#### SENT VIA E-MAIL:

May 23, 2025

AzusaGreensComment@azusaca.gov Knarik Vizcarra, Planning Manager Community Development Department City of Azusa, 213 East Foothill Boulevard, Azusa, California 91702

# <u>Draft Environmental Impact Report (DEIR) for the</u> <u>Azusa Greens Redevelopment Project (Proposed Project)</u> <u>(SCH No: 2023120720)</u>

South Coast Air Quality Management District (South Coast AQMD) staff appreciate the opportunity to review the above-mentioned document. The City of Azusa is the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Lead Agency for the Proposed Project. To provide context, South Coast AQMD staff have provided a brief summary of the project information and prepared the following comments which are organized by topic of concern.

## Summary of Proposed Project Information in the DEIR

Based on the DEIR, the Proposed Project consists of The project consists of an industrial site, a residential site, and a golf course site, each with demolition, construction, and renovation activities. The three project sites are totaling 92.12-acre. Based on a review of aerial photographs, South Coast AQMD staff found that the nearest sensitive receptor (e.g., residential development) is located 30 feet southeast of the industrial site. Construction of the Proposed Project is anticipated to occur in November 2025 and conclude in September 2027, with some phases of construction expected to occur concurrently. The Proposed Project is located on the 919 Sierra Madre Avenue, Azusa.

#### South Coast AQMD Comments

Use of South Coast AQMD's Mass Rate Localized Significance Threshold (LST) Look-Up Table to Analyze the Proposed Project's Localized Air Quality Impact is not Consistent with Guidance for the LST Methodology

The localized significance threshold (LST) analysis in the Draft EIR appears to incorrectly rely on the LST screening tables to determine the significance of localized air quality impacts. As indicated in Table 3-2 of the LST methodology,<sup>5</sup> these screening tables are not applicable for

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Appendix B - Air Quality and Greenhouse Gas Emissions Technical Report, Page 14.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> *Ibid.* Page 39.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> *Ibid.* Page 20.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> *Ibid*. Page 14.

<sup>5</sup> South Coast AQMD Final Localized Significance Threshold Methodology available at: <a href="https://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/ceqa/handbook/localized-significance-thresholds/final-lst-methodology-document.pdf">https://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/ceqa/handbook/localized-significance-thresholds/final-lst-methodology-document.pdf</a>

projects larger than five acres. Since the Proposed Project site size is 92.12 acres and is located in close proximity to sensitive receptors, including residential uses as noted earlier in this letter, reliance on the LST screening tables may underestimate localized air quality impacts. Therefore, it is recommended that the Lead Agency conduct project-specific dispersion modeling to accurately assess the localized air quality impacts from both construction and operational phases of the Proposed Project and include the results in the Final EIR.

Air Quality Mitigation Measures for NOx and PM Emissions from Construction

Given the long-range plan of the Proposed Project from year 2025-2027, Tier 4 technology may not be the cleanest technology when construction occurs. According to the CARB Strategies for Reducing Emissions from Off-Road Construction Equipment, the implementation of off-road Tier 5 starting in 2027 or 2028 and the Governor's Executive Order in September 2020 requires CARB to develop and propose a full transition to Zero Emissions (ZE) by 2035. 6 Considering the scope of the project, it is crucial to ensure that the levels of construction emissions, specifically NOx and PM<sub>10</sub>, remain below significant thresholds during the construction period. Moving towards achieving this goal, where feasible, involves opting for electric emission-free engines instead of diesel-fueled engines for the construction equipment. This proactive choice not only aligns with environmental concerns but also demonstrates a commitment to minimizing the project's environmental footprints. The abatement of NOx can also be pursued by enforcing greener constructions, such as, limiting the usage of older engines in favor of adopting the latest available technologies, or even incorporating exhaust retrofits such as cutting-edge exhaust aftertreatment techniques. Additionally, several other resources to assist the Lead Agency with identifying additional potential mitigation measures for the Proposed Project are included in the South Coast AQMD's CEQA Air Quality Handbook<sup>7</sup> for both operational and construction emissions.

Incompatible land use issue based on CARB and South Coast AQMD's guidance: sitting warehouses (proposed high-cube warehouse in four buildings) within close proximity to existing and new sensitive land uses (residential areas).

