



Minutes for the AQMP Advisory Group Meeting Wednesday, February 14, 2007

1. Welcome and Introduction

Dr. Laki Tisopolos, Assistant Deputy Executive Officer, Planning, Rule Development and Area Sources, called the meeting to order at 9 a.m. and presented a brief overview of the agenda for the meeting. There were no comments on the January 2007 minutes.

2. AQMP Status and Update

Mr. Joe Cassmassi, Planning & Rules Manager, gave a summary on the development process of the AQMP. Staff focused in finalizing modeling analysis, control strategies, attainment demonstration, responding to comments received, preparing CEQA, and Socio-Economic Analysis. CARB recommended a bifurcation of ozone and PM_{2.5} plans. The District proposed an integrated PM_{2.5} and 8-hour ozone plan since the District could demonstrate attainment with PM_{2.5} by 2015 utilizing a combination of CARB's control measures and several complimentary measures developed by District staff. In addition, the District could demonstrate compliance with 8-hour ozone standards by 2023 with the use of a black box of 20 tons per day VOC and 160 tons per day NO_x. A "bump-up" request to "extreme" classification was inevitable. Based on a court decision, the District was required to demonstrate compliance with 120 ppb ozone in 2010 and reestablish conformity budgets. Staff was in the process of modifying Appendices III (Emissions Inventory), IVA (Stationary Source Control Strategy), IVB-1 (CARB's Mobile Source Control Strategy), IVB-2 (Mobile Source Control Strategy Developed by District Staff), IVC (Transportation Control Measures), adding Appendix VI (Reasonably Available Control Measures Demonstration), and evaluating several CEQA scenarios for PM_{2.5} as well as 8-hour ozone. Staff planned for a Governing Board public hearing on May 4th. The audience asked the following questions:

Q: What is the status of the conflict resolution between CARB and the District? (Greg Adams and Carla Walecka)

A: CARB and the District are in agreement that a bump-up request for 8-hour ozone classification is inevitable since the basin cannot meet the ozone standards by 2021, however we have not yet reached agreement on the size of the black box and the feasible attainment date for PM_{2.5}.

Q: We are concerned on when and how fast the District can take action and implement the plan. (Ty Schuiling)

A: CARB and the District are strongly committed to implement the control measures as soon as practicable, however we must rely on innovative technologies to reduce the size of the black box.

Q: What is the District required to do for the 1-hour ozone standards? Why does the District not agree with CARB to bifurcate the ozone and PM_{2.5} plans? (Dianna? City of Los Angeles)

A: We are still in discussion with the U.S. EPA on what needs to be done. In general, the conformity budgets under the 1-hour plan must be retained. The District must implement the control measures of the 1-hour ozone plan, demonstrate that all short-term and mid-term goals can be achieved without relying on black box technologies, and that we can meet all milestones proposed. The basin must show attainment with PM_{2.5} standards by 2015, and the District is very concerned about the implementation time that would be lost if we chose bifurcation. The District believes that action must be taken immediately.

Q: What do the mobile source control measures proposed by the District contain? Can the District submit PM_{2.5} plan ahead of schedule and would that action open the District to lawsuit? (Lee Wallace)

A: The District developed several mobile source control measures, shown in Appendix IV B-2, focused in accelerating vehicle turnover and use of available technologies. There was no penalty in submitting the plan early and the District will minimize the lawsuits by showing its dedicated commitment to clean air.

Q: What would happen if CARB disagreed with the District's approach in focusing in NO_x instead of VOC reduction and is socioeconomic analysis available for a 30-day review? (Bill Lamar)

A: The District chooses to focus in NO_x reduction since NO_x reduction technologies are readily available at reasonable costs compared to VOC reduction technologies. A fully-developed socioeconomic analysis is required during rule development, however it is not required to be released for a 30-day public review during the development of an AQMP. However the District will provide information on costs and cost effectiveness, if available, and the ranking for control measures based on cost information. The District is in an on-going discussion with CARB and plan to submit the 2007 AQMP to CARB for its review in May.

There were suggestions that staff should discuss the modeling results with neighboring air districts such as Mohave Desert and San Joaquin, act promptly on control measures related to locomotives and ports; and lobby more actively to broaden its responsibility.

