, and Appropriate Funds from Undesignated (Unassigned) Fund Balance
- 12. Approve Contract Awards and Modification and Issue RFP as Approved by MSRC

# Items 13 through 20 - Information Only/Receive and File

- 13. Legislative, Public Affairs and Media Report
- 14. Hearing Board Report
- 15. Civil Filings and Civil Penalties Report
- 16. Intergovernmental Review of Environmental Documents and CEQA Lead Agency Projects
- 17. Rule and Control Measure Forecast
- 18. Status Report on Regulation XIII New Source Review
- 19. FY 2024-25 Contract Activity
- 20. Status Report on Major Ongoing and Upcoming Projects for Information Management

# <u>Items 21 through 26 – Reports for Committees, MSRC, and CARB</u>

California Air Resources Board – No meeting held in August.

- 21. Administrative Committee
- 22. Legislative Committee
- 23. Mobile Source Committee
- 24. Stationary Source Committee
- 25. Technology Committee
- 26. Mobile Source Air Pollution Reduction Review Committee
- 27. <u>Items Deferred from Consent and Board Calendar</u>
  There were no items deferred.

#### **Disclosures**

Mayor Pro Tem McCallon, Supervisor Hagman, and Councilmember Raman reported that they had no financial interest in Agenda Item No. 4 but are required to identify for the record that they are all Regional Council Members of SCAG, which is involved in this item.

Supervisor Mitchell reported that she had no financial interest in Agenda Item No. 12 but is required to identify for the record that she is a Board Member for Metro, which is involved in this item.

Supervisor Nguyen recused herself from Agenda Item No. 2 because of a financial interest in Kinder Morgan Inc., which is materially affected by this item, and from Agenda Item No. 8 because of a campaign contribution from Phillips 66 within the past 12 months.

# Agenda Item No. 8

Supervisor Nguyen asked whether the Phillips 66 Wilmington Refinery is in the process of closing and what will happen to the monitoring program during that period.

Executive Officer Nastri confirmed that the refinery is in the process of shutting down and clarified that the monitoring program will be extended for at least another year. For additional details, please refer to the <u>Webcast</u> beginning at 1:04:35.

# Agenda Item No. 11

Pursuant to the Brown Act, John Olvera, Deputy Executive Officer/Administrative & Human Resources, gave oral notice that Agenda Item No. 11 impacts executive management compensation. The item is seeking Board approval to increase the employer contributions towards health insurance premiums. The increase applies to executive management staff, non-represented employees, and the Teamsters bargaining units. For additional details, please refer to the <a href="Webcast">Webcast</a> beginning at 1:05:20.

The public comment period was opened for Agenda Item Nos. 1 through 26. The following individuals addressed the Board.

## Agenda Item No. 4

Ranji George congratulated staff on the significant award from U.S. EPA to implement the INVEST CLEAN Program; however, he expressed concerns that the potential for battery waste pollution and its impact on environmental justice communities is not being adequately addressed. For additional details, please refer to the <a href="Webcast">Webcast</a> beginning at 1:06:31.

Harvey Eder expressed support for Ranji George's concerns and commented on the Low-Income Solar Equity Program, as well as the lack of evaluation for the Solar New Deal. For additional details, please refer to the <u>Webcast</u> beginning at 1:09:36.

#### Agenda Item No. 2

Ramine Ross, Western States Petroleum Association (WSPA), expressed appreciation to staff for discussing WSPA's issues and updating the proposal. While WSPA continues to hold a differing perspective on whether certain costs should be included under Rule 1180, she emphasized the value of the productive meetings throughout the rulemaking process. For additional details, please refer to the <a href="Webcast">Webcast</a> beginning at 1:08:42.

There being no further requests to speak, the public comment period was closed for Agenda Item Nos. 1 through 26.

