March 25, 2016

dwalsh@rctlma.org

Dan Walsh, Associate Engineering Geologist Riverside County Planning Department – Palm Desert 77588 El Duna Ct., Suite H Palm Desert, CA 92211

Initial Project Consultation for Surface Mining Permit No. 00194 Revision No. 1

The South Coast Air Quality Management District (SCAQMD) staff appreciates the opportunity to comment on the above-mentioned project. The SCAQMD staff's comments are recommendations regarding the analysis of potential air quality impacts from the proposed project that should be included in the CEQA document. Please forward a copy of the CEQA document directly to SCAQMD at the address in our letterhead. In addition, please send with the CEQA document all appendices or technical documents related to the air quality and greenhouse gas analyses and electronic versions of all air quality modeling and health risk assessment files. These include original emission calculation spreadsheets and modeling files (not Adobe PDF files). Without all files and supporting air quality documentation, the SCAQMD will be unable to complete its review of the air quality analysis in a timely manner. Any delays in providing all supporting air quality documentation will require additional time for review beyond the end of the comment period.

Air Quality Analysis

The SCAQMD adopted its California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Air Quality Handbook in 1993 to assist other public agencies with the preparation of air quality analyses. The SCAQMD recommends that the Lead Agency use this Handbook as guidance when preparing its air quality analysis. Copies of the Handbook are available from the SCAQMD's Subscription Services Department by calling (909) 396-3720. More recent guidance developed since this Handbook was published is also available on SCAQMD's website here: http://www.aqmd.gov/home/regulations/ceqa/air-quality-analysis-handbook/ceqa-air-quality-handbook-(1993). SCAQMD staff also recommends that the Lead Agency use the CalEEMod land use emissions software. This software has recently been updated to incorporate up-to-date state and locally approved emission factors and methodologies for estimating pollutant emissions from typical land use development. CalEEMod is the only software model maintained by the California Air Pollution Control Officers Association (CAPCOA) and replaces the now outdated URBEMIS. This model is available free of charge at: www.caleemod.com.

The Lead Agency should identify any potential adverse air quality impacts that could occur from all phases of the project and all air pollutant sources related to the project. Air quality impacts from both construction (including demolition, if any) and operations should be calculated. Construction-related air quality impacts typically include, but are not limited to, emissions from the use of heavy-duty equipment from grading, earth-loading/unloading, paving, architectural coatings, off-road mobile sources (e.g., heavy-duty construction equipment) and on-road mobile sources (e.g., construction worker vehicle trips, material transport trips). Operation-related air quality impacts may include, but are not limited to, emissions from stationary sources (e.g., boilers), area sources (e.g., solvents and coatings), and vehicular trips (e.g., on- and off-road tailpipe emissions and entrained dust). Air quality impacts from indirect sources, that is, sources that generate or attract vehicular trips should be included in the analysis.

The SCAQMD has also developed both regional and localized significance thresholds. The SCAQMD staff requests that the Lead Agency quantify criteria pollutant emissions and compare the results to the recommended regional significance thresholds found here: http://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/ceqa/handbook/scaqmd-air-quality-significance-thresholds.pdf. In addition to analyzing regional air quality impacts, the SCAQMD staff recommends calculating localized air quality impacts and comparing the results to localized significance thresholds (LSTs). LST's can be used in addition to the recommended regional significance thresholds as a second indication of air quality impacts when preparing a CEQA document. Therefore, when preparing the air quality analysis for the proposed project, it is recommended that the Lead Agency perform a localized analysis by either using the LSTs developed by the SCAQMD or performing

dispersion modeling as necessary. Guidance for performing a localized air quality analysis can be found at: http://www.aqmd.gov/home/regulations/ceqa/air-quality-analysis-handbook/localized-significance-thresholds.

Project Specific Comments

The lead agency should include project specific details, emission estimates, and references to compliance with applicable SCAQMD rules and regulations for aggregate production including SCAQMD Rule 1157 – PM10 Emission Reductions from Aggregate and Related Operations, Rule 203 – Permit to Operate, Rule 403 – Fugitive Dust and Rule 403.1 – Supplemental Fugitive Dust Control Requirements for Coachella Valley Sources. Permit questions concerning aggregate production can be directed to SCAQMD Engineering and Compliance staff at (909) 396-2504. Furthermore, SCAQMD should be listed as a CEQA responsible agency and the assumptions in the draft CEQA Document will be the basis for permit conditions and limits.

In the event that the proposed project generates or attracts vehicular trips, especially heavy-duty diesel-fueled vehicles, it is recommended that the Lead Agency perform a mobile source health risk assessment. Guidance for performing a mobile source health risk assessment ("Health Risk Assessment Guidance for Analyzing Cancer Risk from Mobile Source Diesel Idling Emissions for CEQA Air Quality Analysis") can be found at: http://www.aqmd.gov/home/regulations/ceqa/air-quality-analysis-handbook/mobile-source-toxics-analysis. An analysis of all toxic air contaminant impacts due to the use of equipment potentially generating such air pollutants should also be included.

In addition, guidance on siting incompatible land uses (such as placing homes near freeways) can be found in the California Air Resources Board's *Air Quality and Land Use Handbook: A Community Perspective*, which can be found at the following internet address: http://www.arb.ca.gov/ch/handbook.pdf. CARB's Land Use Handbook is a general reference guide for evaluating and reducing air pollution impacts associated with new projects that go through the land use decision-making process.

Mitigation Measures

In the event that the project generates significant adverse air quality impacts, CEQA requires that all feasible mitigation measures that go beyond what is required by law be utilized during project construction and operation to minimize or eliminate these impacts. Pursuant to CEQA Guidelines §15126.4 (a)(1)(D), any impacts resulting from mitigation measures must also be discussed. Several resources are available to assist the Lead Agency with identifying possible mitigation measures for the project, including:

- Chapter 11 of the SCAQMD CEQA Air Quality Handbook
- SCAQMD's CEQA web pages at: http://www.aqmd.gov/home/regulations/ceqa/air-quality-analysis-handbook/mitigation-measures-and-control-efficiencies.
- CAPCOA's Quantifying Greenhouse Gas Mitigation Measures available here: http://www.capcoa.org/wp-content/uploads/2010/11/CAPCOA-Quantification-Report-9-14-Final.pdf.

The SCAQMD staff is available to work with the Lead Agency to ensure that project emissions are accurately evaluated and mitigated where feasible. If you have any questions regarding this letter, please contact Jack Cheng at jcheng@aqmd.gov or at (909) 396-2448.

Sincerely,

Jillian Wong, Ph.D. Program Supervisor

Jillian Wong

Planning, Rule Development & Area Sources

RVC160311-04 Control Number