3. AQMP Mobile Source Measures

Sylvia Oey, Southern California Liaison Section Manager of CARB, provided a summary on CARB's mobile source control measures. She indicated that CARB would release a final draft by end of February and plan to bring the plan to its Board in early May. A bump-up request is inevitable for both South Coast and San Joaquin. CARB's plan focuses in further cleaning diesel vehicle fleets and marine vessels, lowering sulfur content of fuels, reducing evaporative and exhaust standards and VOC contents in consumer products. She summarized the control measures on smog check improvements, vehicle retirement, reformulated gasoline, cleaner in-use heavy duty trucks and off-road equipment, goods movement, construction/mining equipment, recreational vehicles, evaporative/exhaust standards for outboard marine tanks, evaporative standards for gasoline stations, enhanced vapor recovery for above-ground storage tanks, and consumer products. She indicated that bonds and funding is available to provide incentives for the South Coast and San Joaquin Valley.

4. Schedule

Dr. Tisopulos summarized the upcoming 2007 AQMP schedules – releasing the modification to draft AQMP in March-April, conducting public workshops in mid March and AQMP regional hearings in mid April. There was a suggestion that staff should include an additional public workshop and regional hearing in San Fernando Valley.

5. Closing Remarks/Scheduling Next Meeting/Adjourn

There were no additional public comments. Dr. Tisopulos indicated that the next meeting would be held on March 14, 2007 and adjourned the meeting at approximately 12:00 p.m.

February 14, 2007 AQMP Advisory Group Meeting

MEMBERS PRESENT

Greg Adams, Los Angeles County Sanitation District
Ed Avol, University of Southern California
Art Brown, City of Buena Park
Shep Burton, Consultant
Curtis Coleman, Southern California Air Quality Alliance
Diane Forte, Coalition for Clean Air/Environment Now
Gretchen Hardison, City of Los Angeles
Bill LaMarr, California Small Business Alliance
Anastacio Medina, American Lung Assn. of Los Angeles
Clayton Miller, Construction Industry Air Quality Coalition
Larry Rhinehart, P.F. Ryan & Associates
Rebecca Rosen, U.S. EPA
Ty Schuiling, San Bernardino Associated Governments
Gary Stafford, Calif. Furniture Manufacturers Association
Lucille Van Ommerring, California Air Resources Board
Carla Walecka, Realtors Committee on Air Quality
Lee Wallace, SoCal Gas Company

OTHERS PRESENT

Carol Bohnenkamp, U.S. EPA
Alan DeSalvio, Mojave Desert AQMD
Sheryll Del Rosario, SCAG
Miles Heller, BP
Tom Ishi, SoCalGas
Graciela Kawa, Boeing
Julia Lester, ENVIRON International Corp.
Linden Marsh
Dan Monette, Toyota USA
Matthew Russell, ENVIRON International Corp.
Arnie Sherwood, SCAG, ITS, UCB
Momo Takahashi, Kesal, Young & Logan
Ivan Tether, California Independent Petroleum Assn.

MEMBERS ABSENT

Stacy Alameida, MTA
Ralph Appy, Port of Los Angeles
Jacki Bacharach, South Bay Cities Council of Governments
Howard Berman, Environmental Mediation
Don Blose, American Lung Association of Inland Counties
Gerry Bonetto, Printing Industries of California
Mike Carroll, Latham & Watkins
Paul Choe, Korean Drycleaners-Laundry Association
Nathan DeBoom, Milk Producers Council
Bob Dulla, Sierra Research
Bahram Fazeli, Communities for a Better Environment
Vernon Hall, Clean Air Now
David Hayes-Bautista, Center for the Study of Latino Health
Joe Garcia, City of Monrovia
David Gutierrez, City of San Gabriel
Mee H. Lee, Lee Consulting Group
Steve Levy, Center for Continuing Study of CA Economy
Melissa Lin Perrella, Natural Resources Defense Council
Glenn Maddalon, American Lung Assn of Orange County
Jonathan Nadler, SCAG
Penny Newman, Center for Community Action and EJ
Peter Okurowski, Association of American Railroads
Ken Pulskamp, City of Santa Clarita
Bill Quinn, CCEEB
Jeb Stuart, Consultant
Mike Wang, Western States Petroleum Association
Monte Ward, Orange County Transportation Authority
John Wohlmuth, Coachella Valley Association of Govts

AQMD STAFF

Sam Atwood, Media Manager
Barbara Baird, Principal Deputy District Counsel
Lori Berard, Air Quality Specialist
Joe Cassmassi, Planning & Rules Manager
Ed Eckerle, Program Supervisor
Michael Krause, Air Quality Specialist
Minh Pham, Air Quality Specialist
Zorik Pirveysian, Manager
Gary Quinn, Program Supervisor
Steve Smith, Program Supervisor
Laki Tisopulos, Assistant Deputy Executive Officer
Patti Whiting, Staff Specialist