# Board Action (Items 1 – 26)

MOVED BY HAGMAN AND SECONDED BY MCCALLON TO APPROVE AGENDA ITEM NOS. 1 THROUGH 26 AS RECOMMENDED, INCLUDING TO RECEIVE AND FILE THE COMMITTEE, MSRC, AND CARB REPORTS;

ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. 25-13 RECOGNIZING FUNDS AND ACCEPTING THE TERMS AND CONDITIONS OF THE FY 2024-25 (YEAR 27) CARL MOYER PROGRAM STATE RESERVE GRANT AWARD; AND

ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. 25-14 RECOGNIZING GRANT FUNDS AND ACCEPTING THE TERMS AND CONDITIONS OF CARB'S FY 2024-25 COMMUNITY AIR PROTECTION PROGRAM GRANT AWARD G24-CAPP-28.

THE MOTION PASSED BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

AYES: Cacciotti, Delgado, Hagman, McCallon,

Mitchell, Nguyen (except Items 2 & 8), Olmos, Padilla-

Campos, Perez, Raman, and Rodriguez

NOES: None

RECUSE: Nguyen (Item Nos. 2 & 8)

ABSENT: Lock Dawson

Chair Delgado announced that Board Member Padilla-Campos was reappointed by Speaker of the Assembly Robert Rivas for another four-year term, January 16, 2026 to January 16, 2030.

# STAFF PRESENTATION/BOARD DISCUSSION/RECEIVE & FILE

28. Permitting Update on Implementation of Rule 1109.1 - Emissions of Oxides of Nitrogen from Petroleum Refineries and Related Operations (Presentation in Lieu of Board Letter – *No Action Required*)

Jason Aspell, Deputy Executive Officer/Engineering & Permitting, gave the staff presentation on Agenda Item No. 28. For additional details, please refer to the <u>Webcast</u> beginning at 1:11:36.

Chair Delgado expressed gratitude for the work accomplished by staff on the implementation of Rule 1109.1 permitting applications.

(Vice Mayor Olmos left the meeting at approximately ~11:10 a.m.)

#### **PUBLIC HEARINGS**

- 29. Determine That Proposed Amended Rule 223 Requirements for Confined Animal Facilities, Is Exempt from CEQA; Amend Rule 223; and Submit Rule 223 Into State Implementation Plan
- 30. Determine That Proposed Amended Rule 445 Wood-Burning Devices, Is Exempt from CEQA; Amend Rule 445; and Submit Rule 445 Into State Implementation Plan
- 31. Determine That Proposed Amended Rules 1133 Emission Reductions from Direct Land Application, 1133.1 Chipping and Grinding Operations, 1133.2 Emission Reductions from Co-Composting Operations, and 1133.3 Emission Reductions

from Composting Operations, Are Exempt from CEQA; Amend Rules 1133, 1133.1, 1133.2, and 1133.3; and Submit Rules 1133, 1133.1, 1133.2, and 1133.3 Into State Implementation Plan

32. Determine That Proposed Amended Rule 1138 – Control of Emissions From Restaurant Operations, Is Exempt From CEQA; Amend Rule 1138; and Submit Rule 1138 Into State Implementation Plan

Mike Krause, Assistant Deputy Executive Officer/Planning, Rule Development and Implementation, gave the staff presentation on Agenda Item Nos. 29-32. For additional details, please refer to the Webcast beginning at 1:11:36.

Supervisor Perez inquired about concerns and comments from the dairy industry regarding PAR 223. Mr. Krause responded that the Milk Producers Council participated in the rulemaking process and that they questioned the importance of reducing small amounts of ammonia emissions. Mr. Krause explained that ammonia is a key precursor to PM2.5 and clarified that the Clean Air Act does not have a de minimis level when it comes to fulfilling requirements to implement Most Stringent Measures (MSM). For additional details, please refer to the Webcast beginning at 1:38:32.

Supervisor Perez inquired about the basis for charging an annual fee for PAR 223. Barbara Baird, Chief Deputy Counsel, explained that permitted sources pay an initial permit fee and an annual fee which covers enforcement costs. For additional details, please refer to the <a href="Webcast">Webcast</a> beginning at 1:38:56.