South Coast AQMD is concerned about the potential health impacts of siting warehouses (proposed six high-cube warehouse buildings) in close proximity to existing and new sensitive land uses (proposed high-density residential areas), since the operation of warehouses generates and attracts heavy-duty diesel-fueled trucks that emit Diesel Particulate Matter (DPM). Based on a review of aerial photographs, South Coast AQMD staff found that the nearest sensitive receptor, approximately 30 feet southeast of the Proposed Project site. Also, according to the Draft EIR, Land Use Plan, the truck routes and loading docks/truck idling/Transport Refrigeration Units (TRUs) will be located very close to existing residential areas. When the health impacts from the Proposed Project are added to the existing background, both existing and new residents living in the surrounding communities will likely face even greater exposure to air pollution and bear a disproportionate burden of increasing health risks. Consequently, the Lead Agency is recommended to follow CARB and South Coast AQMD land-use guidance to ensure

https://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/clean-air-plans/air-quality-management-plans/2022-air-quality-management-plan/combined-construction-carb-amp-aqmp-presentations-01-27-21.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Presentation can be found at:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> https://www.aqmd.gov/home/rules-compliance/ceqa/air-quality-analysis-handbook

that sensitive receptors are not heavily affected by the warehouse truck activities and freeway emissions. This guidance includes:

- 1) The California Air Resources Board's (CARB) *Air Quality and Land Use Handbook: A Community Health Perspective* <sup>8</sup> is a general reference guide for evaluating and reducing air pollution impacts associated with new projects that go through the land use decision-making process with additional guidance on strategies to reduce air pollution exposure near high-volume roadways available in CARB's technical advisory. <sup>9</sup>
- 2) The South Coast AQMD's *Guidance Document for Addressing Air Quality Issues in General Plans and Local Planning*<sup>10</sup> includes suggested policies that local governments can use in their General Plans or through local planning to prevent or reduce potential air pollution impacts and protect public health. It is recommended that the Lead Agency review this Guidance Document as a tool when making local planning and land use decisions.

By adhering to these essential guidance documents and implementing proactive Mitigation Measures (MMs), the lead agency can avoid, eliminate or reduce the adverse impacts of warehouse and truck activities on public health, ensuring that vulnerable communities are adequately protected from disproportionate exposure to air pollution.

# Overlapping Construction and Operational Activities

Even though the Proposed Project consists of approximately a total of 92.12 acres of land over the course of 2-year construction, the Draft EIR does not analyze the scenario of overlapping between the construction and operational activities. Therefore, South Coast AQMD staff recommends that the Lead Agency revise the air quality analysis section to consider the overlapping construction and operation. The estimated overlapped emissions should then be compared to South Coast AQMD's regional air quality CEQA operational thresholds to determine their level of significance, which should be included in the Final EIR. If the overlapped emissions analysis is not included in the Final EIR, the Lead Agency should provide reasons for not having them supported by substantial evidence in the record.

#### Emission Reductions from Health Risk Strategies

South Coast AQMD is concerned about the potential public health impacts of siting existing and new sensitive populations within the proximity of existing air pollution sources (e.g., freeway, railroad). For this reason, prior to approving this Proposed Project as well as any future development projects, the Lead Agency is recommended to consider the impacts of air pollutants on people who will live in the new project area and provide effective mitigation. Additionally, South Coast AQMD suggests that the Lead Agency review and apply the guidance provided in:

1) the California Air Resources Board (CARB) Air Quality Land Use and Handbook: A

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> CARB's *Air Quality and Land Use Handbook: A Community Health Perspective* can be found at: <a href="http://www.arb.ca.gov/ch/handbook.pdf">http://www.arb.ca.gov/ch/handbook.pdf</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> CARB's technical advisory can be found at: <a href="https://www.arb.ca.gov/ch/landuse.htm">https://www.arb.ca.gov/ch/landuse.htm</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> South Coast AQMD. 2005. *Guidance Document for Addressing Air Quality Issues in General Plans and Local Planning*. Available at: <a href="http://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/planning/air-quality-guidance/complete-guidance-document.pdf">http://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/planning/air-quality-guidance/complete-guidance-document.pdf</a>.