Supervisor Hagman commented on concerns regarding the requirement to conduct active phase composting within an enclosure and its impact and unintended consequences on facilities because it disincentivizes investment in composting infrastructure. He also highlighted concerns about the requirement for an acceptable direct land application technique for uncomposted greenwaste and the need to integrate pragmatic solutions and new technologies efficiently, given that rule updates typically occur every 10 to 15 years. For additional details, please refer to the <a href="Webcast">Webcast</a> beginning at 1:42:40.

In response to Chair Delgado asking whether the amendments to the Rule 1133 Series had to be adopted today, Executive Officer Nastri responded that today's amendments are required to demonstrate MSM to U.S. EPA to avoid a sanction clock. Staff is committed to looking at issues and concerns presented by commenters in a future rulemaking. For additional details, please refer to the <u>Webcast</u> beginning at 1:44:35.

Mike Morris, Planning & Rules Manager/Planning, Rule Development, and Implementation, explained that the enclosure requirements are in the existing Rule 1133, and the California Air Pollution Control Officers Association (CAPCOA) is currently studying the baseline emission factors. Staff will evaluate how to proceed, once CAPCOA has completed their statewide review. For additional details, please refer to the <a href="Webcast">Webcast</a> beginning at 1:45:37.

Supervisor Hagman commented on the pressure to vote on PAR 223, PAR 445, PAR 1133 Series, and PAR 1138 today, especially when further work is needed. He acknowledged the urgency to submit the Most Stringent Measures package and the potential consequences if action is not taken today. He requested that staff revisit outstanding issues related to the Rule 1133 Series in the near future and ensure that they do not go unaddressed for decades. For additional details, please refer to the <a href="Webcast">Webcast</a> beginning at 1:46:10.

Executive Officer Nastri responded that staff would revisit the rule next year. For additional details, please refer to the Webcast beginning at 1:47:02.

Board Member Padilla-Compos asked if the composting regulation applied to small operations and if the wood burning regulation applied to artificial logs. Mr. Krause replied no to both questions.

Supervisor Nguyen thanked staff for following up on comments she made at the August 1, 2025 Board meeting and for looking into a separate rulemaking effort to address potential amendments to Rule 1302. For additional details, please refer to the Webcast beginning at 1:48:15.

Mayor Pro Tem Rodriguez inquired whether there would be changes to how arborists use fresh arbor mulch or if they will be able to continue using their best management practices. For additional details, please refer to the Webcast beginning at 1:48:51.

Executive Officer Nastri explained that the proposed amendments are intended to implement the Most Stringent Measures as required under the Clean Air Act for Serious Nonattainment areas seeking an extension of the attainment date. He acknowledged that the other issues need to be addressed and will be considered separately in a future rulemaking. For additional details, please refer to the <u>Webcast</u> beginning at 1:49:55.

Mayor Pro Tem Rodriguez commented on the environmental benefits of clean green waste operations and called for its distinction from traditional composting practices. He sought clarification on whether entities such as West Coast Arborists can continue their existing practices. For additional details, please refer to the <a href="Webcast">Webcast</a> beginning at 1:51:33.

Executive Officer Nastri acknowledged that this was the first time the issues presented by West Coast Arborist had been brought to staff's attention. He requested additional time for staff to review the issues presented. For additional details, please refer to the <a href="Webcast">Webcast</a> beginning at 1:53:23.

The public comment period was opened for Agenda Item Nos. 29-32 and the following individual addressed the Board.

Kurt Berchtold, a Riverside resident, highlighted a key point from his written comments, recommending that PAR 445 prohibit all outdoor wood-burning devices for meaningful air quality benefits. While acknowledging that this recommendation could not

be included in the current amendments since it was not identified as a Most Stringent Measure, he urged that it be considered in a future rulemaking. For additional details, please refer to the <u>Webcast</u> beginning at 1:54:37.

Arin Boughhan, Inland Empire Regional Composting Authority, expressed concern that the proposed amendments to PAR 1133.2 could undermine composting infrastructure needed to meet SB 1383 goals and that the requirement for all active composting to occur within an enclosure would leave the Inland Empire Regional Composting Authority as the only compliant facility, potentially discouraging future investments. He also warned that PAR 1133.2 uses outdated or incomplete science to impose prescriptive processing requirements that overlap with CalRecycle and U.S. EPA regulations and the negative impacts that will result from a reduction in composting capacity. For additional details, please refer to the Webcast beginning at 1:57:02.

David Rothbart, Clean Water SoCal, expressed concern that certain provisions in PAR 1133.2 discourage composting in the South Coast Air Basin and rely on information more than two decades old. He noted that the brief rulemaking process limited opportunities to address these outdated requirements. While acknowledging the urgency to amend the rule to avoid the sanctions clock, he requested that the Board direct staff to reopen the rule as soon as feasible to address these concerns. For additional details, please refer to the Webcast beginning at 1:58:55.

Andrew Trotter and Sean Edger, West Coast Arborist, expressed concern regarding the need to use fresh arbor mulch in landscapes to benefit trees and help with water conservation. The fresh arbor mulch is mostly woody waste and does not readily contribute to ammonia emissions. By allowing direct land application, there are no emissions from having to truck the materials away. They requested that fresh arbor mulch not be considered uncomposted greenwaste. For additional details, please refer to the Webcast beginning at 2:00:41 & 2:03:06

Vice Chair Cacciotti encouraged the West Coast Arborist representatives to participate in the Commercial Lawn and Garden Equipment Incentive & Exchange Program, noting the allocation of additional funding for the program in Agenda Item No. 3. He encouraged them to replace older, polluting equipment with electric alternatives. For additional details, please refer to the <u>Webcast</u> beginning at 2:06:29.

John Lucas, Farmer Boys and California Restaurant Association, highlighted economic and labor challenges facing the restaurant industry and commented on the importance of chain-driven char broilers for operational efficiency. He expressed concern that PAR 1133.2 will impose costly equipment modifications and ongoing costs and maintenance and compliance costs that would negatively impact the industry and local economy. For additional details, please refer to the <u>Webcast</u> beginning at 2:06:58.

Kevin Abernathy, Milk Producers Council, Kaitlyn Elkind, Ramboll and Milk Producers Council consultant

Key comments from the above speakers included:

- Ramboll scientific study found that ammonia emissions from dairies no longer have an impact on PM exceedances;
- PAR 223 amendments are unnecessary as smaller dairies already comply voluntarily with the Rule 223 VOC mitigation measures;
- Expressed concern that the financial burden of permits could force the remaining small population of dairies out of operation;
- Recommended informing other air districts and stakeholders to ensure consistent statewide assessment with current scientific studies;
- Requested an implementation timeline extension and alternative compliance pathway for small dairies bound by lease obligations; and
- Urged the Board to read the Ramboll study.

For additional details, please refer to the <u>Webcast</u> beginning at 2:10:40 and 2:13:35.

Al Sattler, a member of the public, expressed concern that requiring all active composting to occur within enclosures would leave only one compliant facility in the Inland Empire. He emphasized the need for more facilities of that kind. He commented on the challenges cities face to reuse organic material while minimizing air impacts and suggested the decreased use of eucalyptus trees for landscaping. For additional details, please refer to the <u>Webcast</u> beginning at 2:15:53.

Harvey Eder was cut off as his comments were not related to Agenda Item Nos. 29-32. For additional details, please refer to the Webcast beginning at 2:18:11.

Jackie Romero, California Restaurant Association, highlighted the financial pressures currently facing the restaurant industry and expressed concern about the economic and feasibility impacts of PAR 1138. She urged for a delay in the adoption of the proposed amended rule to allow for continued outreach with affected restaurants. For additional details, please refer to the <a href="Webcast">Webcast</a> beginning at 2:18:41.

Mike Darger, Carl's Jr. Restaurants, commented that PAR 1138 puts restaurants that are already on the financial edge at a greater disadvantage, noting the significant costs to retrofit older equipment. He urged the Board to consider the financial burden this places on both large and small businesses that rely on charbroilers. For additional details, please refer to the <u>Webcast</u> beginning at 2:19:57.