Community Health Perspective <sup>11</sup> which provides criteria for evaluating and reducing air pollution impacts associated with new projects involving land use decisions; and 2) CARB's technical advisory which contains strategies to reduce air pollution exposure near high-volume roadways. <sup>12</sup>

Many strategies are available for residential receptors to reduce being exposed to particulate matter, including, but not limited to, HVAC systems equipped with filters rated at a minimum efficiency reporting value (MERV) 13 or higher air filtration capabilities. In some cases, MERV 15 or better is recommended, for building design, orientation, location, vegetation barriers, landscaping screening, etc. Enhanced filtration units are capable of reducing exposure. However, enhanced filtration systems have limitations. For example, filters rated MERV 13 or higher are able to screen out greater than or equal to 50% of DPM<sup>13</sup> but they have no ability to filter out volatile organic compound (VOC) emissions. Also, in a study that South Coast AOMD conducted to investigate filters rated at MERV 13 or better in classrooms, 1415 a cost burden is expected to be within the range of \$120 to \$240 per year to replace each filter panel. The initial start-up cost could substantially increase if an HVAC system needs to be installed and if standalone filter units are required. Installation costs may vary, including costs for conducting site assessments and obtaining permits and approvals before filters can be installed. Other costs may include filter life monitoring, annual maintenance, and training for conducting maintenance and reporting. In addition, the filters would not have any effect unless the HVAC system is running. Therefore, when in use, the increased energy consumption from each HVAC system should be evaluated in the Draft EIR. While the filters operate 100 percent of the time when the HVAC is in use while the residents are indoors, the environmental analysis does not generally account for the times when the residents are not using their HVAC and instead have their windows or doors open or are moving throughout the common space outdoor areas of the Proposed Project. Furthermore, when used filters are replaced with new filters, emissions associated with trucks delivering the new filters and waste disposal trucks transporting the used filters to disposal sites should be evaluated in the Draft EIR. Therefore, any presumed effectiveness and feasibility of a particular HVAC filter should be carefully evaluated in more detail based on supporting evidence before assuming they will sufficiently alleviate exposure to DPM emissions.

Additional Recommended Air Quality and Greenhouse Gases Mitigation Measures and Project Design Considerations

CEQA requires that all feasible mitigation measures that go beyond what is required by law be utilized to minimize or eliminate any significant adverse air quality impacts. To further reduce

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> California Air Resources Board (CARB), Air Quality Land Use and Handbook: A Community Health Perspective, April 2005. Available at: <a href="https://www2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2023-05/Land%20Use%20Handbook">https://www2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2023-05/Land%20Use%20Handbook</a> 0.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> CARB's Strategies to Reduce Air Pollution Exposure Near High-Volume Roadways. Available at: https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2017-10/rd\_technical\_advisory\_final.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> U.S. EPA, "What is a MERV rating?" Available at: <a href="https://www.https://www.epa.gov/indoor-air-quality-iaq/what-merv-rating">https://www.https://www.https://www.epa.gov/indoor-air-quality-iaq/what-merv-rating</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> South Coast AQMD, Draft Pilot Study of High-Performance Air Filtration For Classroom Applications, October 2009. Available at: <a href="https://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/ceqa/handbook/aqmdpilotstudyfinalreport.pdf">https://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/ceqa/handbook/aqmdpilotstudyfinalreport.pdf</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> South Coast AQMD, Draft Pilot Study of High-Performance Air Filtration For Classroom Applications, October 2009. Available at: <a href="https://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/ceqa/handbook/aqmdpilotstudyfinalreport.pdf">https://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/ceqa/handbook/aqmdpilotstudyfinalreport.pdf</a>.

the Proposed Project's air quality impacts, South Coast AQMD recommends incorporating the following mitigation measures and project design considerations into the Final EIR<sup>16</sup>.

# Mitigation Measures for Operational Air Quality Impacts

## Mobile Sources

1. Require zero-emission (ZE) or near-zero emission (NZE) on-road haul trucks, such as heavy-duty trucks with natural gas engines that meet the CARB's adopted optional NOx emissions standard at 0.02 grams per brake horsepower-hour (g/bhp-hr), if and when feasible.

Note: Given the state's clean truck rules and regulations aiming to accelerate the utilization and market penetration of ZE and NZE trucks, such as the Advanced Clean Trucks Rule and the Heavy-duty Low NOx Omnibus Regulation, ZE and NZE trucks will become increasingly more available to use.

2. Require a phase-in schedule to incentivize the use of cleaner operating trucks to reduce any significant adverse air quality impacts.

Note: South Coast AQMD staff is available to discuss the availability of current and upcoming truck technologies and incentive programs with the Lead Agency.

- 3. Limit the daily number of trucks allowed at the Proposed Project to levels analyzed in the Final EIR. If higher daily truck volumes are anticipated to visit the site, the Lead Agency should commit to re-evaluating the Proposed Project through CEQA prior to allowing this higher activity level.
- 4. Provide electric vehicle (EV) charging stations or, at a minimum, provide electrical infrastructure, and electrical panels should be appropriately sized. Electrical hookups should be provided for truckers to plug in any onboard auxiliary equipment.

### Other Area Sources

- 1. Maximize the use of solar energy by installing solar energy arrays.
- 2. Use light-colored paving and roofing materials.
- 3. Utilize only Energy Star heating, cooling, and lighting devices and appliances.

## Design Considerations for Reducing Air Quality and Health Risk Impacts

1. Clearly mark truck routes with trailblazer signs so that trucks will not travel next to or near sensitive land uses (e.g., residences, schools, daycare centers, etc.).

- 2. Design the Proposed Project such that truck entrances and exits are not facing sensitive receptors and trucks will not travel past sensitive land uses to enter or leave the Proposed Project site.
- 3. Design the Proposed Project such that any truck check-in point is inside the Proposed Project site to ensure no trucks are queuing outside.
- 4. Design the Proposed Project to ensure that truck traffic inside the Proposed Project site is as far away as feasible from sensitive receptors.
- 5. Restrict overnight truck parking in sensitive land uses by providing overnight truck parking inside the Proposed Project site.

Lastly, the South Coast AQMD also suggests that the Lead Agency conduct a review of the following references and incorporate additional mitigation measures as applicable to the Proposed Project in the Final EIR:

- State of California Department of Justice: Warehouse Projects: Best Practices and Mitigation Measures to Comply with the California Environmental Quality Act<sup>17</sup>
- 2. South Coast AQMD 2022 Air Quality Management Plan, <sup>18</sup> specifically:
- a) Appendix IV-A South Coast AQMD's Stationary and Mobile Source Control Measures
- b) Appendix IV-B CARB's Strategy for South Coast
- c) Appendix IV-C SCAG's Regional Transportation Strategy and Control Measure
- 3. United States Environmental Protection Agency (U.S. EPA): Mobile Source Pollution Environmental Justice and Transportation.<sup>19</sup>

South Coast AQMD Air Permits and Role as a Responsible Agency

If implementation of the Proposed Project would require the use of new stationary and portable sources, including but not limited to emergency generators, fire water pumps, boilers, etc., air permits from South Coast AQMD will be required. The final CEQA document, whether a ND, or EIR, should include a discussion about the potentially applicable rules that the Proposed Project needs to comply with. Those rules may include, for example, Rule 201 – Permit to Construct,<sup>20</sup> Rule 203 – Permit to Operate,<sup>21</sup> Rule 401 – Visible Emissions,<sup>22</sup> Rule 402 – Nuisance,<sup>23</sup> Rule

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> State of California – Department of Justice, Warehouse Projects: Best Practices and Mitigation Measures to Comply with the California Environmental Quality Act. Available at: <a href="https://oag.ca.gov/system/files/media/warehouse-best-practices.pdf">https://oag.ca.gov/system/files/media/warehouse-best-practices.pdf</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> South Coast AQMD, 2022 Air Quality Management Plan (AQMP). Available at: <a href="http://www.aqmd.gov/home/air-quality/clean-air-plans/air-quality-mgt-plan">http://www.aqmd.gov/home/air-quality/clean-air-plans/air-quality-mgt-plan</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> United States Environmental Protection Agency (U.S. EPA), Mobile Source Pollution - Environmental Justice and Transportation. Available at: <a href="https://www.epa.gov/mobile-source-pollution/environmental-justice-and-transportation">https://www.epa.gov/mobile-source-pollution/environmental-justice-and-transportation</a>
<sup>20</sup> South Coast AQMD. Rule 201 available at: <a href="https://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/rule-book/reg-ii/rule-201.pdf">https://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/rule-book/reg-ii/rule-201.pdf</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> South Coast AQMD. Rule 203 available at: https://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/rule-book/reg-ii/rule-203.pdf

403 – Fugitive Dust,<sup>24</sup> Rule 1110.2 – Emissions from Gaseous and Liquid Fueled Engines,<sup>25</sup> Rule 1113 – Architectural Coating,<sup>26</sup> Rule 1166 – Volatile Organic Compound Emissions from Decontamination of Soil, <sup>27</sup> Rule 1179 – Publicly Owned Treatment Works Operations, <sup>28</sup> Regulation XIII – New Source Review,<sup>29</sup> Rule 1401 – New Source Review of Toxic Air Contaminants, <sup>30</sup> Rule 1466 – Control of Particulate Emissions from Soils with Toxic Air Contaminants, <sup>31</sup> Rule 1470 – Requirements for Stationary Diesel-Fueled Internal Combustion and Other Compression Ignition Engines,<sup>32</sup> etc. It is important to note that when air permits from South Coast AQMD are required, the role of South Coast AQMD would change from a Commenting Agency to a Responsible Agency under CEQA. In addition, if South Coast AQMD is identified as a Responsible Agency, per CEQA Guidelines Sections 15086, the Lead Agency is required to consult with South Coast AQMD.