There being no further requests to speak, the public comment period was closed for Agenda Item Nos. 29-32.

Supervisor Hagman requested clarification on whether the South Coast AQMD is not relying on its own scientific assessments but is being directed by the U.S. EPA to follow a more restrictive regulatory path. For additional details, please refer to the <a href="Webcast">Webcast</a> beginning at 2:21:43.

Executive Officer Nastri responded that the request for an extension to meet the PM 2.5 NAAQS does require South Coast AQMD to incorporate the Most Stringent Measures, which are based on rules developed in other jurisdictions. Executive Officer Nastri committed to addressing the composting issues through later efforts where staff can have more accurate information regarding what is required of these facilities. For additional details, please refer to the <a href="Webcast">Webcast</a> beginning at 2:22:35.

Supervisor Hagman expressed frustration with the difficult position of having to take immediate action to avoid serious consequences, after hearing the concerns by some of the industries impacted by the proposed amended rules. He requested that staff engage with the affected industries following today's vote to address their concerns and explore practical solutions. For additional details, please refer to the <a href="Webcast">Webcast</a> beginning at 2:24:22.

Supervisor Perez commented on the importance of considering the broader impacts of the proposed amended rules on key sectors in the Coachella Valley and advocated for a policymaking approach that is balanced, culturally aware, and economically sensitive. He recognized the need to move forward with the vote today despite the challenges, and urged staff to work with impacted industries to develop fair and practical solutions. For additional details, please refer to the <u>Webcast</u> beginning at 2:26:15.

Supervisor Nguyen acknowledged the need to take immediate action on the proposed amended rules and thanked staff for their continued efforts to work with industry. She highlighted the importance of clarifying definitions in the PAR 1133 series and working with both large and small restaurants to address concerns regarding PAR 1138. She offered her assistance with outreach to Orange County restaurants to assist with language barriers, ensure they understand regulatory notices, and provide guidance on how to seek help. For additional details, please refer to the <u>Webcast</u> beginning at 2:30:53.

Mayor Pro Tem Rodriguez highlighted that the federal government opined and commented on Proposed Amended Rules 1111 and 1121, and possibly the Board should consider saying "no" to get the federal government's attention. Mayor Pro Tem Rodriguez underscored the importance of affordability and the rising cost of living. For additional details, please refer to the <u>Webcast</u> beginning at 2:32:25.

In response to Supervisor Mitchell's inquiry about where chain-driven charbroilers are used, Ian MacMillan, Assistant Deputy Executive Officer/Planning, Rule Development, and Implementation, explained that these units are typically found in brick-and-mortar restaurants and most are already equipped with compliant control devices. For additional details, please refer to the Webcast beginning at 2:36:59.

Mayor Pro Tem Rodriguez requested clarification about the 2-year alternative compliance pathway requested by the small dairies. Mr. Krause clarified that the Rule 223 proposal includes an alternative compliance pathway for dairies that can demonstrate by January 1, 2027 their intent to either cease operations or no longer meet the definition of a Large Confined Animal Facility by January 1, 2029. The alternative pathway would alleviate some dairy farms from filing a permit application. For additional details, please refer to the Webcast beginning at 2:38:36.

# **Board Action (Item 29)**

MOVED BY PEREZ AND SECONDED BY CACCIOTTI TO APPROVE AGENDA ITEM NO. 29 AS RECOMMENDED AND ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. 25-15

- 1) DETERMINING THAT PROPOSED AMENDED RULE 223 REQUIREMENTS FOR CONFINED ANIMAL FACILITIES, IS EXEMPT FROM THE REQUIREMENTS OF CEQA;
- 2) AMENDING RULE 223 REQUIREMENTS FOR CONFINED ANIMAL FACILITIES; AND
- 3) DIRECTING STAFF TO SUBMIT PROPOSED AMENDED RULE 223 FOR INCLUSION INTO THE STATE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN.