CEQA Guidelines Section 15096 sets forth specific procedures for a Responsible Agency, including making a decision on the adequacy of the CEQA document for use as part of the process for conducting a review of the Proposed Project and issuing discretionary approvals. Moreover, it is important to note that if a Responsible Agency determines that a CEQA document is not adequate to rely upon for its discretionary approvals, the Responsible Agency must take further actions listed in CEQA Guideline Section 15096(e), which could have the effect of delaying the implementation of the Proposed Project. In its role as CEQA Responsible Agency, the South Coast AQMD is obligated to ensure that the CEQA document prepared for this Proposed Project contains a sufficient project description and analysis to be relied upon in order to issue any discretionary approvals that may be needed for air permits. South Coast AQMD is concerned that the project description and analysis in its current form in the ND is inadequate to be relied upon for this purpose.

For these reasons, the final CEQA document should be revised to include a discussion about any and all new stationary and portable equipment requiring South Coast AQMD air permits, provide the evaluation of their air quality and greenhouse gas impacts, and identify South Coast AQMD as a Responsible Agency for the Proposed Project as this information will be relied upon as the basis for the permit conditions and emission limits for the air permit(s). Please contact South Coast AQMD's Engineering and Permitting staff at (909) 396-3385 for questions regarding what types of equipment would require air permits. For more general information on permits, please visit South Coast AQMD's webpage at <a href="https://www.aqmd.gov/home/permits">https://www.aqmd.gov/home/permits</a>.

 $<sup>^{22} \</sup> South \ Coast \ AQMD. \ Rule \ 401 \ available \ at: \ \underline{https://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/rule-book/rule-iv/rule-401.pdf}$ 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> South Coast AQMD. Rule 402 available at: https://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/rule-book/rule-iv/rule-402.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> South Coast AQMD. Rule 403 available at: <a href="https://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/rule-book/rule-iv/rule-403">https://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/rule-book/rule-iv/rule-403</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> South Coast AQMD. Rule 1110.2 available at: https://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/rule-book/reg-xi/r1110\_2.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> South Coast AQMD. Rule 1113 available at <a href="https://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/rule-book/reg-xi/r1113.pdf">https://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/rule-book/reg-xi/r1113.pdf</a>

<sup>27</sup> South Coast AQMD. Rule 1166 available at: https://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/rule-book/reg-xi/rule-1166.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> South Coast AQMD. Rule 1179 available at: <a href="https://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/rule-book/reg-xi/rule-1179.pdf">https://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/rule-book/reg-xi/rule-1179.pdf</a>

<sup>29</sup> South Coast AQMD. Regulation XIII available at: <a href="https://www.aqmd.gov/home/rules-compliance/rules/scaqmd-rule-book/regulation-xiii">https://www.aqmd.gov/home/rules-compliance/rules/scaqmd-rule-book/regulation-xiii</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> South Coast AQMD. Rule 1401 available at: https://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/rule-book/reg-xiv/rule-1401.pdf

<sup>31</sup> South Coast AQMD. Rule 1466 available at: <a href="https://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/rule-book/reg-xiv/rule-1466.pdf">https://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/rule-book/reg-xiv/rule-1466.pdf</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> South Coast AQMD. Rule 1470 available at: https://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/rule-book/reg-xiv/rule-1470.pdf

#### Conclusion

As set forth in California Public Resources Code Section 21092.5(a) and CEQA Guidelines Section 15088(a-b), the Lead Agency shall evaluate comments from public agencies on the environmental issues and prepare a written response at least 10 days prior to certifying the Final EIR. As such, please provide South Coast AQMD written responses to all comments contained herein at least 10 days prior to the certification of the Final EIR. In addition, as provided by CEQA Guidelines Section 15088(c), if the Lead Agency's position is at variance with recommendations provided in this comment letter, detailed reasons supported by substantial evidence in the record to explain why specific comments and suggestions are not accepted must be provided.

Thank you for the opportunity to provide comments. South Coast AQMD staff are available to work with the Lead Agency to address any air quality questions that may arise from this comment letter. Please contact Sahar Ghadimi, Air Quality Specialist, at sghadimi@aqmd.gov should you have any questions.

Sam Wang

Sam Wang

Program Supervisor, CEQA IGR

Planning, Rule Development & Implementation

SW:SG LAC250415-07 Control Number