THE MOTION PASSED BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

AYES: Cacciotti, Delgado, Hagman, McCallon,

Mitchell, Nguyen, Padilla-Campos, Perez,

Raman, and Rodriguez

NOES: None

ABSENT: Lock Dawson and Olmos

# **Board Action (Item 30)**

MOVED BY PEREZ AND SECONDED BY CACCIOTTI TO APPROVE AGENDA ITEM NO. 30 AS RECOMMENDED AND ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. 25-16

- 1) DETERMINING THAT PROPOSED AMENDED RULE 445 WOOD-BURNING DEVICES, IS EXEMPT FROM THE REQUIREMENTS OF THE CEQA:
- 2) AMENDING RULE 445 WOOD-BURNING DEVICES; AND
- 3) DIRECTING STAFF TO SUBMIT PROPOSED AMENDED RULE 445 FOR INCLUSION INTO THE STATE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN.

THE MOTION PASSED BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

AYES: Cacciotti, Delgado, Hagman, McCallon,

Mitchell, Nguyen, Padilla-Campos, Perez,

Raman, and Rodriguez

NOES: None

ABSENT: Lock Dawson and Olmos

## **Board Action (Item 31)**

MOVED BY PEREZ AND SECONDED BY CACCIOTTI TO APPROVE AGENDA ITEM NO. 31 AS RECOMMENDED AND ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. 25-17

- 1) DETERMINING THAT PAR 1133 EMISSION REDUCTIONS FROM DIRECT LAND APPLICATION, PAR 1133.1 CHIPPING AND GRINDING OPERATIONS, PAR 1133.2 EMISSION REDUCTIONS FROM CO-COMPOSTING OPERATIONS, AND PAR 1133.3 EMISSION REDUCTIONS FROM COMPOSTING OPERATIONS, ARE EXEMPT FROM THE REQUIREMENTS OF THE CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY ACT;
- 2) AMENDING RULES 1133, 1133.1, 1133.2, AND 1133.3; AND
- 3) DIRECTING STAFF TO SUBMIT PROPOSED AMENDED RULES 1133, 1133.1, 1133.2, AND 1133.3 INTO THE STATE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN

THE MOTION PASSED BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

AYES: Cacciotti, Delgado, Hagman, McCallon,

Mitchell, Nguyen, Padilla-Campos, Perez,

Raman, and Rodriguez

NOES: None

ABSENT: Lock Dawson and Olmos

# **Board Action (Item 32)**

MOVED BY PEREZ AND SECONDED BY CACCIOTTI TO APPROVE AGENDA ITEM NO. 32 AS RECOMMENDED AND ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. 25-18

- 1) DETERMINING THAT PROPOSED AMENDED RULE 1138 CONTROL OF EMISSIONS FROM RESTAURANT OPERATIONS, IS EXEMPT FROM THE REQUIREMENTS OF THE CEQA:
- 2) AMENDING RULE 1138 CONTROL OF EMISSIONS FROM RESTAURANT OPERATIONS; AND
- 3) DIRECTING STAFF TO SUBMIT PROPOSED AMENDED RULE 1138 FOR INCLUSION INTO THE STATE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN.

THE MOTION PASSED BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

AYES: Cacciotti, Delgado, Hagman, McCallon,

Mitchell, Nguyen, Padilla-Campos, Perez,

and Raman

NOES: Rodriguez

ABSENT: Lock Dawson and Olmos

# **CLOSED SESSION**

The Board did not meet in closed session.

# <u>ADJOURNMENT</u>

There being no further business, Chair Delgado adjourned the meeting at 11:40 a.m.

The foregoing is a true statement of the proceedings held by the South Coast Air Quality Management District Board on September 5, 2025.

Respectfully Submitted,

Faye Thomas
Clerk of the Boards

Date Minutes Approved:	_
	_
Vanessa Delgado, Chair	

#### **ACRONYMS**

CARB = California Air Resources Board
CEQA = California Environmental Quality Act
FY = Fiscal Year
ISR = Indirect Source Rule
MOU = Memorandum of Understanding
MSRC = Mobile Source Air Pollution Reduction Review Committee
PAR = Proposed Amended Rule
PR = Proposed Rule